

**HAWAII TEACHER STANDARDS BOARD
TEACHER EDUCATION COMMITTEE MEETING**

Friday, January 13, 2023

**Meeting Conducted by Remote Technology via Zoom
and
Physical Location at 650 Iwilei Road, Suite 268, Honolulu, HI 96817**

MINUTES

PRESENT:

Dr. Jonathan Gillentine
Lokelani Han
Branden Kawazoe
Lauren Moriarty for Bruce Voss

Dr. Cecily Ornelles for Dr. Nathan Murata
Dawn Raymond
Kerry Tom for Keith Hayashi

STAFF:

Felicia Villalobos, Executive Director
Tracey Idica, Licensing Specialist
Kris Murakami, Licensing Specialist

Jennifer Padua, Licensing Specialist
Raymond Rodriguez, Licensing Specialist
Elaine Hutchinson, Secretary

CALL TO ORDER:

Chairperson Ornelles called the meeting to order at 11:01 a.m.

OPENING REMARKS:

Chairperson Ornelles shared information regarding procedures for virtual committee meetings:

- The following committee members, in addition to the Chairperson, are participating in today's virtual committee meeting and have established audio and video connection.
- Committee members shall be visible and audible to all members and the public during meetings.
- This committee meeting will be recorded.

ROLL CALL TO ESTABLISH QUORUM:

Chairperson Ornelles called the roll and established quorum.
All seven (7) committee members were present.

DISCLOSURE FROM COMMITTEE MEMBERS AT PRIVATE LOCATIONS:

Chairperson Ornelles shared information regarding private location disclosure:

- Committee members shall be considered present at the meeting for the purpose of determining compliance with the quorum and voting requirements of the board.
- Committee members who are participating remotely from their homes or from other private locations must announce who is at the private location with them. Minors do not need to be identified unless they have a personal business, property, or financial interest in an issue.

Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they have anyone present with them at their non-public site that they need to disclose.

- No disclosures were made.

ADDITIONAL PROCEDURAL INFORMATION:

Chairperson Ornelles shared additional information regarding meeting protocols and procedures:

- As a reminder, all committee members wishing to speak should raise their hand and the Chairperson will be notified to call on the person. The speaker must state their name prior to making their remarks.
- Votes will be conducted by roll call so that it is clear how each committee member voted.
- Members of the public who have signed up to testify or would like to testify online must be logged into Zoom using the same name they used to sign up for testimony. Please use the Chat Box to provide your name and the agenda item(s) you are testifying on.
- Testifiers today will have two (2) minutes to testify. Anyone who missed the opportunity to testify before the relevant agenda item will be allowed to testify at the end of the meeting.
- Testifying online can be challenging due to technical issues. The Chat Box is being monitored by HTSB staff, and the Committee Chairperson will be notified that you would like to testify, and you will be called on to give your testimony at the appropriate time in the agenda.
- Written testimony received more than forty-nine (49) hours in advance of the meeting has been uploaded to the online meeting agenda for members to review.
- A meeting held by interactive conference technology shall be recessed for up to thirty (30) minutes when audio communication cannot be maintained with a quorum of members, provided that the meeting may reconvene when only audio communication is reestablished.

ANNOUNCEMENTS: None

PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON COMMITTEE AGENDA ITEMS:

1. On-Time written testimony was submitted by Ms. Alyson Emrick, Director, Licensure & Regional Team Initiatives, Teach for America Hawai`i for NBI 22-58.
2. Late written testimony was submitted by Dr. Diann Huber, Founder, iteachHAWAII for NBI 22-59.
3. Ms. Alyson Emrick of Teach for America Hawai`i signed up to give oral testimony for NBI 22-58.
4. Mr. Ian Okamoto of Teach for America Hawai`i signed up to give oral testimony for NBI 22-58.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

The minutes of the November 18, 2022, meeting were approved as written.

DISCUSSION/Action:

NBI 22-58: Consideration of Recommendations from HTSB Educator Preparation Provider Completer Audit for Teach For America Hawaii

- Ms. Alyson Emrick of Teach for America Hawai`i was present and provided oral testimony on NBI 22-58:
“We are happy that all of the audit criteria were met but wanted to take the opportunity to share here with you all a little bit more context around our licensure areas and a little bit about our program. We are proud to have supported 920 corps members, including 234 local and Native Hawaiian teachers in 95 schools across the state since we started here in 2006. All of our candidates are hired by partner schools to be teachers of record and teach with an Emergency Hire Permit while they pursuing their teaching license. During the hiring process, we share with administrators an initial subject area that we have tentatively assigned to candidates and all of the additional content areas that candidates are interested and open to teaching. However, the line that candidates are hired to teach is of course ultimately up to the administrators, hiring staff and the school, based on their school’s needs. The line that candidates are hired to teach is what determines the license that they actually work towards in our certification program. We want to examine how to best address the teacher shortage, meet the need for math teachers, and address the difficulty some candidates experience passing the secondary math PRAXIS. One potential pathway that we’re exploring is potentially adding middle-level math and/or Algebra 1 to our program in addition to what we already have which is the 6-12 math.”

- Mr. Ian Okamoto of Teach for America Hawai`i was present and provided oral testimony on NBI 22-58:
“We, as well as from what we understand, other EPPs, are very excited and interested to see your consideration of NBI 22-61. Looking at the opportunity or the possibility for providers of secondary math to have the additional fields of Algebra 1 and Geometry. For us particularly, the Algebra 1. Thank you for everyone’s consideration. We really appreciate the opportunity to share a little bit more about our program.”
- Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 22-58.
- Committee Member Moriarty stated that she supports the recommendation as put forward in the NBI. She also wanted to note that the Board of Education will be considering the final draft of its Strategic Plan at its next meeting. One of the five desired outcomes under one of our priority goals is that all students are proficient in mathematics by the end of the 8th grade. So any changes to the Hawai`i Teacher Standards Board that would both help to maintain high teacher standard quality but also support that goal would be something she would be interested to explore here from the Teacher Standards Board perspective.
- The committee voted to recommend approval of NBI 22-58 as written, to the full board.

DISCUSSION/Action:

NBI 22-59: Review of iTeach’s Licensure Recommendations

- Executive Director Villalobos stated that Dr. Diann Huber, Founder of iteach, said that she was going to be here to present oral testimony but is not in the virtual room. Dr. Huber submitted late written testimony that is on the website and it was given to board members via the DropBox. Again, it was late testimony so she is unsure if the board had a chance to read that material.
- Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 22-59, including the *Findings* and *Recommendations*. The NBI concludes with:
 - “iTeach has reassured that they will work with HTSB staff and identified program completers to correct the issues found in the review.”
- Committee Member Gillentine stated that he is seeking Chairperson Ornelles’ advice.
 - He was a former employee of iTeach for about a year and a half, just prior to joining the HTSB. He’d be happy to abstain. He does not believe he served as field supervisor for any of these candidates in that regard. He will abstain if she thinks it is appropriate.

- Without knowledge of the individuals involved and your current role, if you feel that you would like to abstain, but Chairperson Ornelles feels that it would not be necessary.
 - She asked if there was any other feedback?
 - Executive Director Villalobos replied that if Committee Member Gillentine abstained, there would still be quorum.
 - Chairperson Ornelles thanked Committee Member Gillentine for sharing that information and for the request to abstain.
- Committee Member Moriarty stated that she read the late testimony and there was a request in there from iteach that the audit be only of their SPED program and not of all programs. They also asked that the “one-off” policy be allowed for the additional candidates.
 - Was there any introduction or discussion that Chairperson Ornelles wanted to make to these proposals?
 - Chairperson Ornelles stated that she believed that the “one-off” policy was allowed for those at the time when the recommendation was made. In terms of the recommendation for only the Special Education audit, the issue is with those that actually were recommended for content area for which they should not have been. She believes that it is a sound recommendation in this particular NBI.
 - Executive Director Villalobos added that the NBI for the “one-off” specifically stated secondary. It has never been K-6. So, the request to have all of the “one-offs” including elementary K-6, was not a part of the NBI even before it was rescinded. It was always only for secondary.
 - Currently, the way the NBI is written, it will take care of all the secondary individuals.
 - As for the audit, usually when we find discrepancies in educator preparation programs, standard practice is to do an entire audit of all completers just to ensure that each program is in line with Hawaii Administrative Rules and board policy.
 - The committee voted to recommend approval of NBI 22-59 as written, to the full board.

DISCUSSION/Action:

NBI 22-60: Consideration of the University of Hawaii at Hilo Letter of Intent to Plan a Bachelor of Science in Educational Studies with a Licensure Track in Elementary Education

- Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 22-61.
- Dr. Jan Ray, Director and Professor, School of Education, University of Hawaii at Hilo was present in the Zoom virtual meeting room.

- She thanked everyone for considering this and stated that she is excited to get started on this program.
- The committee voted to recommend approval of NBI 22-60 as written, to the full board.

DISCUSSION/Action:

NBI 22-61: Granting Hawaii State Approved Teacher Preparation Providers with Approved Math Programs the Option to Recommend within the Mathematics License Fields

- Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 22-61.
- Ms. Alyson Emrick of Teach for America Hawai'i was present and provided oral testimony on NBI 22-61:

“I really am coming with a curiosity. I saw this NBI posted and have a question - If the board would also consider middle level math, grade 6 to 8 license with this NBI, allowing prep programs who have approved secondary math 6-12 license, the ability in addition to Algebra 1 and Geometry, the ability to recommend in middle level math 6-8 with a similar requirement. Showing content knowledge in the subject area and having clinical experience in middle level math, it's something that we as a program were already thinking about before we saw this NBI because we see our middle level math teachers be really successful as evidenced by principal feedback and Danielson observation scores. We see our partner principals continue to hire in those lines. And so I'm curious if that is being considered or would be considered. Thank you.”
- Executive Director Villalobos stated that she thought this was public testimony. Usually in public testimony, the board does not engage.
- Chairperson Ornelles replied to Ms. Emrick on the question she asked in her public testimony:
 - We can definitely, in the future, have consideration for the request that she was making.
 - At this time, just adding that middle level. It is a 6-12; those that are approved for preparation for secondary math
 - So, if we can do a little more research related to that particular request, we can do that.
- The committee voted to recommend approval of NBI 22-61 as written, to the full board.

DISCUSSION/Action:

NBI 18-23 Revised: Revision of Hawaii Department of Education's Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages Add a Teaching Field

- Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 18-23 Revised, which includes its Rationale/Background.
- The committee voted to recommend approval of NBI 18-23 Revised as written, to the full board.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON COMMITTEE AGENDA ITEMS: No additional testimony.

ADJOURNMENT:

Chairperson Ornelles adjourned the meeting at 11:35 a.m.

Recorder: *Elaine Hutchinson* Date: January 13, 2023
Elaine Hutchinson