

**HAWAI‘I TEACHER STANDARDS BOARD
GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING**

Friday, February 9, 2024

**Meeting Conducted by Remote Technology via Zoom
and
Physical Location at 650 Iwilei Road, Suite 158, Honolulu, HI 96817**

MINUTES

PRESENT:

Branden Kawazoe, *Board Chairperson*
Lokelani Han, *Board Vice-Chairperson*
Sean Bacon for Keith Hayashi
Kahele Dukelow for Warren Haruki
Elena Farden for Keahi Makaimoku
Dr. Jonathan Gillentine
Dale Matsuura
Justin Mew
Kristi Miyamae
Dr. Cecily Ornelles for Dr. Nathan Murata
Dawn Raymond
Kim Sanders
Dr. Katina Soares

EXCUSED:

Dondra Ozaki
U‘ilani Miguel, *Non-Voting Member*

STAFF:

Felicia Villalobos, Executive Director
Steven Harada, Licensing Specialist
Dr. Mitzie Higa, Licensing Specialist
Tracey Idica, NBCT, Licensing Specialist
Kris Murakami, Esq., Licensing Specialist
Dr. Jennifer Padua, Licensing Specialist

I. CALL TO ORDER

A. ROLL CALL TO ESTABLISH QUORUM

Board Chairperson Branden Kawazoe called the General Business Meeting to order at 11:15 a.m.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe shared information regarding procedures for virtual board meetings, then called roll call and established quorum. Board Chairperson Kawazoe and Board Members Justin Mew and Kim Sanders were present. Board Vice-Chairperson Lokelani Han and Board Members Sean Bacon, Kahele Dukelow, Dr. Jonathan Gillentine, Dale Matsuura, Kristi Miyamae, Dr. Cecily Ornelles, Dawn Raymond, and Dr. Katina Soares participated remotely. Board Member Dondra Ozaki and Non-Voting Board Member U'ilani Miguel were excused. Board Member Elena Farden was not present at roll call.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe shared information regarding non-public site disclosure. None of the board members participating remotely had anyone present with them. Board Chairperson Kawazoe then shared additional information regarding meeting protocols and procedures.

Board Member Farden entered remotely.

B. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING AGENDA ITEMS

None

C. ANNOUNCEMENTS

Board Chairperson Kawazoe welcomed two new board members, Dale Matsuura and Dondra Ozaki, to the Hawai'i Teacher Standards Board ("HTSB"). He also welcomed two new licensing specialists, Dr. Mitzie Higa and Steven Harada, as well as HTSB's new secretary, Darcie-Ann Chung.

Executive Director Felicia Villalobos wanted to congratulate Licensing Specialist Tracey Idica for maintaining her National Board Certification.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe also congratulated Licensing Specialist Idica and commended her hard work—going into the classroom, videotaping herself, and meeting all the requirements.

Executive Director Villalobos also welcomed the new HTSB board members and staff. She expressed appreciation for their time and dedication to provide services to HTSB to uplift the teaching profession.

D. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES

The minutes of the December 1, 2023, meeting was approved as written.

E. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR’S REPORT

Board Chairperson Kawazoe introduced Executive Director Villalobos to share her report.

Executive Director Villalobos highlighted a new component in her report that was recommended by a board member. There was now a link to the NBI encompassing the evaluation standards that HTSB’s Executive Director would be evaluated against. Executive Director Villalobos cross-referenced these standards to all the activities she had completed since the December board meeting.

Executive Director Villalobos also highlighted the emergency hire data and pointed out the fields of these emergency hire placements, which she stated was useful information for HTSB’s 14 approved educator preparation programs (“EPPs”) to help fill their programs with possible teacher candidates. Regarding the licensure survey data, Executive Director Villalobos mentioned it would change because the survey questions were updated. She stated HTSB staff was still trying to modify the survey for accurate data to share with the full board (“Board”) and educational stakeholders.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

II. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING AGENDA ITEMS

None

F. LICENSING UPDATE – Licensing Specialist Tracey Idica

Licensing Specialist Idica stated it was a very busy last two months, but the HTSB staff was so grateful to have Steven, Mitzie, and Darcie on board with them in the office. Licensing Specialist Idica also mentioned she was working very hard preparing for the National Board Certified Teacher recognition ceremony tomorrow, which was going to be a very special event as it was never done at Washington Place before.

Regarding HTSB staff’s work, Licensing Specialist Idica stated there was a lot of renewals and applications. She shared about a new emergency hire “program” that was held last night in which emergency hires were able to join virtual meetings involving Hawai’i Department of Education (“the Department”) staff and different participating EPPs. Licensing Specialist Idica mentioned she was there to help the emergency hires with their Emergency Hire Permit questions in terms of initial licensure or how to convert to a full license. She also expressed concern regarding emergency hire teachers not knowing they needed an Emergency Hire Permit before they started teaching. She mentioned it might just be that they were not reading their materials, but she shared there was one teacher attending this event who did not know until last night that an Emergency Hire Permit was needed—and that teacher had been working at her school since last month. Licensing Specialist

Idica iterated that, somewhere along the line, these emergency hires were not getting the information they needed. She stated this was an area that HTSB needed to be aware of and make sure teachers knew they needed a license or permit before they started teaching. Overall, Licensing Specialist Idica shared there was a good turnout for the event, the teachers asked a lot of questions, and they were grateful for the opportunity.

Licensing Specialist Idica went on to report that HTSB staff was continuing to do the monthly audits and making sure all teachers were licensed or permitted. She also mentioned HTSB staff had the opportunity to present for the Hawai'i State Public Charter School Commission and help the commissioners better understand the role HTSB played in ensuring all public and charter school teachers were licensed or permitted.

Licensing Specialist Idica asked board members if they had any questions. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe thanked Licensing Specialist Idica for her report.

G. 2024 Ad Hoc Legislative Update: Miyamae

Board Member Miyamae thanked Licensing Specialist Dr. Mitzie Higa, who had been helping Executive Director Villalobos provide and write testimony for HTSB. Board Member Miyamae stated Licensing Specialist Higa created a tracking form for the legislative bills that were moving, then highlighted some of the bills:

- HB1534: Hawai'i Teacher Apprenticeship Program
- HB1537: Hawai'i State Constitution amendment regarding property tax
- HB1614: National Board Certification bonus increase
- HB2400: Revoking licenses for teachers that were being investigated or their investigations were not yet completed.
 - Board Member Miyamae thanked Licensing Specialist Kris Murakami and HTSB's Deputy Attorney General for their additional information and input.
- HB2661: Teacher Mobility Compact
 - Board Member Miyamae mentioned HTSB had a lot of questions last year that still were not answered.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

III. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING AGENDA ITEMS

None

IV. NEW BUSINESS, COMMITTEE REPORTS, AND PENDING COMMITTEE ACTION

COMMITTEE REPORT – Budget, Personnel, and Strategic Planning Committee: Mew

The Budget, Personnel, and Strategic Planning Committee met at 9:00 a.m. and looked at one New Business Item and one discussion/recommendation item.

A. NBI 22-96 Revised: 2023-2024 Election of HTSB Officers and Committee Assignments

Board Member Mew reviewed NBI 22-96 Revised, which assigned newly added HTSB board members Dale Matsuura and Dondra Ozaki to certain HTSB committees. He stated the Budget, Personnel, and Strategic Planning Committee voted to recommend NBI 22-96 Revised, as written, to the Board.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Executive Director Villalobos asked Board Chairperson Kawazoe if she could add some comments regarding this NBI.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called on Executive Director Villalobos.

Executive Director Villalobos wanted to provide a timeline. She stated the two new board members were not yet confirmed and were waiting on the Governor's message to go through the Senate, however, they found out from Boards and Commissions that their official oaths of office were completed, so they were allowed to be voting members. Executive Director Villalobos stated once they received the Governor's message, they would provide guest testimony to the teacher education committee on the Senate side. She mentioned they might be reaching out to folks who knew them so testimony could be submitted. She also stated that she and Licensing Specialist Higa would be there to help support them.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any further questions or discussion. There were no further questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 22-96 Revised, as written. Board Chairperson Kawazoe did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 22-96 Revised, as written.

ACTION: NBI 22-96 Revised: 2023-2024 Election of HTSB Officers and Committee Assignments, was adopted by the Board.

B. Discussion/Recommendations: Permitted Interaction Group Reevaluating the Annual Evaluation of the Executive Director

Board Member Mew briefly reviewed this discussion/recommendation document, which included the Rationale/Background. He stated the Budget, Personnel, and

Strategic Planning Committee had a good discussion and the permitted interaction group (“P.I.G.”) would take the feedback provided by committee members and reconvene prior to the March board meeting to try to finalize the evaluation.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe shared that some comments and questions came up regarding a rubric for the three different rating options. He stated the timeline for this evaluation could be modified, explaining that the evaluation would come in as a New Business Item at the March board meeting, but board members could always discuss and defer it to the next board meeting. Board Chairperson Kawazoe shared that he did think the goal from the committee’s discussion was to have something in place that was timeless and could be used for the HTSB Executive Director’s position for years to come. Board Chairperson Kawazoe stated it was a huge undertaking when they first looked at this years ago and that was kind of where they were headed again, but the P.I.G. would meet prior to the next board meeting and try to incorporate all the comments and suggestions. He reminded the document would be posted a week prior to the board meeting and board members could have a discussion and vote.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion.

ACTION: None. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

COMMITTEE REPORT – Teacher Standards Committee: Sanders

The Teacher Standards Committee met at 9:45 a.m. and looked at two New Business Items.

C. NBI 23-28: License Affirmation (November and December 2023)

Board Member Sanders reviewed NBI 23-28, affirming the licenses and permits for the respective months. She stated the Teacher Standards Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-28, as written, to the Board.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 23-28, as written. Board Chairperson Kawazoe did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 23-28, as written.

ACTION: NBI 23-28: License Affirmation (November and December 2023), was adopted by the Board.

D. NBI 23-02 Revised: Adoption of the Online Teaching Workgroup Recommendations

Board Member Sanders reviewed NBI 23-02 Revised, which included the Rationale/Background. She stated the Teacher Standards Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-02 Revised, as written, to the Board.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 23-02 Revised, as written. Board Chairperson Kawazoe did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 23-02 Revised, as written.

ACTION: NBI 23-02 Revised: Adoption of the Online Teaching Workgroup Recommendations, was adopted by the Board.

COMMITTEE REPORT – Teacher Education Committee: Ornelles

The Teacher Education Committee met at 10:31 a.m. and looked at two New Business Items.

E. NBI 23-24 Revised: Imposed Moratorium for Preparation Providers Seeking Initial Program Approval

Board Member Ornelles reviewed NBI 23-24 Revised, which included the Rationale/Background. She highlighted that this imposed moratorium would not affect the current HTSB approved EPPs in Hawai'i. She also highlighted that EPPs who had an affiliation agreement with the Department but were not approved by HTSB were also included in this moratorium and could not apply for initial program approval during this period.

Board Member Ornelles shared that the Teacher Education Committee had a discussion regarding a request for clarification on whether or not this NBI would affect the current 14 HTSB approved EPPs in terms of their ability to submit for program approvals. She mentioned Executive Director Villalobos responded that this revision to NBI 23-24 would not affect the current 14 HTSB approved EPPs' ability to submit for programs or add-a-field considerations.

Board Member Ornelles stated the Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-24 Revised, as written, to the Board.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 23-24 Revised, as written. Board Chairperson Kawazoe did not

vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 23-24 Revised, as written.

ACTION: NBI 23-24 Revised: Imposed Moratorium for Preparation Providers Seeking Initial Program Approval, was adopted by the Board.

F. NBI 23-25: Approval of Substantive Modifications to the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's Master of Education in Curriculum Studies (PK-3) Added Field Program

Board Chairperson Kawazoe shared with board members that two individuals from University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's College of Education were present to answer any questions regarding this agenda item.

Board Member Ornelles introduced Robyn Chun and Kiyomi Umezawa of University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's College of Education. She then reviewed NBI 23-25, which included the Rationale/Background. She highlighted that individuals who were already admitted and enrolled into the Master of Education in Curriculum Studies (PK-3) Added Field program would be allowed to complete it under the original NBI 16-41 requirements.

Board Member Ornelles mentioned the Teacher Education Committee did not have discussion on this agenda item, but there was comment on the importance of the alignment of this program to practitioner-focused and updating to current standards.

Board Member Ornelles stated the Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-25, as written, to the Board.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 23-25, as written. Board Chairperson Kawazoe did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 23-25, as written.

ACTION: NBI 23-25: Approval of Substantive Modifications to the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's Master of Education in Curriculum Studies (PK-3) Added Field Program, was adopted by the Board.

V. EXECUTIVE SESSION

Board Chairperson Kawazoe shared information regarding procedures for virtual Executive Session.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a motion to move into Executive Session.

Board Member Raymond made a motion to move into Executive Session. Board Vice-Chairperson Han seconded the motion.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether or not to move into Executive Session. Board Chairperson Kawazoe did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to move into Executive Session at 11:48 a.m.

This portion of the meeting is a closed meeting under HRS §92-4 and HRS §92-5(a)(1)(2) and (4).

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called the meeting back to order at 1:18 p.m.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe reported out what was discussed during Executive Session:

- Meeting minutes from October 27, 2023
- Personnel update from Executive Director Villalobos
- Consultation with Deputy Attorney General Michael Azuma
- NBI 23-26 – Case No. 23-08:
 - Board Chairperson Kawazoe and Board Member Mew recused themselves from this NBI's discussion and vote.
 - Board Vice-Chairperson Han reported that the Board adopted this NBI.
- NBI 23-27 – Case No. 23-09: Adopted
- NBI 23-29 – Case No. 23-10: Adopted
- NBI 23-30 – Case No. 23-11: Deferred to March board meeting.

VI. NEXT HTSB MEETING: March 15, 2024

Board Chairperson Kawazoe stated the next HTSB Board Meeting was scheduled for March 15, 2024. The details of the agenda would come out prior to the meeting.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

VII. ADJOURNMENT

Board Chairperson Kawazoe adjourned the General Business Meeting at 1:20 p.m.