

**HAWAII TEACHER STANDARDS BOARD
TEACHER EDUCATION COMMITTEE MEETING**

Friday, February 10, 2023

**Meeting Conducted by Remote Technology via Zoom
and
Physical Location at 650 Iwilei Road, Suite 268, Honolulu, HI 96817**

MINUTES

PRESENT:

Dr. Jonathan Gillentine
Lokelani Han
Branden Kawazoe
Lauren Moriarty for Bruce Voss

Dr. Cecily Ornelles for Dr. Nathan Murata
Dawn Raymond
Sean Bacon for Keith Hayashi

STAFF:

Felicia Villalobos, Executive Director
Tracey Idica, Licensing Specialist
Kris Murakami, Licensing Specialist

Jennifer Padua, Licensing Specialist
Raymond Rodriguez, Licensing Specialist
Elaine Hutchinson, Secretary

CALL TO ORDER:

Chairperson Ornelles called the meeting to order at 10:31 a.m.

OPENING REMARKS:

Chairperson Ornelles shared information regarding procedures for virtual committee meetings:

- The following committee members, in addition to the Chairperson, are participating in today's virtual committee meeting and have established audio and video connection.
- Committee members shall be visible and audible to all members and the public during meetings.
- This committee meeting will be recorded.

ROLL CALL TO ESTABLISH QUORUM:

Chairperson Ornelles called the roll and established quorum.
All seven (7) committee members were present.

DISCLOSURE FROM COMMITTEE MEMBERS AT PRIVATE LOCATIONS:

Chairperson Ornelles shared information regarding private location disclosure:

- Committee members shall be considered present at the meeting for the purpose of determining compliance with the quorum and voting requirements of the board.
- Committee members who are participating remotely from their homes or from other private locations must announce who is at the private location with them. Minors do not need to be identified unless they have a personal business, property, or financial interest in an issue.

Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they have anyone present with them at their non-public site that they need to disclose.

- No disclosures were made.

ADDITIONAL PROCEDURAL INFORMATION:

Chairperson Ornelles shared additional information regarding meeting protocols and procedures:

- As a reminder, all committee members wishing to speak should raise their hand and the Chairperson will be notified to call on the person. The speaker must state their name prior to making their remarks.
- Votes will be conducted by roll call so that it is clear how each committee member voted.
- Members of the public who have signed up to testify or would like to testify online must be logged into Zoom using the same name they used to sign up for testimony. Please use the Chat Box to provide your name and the agenda item(s) you are testifying on.
- Testifiers today will have two (2) minutes to testify. Anyone who missed the opportunity to testify before the relevant agenda item will be allowed to testify at the end of the meeting.
- Testifying online can be challenging due to technical issues. The Chat Box is being monitored by HTSB staff, and the Committee Chairperson will be notified that you would like to testify, and you will be called on to give your testimony at the appropriate time in the agenda.
- Written testimony received more than forty-nine (49) hours in advance of the meeting has been uploaded to the online meeting agenda for members to review.
- A meeting held by interactive conference technology shall be recessed for up to thirty (30) minutes when audio communication cannot be maintained with a quorum of members, provided that the meeting may reconvene when only audio communication is reestablished.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON COMMITTEE AGENDA ITEMS:

Dr. Dale Fryxell, Dean, School of Education and Behavioral Sciences at Chaminade University of Honolulu, presented oral public testimony for NBI 22-71.

“Our first-year undergraduate students who started our program prior to November 19, 2021 will only be juniors by the proposed December 31, 2023 deadline proposed in NBI 22-71, and that’s only if they are on track. This is the best cast scenario. Some students can take five, six or more years to complete their course of study. Students generally do their student teaching during the last semester of their senior year. We currently do have students that started their programs prior to November 19, 2021 who are planning to do their student teaching out-of-state. We also have students who are currently living in Hawaii and attending our programs who, for various reasons, may decide to or be forced to move out-of-state. Often these moves are not known ahead of time and may be due to family emergencies like caring for a parent or grandparent, employment relocations or cost of living considerations, in addition to military moves, which are covered by NBI 20-16. In considering our reactions to the implementation of this NBI, we would probably have to consider submitting the names of all our education students who started prior to November 19, 2021 just in case they were to move out-of-state. We also need clarification on whether all students need to complete any out-of-state student teaching prior to December 31, 2023 even if they are on the list that we submit. Students starting our programs prior to November 19, 2021 had the expectation that they would be able to complete their student teaching out-of-state and we think that changing this after they start may potentially cause undue problems, hardships, or issues for some students. Thank you very much.”

ANNOUNCEMENTS: None

APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

The minutes of the January 13, 2023, meeting were approved as written.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON COMMITTEE AGENDA ITEMS: No additional testimony

DISCUSSION/Action:

NBI 22-70: Granting Hawaii State Approved Teacher Preparation Providers with Approved Math Programs the Option to Recommend in Grade Levels 6-8

- Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 22-70.
- The committee voted to recommend approval of NBI 22-70 as written, to the full board.

DISCUSSION/Action:

NBI 22-71: Out-of-State Teacher Candidates Enrolled in an Approved HTSB Educator Preparation Program prior to November 19, 2021

- Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 22-71 which included the Rationale/Background.
- Chairperson Ornelles noted that the date that NBI 12-27 Revised was adopted by the Board needs to be amended from September 16, 2022 to November 19, 2021.
- Public testimony on this NBI was provided by Dr. Dale Fryxell, Dean, School of Education and Behavioral Sciences at Chaminade University of Honolulu.
- Committee Member Moriarty had two questions.
 1. How many students at the University of Hawaii at Manoa will this NBI apply to?
 - We've heard testimony from Chaminade University.
 - The University of Hawaii at Manoa is the largest by numbers in the state. She's interested in any indication of how many UH-Manoa students might be affected by this NBI.
 2. What happens to these folks?
 - If they took four (4) years to get an education degree, and then their last semester they can't get a teaching degree because they can't complete their student teaching here in Hawaii.
 - What happens to them? They just can't become teachers? Would they have to start all over in another state with their education in a different university?

She would like a better understanding and is asking these two questions.
- Chairperson Ornelles stated that yes, with the passing of NBI 12-27, all EPPs were notified and aware of that requirement.
 - For the University of Hawaii at Manoa, we have teacher licensing programs that run the course of two years or three semesters for the post-baccalaureate.
 - The timeline indicated here—of completion by December 31, 2023—would be adequate and actually a fine timeline for completion for those individuals.
 - The rationale is taking a look at when the NBI was introduced and passed in 2021, allowing for time for completion. They would complete—if there were any candidates that were given permission, or who were under the understanding that they could complete—their residency, internships, and student teaching outside of the State of Hawaii.

- Committee Member Moriarty stated, “That’s if they’re on time with their program. Is that correct?”
 - She is speaking from personal experience. She had a family emergency in the middle of the time when she was completing her degree. That pushed her back one semester from finishing her degree in her Master’s of Arts in teaching.
 - She understands what Chairperson Ornelles is pointing out, that that’s for those who know and are on track.
 - Her question is a slightly different question:
Do you have any estimate of how many people going through our University of Hawaii programs do not finish in the normal time frame and might be affected by this need for an exception?

- Chairperson Ornelles stated that she does not believe that they would have anyone at the University of Hawaii who would be affected by this. She would absolutely confirm with all of their programs.
 - However, she does believe that once the NBI was passed, faculty and program coordinators were very aware of the requirement to complete the student teaching, residency, or internship here in the State of Hawaii.
 - So, we have alerted all of our candidates of that requirement upon the passing of that NBI when that happened in November.
 - She will definitely confirm that, but she does not have a number at this point for the University of Hawaii. But her understanding is from discussion and knowledge of the programs here, that individuals are completing here in the State of Hawaii as required by that NBI.

- Committee Member Moriarty stated that, “Therefore, to the extent of your (Chairperson Ornellas) and the staff’s knowledge, the University of Hawaii would not feel that they need to submit any names for requests for exception at this point. Is that correct?”

- Chairperson Ornelles stated that she believed that is accurate. Again, she hasn’t had an opportunity to talk to all of the program directors but, in her discussions, they have communicated to students.
 - In fact, she recently had a communication with a faculty member who was very aware of this circumstance and was requiring a candidate who had been enrolled prior to 2021 to complete here in the State of Hawaii.
 - That candidate had been alerted because their program is currently not completed, that they would need to complete here in the State of Hawaii.
 - She wishes she was a little more definitive of whether we have absolutely zero, but she thinks with also alerting HTSB by the March 1, 2023 deadline, she thinks folks will be able to do that.
 - She does believe that completion can occur by 2023 given the timelines of our programs.

- She does understand though, your question regarding those circumstances beyond control when someone is delayed. She doesn't know of any of those circumstances at this time.
- Committee Member Moriarty stated that her understanding is if someone were to be delayed, then what would happen is they would essentially make a personal decision that they would not go help their mother, not go with a spouse who got a different job, and remain in Hawaii and complete their student teaching. Or, they would decide essentially not to be a teacher, unless they could work something out with a university somewhere else. That's her common sense of understanding of what it says.
- Chairperson Ornelles would like to also draw from Executive Director Villalobos on when there are extenuating circumstances and not as beyond emergencies, what might occur. This is not for capturing those extreme circumstances.
 - She thinks it's ensuring that, with the passage of the NBI in 2021, we have an end point so we're not having folks ten years from now or continue to do their preparation or their clinical experience out-of-state.
- Chairperson Ornelles asked Executive Director Villalobos to speak on severe or extreme extenuating circumstances.
- Executive Director Villalobos stated that there is a mechanism in place in the Hawaii Administrative Rules that allows for someone to submit documentation thirty (30) days prior to a Board meeting of any exception with licensing requirements they want to provide to the Board.
 - We've had people in the past with medical issues who cannot continue on their program.
 - The Board will take a look at it in Executive Session and basically have a timeline of what occurred and they can provide that person with an exception to the rules that are outlined for licensure.
- Committee Member Moriarty stated that therefore the language that said ". . . will not be granted an exception," when in fact there is a process in place for those types of emergencies to be addressed.
- Executive Director Villalobos stated that is correct. There are for emergency purposes.
 - We've had EPPs come to us for non-emergencies. For example, they just forgot a name.
 - So, we want to make sure they do their due diligence to give us an accurate list of individuals and eventually in the future ten years from now, they don't say, "Oh, I forgot a name on this list."
 - But for emergency purposes, the Board would look at that in Executive Session under the Hawaii Administrative Rules that are in place currently.

- Committee Member Moriarty thanked the Committee for their indulgence in allowing this long line of questioning.
 - Leading to it is both the intent of this NBI, which she sees that is indeed one that she thinks we share in that if you're going to teach in Hawaii, it's good that you had your experience in Hawaii. If your license is from Hawaii, it's good that you understand our teaching circumstances here.
 - At the same time she's trying to balance that larger question that we have, which is the fact that we have a severe teacher shortage here in Hawaii and nationwide. She would hope that there would be some process for somebody, not who is trying to game the system, but for somebody who really had an emergency, to not give up the dream of becoming a teacher.

- Committee Member Kawazoe had questions for Dr. Fryxell of Chaminade University.
 1. Why are teacher candidates completing their internships and clinical experience outside of the state?
 2. What is the need? Is it for these extenuating circumstances? Is it COVID related?
 3. How many of these candidates that are completing their student teaching, residency, and internships out-of-state actually come back and teach in our schools in the State of Hawaii?

- Dr. Fryxell provided the following answers to Committee Member Kawazoe's questions:
 - Basically, they've told all of their students from the date of November 19, 2021 that they are required to do their student teaching in-state.
 - It is really the students that started prior to that date, who may be in a four-year program, that could take five or six years that we're concerned about.
 - It's really a small number of students who are currently out-of-state and had to move out-of-state for various reasons. He doesn't have a number on how many come back but a lot of these students are from Hawaii and may just be on the mainland for a short period of time and could come back. You never know. And, we do have students who might leave for these various reasons.
 - Currently, he thinks there are five students that are on the mainland and will probably do their student teaching there, that started prior to November 19, 2021.
 - The goal at Chaminade is really to recruit students that want to become teachers and stay here in Hawaii, but he thinks that the bigger picture is as Committee Member Moriarty stated.
 - Chaminade is also interested in working toward the teacher shortage nationally so we weren't that happy about the prior NBI that kind of doesn't let us do that anymore.
 - We just want to try to make sure that we take care of the students that are already in our program.

There was a power glitch and audio communication was disrupted for Chairperson Ornelles. Vice-Chairperson Bacon stepped in for her.

- Vice-Chair Bacon asked Committee Member Kawazoe if he had additional questions for Dr. Fryxell.
- Committee Member Kawazoe did not have any questions for Dr. Fryxell, but did for Executive Director Villalobos.
 - He asked her if she has any data numbers on those candidates that are completing their internship out-of-state.
 - How many are back here in our school system?
- Executive Director Villalobos stated that is why the November 19, 2021 NBI was brought up.
 - We can't find any of the folks that did their clinical experience out-of-state in our Hawaii schools at all.
 - She can do another research to see if they came back, but what we have found is that once they completed an EPP program in another state or even another country, they actually ask for reciprocity in the state they're currently in.
 - Our Licensing Specialists are then tasked with using reciprocity to grant them a Hawaii license or they would ask for their Hawaii license be transferred to the license of the state they are in.
 - So they're using reciprocity in the state in which they did their clinical experience in.
 - When we looked back in 2021, we could not find any of the folks that did their clinical experience out-of-state or out-of-country, here in Hawaii.
- Committee Member Moriarty stated that listening to what Executive Director Villalobos has just explained, it seems to her that from a budgetary perspective, there are two issues:
 1. The use of state resources to support the training of teachers who don't stay here.
 - That would apply in the case of University of Hawaii where part of the education of the student is funded by state general fund resources and state taxes.
 - That would not be the case with Chaminade, HPU, and BYU for example.
 2. A second question would be a direct point that Executive Director Villalobos has just brought up again.
 - It is state funding and state resources that support the work of our Hawaii Teacher Standards Board staff.
 - This would not be impacted regardless of whether the university was a state-funded or private university.

- Vice-Chair Bacon had a question for Executive Director Villalobos.
 - For example, if Chaminade did have the five to eight candidates that are possibly still working on their degree out-of-state, they could submit those names to HTSB prior to March 1, 2023. If later on down the road there was a situation where they did identify an additional person, they would be able to come back to the Board within thirty (30) days to request an exception for that person.
 - Is this understanding correct?
- Executive Director Villalobos replied that the exception would be under serious circumstances such as medical. There are some things listed under Hawaii Administrative Rules that would outline that.
 - We would request that, by the March 1, 2023 date, we get everyone's names.
 - This NBI can always be revised at the next meeting if we find that a lot of individuals from all the different EPPs all of a sudden say that their candidate will not finish until this time.
 - Chairperson Ornelles can go ahead and revise this NBI and put it on the April agenda to extend the date because they found EPPs needed more time or whatever the circumstances are. For example, if there were a whole group of individuals that are completing their clinical experience out-of-state or out-of-country.
- Vice-Chair Bacon asked Executive Director Villalobos if there is a time constraint that we need to take an action on at this board meeting, or is there a way that maybe we can get some additional data possibly to see how many this may affect to make a determination at a future meeting, or is there some sensitivity on the time frame for today's meeting?
- Executive Director Villalobos stated that because March 1, 2023 is in policy now, if she were to send an email to all EPPs, there's no guarantee that she will get all of the information back because it's not in policy. So we may not gather all of the information.
 - If it's in policy, she sends the NBI to all EPPs saying that this is the deadline, March 1, 2023. That would be great to get all the information required.
 - Again, the Board does not have meetings in May, June, July and possibly not August. April would be the last board meeting in order for NBIs to be discussed, unless you want to put together a board meeting in the summer or beginning of the school year.
 - The time-sensitive nature of it is that we want to get it by March 1, 2023 and then have time for the April board meeting to either revisit this or just see again how many names are on the list and she can provide that to you.
 - Again, you can always defer it or amend the NBI right now if you would like to change the December 31, 2023 date.

Chairperson Ornelles' audio connection was restored and she rejoined the meeting.

- Committee Member Bacon stated that he wants to really make sure that we have no unintended consequences here.
 - We do have a teacher shortage in the state and he wants to make sure that we don't put up an additional unintended barrier here to ensure we are able to have qualified candidates in our classrooms.
 - The State Board of Education just approved their Strategic Plan.
 - Part of that Strategic Plan is ensuring we have licensed qualified teachers in all of our classrooms and every single one of them counts.
 - He wants to make sure that we don't have any unintended consequences from this NBI.
 - He thanked Dr. Fryxell for his testimony which created a great discussion.
 - He wants to consider everything before we make a final decision on this today.

- Chairperson Ornelles stated that her understanding is that our options on this NBI today are to:
 1. **Vote** on this particular item today;
 2. **Defer** it with the intent to acquire more information by March 1, 2023 for the March Board meeting so we can perhaps put forward a timeframe that wouldn't compromise any individuals that may be affected by this and determine the next steps for acquiring the information needed;
 3. **Amend** and change some of the information that is included in this NBI.

- Committee Member Kawazoe stated he would vote to proceed with this NBI so at least we can get names, numbers and lists. We can gather the information as soon as possible and can amend the NBI after the March meeting. We can move forward, given that there are no Board meetings over the summer.

- Committee Member Moriarty thanked Committee Member Kawazoe for his suggestion. It does provide some clarity and she can understand the rationale for that. If we choose that path, she suggested pushing back the deadline, making it June 2024. This provides more space for people who may be caught up and didn't have the ability to plan as they might have planned.

- Committee Member Kawazoe agreed with moving the date back from December 31, 2023 to June 30, 2024.

- Committee Member Moriarty is still interested, as we go forward, in trying to understand the number of people that this affects. This is because of the unintended consequences preventing people who might want to be teachers.

- Committee Member Bacon stated that he is also in favor of moving back the date to June 30, 2024. If we get additional data, he'd like to be sure that we could

possibly revisit this NBI if the data shows unintended consequences that the Board needs to address.

- Motion to amend NBI 22-71 (Gillentine/Raymond)
- The committee voted to amend NBI 22-71.
- The committee voted to recommend approval of NBI 22-71 as amended, to the full board.

DISCUSSION/Action:

NBI 22-72: HTSB's Plan to Endorse and Support the Building of an Educators Rising Presence in Hawaii

- Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 22-72 which included the Rationale/Background.
- Licensing Specialist Idica spoke on Educators Rising and provided information.
 - She thanked the Board for considering this NBI because she sees so much potential in Educators Rising helping us to address the teacher shortage issue.
 - When we had Mr. Wally Janneh of Educators Rising here with us at the last Board meeting, we were also able to take him to visit with the different stakeholders.
 - We got consensus from HSTA, HEA, TECC, and the Superintendent's office. They all felt that this has potential to really begin to make a difference in Hawaii and to build the teacher academies.
 - This is why we are now turning to the Board for support.
- The committee voted to recommend approval of NBI 22-71 as written, to the full board.

ADJOURNMENT:

Chairperson Ornelles adjourned the meeting at 11:22 a.m.

Recorder: Elaine Hutchinson Date: February 10, 2023
Elaine Hutchinson