

**HAWAII TEACHER STANDARDS BOARD
TEACHER STANDARDS COMMITTEE MEETING**

Friday, February 10, 2023

**Meeting Conducted by Remote Technology via Zoom
and
Physical Location at 650 Iwilei Road, Suite 268, Honolulu, HI 96817**

MINUTES

PRESENT:

Elena Farden for Keahi Makaimoku
Lokelani Han
Branden Kawazoe
Justin Mew

Dawn Raymond
Kim Sanders
Dr. Katina Soares

STAFF:

Felicia Villalobos, Executive Director
Tracey Idica, Licensing Specialist
Kris Murakami, Licensing Specialist

Jennifer Padua, Licensing Specialist
Raymond Rodriguez, Licensing Specialist
Elaine Hutchinson, Secretary

CALL TO ORDER:

Chairperson Sanders called the meeting to order at 9:33 a.m.

OPENING REMARKS:

Chairperson Sanders shared information regarding procedures for virtual committee meetings:

- The following committee members, in addition to the Chairperson, are participating in today's virtual committee meeting and have established audio and video connection.
- Committee members shall be visible and audible to other members and the public during meetings.
- This committee meeting will be recorded.

ROLL CALL TO ESTABLISH QUORUM:

Chairperson Sanders called the roll and established quorum.
All seven (7) committee members were present.

DISCLOSURE FROM COMMITTEE MEMBERS AT PRIVATE LOCATIONS:

Chairperson Sanders shared information regarding private location disclosure:

- Committee members shall be considered present at the meeting for the purpose of determining compliance with the quorum and voting requirements of the board.
- Committee members who are participating remotely from their homes or other private locations must announce who is at the private location with them. Minors do not need to be identified unless they have a personal business, property, or financial interest in an issue.

Chairperson Sanders asked committee members if they have anyone present with them at their non-public site that they need to disclose.

- No disclosures were made.

ADDITIONAL PROCEDURAL INFORMATION:

Chairperson Sanders shared additional information regarding meeting protocols and procedures:

- As a reminder, all committee members wishing to speak should raise their hand and the Chairperson will be notified to call on the person. The speaker must state their name prior to making their remarks.
- Votes will be conducted by roll call so that it is clear how each committee member voted.
- Members of the public who have signed up to testify or would like to testify online must be logged into Zoom using the same name they used to sign up for testimony. Please use the Chat Box to provide your name and the agenda item(s) you are testifying on. Testifiers today will have two (2) minutes to testify. Anyone who missed the opportunity to testify before the relevant agenda item will be allowed to testify at the end of the meeting.
- Testifying online can be challenging due to technical issues. The Chat Box is being monitored by Hawai'i Teacher Standards Board staff, and the Committee Chairperson will be notified that you would like to testify. You will be called on to give your testimony at the appropriate time in the agenda.
- Written testimony received more than forty-nine (49) hours in advance of the meeting has been uploaded to the online meeting agenda for members to review.
- A meeting held by interactive conference technology shall be recessed for up to thirty (30) minutes when audio communication cannot be maintained with a quorum of members, provided that the meeting may reconvene when only audio communication is reestablished.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON COMMITTEE AGENDA ITEMS: None

ANNOUNCEMENTS: None

APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

The minutes of the January 13, 2023, meeting were approved as written.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON COMMITTEE AGENDA ITEMS: None

PRESENTATION:

Dr. Troy Hutchings Presentation on the upcoming study: “The Effect of Career Stage on Teacher Professional Decision-Making”

- He and Dr. Shawna Ortogero of UH-Manoa are conducting a research project on behalf of the initiatives that HTSB has undertaken for the past 10 to 12 years, dealing with professional ethics.
- They have a multi-method research project called, “The Effect of Career Stage on Teacher Professional Decision-Making.” They will be examining how teachers from various career stages (early career, mid-career, latter career) approach the complexities of their job.
- The way they are going to do this is by having fifteen (15) different scenarios in a survey format. They are not going to be looking at a binary of right and wrong, but rather the complexity of it. More specifically, the risk level involved with each of the decision-making in each of those situations.
- Then they will be following that up with a series of interviews as well.
- The survey and interviews are the multi-methods.
- They anticipate a participation level of about twenty percent (20%) of all State of Hawaii teachers in public, private, and charter schools. They are looking at well over three thousand (3,000) participants in this particular study.
- The research is approved by the UH IRB and the HIDOE Data Governance Office. They are looking at about 3,000 surveys and 150 interviews.
- They will be disaggregating the data, whether it is interview data or survey data, by career stage. Then, they will triangulate the two sets of data to really examine how teachers approach everyday decision-making. All of the scenarios are “in the gray” and are not outlier situations.
- This is kind of what they are doing and is an extension of all of the work that has been done already by this particular Board.
 - The initiatives starting with the adoption of the Model Code of Ethics for Educators (MCEE).
 - Initiatives the teacher prep programs are taking in preparing educators to examine the complexities of their professional decisions.

Committee Member Han stated that she took the MCEE course.

- It was an eye-opener for her because the scenarios and information that were given, she has seen. It was not in her own practice but in her co-workers’ practice.
- She encourages teachers at her school to take it because you just don’t know.
- You’d think that it’s in good faith and it’s helping but, sometimes, there’s a double-edged sword.

- It was a really good training that she received and is looking forward to doing it again. We could all use reminding of what ethics actually looks like.

Dr. Hutchings thanked Committee Member Han for her comments.

- This entire project gives you more of that opportunity.
- The research looks at both in-service as well as pre-service preparation in professional learning in those areas so we can handle the complexities.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON COMMITTEE AGENDA ITEMS: None

DISCUSSION/Action:

NBI 22-67: The Consideration of HTSB's Endorsement of Hawaii Education Association (HEA) Spring 2023 Workshops: Creating Educator Communities of Care

- Chairperson Sanders reviewed NBI 22-67 which included the Rationale/Background.
- Committee Member Farden stated that this is a great opportunity.
 - We are supporting the teachers and staff in their travel costs to attend because these events are taking place across the islands.
 - She asked if there is a cost, a budget that's attached to this and a budget line item that also supports this?
- Executive Director Villalobos provided the following answers:
 - The HTSB staff travel costs will be for only one person. We do not know if the travel will be to one, two or all three of the neighbor island workshops. We are still in the planning phase and wanted to get support from you folks first.
 - This expense is planned for and included in the MCEE Budget Line Item. This is one of the items in this group that funds can be spent for.
- Committee Member Mew stated that as a member of the Budget Committee, he can verify that there is a Budget Line Item with money that was budgeted for purposes like this.
- Committee Member Han said that, speaking as a teacher in a rural area, will there be opportunities for these presentations online? Is a virtual workshop in the making?
 - There are different schools across the state that may be able to host or support. Moloka'i and Kona have Community Colleges.
 - They have educators that may benefit from these workshops.
- Executive Director Villalobos stated that this event is sponsored by HEA.
 - HTSB is not putting in any money towards it except for having our staff member participate and follow along HEA.
 - Licensing Specialist Rodriguez has been working with HEA on this project.
- Licensing Specialist Rodriguez stated that he is very excited about this opportunity because it talks about mental health, teacher well-being and the connection to educator ethics.

- Specifically with the virtual options, there's another project being talked about later today that will connect hopefully to this. That part will be a virtual option that our board would be connecting to this, inviting other people to participate virtually.
- HEA also has something set up with Dr. Hutchings in the summertime with opportunities to participate in a virtual format. It will be with this content, type of material, and a professional learning type of environment.
- The short answer to Committee Member Han's question is "Yes."
- There will be virtual opportunities but it won't be on these days. It will be on separate days but there will be potentially two different opportunities for people to participate in a virtual format.
- Executive Director Villalobos stated that, since Licensing Specialist Rodriguez has been working on this project with HEA, he can just send out your request if there is any possibility at these colleges to do a hybrid session to somehow put in on YouTube or something like that.
 - Again, Licensing Specialist Rodriguez will ask the HEA folks who are putting this event together because this is a very important point for our neighbor island teachers.
- Committee Member Farden stated that she fully supports this professional learning development and opportunity.
 - She would just like the Board and the Committee to consider, going forward for future requests like this, if they could also add in the other components of:
 1. What is the benefit or alignment that's going to happen for this staff member to attend.
 2. That there is budget that's aligned to it.
 - She thinks that would help answer all of the questions that you have going forward, in addition to what you already have on the document here. But the alignment and benefit would also be helpful so we know how it's going to also support the ongoing work of the staff and Board.
- The committee voted to recommend approval of NBI 22-67 as written, to the full board.

DISCUSSION/Action:

NBI 22-68: License Affirmation (December 2022)

- Chairperson Sanders reviewed NBI 22-68.
- The committee voted to recommend approval of NBI 22-68 as written, to the full board.

ADJOURNMENT:

Chairperson Sanders adjourned the meeting at 9:55 a.m.

Recorder: Elaine Hutchinson Date: February 10, 2023

Elaine Hutchinson