

**HAWAI‘I TEACHER STANDARDS BOARD  
TEACHER EDUCATION COMMITTEE MEETING**

**Friday, March 15, 2024**

**Meeting Conducted by Remote Technology via Zoom  
and  
Physical Location at 650 Iwilei Road, Suite 158, Honolulu, HI 96817**

**MINUTES**

**PRESENT:**

Dr. Cecily Ornelles for Dr. Nathan Murata, *Committee Chairperson*  
Sean Bacon for Keith Hayashi, *Committee Vice-Chairperson*  
Kahele Dukelow for Warren Haruki  
Dr. Jonathan Gillentine  
Dale Matsuura  
Dondra Ozaki  
Dawn Raymond  
Branden Kawazoe, *Ex-officio*

**EXCUSED:**

U‘ilani Miguel, *Non-Voting Member*  
Lokelani Han, *Ex-officio*

**STAFF:**

Felicia Villalobos, Executive Director  
Steven Harada, Licensing Specialist  
Dr. Mitzie Higa, Licensing Specialist  
Tracey Idica, NBCT, Licensing Specialist  
Dr. Jennifer Padua, Licensing Specialist

**I. CALL TO ORDER**

**A. ROLL CALL TO ESTABLISH QUORUM**

Committee Chairperson Dr. Cecily Ornelles called the Teacher Education Committee Meeting to order at 9:01 a.m.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles shared information regarding procedures for virtual committee meetings, then called roll call and established quorum. Committee Chairperson Ornelles; Committee Vice-Chairperson Sean Bacon; Committee Members Dr. Jonathan Gillentine, Dale Matsuura, Dondra Ozaki, and Dawn Raymond; and *Ex-officio* Committee Member Branden Kawazoe participated

remotely. Non-Voting Committee Member U'ilani Miguel and *Ex-officio* Committee Member Lokelani Han were excused. Committee Member Kahele Dukelow was not present during roll call.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles shared information regarding non-public site disclosure. None of the committee members participating remotely had anyone present with them. Committee Chairperson Ornelles then shared additional information regarding meeting protocols and procedures.

**B. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON COMMITTEE AGENDA ITEMS**

There was no public testimony.

Executive Director Felicia Villalobos disclosed that there were faculty from quite a few educator preparation programs (“EPPs”) in attendance to speak on or answer any questions regarding their New Business Items (“NBIs”).

Committee Chairperson Ornelles stated the committee would recognize those individuals prior to their NBI to see if they would like to provide any summary at that time.

**C. ANNOUNCEMENTS**

Executive Director Villalobos congratulated new committee and board member Dondra Ozaki, as she was excused from the last board meeting.

**D. APPROVAL OF COMMITTEE MINUTES**

The minutes of the February 9, 2024, meeting was approved as written.

**II. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON COMMITTEE AGENDA ITEMS**

None

**III. ACTION ITEMS**

**C. NBI 23-32: Adoption of the International Society for Technology in Education Standards for Licensure and Hawai'i Educator Preparation Program Verification of Content Knowledge of Teacher Candidates**

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 23-32, which included the Rationale/Purpose.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 23-32, as written, to the full board (“Board”) at the General Business Meeting scheduled later at 11:00 a.m. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. Committee Member Dukelow was not present during the vote. All other committee members present voted to recommend.

**ACTION: The Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-32, as written, to the Board, with six of seven members present voting aye.**

**D. NBI 23-33: Teacher Candidates Clinical Experience Criteria for Initial Licensure in Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages**

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 23-33, which included the Rationale/Background.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any questions or discussion.

Committee Member Gillentine asked if this NBI is addressing the case discussed last month in which there was difficulty in supporting a teacher candidate who did not have access to a mentor teacher.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles responded that it did. She mentioned this NBI recognizes that having a TESOL (Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages) licensed teacher is very challenging to secure and would provide the opportunity for an individual such as the one that was discussed, as well as others who may be affected, to be able to work in a classroom, but with specific guidelines to ensure the quality of their experience and receive the feedback they need during that very important time of student teaching.

Committee Member Bacon wanted clarification as to who would be approving the written requests that EPPs submit 60 days prior to the start of a teacher candidate’s clinical experience, as it would be approved on a case-by-case basis.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called on Executive Director Villalobos to address this question as it was very important for clarification.

Executive Director Villalobos stated Hawai’i Teacher Standards Board (“HTSB”) staff would be managing this since there is a small pool of candidates and not all EPPs are allowed to recommend in TESOL. She stated this would allow staff to look at each one and consult with Board Chairperson Kawazoe and other board members if there is anything that is complex.

Executive Director Villalobos explained for the guests attending the meeting that the chairperson would only be answering questions from board members as this was a board member discussion. She mentioned if guests would like to submit testimony at the proper time, then the chairperson would be notified of the testimony. Executive

Director Villalobos then asked Committee Member Bacon if she answered his question.

Committee Member Bacon stated she did. He mentioned it was just not clear in the NBI and, because of the limited amount of TESOL applicants, he wanted to make sure HTSB could respond to these EPPs in a timely manner and without any additional barriers.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles stated Committee Member Bacon raised an important issue and asked committee members if it would be possible to add a statement regarding when this NBI takes effect. She mentioned this would allow EPPs time to secure placements, know what their needs might be, and whether or not they would need to submit requests to HTSB. She suggested the NBI takes effect in the beginning of the spring semester on January 1, 2025, allowing time for EPPs to determine placements and to meet the NBI's requirements.

*Committee Member Dukelow entered remotely.*

Executive Director Villalobos stated the effective date of January 1, 2025, could be added to the NBI's first paragraph.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles agreed that would be her recommendation and then asked committee members if they had any further questions or discussion.

Executive Director Villalobos advised Committee Chairperson Ornelles that a motion was needed to amend the NBI.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles acknowledged Executive Director Villalobos's suggestion and asked committee members if they had any further questions or discussion.

Committee Member Bacon wanted to know if HTSB would be able to accommodate if an EPP submits a request that is 45 or 30 days before placement starts. He explained sometimes EPPs try to do last minute placements and he would not want the 60-day timeframe to limit teacher candidates from going into a practicum experience and having to wait another semester.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles acknowledged Committee Member Bacon's concern. She mentioned it does occur where placements are being secured and there are changes in teachers at schools, which may make the 60-day timeframe challenging. She yielded to Executive Director Villalobos to speak on the human resources and being able to ensure request approvals.

Executive Director Villalobos stated it may be tricky because if a date is not put on the NBI, the EPP could submit their request the day before and want one-day approval before the placement the following day. She stated she would leave it up to

the committee members to see what an acceptable amount of time would be. She mentioned HTSB really wants its EPPs to be seeking cooperating teachers and they should have a pool of teachers that they are considering prior to placement. She iterated EPPs should already have partnerships with schools, especially if they are recommending in TESOL as there are no new programs recently recommending in TESOL and they are all established programs.

Committee Member Bacon suggested a 30-day notice, but he also asked Executive Director Villalobos if that was doable for staff. He mentioned he knows they have quite a bit of work to do, but he wanted to make sure there are as few barriers as possible since TESOL is a very limited area.

Executive Director Villalobos deferred to Licensing Specialist Dr. Jennifer Padua, stating she is HTSB's EPP specialist and would probably be doing much of the work for this NBI.

Licensing Specialist Padua explained that one of the rationales for choosing 60 days was to coincide with the school quarters of the Hawai'i Department of Education ("the Department"). She mentioned most quarters are usually 45 days so, with 30 days, the candidate would be placed in the middle of a quarter. She stated the 60 days was so EPPs could find placements in advance, and if HTSB did not approve someone for a placement then that extra timeframe would provide some padding in case this sort of negotiation needed to happen.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked if Licensing Specialist Padua felt that maintaining the 60 days is advisable, given the timeline.

Licensing Specialist Padua stated 60 days is advisable. She clarified it did not mean that it would take 60 days to process the request, and that it is possible for HTSB staff to do it pretty quickly depending on their schedule. She mentioned if the staff processes a request in a week and that EPP or teacher candidate does not have a cooperating teacher, then that would allow them more time to look for someone else without encroaching on the Department's quarterly system.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked if it was possible to have a slightly shorter timeframe versus the 2-month window of time. She shared Committee Member Bacon's concern, but she also understood HTSB staff's concern. She mentioned she felt that it would be terrible if someone was delayed an entire semester, with financial implications, etc., if the processing timeframe was not met.

*Ex-officio* Committee Member Kawazoe suggested 45 days as a way of meeting in the middle. He stated he was unsure if this could be a case-by-base situation, but he knew the specialists were working very hard, so a balance needed to be found.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles stated she wanted to ensure that the voice of HTSB was heard in terms of managing a 45-day timeframe with appreciation of a

case-by-case consideration. She understood a timeframe was needed so that the EPPs could submit their requests in a way that HTSB could support them.

Executive Director Villalobos suggested some type of clause be added stating that written requests will be approved on a case-by-case basis with no guarantee it would be done in a certain amount of time (i.e., 60 days, 45 days, 50 days). She stated she wanted EPPs to understand that if they are going to submit their requests at the eleventh hour, then there is no guarantee that it will be approved at that time. She felt that the committee should decide on the wording for the clause.

Executive Director Villalobos emphasized that the overall question of this discussion is what are EPPs doing to ensure that their TESOL teacher candidates have the correct placements so that HTSB does not have to search for cooperating teachers for them? She explained when the Board approves EPPs that are trying to license in these shortage areas, the Board must be aware that the EPPs need to build partnerships with schools immediately and have that pool of cooperating teachers ready to go. She also explained it is the EPPs' promise to the Board when they are approved that they are going to be able to recommend in those certain license fields, and part of their responsibility is ensuring that they have the correct placements in order to provide that guarantee. She understood there will be instances where great TESOL teachers retire and leave a hole in their cooperating teacher pool, but reaching out to the schools and building those partnerships will be vital moving forward. She stated if the Board does get more EPPs wanting to recommend in TESOL, then the Board will really need to ask them the question of: *How are you going to ensure that you are finding the correct cooperating teacher and placements for these teachers?* She mentioned research has shown that if teachers are prepared correctly, they will stay longer in the classroom, leading to retention. She then reiterated the committee members can amend the language for this NBI.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles wanted to propose to add some amendments at the end of the paragraph located under the bulleted points.

Executive Director Villalobos suggested taking out the number of 60 days in that same paragraph and adding a clause about it not guaranteeing approval, just in case an EPP decides to submit their request the night before and staff is not available to review it or if there are any issues.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles acknowledged Executive Director Villalobos's suggestion and recommended: *"Submission of a request does not guarantee that approval will be granted."*

Executive Director Villalobos stated that was fine with her unless the committee had other ideas regarding timeliness.

Committee Member Matsuura asked if it was possible to say, *"Approval may take up to 60 days,"* so the EPP has that length of time in mind.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles acknowledged that Committee Member Matsuura's statement communicated the need for timeliness because it would impact the time in placement and students need to be able to fulfill the 450 hours. She also mentioned HTSB would have some flexibility in their response, while also ensuring that EPPs submit their requests ahead of time otherwise it would delay student teaching—and there is a point at which fulfillment of the hours cannot occur if too many weeks have elapsed.

Committee Member Gillentine suggested, "*Submission of a request may take up to 60 days,*" be changed from "*submission*" to "*processing.*" He stated he felt that "*submission*" sounded like there are many things the EPP would have to do that takes a long time, but it is actually the processing of the request that would possibly take an extended period of time.

Committee Member Bacon wanted to concur with what Committee Member Matsuura suggested. He mentioned he liked the phrasing as it does not put a hard limit on it, but it at least alerts the EPPs that it may take up to 60 days to process.

Committee Member Gillentine asked Committee Chairperson Ornelles if she needed one motion for these three amendments, or if they could all be lumped together.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles stated she was going to ask for a motion for all of the amendments, but she would also defer to Executive Director Villalobos.

Executive Director Villalobos stated the amendments could be lumped into one motion.

Committee Member Gillentine made a motion to approve the three amendments for NBI 23-33. Committee Member Bacon seconded the motion.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on the motion to approve the three amendments for NBI 23-33. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. All other committee members present voted to approve the three amendments for NBI 23-33.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any further questions or discussion. There were no further questions or discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 23-33, as amended, to the Board at the General Business Meeting scheduled later at 11:00 a.m. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. All other committee members present voted to recommend.

**ACTION: The Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-33, as amended, to the Board, with seven of eight members present voting aye.**

**E. NBI 23-34: Approval of the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's Letter of Intent to Plan a Special Education Teacher Leader Added Field Program**

Committee Chairperson Ornelles introduced NBI 23-34 and offered to yield to University of Hawai'i at Mānoa ("UH Mānoa") faculty in attendance who would like to provide any summary prior to the committee's vote on this NBI.

Dr. Sarah Cook, associate professor in the Department of Special Education at UH Mānoa, stated their team believes there is a critical need to develop opportunities that encourage current special education teachers to go beyond initial licensure programs, to support school-wide initiatives for ensuring high quality and inclusive programming for students with disabilities, and to address challenges related to teacher retention. She explained the purpose of the M.Ed. in Special Education Leadership and Research track is to provide advanced training and professional development, as well as to prepare teacher leaders so they can foster school-wide practices, support teachers and administrators to have the cultural competencies necessary to support the success of all students in the school. She stated these teacher leaders will be prepared to mentor new teachers, advocate for students, and provide professional development on educational policies and practice.

Dr. Cook stated their team is proposing that these teachers completing this M.Ed. program be recognized by earning an add-a-field of *Teacher Leader* to their existing teaching license to officially recognize them as leaders within the Department. She mentioned their team also believes this is a strategic approach to address the challenges of teacher retention, as teacher leaders can contribute to factors such as improved administrative support, the quality of working conditions, a supportive school culture, and job satisfaction.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles briefly reviewed NBI 23-34, which included the Rationale/Background and Letter of Intent application.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any questions or discussion.

Committee Member Gillentine expressed this is a wonderful addition to the choices that are available to teachers and felt that the program was very timely. He appreciated that the creators of this program are addressing cultural competence and encouraging teachers to influence PD (professional development).

Committee Member Bacon agreed with Committee Member Gillentine's comments about the program being timely as it weaves into the Board of Education's recently approved strategic plan, which focuses on recruitment, retention, and ensuring PD for all teachers.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any further discussion. There were no further questions or discussion from committee members.



Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 23-34, as written, to the Board at the General Business Meeting scheduled later at 11:00 a.m. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. All other committee members present voted to recommend.

**ACTION: The Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-34, as written, to the Board, with seven of eight members present voting aye.**

**F. NBI 23-35: Continuing State Approval of the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's Library and Information Science Program for School Librarians**

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 23-35, which included the Rationale/Background and the American Library Association ("ALA") accreditation letter. She mentioned there was a faculty member present from UH Mānoa's Library and Information Science Program ("LISP").

Meera Garud, instructor and coordinator for UH Mānoa's library program, stated she was available to answer any questions. She mentioned their program is the only Hawai'i state-approved library program, and over 95% of currently licensed school librarians that are in Hawai'i's public schools are from their program. She stated their team is very invested in the community and are happy to continue doing this.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any questions or discussion.

Executive Director Villalobos asked Committee Chairperson Ornelles if Licensing Specialist Padua could speak on this NBI. She stated, as staff, they attend accreditation meetings, so they wanted to highlight a couple of things.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles yielded to Licensing Specialist Padua.

Licensing Specialist Padua explained it is required by Hawaii Administrative Rules ("HAR") for HTSB to go on site visits with accreditation teams. She also explained LISP is part of a bigger program at UH Mānoa, but they did a remarkable job of incorporating the entire College of Social Sciences. She stated the accreditation team met with some of those faculty, observed instructors and professors teaching, and met with different student focus groups online doing their master's and doctoral work. She mentioned this was a very impressive accreditation visit and the committees were very good about asking standards questions, as well as asking about what the program was doing and how they could keep the momentum going. She reiterated this was one of the best accreditation visits she has seen in terms of rigor and partnership.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any further questions or discussion. There were no further questions or discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 23-35, as written, to the Board at the General Business Meeting scheduled later at 11:00 a.m. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. All other committee members present voted to recommend.

**ACTION: The Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-35, as written, to the Board, with seven of eight members present voting aye.**

**G. NBI 23-36: Continuing State Approval for Chaminade University of Honolulu's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs**

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 23-36, which included the Rationale/Background and Association for Advancing Quality in Educator Preparation ("AAQEP") accreditation letter.

Executive Director Villalobos stated Dr. Dale Fryxell of Chaminade University's Education Program was present at HTSB's public meeting site and would have staff allow him to use the public guest testimony laptop.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles yielded to Dr. Fryxell.

Dr. Fryxell, Dean of the School of Education and Behavioral Sciences at Chaminade University, stated he was available to answer any questions and thanked the Board for moving over to AAQEP as they found it to be a very positive and enlightening experience. He also thanked Licensing Specialist Padua, who participated in their site visit teams, and Executive Director Villalobos for all her support and guidance while going through the process.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from committee members.

Executive Director Villalobos asked Committee Chairperson Ornelles if she could add something.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called on Executive Director Villalobos.

Executive Director Villalobos stated she was unable to attend the on-site accreditation visits as she was at a conference, and unfortunately HTSB only had one staff member available to attend the on-site visits. She explained Chaminade had program reviews occurring at the same time for both their counseling and education programs, which a couple of HTSB licensing specialists tried to attend meetings for. She gave kudos to Chaminade for fitting it all into a couple of days, but she stated this made it difficult for HTSB staff to attend all the on-site visits. She wanted to recommend spreading everything out just a little bit more for future accreditation meetings.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any further questions or discussion. There were no further questions or discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 23-36, as written, to the Board at the General Business Meeting scheduled later at 11:00 a.m. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. All other committee members present voted to recommend.

**ACTION: The Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-36, as written, to the Board, with seven of eight members present voting aye.**

**H. NBI 23-37: Continuing State Approval for Chaminade University of Honolulu's School Counseling Educator Preparation Program**

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 23-37, which included the Rationale/Background and AAQEP accreditation letter. She mentioned Dr. Fryxell of Chaminade University was present so if he wanted to provide any summary or information then she would yield to him.

Executive Director Villalobos stated Dr. Darren Iwamoto of Chaminade University was also present online.

Dr. Fryxell expressed it was a very great process for their team to go through as they value continuous improvement in their programs. He found this opportunity as a way to make sure their program is doing what it is supposed to do, which is creating quality school counselors. He stated he was available to answer any questions.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 23-37, as written, to the Board at the General Business Meeting scheduled later at 11:00 a.m. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. All other committee members present voted to recommend.

**ACTION: The Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-37, as written, to the Board, with seven of eight members present voting aye.**

**IV. ADJOURNMENT**

Committee Chairperson Ornelles adjourned the Teacher Education Committee Meeting at 10:03 a.m.