

**HAWAII TEACHER STANDARDS BOARD
GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING**

Friday, March 24, 2023

**Meeting Conducted by Remote Technology via Zoom
and
Physical Location at 650 Iwilei Road, Suite 268, Honolulu, HI 96817**

MINUTES

PRESENT:

Dr. Jonathan Gillentine	Dr. Cecily Ornelles for Dr. Nathan Murata
Lokelani Han	Dawn Raymond
Branden Kawazoe	Dr. Katina Soares
Kristi Miyamae	Kerry Tom for Keith Hayashi
Lauren Moriarty for Bruce Voss	

EXCUSED:

Elena Farden for Keahi Makaimoku	Kim Sanders
Justin Mew	

STAFF:

Felicia Villalobos, Executive Director	Jennifer Padua, Licensing Specialist
Tracey Idica, Licensing Specialist	Raymond Rodriguez, Licensing Specialist
Kris Murakami, Licensing Specialist	Elaine Hutchinson, Secretary

CALL TO ORDER:

Chairperson Kawazoe called the meeting to order at 12:30 p.m.

OPENING REMARKS:

Chairperson Kawazoe shared information regarding procedures for virtual board meetings:

- The following board members, in addition to the Chairperson, are participating in today's virtual board meeting and have established audio and video connection.
- Board members shall be visible and audible to other members and the public during meetings.
- This board meeting will be recorded and all committee meeting minutes will be posted on HTSB's website.

ROLL CALL TO ESTABLISH QUORUM:

Chairperson Kawazoe called the roll and established quorum. Nine (9) Board Members were present, three (3) were excused. We have the number of members needed for quorum.

DISCLOSURE FROM BOARD MEMBERS AT PRIVATE LOCATIONS:

Chairperson Kawazoe shared information regarding private location disclosure:

- Board members shall be considered present at the meeting for the purpose of determining compliance with the quorum and voting requirements of the board.
- Board members who are not participating at the Board's public location must announce who is at the remote location with them. Minors do not need to be identified unless they have a personal business, property, or financial interest in an issue.

Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they have anyone present with them at their non-public site that they need to disclose.

- No disclosures were made.

ADDITIONAL PROCEDURAL INFORMATION:

Chairperson Kawazoe shared additional information regarding meeting protocols and procedures:

- As a reminder, all board members wishing to speak should raise their hand and the Chairperson will be notified to call on the person. The speaker must state their name prior to making their remarks.
- Votes will be conducted by roll call so that it is clear how each board member voted.
- Members of the public who have signed up to testify or would like to testify online must be logged into Zoom using the same name they used to sign up for testimony. Please use the Chat Box to provide your name and the agenda item(s) you are testifying on. Testifiers today will have two (2) minutes to testify. Anyone who missed the opportunity to testify before the relevant agenda item will be allowed to testify at specified portions of the meeting.
- Testifying online can be challenging due to technical issues. The Chat Box is being monitored by HTSB staff, and the Chairperson will be notified that you would like to testify, and you will be called on to give your testimony at the appropriate times in the agenda.
- Written testimony received more than forty-nine (49) hours in advance of the meeting has been uploaded to the online meeting agenda for members to review.
- A meeting held by interactive conference technology shall be recessed for up to thirty (30) minutes when audio communication cannot be maintained with a quorum of members, provided that the meeting may reconvene when only audio communication is reestablished.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING AGENDA ITEMS:

Dr. Dale Fryxell, Dean, School of Education and Behavioral Sciences at Chaminade University of Honolulu, submitted late written Testimony for NBI 22-71 Revised.

It was sent to the Board Members.

ANNOUNCEMENTS:

Executive Director Villalobos repeated Chairperson Kawazoe's announcement that we are exactly at nine (9) members for quorum. If anyone is to lose audio or leave for any reason, we will have to stop the board meeting because the Board will not be able to vote on anything.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

Approval of the minutes from the February 10, 2023, meeting were deferred to the April 28, 2023 Board Meeting.

Board Member Moriarty had a question with respect to the part on the discussion of NBI 22-66 amendments and motions on Page 12, at the bottom.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT:

Executive Director Villalobos submitted and stands on her report to the board as written.

- She recently attended two conferences in Indianapolis, IN:
 1. Association for Advancing Quality in Educator Preparation (AAQEP)
 2. American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education (AACTE)They had many breakout sessions on what states are doing to alleviate the teacher shortage. Breakout session topics included:
 - Grow Your Own, teacher apprenticeships, residency, and funding of programs with state and Federal funds.
 - Teacher burnout, the need for mentorship and support.
 - Discussions and sharing of information on what worked and what didn't work in other states.
- She provided an update on the Office of Hawaiian Education (OHE) Kupu Mai Ka `Oiwī: OHE 2023 summit that she, Licensing Specialist Rodriguez and Board Member Moriarty attended. We brought in Dr. Troy Hutchings to speak on Model Code of Ethics for Educators (MCEE).
 - She learned a lot about what their program is doing from the amazing and inspiring keynote speakers.
 - It was a two-day conference at the Convention Center and a site visit where they learned about Hawaiian history, culture, native plants and the organization.
 - Conferences on the neighbor islands were also held.
 - She believes that every teacher should have knowledge about the history of education here in Hawaii. They can then understand their duty to teach Hawaiian culture, knowledge, language in schools. Are we compliant with the Constitution? She will continue to work with OHE and speak on how we can present something to the Board.

Licensing Specialist Rodriguez spoke about two major takeaways from attending the OHE summit.

1. He was immersed in all of this knowledge which was incredible. He will keep in mind what he learned about helping to support the person to grow when he designs our professional learning experiences that the Board is sharing with educators.

2. We have 1,200 teacher vacancies every year. Our EPPs are producing 500 to 600 in a good year. They are required to incorporate Hawaiian knowledge and culture in their program as part of the Hawaii Administrative Rules (HAR). That leaves about 600 to 700 every year that are coming and teaching in our state that are not required to have been trained in Hawaiian culture, knowledge and skills because they are not. This is not a part of the HAR to require this of those incoming people. It makes him want to explore this more and have conversations with you folks about it.

Board Member Moriarty stated that it was really well done. She observed all kinds of connections being made, both in ideas and in people. She hopes that kind of connections and inspiration will continue and that we find ways to do that.

- The Executive Director's Report also includes a Charter School Report. We have been working with the Charter Commission to receive timely information. Our systems are not the same so they do not "talk to each other." We are looking for ways to receive the data and ensure that the data is accurate.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING AGENDA ITEMS:

No additional Testimony.

LICENSING UPDATE: Licensing Specialist Tracey Idica

- The Licensing Specialists have been busy with their regular duties along with the presentations and different things that are part of our normal routine.
- HTSB's participation in HSTA's Institute Days Update
 - Our office did four (4) presentations:
Licensing Specialists Rodriquez and Murakami presented on navigating the risks of teaching.
She (Licensing Specialist Idica) and Licensing Specialist Padua presented on adding fields to one's license. They also did an overview on how to renew your license.
 - All sessions were well-attended and the feedback comments were overwhelmingly positive and appreciative.

2023 AD HOC COMMITTEE LEGISLATIVE UPDATE: Board Member Kristi Miyamae

- The Ad Hoc Committee has been following:
 - The Teacher Compact bill which was deferred
 - Apprenticeship bills which Senator Donovan Dela Cruz is working on and looking for ways to fund it. Senator Dela Cruz has asked HTSB staff to try to help with those requirements.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING AGENDA ITEMS:

No additional Testimony.

NEW BUSINESS, COMMITTEE REPORTS, AND PENDING COMMITTEE ACTION

**COMMITTEE REPORT: BUDGET, PERSONNEL, AND STRATEGIC PLANNING
COMMITTEE**

DISCUSSION:

- **NBI 22-67 UPDATE:** The Consideration of HTSB’s Endorsement of HEA’s Spring 2023 Workshops: Creating Educator Communities of Care
Committee Vice-Chairperson Gillentine stated that Licensing Specialist Rodriguez reported that the workshops were advertised, well-received, and attended by a wide array of educators.
 - You will note that the importance of the Model Code of Ethics for Educators is part of our mission, as is providing professional development. This fit the bill very nicely.
 - One of the vital connections that was made was between ethics and teacher well-being. Educators who attended were able to share their perspectives on that.
 - The budget allowed for travel for staff and Licensing Specialist Rodriguez will be traveling to the Kauai Workshop.Licensing Specialist Rodriguez stated that the main thing of this NBI was to make sure that everybody saw the connection between the Hawaii Revised Statutes (HRS) and the Hawaii Administrative Rules (HRS) and the purpose of the Workshop.

DISCUSSION/Action:

- **NBI 21-28 Revised:** Budget for 2022-2023
Committee Vice-Chairperson Gillentine stated that an existing line item in our budget is being revised with some specificity as to how we would like to use some of these funds for grant writing and focusing in on the teacher shortage. The reasoning behind this is to provide us the capability to use funds for it.
 - There was no discussion.
 - The Board voted to approve NBI 21-28 Revised as written, which was adopted by the HTSB.

- **NBI 22-76:** 2022-2023 Evaluation of the Hawaii Teacher Standards Board Executive Director
Committee Vice-Chairperson Gillentine reviewed NBI 22-76. He stated that there was input on adding some specific things for future changes and determined it is best to not make them at the present time.
 - There was no discussion.
 - The Board voted to approve NBI 22-76 as written, which was adopted by the HTSB.

- **NBI 22-77:** Grant Funding Support for the Development and Support of Teacher Apprenticeships, Teacher Residencies, and Grow Your Own Programs
Committee Vice-Chairperson Gillentine stated that this NBI allows us to move forward with that line item in the budget to contract with grant writers to hopefully receive additional funding through grants that are available.

- Executive Director Villalobos spoke on the value of setting aside funds for grant writers and how the grant funding can be used to address the teacher shortage. It is going to be a partnership with all of the different educational stakeholders including HSTA, HIDOE, Board of Education and P-20.
- Board Member Moriarty lauded the staff for very aggressively pursuing this and taking it on. She is the Board of Education's representative on the Government Affairs Committee of the National Association of State Boards of Education. We have members of our staff for that, who try to track legislation at the Federal level and actions at the White House and Federal DOE level to support programs like this. So that there are specific things that people would like to know, I'm always open to input. But most importantly, thank you to our staff for really taking this one on.
- There was no further discussion.
- The Board voted to approve NBI 22-77 as written, which was adopted by the HTSB.

COMMITTEE REPORT: TEACHER STANDARDS COMMITTEE

- Committee Chairperson Sanders conducted the Teacher Standards Committee Meeting at 9:00 am this morning. She is excused from the General Business Meeting.
- Committee Vice-Chairperson Elena Farden was excused from the Teacher Standards Committee Meeting and is excused from the General Business Meeting.
- Chairperson Kawazoe was present at the Teacher Standards Committee Meeting and will report out.

DISCUSSION/Action:

- **NBI 10-56 Revised:** Acceptance of Verification of Experience and Options for Meeting Standards for License Renewal
Chairperson Kawazoe reviewed NBI 10-56 Revised and stated that the policies contained in it are found in three (3) different NBIs. This NBI compiles the policies into this one NBI.
 - There was no discussion.
 - The Board voted to approve NBI 10-56 Revised as written, which was adopted by the HTSB.
- **NBI 22-55 Revised:** Adoption of the 2022-2023 Hawaiian Focus Workgroup Recommendation (Part 2)
Chairperson Kawazoe reviewed NBI 22-55 Revised.
 - There was no discussion.
 - The Board voted to approve NBI 22-55 Revised as written, which was adopted by the HTSB.
- **NBI 22-78:** Formation of the Early Childhood Education Teacher Licensing Workgroup
Chairperson Kawazoe reviewed NBI 22-78.
 - Executive Director Villalobos stated that the current pathway is the only pathway. To be issued a license in Early Childhood Education, candidates must go through a preparation program. There is no option for someone to take a test to add it to

their license. This was changed to this by the Board a while back. Now the EOEL would like to relook at that and maybe even looking at National Board Certified Teachers on where they land on early childhood to have the ability to add something to their license, depending on the requirements.

- There was no discussion.
 - The Board voted to approve NBI 22-78 as written, which was adopted by the HTSB.
- **NBI 22-79:** The Expediting of Applications for Military and Military Spouses or Registered Domestic Partners of Active-Duty Military Personnel
Chairperson Kawazoe reviewed NBI 22-79.
 - There was no discussion.
 - The Board voted to approve NBI 22-79 as written, which was adopted by the HTSB.
- **NBI 22-80:** License Affirmation (2023 January, February, and Renewals)
Chairperson Kawazoe reviewed NBI 22-80.
 - There was no discussion.
 - The Board voted to approve NBI 22-80 as written, which was adopted by the HTSB.

COMMITTEE REPORT: TEACHER EDUCATION COMMITTEE

DISCUSSION/Action:

- **NBI 17-10 Revised:** Options for Hawaii Educator Preparation Programs Using External Accrediting Organizations for Review to be Considered for State Approval
Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 17-10 Revised.
 - There was no discussion.
 - The Board voted to approve NBI 17-10 Revised as written, which was adopted by the HTSB.
- **NBI 21-09 Revised:** Approval of Association for Advancing Quality in Educator Preparation Provider (AAQEP) Cooperation Agreement
Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 21-09 Revised.
 - There was no discussion.
 - The Board voted to approve NBI 21-09 Revised as written, which was adopted by the HTSB.
- **NBI 12-29 Revised:** Hawaii Educator Preparation Programs Verification of Basic Skills and Content Knowledge for Licensure
Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 12-29 Revised.
 - Dr. Dale Fryxell of Chaminade University provided oral Testimony at the Committee Meeting and is present to answer any questions. No questions were asked.
 - Dr. Fryxell also submitted late written Testimony.
 - There was no discussion.

- The Board voted to approve NBI 12-29 Revised as written, which was adopted by the HTSB.
- **NBI 22-71 Revised:** Out-of-State Teacher Candidates Enrolled in an Approved HTSB Educator Preparation Program Prior to November 19, 2021
Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 22-71 Revised.
 - There was no discussion.
 - The Board voted to approve NBI 22-71 Revised as written, which was adopted by the HTSB.
- **NBI 22-81:** Consideration of the University of Hawai'i at West O`ahu Letter of Intent to Plan Licensure Pathways and Add a Field in Early Childhood Education
Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 22-81.
 - Dr. Mary Heller was present at the Committee Meeting and is present to answer any questions. No questions were asked.
 - There was no discussion.
 - The Board voted to approve NBI 22-81 as written, which was adopted by the HTSB.
- **NBI 22-82:** HTSB Approval of Updated Praxis Licensure Exams
Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 22-82.
 - There was no discussion.
 - The Board voted to approve NBI 22-82 as written, which was adopted by the HTSB.
- **NBI 22-83:** Adoption of Updated Content Standards in English Language Arts for Licensure and Hawaii Educator Preparation Program Verification of Content Knowledge of Teacher Candidates
Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 22-83.
 - There was no discussion.
 - The Board voted to approve NBI 22-83 as written, which was adopted by the HTSB.
- **NBI 22-84:** Verification of Successful Completion of a State-Approved Teacher Education Program for All Out-of-State Applicants Seeking Licensure in Hawaii
Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 22-84.
 - There was no discussion.
 - The Board voted to approve NBI 22-84 as written, which was adopted by the HTSB.
- **NBI 22-85:** State Approval for the University of Hawai'i at Manoa's Music Licensure Program
Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 22-85.
 - There was no discussion.

- The Board voted to approve NBI 22-85 as written, which was adopted by the HTSB.
- **NBI 22-86: Imposed Moratorium for All Hawaii State Approved Preparation Providers and Preparation Providers Seeking Approval with HTSB**
Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 22-86.
 - There was no discussion.
 - The Board voted to approve NBI 22-86 as written, which was adopted by the HTSB.

EXECUTIVE SESSION PROCEDURAL INFORMATION:

Chairperson Kawazoe shared information regarding procedures for virtual Executive Session:

- Executive Session will be conducted in this virtual meeting room and all other attendees will be transferred to a waiting room without access to the general room.
- You may not re-enter until the waiting room is closed. If you leave the waiting room, you must log back into the general meeting and be admitted after the Executive Session is adjourned.
- The Executive Session will be accessible only to HTSB members and required staff.
- During Executive Session, Board Members shall be audible to other authorized participants but are not required to be visible.
- They should also ensure that no other individuals are able to see or hear the Executive Session meeting.

MOTION TO RISE INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION (Raymond/Han)

This portion of the meeting is a closed meeting under Section 92-4 and Section 92-5(a)(1)(2) and (4), Hawaii Revised Statutes.

BOARD MEMBERS VOTED TO ENTER EXECUTIVE SESSION AT 1:33 P.M.

CALL BACK TO ORDER BY CHAIRPERSON KAWAZOE AT 3:33 P.M.

TOPIC: Report out of Executive Session

DISCUSSION:

Chairperson Kawazoe reported out:

- The minutes from the February 10, 2023, Executive Session were approved as written.
- Personnel Update: Villalobos

- Consultation with Deputy Attorney Generals on questions and issues pertaining to the board’s powers, duties, privileges, immunities, and liabilities.
 - HTSB Approved Educator Preparation Program (EPP) Clinical Experience Placements
 - Teaching without License or Permit: HRS §302A-805 Teachers, license or permit required renewals and HRS §302A-808 Penalties

NEW BUSINESS ITEMS APPROVED:

1. NBI 22-87: Case Number 22-22 (Miyamae/Gillentine)
2. NBI 22-88: Case Number 22-23 (Miyamae/Han)
3. NBI 22-89: Case Number 22-24 (Gillentine/Han)
4. NBI 22-90: Case Number 22-25 (Miyamae/Gillentine)
5. NBI 22-91: Case Number 22-26 (Han/Raymond)

NEW BUSINESS ITEMS DEFERRED:

1. NBI 22-92: Case Number 22-27
2. NBI 22-93: Case Number 22-28
3. NBI 22-94: Case Number 22-29

TOPIC: Next HTSB Meeting: April 28, 2023

DISCUSSION:

ADJOURNMENT:

Chairperson Kawazoe adjourned the meeting at 3:34 p.m.

Recorder: Elaine Hutchinson Date: March 24, 2023
Elaine Hutchinson