



**STATE OF HAWAII
HAWAII TEACHER STANDARDS BOARD
GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING**

MINUTES

Remote Technology via Zoom

650 Iwilei Road, Suite 158
Honolulu, HI 96817

Friday, March 28, 2025

PRESENT IN-PERSON:

Kristi Miyamae, *Board Chairperson*
Kim Sanders

PRESENT ONLINE:

Sean Bacon for Keith Hayashi
Dr. Jonathan Gillentine
Dale Matsuura
Dr. Cecily Ornelles for Dr. Nathan Murata
Dondra Ozaki
Dawn Raymond
Dr. Katina Soares
Erika Vincent for Ka'ohinani Daniels

EXCUSED:

Lokelani Han, *Board Vice-Chairperson*
Kahele Dukelow for Roy Takumi
Justin Mew

STAFF:

Felicia Villalobos, Executive Director
Steven Harada, Licensing Specialist
Dr. Mitzie Higa, Licensing Specialist
Tracey Idica, NBCT, Licensing Specialist
Kaulana Molina, NBCT, Licensing Specialist
Kris Murakami, Esq., Licensing Specialist
Dr. Jennifer Padua, Licensing Specialist

I. CALL TO ORDER

A. ROLL CALL TO ESTABLISH QUORUM

Board Chairperson Kristi Miyamae called the General Business Meeting to order at 12:01 p.m.

Board Chairperson Miyamae shared information regarding procedures for virtual board meetings, then called roll call and established quorum. Board Chairperson Miyamae and Board Member Kim Sanders were present in-person. Board Members Sean Bacon, Dr. Jonathan Gillentine, Dale Matsuura, Dr. Cecily Ornelles, Dondra Ozaki, Dawn Raymond, Dr. Katina Soares, and Erika Vincent were present online. Board Vice-Chairperson Lokelani Han, and Board Members Kahele Dukelow and Justin Mew were excused.

Board Chairperson Miyamae shared information regarding non-public site disclosure. None of the board members participating online had anyone present with them to disclose. Board Chairperson Miyamae then shared additional information regarding meeting protocols and procedures.

B. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING AGENDA ITEMS

Alyson Emrick, Director of Licensure at Teach For America (“TFA”) Hawai‘i, testified online via Zoom on NBI 24-27: *Teach For America Audit Findings Year 1*. She requested amending language for Conditions 2 and 3 in the NBI by removing ‘*partially*’ from ‘*partially met*,’ stating TFA met all four conditions. She stated [1] the Hawai‘i Teacher Standards Board (“HTSB”) staff is best positioned to notify TFA of missing documents; and [2] TFA already provides these documents in the annual audit. She requested TFA be allowed to provide missing documents on behalf of their program completers.

Dr. Piikea Kalakau-Baarde testified online via Zoom on NBI 24-27: *Teach For America Audit Findings Year 1*. She requested amending language for Condition 2 in the NBI by removing ‘*partially*’ from ‘*partially met*,’ She stated all TFA candidates that applied for a license did submit their Form 5. She also stated TFA does not have access to their teacher candidates’ HTSB accounts and are unable to track document uploads. She requested HTSB staff be permitted to inform TFA of missing documents since TFA already provides these documents in the annual audit.

Jonathan Hinderer, Managing Director of Leadership Development for Hawai‘i Island at TFA Hawai‘i, testified online via Zoom on NBI 24-27: *Teach For America Audit Findings Year 1*. He requested amending language for Condition 3 in the NBI by removing ‘*partially*’ from ‘*partially met*,’ stating TFA provided all requested information and all TFA candidates completed their clinical experience in their recommended license field.

Joshua Lee testified online via Zoom on NBI 24-27: *Teach For America Audit Findings Year 1*. He requested amending language for Conditions 2 and 3 in the NBI by removing ‘*partially*’ from ‘*partially met*,’ stating TFA fully met the conditions. He stated [1] a candidate’s nonsubmittal of required documents does not change the fact that TFA performed the verification; and [2] this does not reflect partially meeting conditions since no completer was issued a license without submitting required documents.

Lindsey Takenaka testified online via Zoom on NBI 24-27: *Teach For America Audit Findings Year 1*. She stated an educator preparation program’s (“EPP’s”) recommendation

for licensure indicates completion of the program and verification that the candidate met licensure requirements. She mentioned it is not reasonable to say that TFA should not include recommendations for completers who are not immediately pursuing licensure. She stated TFA is willing to directly share all required documents at the time of recommendation so that HTSB staff do not need to rely on completers' submissions. She then requested amending language for Conditions 2 and 3 in the NBI to reflect that TFA met all conditions.

Sonia Fantz, Manager of Regional Initiatives at TFA Hawai'i, testified online via Zoom on NBI 24-27: *Teach For America Audit Findings Year 1*. She stated TFA fully complied with all conditions, requesting the NBI be revised to reflect that the four conditions were met in full. She proposed two process improvements: [1] change the data submission due date from July 31st to October 1st to align with the Hawai'i Department of Education ("HIDOE") reporting timelines; and [2] allow HTSB staff to share with TFA staff the names of candidates who have not uploaded required documents to their HTSB accounts.

C. ANNOUNCEMENTS

Board Chairperson Miyamae congratulated Board Member Dr. Philip Bossert on his retirement and thanked him for his partnership and all that he has done for teachers.

Board Member Bossert shared that it has been a pleasure working with HTSB and he has learned a lot.

Board Chairperson Miyamae announced that Deanna D'Olier, the Executive Director-Elect of the Hawai'i Association of Independent Schools ("HAIS"), would be taking Board Member Bossert's place on the full board ("Board"). She also bid farewell to Deputy Attorney General ("DAG") Darien Chow and introduced the Board's new DAG, Amber Boll.

DAG Boll introduced her second, DAG Karen Arikawa-Hu.

D. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES

The minutes of the January 17, 2025, meeting was approved as written.

Board Chairperson Miyamae announced that Board Member Ka'ohinani Daniels has a proxy. She introduced Board Member Erika Vincent, the Executive Director of the Native Hawaiian Education Council ("NHEC").

E. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Board Chairperson Miyamae introduced Executive Director Felicia Villalobos to share her report.

Executive Director Villalobos reported there was an uptick in license application approvals due to the license renewal period. She then stated she wanted to alert the Board that HTSB was not invited to this year's HSTA (Hawai'i State Teachers Association) Institute Day, recalling that HTSB was always invited in the past. She also stated there was a HIDOE audit review at the Board of Education's ("BOE's") February 13, 2025, meeting, where one audit finding/Corrective Action addressed communication with HTSB and obtaining fingerprints. She mentioned she attended this meeting in-person to answer any questions from BOE. She explained that HTSB was not part of the audit, nor does she have the audit findings

related to HTSB. She clarified that HTSB does not do fingerprinting, as that is done on the employer's side.

Board Chairperson Miyamae shared that she reached out to HSTA's President regarding Institute Day and found out it was decided not to include HTSB due to duplicative options. She shared her confusion and reiterated the importance of teacher licensure and HTSB's presence at the event. She stated she would let her chapter's Vice President know that HTSB is still interested in attending, and she invited other board members to do the same. She then asked Board Member Bacon if he can get a copy of HIDOE's audit findings report since HTSB was not involved in the audit. She also asked if HIDOE is putting into effect any changes specific to HTSB, and if any recommendations were made at that BOE meeting.

Board Member Bacon stated he would look into the audit findings report. He also stated the recommendation is to continue working closely with HTSB. He clarified that HIDOE is looking to work with other external organizations to help process fingerprints timely, as that was another delay unrelated to HTSB.

Board Chairperson Miyamae stated she looks forward to following up with Board Member Bacon about the audit findings. She then yielded to Executive Director Villalobos.

Executive Director Villalobos reported that the first Educators Rising competition was held virtually, put together by Dr. Janet Kim of University of Hawai'i at Mānoa ("UH Mānoa") and Leina'ala Kealoha. She shared that a UH Mānoa professor and herself were part of the Model Code of Ethics for Educators ("MCEE") competition, and thought it was amazing to see high school students learn about MCEE. She hopes in collaboration with the high schools, HIDOE, and other stakeholders, next year's event can be in-person and all neighbor islands can be invited. She mentioned these state competitions lead to a national competition. She also mentioned there was appreciation for HTSB for funding this initiative and for funding the students' memberships. She then reported that save-the-dates will be sent out for the HTSB Summer Summit ("HSS") in early June, which is a meeting/training event for board members and stakeholders to be publicly advertised.

II. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING AGENDA ITEMS

None

A. LICENSING UPDATE – Licensing Specialist Dr. Jennifer Padua

Board Chairperson Miyamae introduced Specialist Padua to share the licensing update.

Specialist Padua shared that it is still the license renewal period, which began on January 1st. She explained that reminders have been going out every month to those who hold Standard and Advanced Licenses expiring on June 30th. She also explained that reminders will be sent out in April or May to those with Provisional Licenses so that they may convert to a Standard License. She mentioned many teachers have not logged in to their HTSB accounts since 2019 or 2020. She stated HTSB now requires more information from applicants (e.g., valid government-issued photo identification, personal email address), which may cause hiccups in the application process. She also shared there are applicants coming out of retirement or who completed a state-approved teacher education program ("SATEP") years ago and are applying for licensure. She stated one of the challenges is that they do not have documents in their HTSB accounts, they did not save printed copies, or

their SATEP does not have records of their program (e.g., license field, grade level). She stated HTSB staff have been reaching out to some EPPs and applicants to inform them of submitting required documents.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

B. REGISTERED TEACHER APPRENTICESHIP UPDATE – Licensing Specialist Dr. Mitzie Higa

Board Chairperson Miyamae introduced Specialist Higa to share an update on registered teacher apprenticeship.

Specialist Higa shared that HTSB is waiting for the consult and confer process to be completed, and for an update on the SAEF (State Apprenticeship Expansion Formula) grant budget. She stated the contract for HTSB to sign as the sub-grantee of the SAEF grant is currently back with the Department of Labor and Industrial Relations (“DLIR”), but once it is received HTSB can move forward. She mentioned there were some changes to the Standards of Apprenticeship [for Teachers], which were presented to and approved by the State Apprenticeship Council (“SAC”). She explained the changes essentially added HSTA to the apprenticeship committee and gave them a signature page.

C. LEGISLATIVE UPDATE – Licensing Specialist Dr. Mitzie Higa

Specialist Higa gave updates about two bills that HTSB has been following, one of which pertains to registered teacher apprenticeship and is in the Governor’s Plan, but never had a committee hearing. She mentioned the House and the Senate may be waiting for next session since HTSB has not yet received the SAEF grant money. She stated the second bill that HTSB has been following would have taken away some of the Board’s rights and would somewhat defeat the Board’s purpose if put into law. She mentioned this bill has gone through both the House and the Senate, but was amended to reflect that criteria for an international license would be at HTSB’s discretion. She shared the public can watch recordings of testimony and read written testimony submitted on the Legislature’s website. She then thanked the permitted interaction group (“P.I.G.”).

Board Chairperson Miyamae wanted to clarify the Board’s decision to oppose SB819—the second bill Specialist Higa gave an update on—and mentioned she testified [in-person] on this bill. She first asked Licensing Specialist Kris Murakami, Esq., to explain why HTSB and HIDOE are separate entities, stating she thinks the board members need to understand this.

Specialist Murakami explained that prior to Hawaii Revised Statutes (“HRS”) enacting the separation between licensure and employment, HIDOE handled both. She stated it was found there was a conflict of interest, as the employer could make arbitrary decisions about whether or not to license and employ an individual. She explained the statute was then created so that HIDOE would solely be responsible for all matters pertaining to employment, while HTSB would have the authority to decide all matters pertaining to licensure. She stated there would be collaboration but a separation at the same time, though HTSB is still administratively attached to HIDOE. She stated she thinks this Board tries very earnestly to make certain there is no entanglement of licensure and employment. She mentioned she thinks HIDOE and HTSB have a good partnership, and HIDOE realized that licensure matters should be deferred to HTSB as indicated by HRS.

Board Chairperson Miyamae stated it was from her understanding that SB819 was brought forward by the Filipino Caucus, but it was actually HIDOE's Office of Talent Management ("OTM") that was behind it. She mentioned she knows HIDOE has been speaking in support of this bill, then she referred back to keeping employment and licensure separate and asked Board Member Bacon why it seems like HIDOE is coming out to support this bill more than the Filipino Caucus has.

Board Member Bacon stated he thinks since the J-1 visa program is a five-year program, HIDOE would like these individuals to be able to take full advantage of the five years. He mentioned HRS does indicate that anyone in a HIDOE classroom needs to be issued a license or permit from HTSB. He then explained that J-1 teachers are in Hawai'i for a very limited amount of time and are not here for their entire careers, but they are able to teach for three years without going through additional testing and requirements. He stated he thinks HIDOE is looking for a way for J-1 teachers to be able to teach for five years before returning to their home country, mentioning he thinks that is the intent of the bill at this point.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked Board Member Bacon if there is a reason why no one from HIDOE reached out to HTSB about concerns raised within the Board's testimony once he learned that HTSB opposed the bill.

Board Member Bacon stated he thinks HIDOE is always willing to collaborate to see what can be done to best benefit the students.

Board Chairperson Miyamae suggested board members watch the testimony for this bill on YouTube, for which the link would be shared.

Board Member Sanders shared that she has a hard time with this matter, knowing there is a bill out there that undermines HTSB. She stated each board member is nominated and appointed by the Governor and they each take their responsibility seriously, so this bill is blindsiding to HTSB. She mentioned she thinks this was not done nicely and OTM should be working with HTSB. She stated this perceived need to expedite the process for J-1 teachers would potentially be at HTSB's expense, with implications of compromising teacher quality and eroding professional standards. She mentioned she thinks the public trusts HTSB to do the right thing, but this bill makes it seem like HTSB is not working toward ensuring the best teachers for students. She stated this bill disregards much of the educational input on the Board, and it could also impact employment for local teachers. She stated she thinks there are many long-term consequences from a short-term fix, requesting that everyone be respectful of each other.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

D. Board Members Report on Conferences and Events Attended

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked board members to share some takeaways from conferences and events they attended.

- ***NASDTEC 2nd National Convening on Registered Apprenticeships in Teaching***

Board Member Sanders shared that this conference was very enlightening, giving attendees a chance to see what other states are doing with their apprenticeships and the

progress they are making. She stated it helped her to see the huge possibilities for Hawai'i, and that HTSB would be able to provide these possibilities to locals wanting to become teachers.

Board Member Ozaki shared that this conference was very inspiring, with breakout sessions pertaining to core components (e.g., training hours, progressive wages). She mentioned a key theme that emerged was mentorship, as finding capable mentors is always a concern. She shared the ultimate goal is to create journey workers of these mentors, who have their apprentice that works under them, and then the apprentice will eventually become a mentor themselves. She stated it is very important to build a sustainable system of support for new and future teachers, mentioning that retention was discussed often. She highlighted that having strong partnerships is going to be essential, such as with HIDOE and early education programs. She shared that she is looking forward to seeing what Hawai'i's apprenticeship program will look like.

Board Chairperson Miyamae invited HTSB staff to share their experiences.

Specialist Padua shared that she was intrigued by the early childhood education pathway presentation, as they mentioned how early childhood educators may start off as a teacher's aide, then get an associate's degree before moving up to a bachelor's degree. She stated sustainability was also discussed, that these educators can move into full-time classrooms and make room for others in the AA program, and that those with bachelor's degrees have more experience by the time they are full-time classroom teachers. She mentioned this is a different and unknown pipeline for early childhood educators to become full-time teachers, while gaining practical experience and remaining in their communities.

Specialist Higa shared that it was inspiring to see so many states doing apprenticeship programs with great retention rates, and it is interesting to see what can be learned from them as Hawai'i's will be both a statewide and an earn-as-you-learn program. She stated people are hired as EAs (educational assistants) and TAs (temporary assignments) in Hawai'i, while in other states they would be considered paraprofessionals. She mentioned not only does Hawai'i have a shortage of teachers, but also a shortage of EAs, which the apprenticeship program will help to build up, as well as pay for tuition at University of Hawai'i schools through the SAEF grant. She mentioned people are already emailing HTSB about this and they cannot wait for it to get started.

Executive Director Villalobos shared that she was inspired by the story of one of the speakers, who was the 2024 National Teacher of the Year and a product of Tennessee's grow-your-own program. She stated it gives HTSB more motivation to start pre-apprenticeship and registered apprenticeship because it works, but the barriers of cost need to be lowered, and quality education needs to be provided in order to become a qualified teacher.

Board Chairperson Miyamae shared that attending these many conferences has opened her eyes to the scope of what HTSB really does, and that these connections made with other states are very important. She stated it is inspiring to hear the different approaches states are taking with their apprenticeship programs. She mentioned she attended a breakout session pertaining to artificial intelligence and her conversation with the presenter was very eye-opening. She also mentioned there was a breakout pertaining to federal updates, which is currently very important.

- ***American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education (“AACTE”)***

Board Chairperson Miyamae shared that the pre-conference pertained to community colleges, some of which spearhead bachelor's degrees. She mentioned while she thinks this would be a conflict, it seems to work for those states. She stated it was eye-opening to see how they think outside the box. She also shared that Dr. Nathan Murata from UH Mānoa attended this conference, and she was able to hear his story and thoughts, as well as share hers. She stated these connections are very important and one of her big takeaways.

Executive Director Villalobos shared that much of the focus for these conferences are not only teacher shortages, but also retention issues. She stated one of the districts said, *“People don’t have survey fatigue. They have lack-of-action fatigue.”* She explained that teachers fill out these surveys, but no action is taken; however, one district took every survey and made immediate changes. She stated the teachers felt heard, like they were making a difference, and that their voices were a part of changes within their district. She mentioned with this new tactic, the district is seeing teachers more satisfied in their job placements and are staying in the profession. She also shared that Linda Darling Hammond was a presenter, and she looks forward to learning more about what her team is doing to help support students in the classroom and retention.

- ***2025 National Board Certified Teacher Recognition Ceremony***

Board Chairperson Miyamae called on Licensing Specialist Tracey Idica, NBCT, to share about this ceremony.

Specialist Idica stated it is her honor to work on this project each year, and the work behind the scenes begins the year prior. She shared that this year's celebration was held on March 1st at Washington Place, with 22 of 25 new National Board Certified Teachers (“NBCTs”) present. She also shared that the 2025 State Teacher of the Year, Bryan Silver, just achieved his National Board certification and was one of the key speakers for the event. She mentioned 17 state legislators attended as well. She thanked HTSB for providing her with the support and opportunity to do this work, stating the NBCTs appreciated the luncheon and the swag bags they received. She also thanked HSTA for providing flights for the new NBCTs from neighbor islands; HIDOE for providing the certificates and allowing her to work with Eryn Lau for planning; and HEA (Hawai'i Education Association) for providing the beverages, desserts, keynote speaker, and for giving the new NBCTs a complimentary one-year HEA membership. She mentioned packages were also sent out to NBCTs who maintained their certification.

Board Member Raymond shared that it was her first time attending this ceremony and she wanted to thank Specialist Idica and HTSB staff for all their hard work. She mentioned she sat on a table with a new NBCT from Kaua'i, along with their CAS (Complex Area Superintendent) and Vice Principal. She stated it was very nice to see the connections they had with this new NBCT and being there to celebrate with them.

Board Member Gillentine shared that he echoes Specialist Idica's gratitude to the Board, but he also gives her a big shout-out for the important work of this event. He mentioned he was privileged to help set up and work at the registration table. He also mentioned he had a nice reunion with one of the new NBCTs, whom he was a candidate support provider and teacher education program field supervisor for. He stated he thinks it is important that the National Board Collective supports Specialist Idica with this work.

Board Member Sanders shared that the event was very amazing, and for Governor Green to open his house to celebrate with everyone shows how much he appreciates education and what educators do for students. She mentioned it is amazing to see how much this has grown since she was the principal at 'Aiea High School and Specialist Idica started working as a National Board mentor.

Board Member Bacon shared that it was a very great event and wanted to give a shout-out to the Board and HTSB staff for all their hard work. He mentioned recruitment and retention is really being worked on, so recognizing the hard work that these new NBCTs are doing and having them with other peers is great. He also acknowledged all the collaboration for this event.

Board Chairperson Miyamae shared Board Member Bacon's sentiments, and that it is HTSB staff who make this event so special. She stated educators need to be celebrated and honored in this way, and more people need to be brought into National Board.

- ***American Association of School Personnel Administrators ("AASPA"): 2025 National Educator Shortage Summit***

Board Chairperson Miyamae shared that this conference was terrific because everyone was split into groups from the beginning to converse about specific topics and share what their states are doing to retain teachers. She stated some are thinking outside of the box, giving back to their teachers and helping their wellness. She mentioned one state has a free clinic for teachers' families to obtain medication easier. She iterated that not every idea shared may fit within the parameters of what Hawai'i can do, but it was her big takeaway.

Executive Director Villalobos shared that she attended the registered apprenticeship breakouts, as any information from other states and districts is helpful. She mentioned one presenter said that they treat their apprentices like athletes in college (e.g., early registration, support services). She stated perhaps this is something that can be put in place with Hawai'i EPPs, since one of the barriers is the difficulties returning to college and navigating that process, including registration and what courses to take next.

III. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING AGENDA ITEMS

None

IV. NEW BUSINESS, COMMITTEE REPORTS, AND PENDING COMMITTEE ACTION

BOARD ACTION – NEW BUSINESS: Committee of the Whole

A. Discussion: Executive Director's Upcoming Annual Evaluation

Board Chairperson Miyamae introduced the Executive Director's Upcoming Annual Evaluation. She stated the evaluation will be sent out to board members, staff, and the executive director, explaining that Board action will be taken at the April board meeting.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

ACTION — None.

PENDING COMMITTEE ACTION – Teacher Standards Committee: Sanders

The Teacher Standards Committee met at 9:00 a.m. and looked at two New Business Items.

B. NBI 24-23: License Affirmation (December 2024 and January 2025)

Committee Chairperson Sanders reviewed NBI 24-23, affirming the licenses and permits for the respective months. She stated the Teacher Standards Committee voted to recommend NBI 24-23, as written, to the Board.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Miyamae called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 24-23, as written. Board Chairperson Miyamae did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 24-23, as written.

ACTION — NBI 24-23: License Affirmation (December 2024 and January 2025), as written, was adopted by the Board.

C. NBI 24-24: The 2024-2025 Career and Technical Education Workgroup Recommendation to Expand from HTSB's Six CTE License Fields to Thirteen

Committee Chairperson Sanders reviewed NBI 24-24, which includes the Rationale/Background. She stated the Teacher Standards Committee voted to recommend NBI 24-24, as written, to the Board.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Miyamae called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 24-24, as written. Board Chairperson Miyamae did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 24-24, as written.

ACTION — NBI 24-24: The 2024-2025 Career and Technical Education Workgroup Recommendation to Expand from HTSB's Six CTE License Fields to Thirteen, as written, was adopted by the Board.

PENDING COMMITTEE ACTION – Teacher Education Committee: Ornelles

The Teacher Education Committee met at 10:00 a.m. and looked at four New Business Items.

D. NBI 24-20 Revised: The University of Hawai'i at Hilo's Bachelor of Arts in Education Studies Elementary Education Program Review

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 24-20 Revised, which includes changes of wording indicated in red. She stated the Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 24-20 Revised, as written, to the Board.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Miyamae called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 24-20 Revised, as written. Board Chairperson Miyamae did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 24-20 Revised, as written.

ACTION — NBI 24-20 Revised: The University of Hawai'i at Hilo's Bachelor of Arts in Education Studies Elementary Education Program Review, as written, was adopted by the Board.

E. NBI 24-25: Granting Hawai'i State Approved Teacher Preparation Providers with Approved Science Programs the Option to Recommend in Grade Levels 6-8

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 24-25, which includes the Rationale/Background. She stated the Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 24-25, as written, to the Board.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Miyamae called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 24-25, as written. Board Chairperson Miyamae did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 24-25, as written.

ACTION — NBI 24-25: Granting Hawai'i State Approved Teacher Preparation Providers with Approved Science Programs the Option to Recommend in Grade Levels 6-8, as written, was adopted by the Board.

F. NBI 24-26: Granting Hawai'i State Approved Teacher Preparation Providers with Approved Science Programs the Option to Recommend within the Science License Fields

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 24-26, which includes the Rationale/Background. She shared that committee members had discussion pertaining to issues of being identified as Highly Qualified (Hawai'i Qualified/"HQ"), and that EPPs are still able to recommend their candidates in the broader area of science if all requirements have been completed.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Miyamae called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 24-26, as written. Board Chairperson Miyamae did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 24-26, as written.

ACTION — NBI 24-26: Granting Hawai'i State Approved Teacher Preparation Providers with Approved Science Programs the Option to Recommend within the Science License Fields, as written, was adopted by the Board.

G. NBI 24-27: Teach For America Audit Findings Year 1

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 24-27, which includes the Rationale/Background. She acknowledged the testimonies provided during committee, mentioning the NBI amendment requests from TFA. She shared that committee members had discussion, and information was shared from HTSB staff regarding the audit process.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked board members if they had any questions or discussion.

Board Member Bacon stated he was the only committee member to vote no on this NBI, though he is in support of the amendment that was made during committee. He mentioned he has concerns regarding the '*partially met*' conditions, as he feels TFA did complete all requirements, whereas it was their candidates who did not submit required documents and chose not to apply for licensure. He iterated he would vote no on this NBI if it stands as is.

Board Chairperson Miyamae shared that it was discussed in committee if there would be any negative repercussions to this NBI. She stated the audit is about improving, so submitting required documents should be on the EPPs because once the candidate is recommended, the application should be ready to go. She mentioned it should not fall on HTSB staff to have to follow up with every candidate, but rather on the EPPs to have that relationship with their candidates and keep track. She stated she would approve this NBI because there are no negative ramifications except to improve.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked board members if they had any further questions or discussion. There were no further questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Miyamae called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 24-27, as amended. Board Members Bacon, Ornelles, and Vincent voted nay. All other board members present voted to approve NBI 24-27, as amended.

ACTION — NBI 24-27: Teach For America Audit Findings Year 1, as amended, was adopted by the Board.

V. EXECUTIVE SESSION

Board Chairperson Miyamae shared information regarding procedures for virtual Executive Session.

Board Chairperson Miyamae called for a motion to rise into Executive Session.

Board Member Raymond moved to rise into Executive Session. Board Member Gillentine seconded the motion.

Board Chairperson Miyamae called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether or not to rise into Executive Session. Board Chairperson Miyamae did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to rise into Executive Session at 1:46 p.m.

This portion of the meeting is a closed meeting under HRS §92-4 and HRS §92-5(a)(1)(2) and (4).

Board Chairperson Miyamae called the meeting back to order at 3:39 p.m.

Board Chairperson Miyamae reported out what was discussed during Executive Session:

APPROVED

- Meeting minutes from January 17, 2025
- Personnel update from Executive Director Villalobos
- Consultation with Deputy Attorney General Amber Boll
- NBI 24-28: Case No. 24-04 – Adopted
- NBI 24-29: Case No. 24-05 – Deferred

VI. NEXT HTSB MEETING: April 25, 2025

Board Chairperson Miyamae stated the next HTSB Board Meeting was scheduled for April 25, 2025. The details of the agenda would come out prior to the meeting.

VII. ADJOURNMENT

Board Chairperson Miyamae adjourned the General Business Meeting at 3:40 p.m.

APPROVED

List of people who submitted written testimony before the committee meeting

<i>ON-TIME TESTIMONY</i>		
NAME	ORGANIZATION	AGENDA ITEM
Jill Baldemor	Teach For America Hawai'i – Executive Director	IV.G. NBI 24-27: Teach For America Audit Findings Year 1