



**STATE OF HAWAII
HAWAII TEACHER STANDARDS BOARD
TEACHER EDUCATION COMMITTEE MEETING**

MINUTES

Remote Technology via Zoom

650 Iwilei Road, Suite 158
Honolulu, HI 96817

Friday, March 28, 2025

PRESENT IN-PERSON:

Kristi Miyamae, *Ex-officio*

PRESENT ONLINE:

Dr. Cecily Ornelles for Dr. Nathan Murata, *Committee Chairperson*

Dr. Jonathan Gillentine, *Committee Vice-Chairperson*

Sean Bacon for Keith Hayashi

Dale Matsuura

Dondra Ozaki

Dawn Raymond

EXCUSED:

Kahele Dukelow for Roy Takumi

Lokelani Han, *Ex-officio*

STAFF:

Felicia Villalobos, Executive Director

Steven Harada, Licensing Specialist

Dr. Mitzie Higa, Licensing Specialist

Tracey Idica, NBCT, Licensing Specialist

Kaulana Molina, NBCT, Licensing Specialist

Kris Murakami, Esq., Licensing Specialist

Dr. Jennifer Padua, Licensing Specialist

I. CALL TO ORDER

A. ROLL CALL TO ESTABLISH QUORUM

Committee Chairperson Dr. Cecily Ornelles called the Teacher Education Committee Meeting to order at 10:00 a.m.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles shared information regarding procedures for virtual committee meetings, then called roll call and established quorum. *Ex-officio* Committee Member Kristi Miyamae was present in-person. Committee Chairperson Ornelles; Committee Vice-Chairperson Dr. Jonathan Gillentine; and Committee Members Sean Bacon, Dale Matsuura, Dondra Ozaki, and Dawn Raymond were present online. Committee Member Kahele Dukelow and *Ex-officio* Committee Member Lokelani Han were excused.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles shared information regarding non-public site disclosure. None of the committee members participating online had anyone present with them. Committee Chairperson Ornelles then shared additional information regarding meeting protocols and procedures.

B. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON COMMITTEE AGENDA ITEMS

Alyson Emrick, Director of Licensure at Teach For America (“TFA”) Hawai’i, testified online via Zoom on NBI 24-27: *Teach For America Audit Findings Year 1*. She requested amending language for Conditions 2 and 3 in the NBI (New Business Item) by removing ‘*partially*’ from ‘*partially met,*’ stating TFA met all four conditions.

Jonathan Hinderer, Managing Director of Leadership Development for Hawai’i Island at TFA Hawai’i, testified online via Zoom on NBI 24-27: *Teach For America Audit Findings Year 1*. He requested amending language for Condition 3 in the NBI by removing ‘*partially*’ from ‘*partially met,*’ stating TFA provided all requested information and all TFA teacher candidates completed their clinical experience in their recommended license field.

Lindsey Takenaka testified online via Zoom on NBI 24-27: *Teach For America Audit Findings Year 1*. She requested amending the language for Condition 2 in the NBI by removing ‘*partially*’ from ‘*partially met,*’ stating TFA requires all candidates turn in their Form 5s prior to being issued a license from the Hawai’i Teacher Standards Board (“HTSB”). She requested HTSB staff notify TFA staff of missing documents so they can follow-up with their candidates directly. She stated TFA sends all Form 5s in the annual audit and are willing to share them at an earlier time.

Dr. Piikea Kalakau-Baarde testified online via Zoom on NBI 24-27: *Teach For America Audit Findings Year 1*. She stated TFA fully complied with all four conditions, requesting the NBI be revised to reflect that the four conditions were met in full. She proposed two process improvements: [1] change the data submission due date from July 31st to October 1st to align with the Hawai’i Department of Education (“HIDOE”) reporting timelines; and [2] allow HTSB staff to share with TFA staff the names of candidates who have not uploaded their Form 5s to their HTSB accounts.

C. ANNOUNCEMENTS

Executive Director Felicia Villalobos announced that on-time written testimony for NBI 24-27 was already posted to the HTSB website and shared with the full board (“Board”).

D. APPROVAL OF COMMITTEE MINUTES

The minutes of the January 17, 2025, meeting was approved as written.

II. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON COMMITTEE AGENDA ITEMS

None

III. ACTION / DISCUSSION ITEMS

E. NBI 24-20 Revised: The University of Hawai'i at Hilo's Bachelor of Arts in Education Studies Elementary Education Program Review

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 24-20 Revised, which includes changes of wording indicated in red.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a motion to accept the changes made to NBI 24-20 Revised.

Committee Member Raymond moved to accept the changes. Committee Vice-Chairperson Gillentine seconded the motion.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 24-20 Revised, as written, to the Board at the General Business Meeting scheduled at 12:00 p.m. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. All other committee members present voted to recommend.

ACTION — The Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 24-20 Revised, as written, to the Board, with six of seven members present voting aye.

F. NBI 24-25: Granting Hawai'i State Approved Teacher Preparation Providers with Approved Science Programs the Option to Recommend in Grade Levels 6-8

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 24-25, which includes the Rationale/Background.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 24-25, as written, to the Board at the General Business Meeting scheduled at 12:00 p.m. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. All other committee members present voted to recommend.

ACTION — The Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 24-25, as written, to the Board, with six of seven members present voting aye.

G. NBI 24-26: Granting Hawai'i State Approved Teacher Preparation Providers with Approved Science Programs the Option to Recommend within the Science License Fields

UNAPPROVED

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 24-26, which includes the Rationale/Background.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked Executive Director Villalobos if '*Physical Science*' is a duplication of '*Physics*' as it is not on the list of licensure fields offered by HTSB.

Executive Director Villalobos answered that it is one of the Praxis exams the Board has already approved.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any questions or discussion.

Committee Member Raymond asked how this NBI may impact current teachers with a science license who may have to teach a different line. She asked if they would need to go back to add the specific science field.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles deferred to Executive Director Villalobos.

Executive Director Villalobos answered that this is for individuals who may have completed their bachelor's degree in a specific science field (e.g., Biology) and only want to teach in that specific field (e.g., Biology). She stated this would allow them to teach in that specific field; however, she would pass the matter of HQ (Hawai'i Qualified/Highly Qualified) on to Committee Member Bacon. She mentioned she would also defer that to the school administrator, who may want the teacher to have multiple lines and not just the specific field.

Committee Member Bacon stated the teachers would be HQ for all the lines in their specific field (e.g., Biology), but not necessarily HQ for lines in others (e.g., Chemistry). He mentioned there would need to be a plan for these teachers to become HQ in those lines.

Executive Director Villalobos clarified that this NBI would not impact current lines and is not grandfathering anyone in. She stated this is moving forward and for people who only want a specific science field so that they do not need to take the entire 6-12 Science test. She mentioned they can also add Science to their license later, which she believes would make them HQ for all science areas.

Committee Member Bacon asked if these teachers licensed in specific science fields (e.g., Biology) could later take the appropriate exam and add another specific field to their license (e.g., Chemistry).

Executive Director Villalobos answered yes, as the Board approved and adopted all the listed tests and sciences. She stated if the teachers pass the appropriate exam, they would be able to add that specific science field to their license.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any further questions or discussion. There were no further questions or discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 24-26, as written, to the Board at the General Business Meeting scheduled at 12:00 p.m. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. All other committee members present voted to recommend.

ACTION — The Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 24-26, as written, to the Board, with six of seven members present voting aye.

H. NBI 24-27: Teach For America Audit Findings Year 1

Committee Chairperson Ornelles introduced NBI 24-27, then requested the committee first take some time to review the on-time written testimony. She also acknowledged the oral testimony given earlier. She reviewed NBI 24-27, which includes the Rationale/Background. She also acknowledged requests for changes in the NBI as stated in the oral testimony.

Executive Director Villalobos explained that this committee can decide to change TFA's submission date in Condition 1 from July 31st to October 1st.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a motion to change the language in this timeline.

Committee Member Matsuura moved to change the submission date to October 1st. *Ex-officio* Committee Member Miyamae seconded the motion.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles clarified the language is to reflect that the submission of TFA's completer list would be on or before October 1st, giving them the ability to submit sooner if they are able to do so.

Committee Member Matsuura asked if this would impact HTSB in any way.

Executive Director Villalobos answered no, it just moves the timeline for the audit slightly further down the line. She stated this is still an okay timeline for staff, understanding that there is a delay with information provided by HIDEOE.

Committee Member Bacon wanted clarification that this does not prohibit TFA from submitting names early and are able to submit piecemeal as information becomes available.

Executive Director Villalobos answered yes, as long as it is submitted before October 1st.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any further questions or discussion on the amended language in Condition 1 as written in red. There were no further questions or discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on whether or not to approve the amended language in Condition 1. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. All other committee members present voted to approve.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any further questions or discussion on the remainder of the NBI.

Ex-officio Committee Member Miyamae asked if Executive Director Villalobos or one of the HTSB licensing specialists could provide any additional information for Conditions 2 and 3.

Executive Director Villalobos shared that HTSB staff did not know TFA was using the Helper Helper tool. She mentioned if available next year, the Helper Helper information would save staff time on research and calculations. She then asked if Licensing Specialist Dr. Jennifer Padua could provide additional information.

Specialist Padua shared that all HTSB licensing specialists worked on the audit, dividing the teacher candidates equally. For Condition 2, she stated HTSB staff gave a licensing presentation to the candidates outlining required documents and gave the PowerPoint to TFA. She suggested TFA refer to that PowerPoint or make sure all their candidates attend this presentation. For Condition 3, she shared that HTSB licensing specialists researched instructional blocks at candidates' schools to figure out their lines and questioned if candidates in multiple instructional lines are receiving support for all of them. She mentioned that while some completers did not get licensed, it is uncertain if they will get licensed someday and, according to their program recommendation, they are entitled to a license. She then invited other licensing specialists to share their thoughts.

Licensing Specialist Tracey Idica, NBCT, shared that she wanted to confirm what Specialist Padua had stated. She mentioned it was difficult to determine the clinical experience hours and such when going through the audit.

Committee Member Bacon wanted clarification on Condition 2 regarding the program completers who did not submit their Form 5s. He asked if the requirement is for them to still upload their Form 5s even though they are not trying to get licensed.

Executive Director Villalobos answered that an educator preparation program's ("EPP's") recommendation tells HTSB that the completer is ready for licensure at any time. She explained that the recommendation is in the completer's HTSB account years down the line, and they can decide at any time to get licensed, which means the required documents should be ready for application processing. She shared that the current issue is completers with EPP recommendations from 10+ years ago are now trying to apply for licensure, and there is a scramble to obtain records from the point when they were recommended.

Committee Member Bacon stated he feels that TFA is being penalized for their completers deciding not to apply for licensure.

Executive Director Villalobos stated if TFA knows that some of their completers are not going to apply for licensure, then recommendations should not come in for them. She explained that a recommendation indicates the completer is going to be licensed.

Committee Member Bacon asked if it is clear to the EPPs that they should not recommend completers if they are not going to apply for licensure.

Executive Director Villalobos answered she thinks it would be clear to the EPPs that the intent of the recommendation is [1] for HTSB to not need to double- or triple-check that the completer meets all the requirements, and [2] for the completer to be issued a license. She mentioned HTSB does not know what happens in the time from when an EPP recommends a completer for licensure to when the completer actually applies for licensure, so all required documents should be provided to go along with that recommendation.

Committee Member Raymond stated she thinks Condition 2 is still partially met because completers did not upload their Form 5s.

Ex-officio Committee Member Miyamae stated since this is the first year of the audit, there is now information to help improve results for the next year. She asked if there are any ramifications for only partially meeting conditions.

UNAPPROVED

Committee Chairperson Ornelles stated she had the same question.

Executive Director Villalobos answered no, since the conditions were partially met. She stated the next audit would move forward with these clarifications. She mentioned if conditions were not met entirely, then the Board would need to look at that.

Committee Member Bacon asked if the issue with Condition 3 is that the completer who did not send their Praxis score also did not apply for licensure.

Executive Director Villalobos answered yes, because the completer was recommended for licensure. She reiterated when EPPs recommend completers, HTSB licensing specialists look at all documentation and records that the completer is ready to be licensed at any point.

Committee Member Bacon stated he disagrees with the findings for Conditions 2 and 3, sharing that he feels TFA followed the requirements. He mentioned he does not feel that the EPP should be held responsible if one of their completers choose not to apply for a license. He suggested changing the language in the NBI to say that TFA did meet the conditions.

Ex-officio Committee Member Miyamae stated the conditions are just for the audit and to make sure everything is in place. She mentioned she thinks they are still only partially met, but now moving forward the requirements for EPP recommendations are clear and all information needs to be provided.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any further questions or discussion.

Committee Member Raymond, Committee Chairperson Ornelles, and Committee Vice-Chairperson Gillentine clarified what was being voted on next for the NBI (i.e., no changes to '*partially met*') and what was already voted on (i.e., approved amendment for the October 1st submission date).

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any further questions or discussion. There were no further questions or discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 24-27, as amended, to the Board at the General Business Meeting scheduled at 12:00 p.m. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. Committee Member Bacon voted to not recommend. All other committee members present voted to recommend.

ACTION — The Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 24-27, as amended, to the Board, with five of seven members present voting aye.

IV. ADJOURNMENT

Committee Chairperson Ornelles adjourned the Teacher Education Committee Meeting at 11:05 a.m.

UNAPPROVED

List of people who submitted written testimony before the committee meeting

| <i>ON-TIME TESTIMONY</i> | | |
|---------------------------------|--|---|
| NAME | ORGANIZATION | AGENDA ITEM |
| Jill Baldemor | Teach For America Hawai'i – Executive Director | III.H. NBI 24-27: Teach For America Audit Findings Year 1 |