

**HAWAI‘I TEACHER STANDARDS BOARD
GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING**

Friday, April 26, 2024

**Meeting Conducted by Remote Technology via Zoom
and
Physical Location at 650 Iwilei Road, Suite 158, Honolulu, HI 96817**

MINUTES

PRESENT:

Branden Kawazoe, *Board Chairperson*
Lokelani Han, *Board Vice-Chairperson*
Sean Bacon for Keith Hayashi
Kahele Dukelow for Warren Haruki
Dr. Jonathan Gillentine
Justin Mew
Kristi Miyamae
Dr. Cecily Ornelles for Dr. Nathan Murata
Dondra Ozaki
Dawn Raymond
Kim Sanders
Dr. Katina Soares

EXCUSED:

Dale Matsuura
U‘ilani Miguel, *Non-Voting Member*

NOT PRESENT:

Elena Farden for Keahi Makaimoku

STAFF:

Felicia Villalobos, Executive Director
Steven Harada, Licensing Specialist
Dr. Mitzie Higa, Licensing Specialist
Tracey Idica, NBCT, Licensing Specialist
Kris Murakami, Esq., Licensing Specialist
Dr. Jennifer Padua, Licensing Specialist

I. CALL TO ORDER

A. ROLL CALL TO ESTABLISH QUORUM

Board Chairperson Branden Kawazoe called the General Business Meeting to order at 12:34 p.m.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe shared information regarding procedures for virtual board meetings, then called roll call and established quorum. Board Chairperson Kawazoe and Board Member Kim Sanders were present. Board Vice-Chairperson Lokelani Han and Board Members Sean Bacon, Kahele Dukelow, Dr. Jonathan Gillentine, Justin Mew, Kristi Miyamae, Dr. Cecily Ornelles, Dondra Ozaki, Dawn Raymond, and Dr. Katina Soares participated remotely. Board Member Dale Matsuura and Non-Voting Board Member U'ilani Miguel were excused. Board Member Elena Farden was not present.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe shared information regarding non-public site disclosure. None of the board members participating remotely had anyone present with them. Board Chairperson Kawazoe then shared additional information regarding meeting protocols and procedures.

B. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING AGENDA ITEMS

None

C. ANNOUNCEMENTS

Board Chairperson Kawazoe congratulated newly confirmed board members Dale Matsuura and Dondra Ozaki. He also announced that this is his last board meeting and thanked everyone for this wonderful ride. He commented that the Hawai'i Teacher Standards Board ("HTSB") is headed in the right direction with the leadership, staff, and board members.

Executive Director Felicia Villalobos commented that Board Chairperson Kawazoe's work and dedication to the teaching profession, as well as his nine years of service as a board member, are very much appreciated.

D. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES

The minutes of the March 15, 2024, meeting was approved as written.

E. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Board Chairperson Kawazoe introduced Executive Director Villalobos to share her report.

Executive Director Villalobos stated she stands on her report and wanted to update the full board ("Board") on the SAEF (State Apprenticeship Expansion Formula)

grant. She explained that last year HTSB applied for the SAEF grant but did not receive it. She mentioned the states that did get it last year were pulled out of the pot, so the remaining states have a better chance of getting the grant this year. She stated HTSB worked in partnership again with the Department of Labor and Industrial Relations (“DLIR”) to apply for a \$4.9 million grant and they are hoping results will come out in June or July. She mentioned positions for data analysis and budget managing were added into the grant application, explaining that schools and other agencies attached to the Hawai‘i Department of Education (“DOE”) have budget managers, but HTSB does not. She stated since grants are not forever, HTSB is also looking at legislative bills to help prolong and fulfill the needs for a statewide registered teacher apprenticeship program.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

II. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING AGENDA ITEMS

None

F. LICENSING UPDATE – Licensing Specialist Tracey Idica, NBCT

Licensing Specialist Idica commented that Board Chairperson Kawazoe will be missed. She then stated the licensing specialists have been very busy going through and discussing revisions for Hawaii Administrative Rules. She also mentioned Licensing Specialist Steven Harada has taken the lead on reviewing the different license application options on HTSB’s licensing management system (“LMS”).

Licensing Specialist Idica stated the license renewal season is still ongoing and has been mostly smooth, but several international applicants from a few years ago are also coming back to try to renew, despite having never taught in Hawai‘i. She stated this is also submission season for National Board Certified Teachers (“NBCT”), and both initial and maintaining candidates have been working with INPEACE (Institute for Native Pacific Education and Culture) on the leeward coast of O‘ahu. She also mentioned Licensing Specialist Dr. Jennifer Padua has been working very hard trying to get HTSB’s educator preparation providers (“EPPs”) on the same page and understanding what needs to be done.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

III. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING AGENDA ITEMS

There was no public testimony.

Executive Director Villalobos quickly wanted to explain to the new board members the different acronyms they may hear that are being used:

- HRS = Hawaii Revised Statutes: Changed legislatively.

- HAR = Hawaii Administrative Rules: Changed internally but goes through a process in which the public sees the document, comments on it, and it goes to the Governor for signature.
- NBI = New Business Item: HTSB policy.

G. BOARD MEMBER REPORT ON EVENT(S) ATTENDED – David Donaldson’s Presentation at the Capitol

Board Member Ornelles stated she appreciated the coordination of the meeting and the opportunity to hear directly from David Donaldson about the possibility of what HTSB may be able to engage with in supporting its EPPs.

Board Member Gillentine agreed with Board Member Ornelles, stating it was helpful information and a good experience. He commented that it was also a delight to be in the same room as other HTSB board members, some of whom he had never seen before.

Board Member Bacon agreed with Board Member Ornelles and Board Member Gillentine. He stated it was great getting additional exposure to these possibilities of how HTSB and its EPPs can work together to support the profession and have more qualified applicants and teacher candidates. He mentioned it was also great to see some of the legislative support that HTSB received.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe thanked the board members for their feedback and for representing HTSB.

IV. NEW BUSINESS, COMMITTEE REPORTS, AND PENDING COMMITTEE ACTION

PENDING COMMITTEE ACTION – Budget, Personnel, and Strategic Planning Committee: Mew

The Budget, Personnel, and Strategic Planning Committee met at 9:00 a.m. and looked at six New Business Items. Board Member/Committee Chairperson Mew was excused from the meeting. Board Member/Committee Vice-Chairperson Gillentine led the meeting.

A. NBI 22-95 Revised: The Hawai‘i Teacher Standards Board Budget for 2023-2024

Board Member Gillentine stated the Budget, Personnel, and Strategic Planning Committee voted to recommend NBI 22-95 Revised, as written, to the Board. He reviewed NBI 22-95 Revised, highlighting that the changes provide additional information within budget category descriptions and are related to the coding of costs for payment processing. He mentioned there was a discussion point during the committee meeting regarding ‘*staff parking*’ in section five. He stated the committee would like to ask for input from the Department of the Attorney General (“AG”) on whether or not HTSB is allowed to use general funds to pay for staff parking.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion.

Board Member Bacon commented that he wants to support HTSB and its staff, but he wants to make sure the Board gets an appropriate opinion on whether or not staff parking is an appropriate use of funds. He stated he would vote no until there is additional clarification, though he does support the rest of the NBI.

Board Member Mew mentioned his position as school principal and how there are procurement rules related to Board Member Bacon's concern. He stated during the summer he, as the Budget Committee Chairperson, will find out more about HTSB's procurement rules, which may or may not be different from the DOE's, so he will probably work with Board Member Bacon a bit. He mentioned coding is part of the procurement rules, but he does not know exactly to what extent the Board can sign off. He stated he would be voting yes for this NBI, but if there are certain rules and policies outside of the Board's control, he would request training for staff so that the Board knows what those rules and policies are.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe explained that the committee's discussion was to run this matter by the AG. He stated the committee's vote resulted in recommending this NBI to the Board, but if it comes back from the AG that the Board is unable to pay for staff parking, then that budget revision would be made at the first board meeting of the new school year. He suggested that Board Member Mew work with the AG as well.

Board Vice-Chairperson Han asked if it would be better to take '*staff parking*' out of the budget now, then put it back in after hearing from the AG. She also asked if '*staff parking*' is left in and the AG allows it, would it not also benefit the DOE, who is also trying to get staff parking covered. She mentioned she is trying to look at the NBI so that all the board members could feel good about putting it through, as she knows staff parking is the one thing not sitting well with some members.

Board Member Gillentine mentioned Executive Director Villalobos had explained that eliminating staff parking would be a pay cut for staff and it may put them in unsafe situations due to the office's location and limited off-site parking. He stated HTSB's situation is different from the DOE's, as HTSB is administratively attached and is an outlier in terms of state agencies.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe stated he thinks the rationale behind leaving '*staff parking*' in the budget is that if the Board finds out it is approved, then the Board can start covering for it right away; whereas if '*staff parking*' is taken out of the budget and the Board finds out it is approved, then the Board would need to wait until the next board meeting to add it back in. He mentioned the next board meeting is four months away in August, and this matter depends on how quick the Board can get an answer from the AG. He commented he believes the Board could keep the status quo until then, as staff is paying for parking anyway.

Board Member Gillentine mentioned the '*any other expenses as deemed appropriate by the Board Chairperson and Executive Director*' item may also have an impact on decisions.

Board Member Bacon proposed an amendment to remove '*staff parking*' from section five. He stated section five allows '*any other expenses as deemed appropriate by the Board Chairperson and Executive Director.*' He asked if the Board finds out that staff parking is an allowable expense, could the '*any other expenses...*' clause be used to authorize it.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a motion to amend section five by removing '*staff parking.*'

Board Vice-Chairperson Han made a motion to amend section five by removing '*staff parking.*' Board Member Bacon seconded the motion.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion about the amendment.

Board Member Gillentine asked if this amendment would allow staff parking to be covered until the Board hears otherwise.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called on Executive Director Villalobos to answer that question.

Executive Director Villalobos mentioned staff has been having trouble getting payments processed through Vendor Payment ("VP"). She explained that every payment that is not explicitly written in the budget is being questioned by VP, and they consider not approving those payments. She stated the red revisions in the NBI are to cover every possible payment, otherwise there are hold-ups in processing (e.g., justification forms, potential rejection if done incorrectly), which means holding up suppliers, who ask about when they will get paid and may then no longer want to do business with HTSB. She suggested leaving '*staff parking*' in the budget because if it is not there, VP could say it is not explicitly written and she is unsure if the '*any other expenses...*' language would be accepted. She mentioned she has been asking VP and Labor Relations for concrete evidence (e.g., HRS), but she is unable to get a straight answer. She explained that she sat on the Board when '*staff parking*' was passed in about 2017, so she wants to provide to the Board concrete evidence that staff parking cannot be covered. She also explained that HRS does say the Board can set and administer its own budget. She mentioned if '*staff parking*' is allowed, but it is removed from the budget and the '*any other expenses...*' language is rejected, she would need to create an NBI, and the Board would need to have either an extra board meeting during the summer or wait until the August board meeting.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe mentioned Licensing Specialist Idica also ran into some barriers for the NBCT event at Washington Place. He called on her to explain what had happened, commenting that he also thinks this is why the budget needs to be detailed.

Licensing Specialist Idica stated before HTSB welcomed its new secretary, Board Member Bacon's secretary helped her in the meantime with final purchase orders for the catered meal and flower arrangements for the NBCT celebration event at Washington Place [in February]. She explained that VP would not process payment for the flowers due to the way they were invoiced (i.e., 'bouquets' versus 'centerpieces'), so she had to write a justification letter explaining that the florist would not make centerpieces due to Valentine's Day but recommended getting ready-made bouquets to place in vases. She also explained that the payment for the catered meal was rejected, so she had to submit a justification form. She mentioned there were suppliers that barely got paid for the event and it was a very challenging journey.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any further questions or discussion.

Board Member Raymond wanted clarification on whether or not the first vote for this NBI was for the amendment to remove '*staff parking*.'

Board Chairperson Kawazoe answered yes, that voting 'aye' on the amendment would be to remove '*staff parking*' and voting 'nay' would be to keep '*staff parking*.'

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any further questions or discussion. There were no further questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion to approve the amendment to remove '*staff parking*.' Board Chairperson Kawazoe did not vote. Board Member Bacon voted to approve the amendment. All other board members present voted to not approve the amendment.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe announced that the motion was not adopted, and the Board would proceed with NBI 22-95 Revised, as written.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 22-95 Revised, as written. Board Chairperson Kawazoe did not vote. Board Member Bacon voted to deny NBI 22-95 Revised, as written. All other board members present voted to approve NBI 22-95 Revised, as written.

ACTION: NBI 22-95 Revised: The Hawai'i Teacher Standards Board Budget for 2023-2024, was adopted by the Board. 11 of 12 members present voted. 10 members voted aye, and one member voted nay.

B. NBI 23-42: The Hawai'i Teacher Standards Board Budget for 2024-2025

Board Chairperson Kawazoe briefly informed that NBI 23-42 was essentially copied and pasted from NBI 22-95 Revised.

Board Member Gillentine stated the Budget, Personnel, and Strategic Planning Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-42, as written, to the Board. He reviewed NBI 23-42, agreeing with Board Chairperson Kawazoe and highlighting that the additional position numbers for new staff are included. He iterated that the Board would wait to hear from the AG regarding staff parking, or from Board Member Mew in case he has any luck with procurement rules.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion.

Board Member Bacon stated he supports HTSB and its staff, but he would vote no until there is a clear answer on whether or not staff parking is an allowable expense.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any further questions or discussion. There were no further questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 23-42, as written. Board Chairperson Kawazoe did not vote. Board Member Bacon voted to deny NBI 23-42, as written. All other board members present voted to approve NBI 23-42, as written.

ACTION: NBI 23-42: The Hawai'i Teacher Standards Board Budget for 2024-2025, was adopted by the Board. 11 of 12 members present voted. 10 members voted aye, and one member voted nay.

C. NBI 23-43: The Hawai'i Teacher Standards Board Election of Board Officers and Committee Assignments for 2024-2025

Board Member Gillentine stated the Budget, Personnel, and Strategic Planning Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-43, as written, to the Board. He briefly reviewed NBI 23-43.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe thanked board members in advance for their service in the new school year and wished incoming Board Chairperson Miyamae good luck.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 23-43, as written. Board Chairperson Kawazoe did not vote.

The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 23-43, as written.

ACTION: NBI 23-43: The Hawai'i Teacher Standards Board Election of Board Officers and Committee Assignments for 2024-2025, was adopted by the Board.

D. NBI 23-44: The Hawai'i Teacher Standards Board Meeting Schedule for 2024-2025

Board Member Gillentine stated the Budget, Personnel, and Strategic Planning Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-44, as written, to the Board. He briefly reviewed NBI 23-44.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe mentioned if anything comes up and the Board needs to have an emergency meeting, then incoming Board Chairperson Miyamae or Executive Director Villalobos will reach out to board members.

Board Member Raymond informed she would be unable to attend the September board meeting in the new school year, but she is okay with approving the NBI.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe stated as the meeting information comes out, board members should inform incoming Board Chairperson Miyamae and Executive Director Villalobos if they cannot attend so that quorum is maintained.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 23-44, as written. Board Chairperson Kawazoe did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 23-44, as written.

ACTION: NBI 23-44: The Hawai'i Teacher Standards Board Meeting Schedule for 2024-2025, was adopted by the Board.

E. NBI 23-45: The Hawai'i Teacher Standards Board Executive Director's Evaluation Recommendation for 2023-2024

Board Member Gillentine stated the Budget, Personnel, and Strategic Planning Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-45, as amended, to the Board. He reviewed the amendment made during committee, which was to change the evaluation rating from '*acceptable*' to '*commendable*.'

Board Chairperson Kawazoe clarified that the more detailed scale for the *commendable*, *acceptable*, and *marginal* ratings would come from Board Member Mew at a later board meeting.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion.

Board Member Mew commented that he was glad the evaluation rating was being changed from ‘*acceptable*’ to ‘*commendable*’ as the result was overwhelming. He shared that the average *commendable* rating was 91.7% while the average *acceptable* rating was 8.3%. He mentioned 100% could not be expected and that would not be good for anyone, but 90% and above would traditionally equate to an ‘A’ in school. He stated he is very much in support of the committee’s amendment.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any further questions or discussion. There were no further questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 23-45, as amended. Board Chairperson Kawazoe did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 23-45, as amended.

ACTION: NBI 23-45: The Hawai‘i Teacher Standards Board Executive Director’s Evaluation Recommendation for 2023-2024, was adopted by the Board, as amended.

F. NBI 23-46: Adoption of the Permitted Interaction Group’s Revised Annual Evaluation Tool Used to Evaluate HTSB’s Executive Director

Board Member Gillentine stated the Budget, Personnel, and Strategic Planning Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-46, as amended, to the Board. He reviewed the amendments made during committee, which were to: [1] add a fourth rating option of ‘*abstain*’ for new board members and staff coming in who may not have enough information to appropriately evaluate the Executive Director; and [2] change the bullet points within each standard to numerals (e.g., Standard 1.1, Standard 1.2) for an easier and more detailed evaluation.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe clarified that the rationale behind the second amendment was to make the sub-standards more specific because currently it is too broad; therefore, it is challenging for staff to evaluate the Executive Director and even for Executive Director Villalobos to evaluate herself. He stated he would work on these changes and get them ready for the new school year.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 23-46, as amended. Board Chairperson Kawazoe did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 23-46, as amended.

ACTION: NBI 23-46: Adoption of the Permitted Interaction Group’s Revised Annual Evaluation Tool Used to Evaluate HTSB’s Executive Director, was adopted by the Board, as amended.

COMMITTEE REPORT – Legislative Committee: Miyamae

The Legislative Committee met at 10:30 a.m. They had two updates.

G. 2024 Ad Hoc Committee Legislative Update

Board Member Miyamae stated there are two updates and asked Board Chairperson Kawazoe if Licensing Specialist Dr. Mitzie Higa could speak on the legislative bills.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called on Licensing Specialist Higa.

Licensing Specialist Higa commended the Permitted Interaction Group (“P.I.G.”) as they were very responsive, informing her if any revisions made to bills were in line with the Board’s priorities. She referred to the updated legislative bill tracker and informed of updates:

- SB2257, about CTE (Career and Technical Education): Voted in favor out of conference committee. Will go to the floor of both the House and the Senate.
- HB2074, about Kaiapuni educators: Still alive and has a conference committee.
- SB2475, about the ‘harm to students’ registry: Going to conference committee.
- HB1534, about Registered Teacher Apprenticeship: Was not heard in the Senate. HTSB will need to try again next session but will continue to fight for it in different ways and in different funding.
- HB2400, about teachers resigning or retiring before their investigations are completed: Went to the Governor for signature.
 - The AG recommended these teachers ‘forfeit’ their licenses.
 - HTSB staff checked the NASDTEC (National Association of State Directors of Teacher Education and Certification) Clearinghouse, finding that ‘*other*’ can be selected and ‘*forfeited license in pendency of an investigation*’ or ‘*forfeited license before an investigation was finished*’ can be written in for entries.

Licensing Specialist Higa mentioned SB2475 is somewhat tied to HB2400, so HTSB still needs to see how that goes.

Board Member Miyamae thanked Licensing Specialist Higa, Executive Director Villalobos, and the P.I.G. members for their time and effort. She then mentioned the P.I.G.’s completion, stating the next P.I.G. coming in would look over the Board’s priorities for the next legislative session.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe thanked the committee and P.I.G., Licensing Specialist Higa, and Executive Director Villalobos for their hard work.

ACTION: None. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

PENDING COMMITTEE ACTION – Teacher Standards Committee: Sanders

The Teacher Standards Committee met at 11:00 a.m. and looked at two New Business Items.

H. NBI 23-41: License Affirmation (February and March 2024)

Board Member Sanders stated the Teacher Standards Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-41, as written, to the Board. She briefly reviewed NBI 23-41, affirming the licenses and permits for the respective months.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 23-41, as written. Board Chairperson Kawazoe did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 23-41, as written.

ACTION: NBI 23-41: License Affirmation (February and March 2024), was adopted by the Board.

I. NBI 22-78 Revised: Formation of the Early Childhood Education Teacher Licensing Workgroup

Board Member Sanders stated the Teacher Standards Committee voted to recommend NBI 22-78 Revised, as written, to the Board. She reviewed NBI 22-78 Revised, which includes the Rationale/Background. She highlighted the addition of the 2024-2025 school year so that the workgroup could finalize its work, as well as the possibility of having in-person meetings.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 22-78 Revised, as written. Board Chairperson Kawazoe did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 22-78 Revised, as written.

ACTION: NBI 22-78 Revised: Formation of the Early Childhood Education Teacher Licensing Workgroup, was adopted by the Board.

PENDING COMMITTEE ACTION – Teacher Education Committee: Ornelles

The Teacher Education Committee met at 11:30 a.m. and looked at four New Business Items.

J. NBI 23-33 Revised: Teacher Candidates Clinical Experience Criteria for Initial Licensure in Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages

Board Member Ornelles stated the Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-33 Revised, as written, to the Board. She reviewed NBI 23-33 Revised, which includes the Rationale/Background, and highlighted the revisions made in red. She mentioned there was a discussion point during the committee meeting regarding the second revision, which is to encourage EPPs to identify potential and appropriate placements ahead of time for the licensure areas that they are approved to recommend in, including TESOL (Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages), as this will ensure smooth progression for their teacher candidates.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 23-33 Revised, as written. Board Chairperson Kawazoe did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 23-33 Revised, as written.

ACTION: NBI 23-33 Revised: Teacher Candidates Clinical Experience Criteria for Initial Licensure in Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages, was adopted by the Board.

K. NBI 23-47: Adoption of Replacement Praxis Licensure Exam for Special Education: Severe to Profound

Board Member Ornelles stated the Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-47, as written, to the Board. She reviewed NBI 23-47, which includes the Rationale/Background.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 23-47, as written. Board Chairperson Kawazoe did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 23-47, as written.

ACTION: NBI 23-47: Adoption of Replacement Praxis Licensure Exam for Special Education: Severe to Profound, was adopted by the Board.

L. NBI 23-48: Approval of Modifications to the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's Bachelor of Education in Blended Early Childhood Education and Early Childhood Special Education PK-3 Dual Licensure Program

Board Member Ornelles stated the Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-48, as written, to the Board. She reviewed NBI 23-48, which

includes the Rationale/Background. She mentioned Dr. Leah Muccio, early childhood education associate professor in the Institute for Teacher Education at University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's College of Education, provided a summary for the modifications of this program.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 23-48, as written. Board Chairperson Kawazoe did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 23-48, as written.

ACTION: NBI 23-48: Approval of Modifications to the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's Bachelor of Education in Blended Early Childhood Education and Early Childhood Special Education PK-3 Dual Licensure Program, was adopted by the Board.

M. NBI 23-49: Results and Recommendations from HTSB's 2023 Annual Educator Preparation Provider Completer Audit

Board Member Ornelles stated the Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-49, as amended, to the Board. She reviewed NBI 23-49, as amended, which includes the audit process, results, and recommendations. She also reviewed the amendments made during committee, which were: [1] for recommendation five, clarifying whether teacher candidates placed at the sixth-grade level are being recommended for the elementary (K-6) level or the secondary (6-12) level with a content area; and [2] for recommendation six, aligning the cooperating teacher's HTSB licensure field and the licensure field that the teacher candidate is pursuing.

Board Member Ornelles mentioned there was clarification during committee regarding the number of student teaching hours required to have two grade-level bands on a license. She stated future discussion will need to be had to ensure enough student teaching hours are completed so that teacher candidates are fully prepared. She also mentioned there was clarification regarding whether or not EPPs are consulted about audit recommendations to ensure they would not pose as barriers. She stated EPPs are consulted with before the recommendations become requirements or NBI policies. She also mentioned there was clarification about the audit recommendations themselves. She stated they are only recommendations, though they may contribute to future NBIs.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 23-49, as amended. Board Chairperson Kawazoe did not vote.

The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 23-49, as amended.

ACTION: NBI 23-49: Results and Recommendations from HTSB's 2023 Annual Educator Preparation Provider Completer Audit, was adopted by the Board, as amended.

V. EXECUTIVE SESSION

Board Chairperson Kawazoe shared information regarding procedures for virtual Executive Session.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a motion to move into Executive Session.

Board Member Mew made a motion to move into Executive Session. Board Member Gillentine seconded the motion.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether or not to move into Executive Session. Board Chairperson Kawazoe did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to move into Executive Session at 1:47 p.m.

This portion of the meeting is a closed meeting under HRS §92-4 and HRS §92-5(a)(1)(2) and (4).

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called the meeting back to order at 2:35 p.m.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe reported out what was discussed during Executive Session:

- Meeting minutes from March 15, 2024
- Personnel update from Executive Director Villalobos
- Consultation with Deputy Attorney General Michael Azuma
- NBI 23-50 – Case No. 23-15: Adopted
- NBI 23-51 – Case No. 23-16: Adopted

VI. NEXT HTSB MEETING: August 30, 2024

Board Chairperson Kawazoe stated the next HTSB Board Meeting was scheduled for August 30, 2024. The details of the agenda would come out prior to the meeting.

VII. ADJOURNMENT

Board Chairperson Kawazoe adjourned the General Business Meeting at 2:36 p.m.