

**HAWAI‘I TEACHER STANDARDS BOARD
TEACHER EDUCATION COMMITTEE MEETING**

Friday, April 26, 2024

**Meeting Conducted by Remote Technology via Zoom
and
Physical Location at 650 Iwilei Road, Suite 158, Honolulu, HI 96817**

MINUTES

PRESENT:

Dr. Cecily Ornelles for Dr. Nathan Murata, *Committee Chairperson*
Sean Bacon for Keith Hayashi, *Committee Vice-Chairperson*
Kahele Dukelow for Warren Haruki
Dr. Jonathan Gillentine
Dondra Ozaki
Dawn Raymond
Branden Kawazoe, *Ex-officio*
Lokelani Han, *Ex-officio*

EXCUSED:

Dale Matsuura
U‘ilani Miguel, *Non-Voting Member*

STAFF:

Felicia Villalobos, Executive Director
Steven Harada, Licensing Specialist
Dr. Mitzie Higa, Licensing Specialist
Tracey Idica, NBCT, Licensing Specialist
Kris Murakami, Esq., Licensing Specialist
Dr. Jennifer Padua, Licensing Specialist

I. CALL TO ORDER

A. ROLL CALL TO ESTABLISH QUORUM

Committee Chairperson Dr. Cecily Ornelles called the Teacher Education Committee Meeting to order at 11:30 a.m.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles shared information regarding procedures for virtual committee meetings, then called roll call and established quorum. *Ex-officio* Committee Member Branden Kawazoe was present. Committee Chairperson Ornelles; Committee Vice-Chairperson Sean Bacon; and Committee Members

Kahele Dukelow, Dr. Jonathan Gillentine, Dondra Ozaki, and Dawn Raymond participated remotely. Committee Member Dale Matsuura and Non-Voting Committee Member U'ilani Miguel were excused. *Ex-officio* Committee Member Lokelani Han was not present at roll call.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles shared information regarding non-public site disclosure. None of the committee members participating remotely had anyone present with them. Committee Chairperson Ornelles then shared additional information regarding meeting protocols and procedures.

B. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON COMMITTEE AGENDA ITEMS

None

C. ANNOUNCEMENTS

None

Ex-officio Committee Member Han entered remotely.

D. APPROVAL OF COMMITTEE MINUTES

The minutes of the March 15, 2024, meeting was approved as written.

II. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON COMMITTEE AGENDA ITEMS

None

III. ACTION / DISCUSSION ITEMS

E. NBI 23-33 Revised: Teacher Candidates Clinical Experience Criteria for Initial Licensure in Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 23-33 Revised, which includes the Rationale/Background, and highlighted the revisions made in red.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 23-33 Revised, as written, to the full board ("Board") at the General Business Meeting scheduled later at 12:30 p.m.

Ex-officio Committee Member Han stated she was trying to raise her hand in Zoom to ask a question. She wanted clarification regarding whether or not the process of TESOL (Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages) student teaching

placement is different from any other subject line. She asked if this New Business Item (“NBI”) is trying to ensure that TESOL placements are in TESOL.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles explained that when an educator preparation provider (“EPP”) is approved by Hawai‘i Teacher Standards Board (“HTSB”) to prepare individuals in a particular area, the EPP should know its placements ahead of time. She stated the effort in this NBI is so that EPPs have already investigated and coordinated ahead of time to determine that there are placements possible for their teacher candidates. She commented that EPPs do not want to wait until their teacher candidates get to their student teaching semester, and then start looking for placement. She explained if a request letter needs to come to HTSB for approval, it would delay the process for that teacher candidate, and they may be unable to progress smoothly through their program.

As there was further discussion during the roll call vote, *Ex-officio* Committee Member Kawazoe recommended to Committee Chairperson Ornelles that she do a re-vote.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any further questions or discussion. There were no further questions or discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for another roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 23-33 Revised, as written, to the Board at the General Business Meeting scheduled later at 12:30 p.m. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. All other committee members present voted to recommend.

ACTION: The Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-33 Revised, as written, to the Board, with seven of eight members present voting aye.

F. NBI 23-47: Adoption of Replacement Praxis Licensure Exam for Special Education: Severe to Profound

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 23-47, which includes the Rationale/Background.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 23-47, as written, to the Board at the General Business Meeting scheduled later at 12:30 p.m. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. All other committee members present voted to recommend.

ACTION: The Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-47, as written, to the Board, with seven of eight members present voting aye.

G. NBI 23-48: Approval of Modifications to the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's Bachelor of Education in Blended Early Childhood Education and Early Childhood Special Education PK-3 Dual Licensure Program

Committee Chairperson Ornelles mentioned that representatives from the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's ("UH Mānoa's") College of Education were in attendance. She reviewed NBI 23-48, which includes the Rationale/Background. She then yielded to UH Mānoa faculty to provide a summary.

Dr. Leah Muccio, early childhood education associate professor in the Institute for Teacher Education at UH Mānoa's College of Education, acknowledged her colleagues also in attendance: Dr. Christopher Au, Dr. Rhonda Black, Dr. Lori Fulton, Professor Michael Sheehey, and Dr. Jon Yoshioka. She explained that the requested modification will permit blended teacher candidates to complete all content knowledge requirements in the fields of early childhood and early childhood special education before student teaching, while continuing teacher preparation. She then summarized the shift in course content and stated the proposed changes would be implemented for the incoming 24-26 and subsequent cohorts.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 23-48, as written, to the Board at the General Business Meeting scheduled later at 12:30 p.m. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. All other committee members present voted to recommend.

ACTION: The Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-48, as written, to the Board, with seven of eight members present voting aye.

H. NBI 23-49: Results and Recommendations from HTSB's 2023 Annual Educator Preparation Provider Completer Audit

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 23-49, which includes the audit process, results, and recommendations.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles proposed an amendment for recommendation five, commenting that it is not so much about preventing student teaching placement at the sixth-grade level, but clarifying whether these teacher candidates placed for student teaching at the sixth-grade level are being recommended for the elementary (K-6) level or the secondary (6-12) level with a content area.

Executive Director Felicia Villalobos asked Committee Chairperson Ornelles if she could add more context for the new board members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called on Executive Director Villalobos.

Executive Director Villalobos explained that HTSB has two grade-level bands for licenses, K-6 and 6-12, which overlap each other. She commented that what some EPPs have been doing is placing their teacher candidates in sixth grade classrooms then recommending them for both K-6 and 6-12, from which they got K-12 licenses when they only did the 450 hours of clinical experience. She stated to ensure individuals who have K-12 licenses are prepared to teach both kindergarten students and high school seniors, HTSB wants those individuals to have both K-6 and 6-12 student teaching placements. She mentioned she believes the Hawaiian language immersion teacher candidates do 1,000 hours of student teaching before they are recommended for K-12, so those EPPs are doing both K-6 and 6-12 placements to ensure preparation quality. She stated the overlapping sixth grade in both grade-level bands is a loophole, so EPPs need to choose whether they are recommending their teacher candidates for elementary only or secondary with a content area only. She iterated if they choose K-12, those teacher candidates need to have two student teaching placements.

Ex-officio Committee Member Han wanted clarification regarding the two student teaching placements for the K-12 recommendation and the 450 hours of clinical experience.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles stated the current requirement for clinical experience is 450 hours. She mentioned she believes the Board will have future discussion regarding an appropriate split for dual programming. She also mentioned HTSB has EPPs that are approved to recommend in K-12, as well as dual licensure in specific areas (e.g., elementary education and special education). She clarified that recommendation five is ensuring that the sixth-grade level does not get broadly used to represent K-12. She explained that individuals with a sixth-grade student teaching placement in a K-6 environment needs to fulfill their coursework at the elementary level, and the EPP's recommendation would be for elementary. She also explained that middle schools extending into sixth grade fall in the secondary level, so individuals with a sixth-grade student teaching placement in a 6-12 environment also need to fulfill their content requirement (i.e., science, mathematics), and the EPP's recommendation would be for secondary with a specific content area. She then asked Executive Director Villalobos if she had any additional information.

Executive Director Villalobos answered no and encouraged committee members to ask any clarifying questions they may have.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any questions or discussion about recommendation five. There were no questions or discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles proposed an amendment for recommendation six regarding alignment of the cooperating teacher's HTSB licensure field and the licensure field that the teacher candidate is pursuing. She explained that if the cooperating teacher has their HTSB licensure in secondary science, but the teacher

candidate is pursuing secondary mathematics, then there is no alignment. She stated the idea of this NBI is that the cooperating teacher who is mentoring the teacher candidate should be able to provide relevant and important feedback in the specific licensure field being pursued.

Committee Member Raymond commented on recommendation five, sharing from personal experience that she does see a big difference between the elementary sixth grade level and the secondary sixth grade level. She agreed with the proposed amendment for recommendation five.

Committee Vice-Chairperson Bacon asked if HTSB has received any feedback from EPPs about how recommendation six may affect finding student teaching placements for their teacher candidates. He stated he wants to make sure this recommendation will not create barriers or negatively impact the EPPs.

Executive Director Villalobos answered there has been no feedback regarding sixth-grade placement. She clarified that the recommendations come from HTSB staff based on what they saw in the audit concerning quality preparation and fully trained educators. She stated the Board may turn the recommendations into NBI policies and determine what regulations it wants to put in place. She mentioned staff can gather more data from the EPPs.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles commented that she appreciates Committee Vice-Chairperson Bacon's question as it clarified that these are only recommendations at this point in time. She mentioned she knows that HTSB staff has consulted with EPPs prior to moving forward with NBIs, so these recommendations are areas that need to be further explored and their implications discussed with all involved.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any questions or discussion about recommendation six. There were no questions or discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any questions or discussion about the remaining recommendations.

Executive Director Villalobos wanted to address *Ex-officio* Committee Member Han's question regarding clinical experience hours. She explained that staff found there were teacher candidates being recommended for K-12, but the majority of their 450 hours may have been done in one grade-level band while the remaining minority amount was done in the other. She mentioned this is possible with the way HTSB policy is written right now as there is currently no balance requirement. She explained staff is looking at licensure fields such as TESOL, counseling, and P.E., which are usually K-12. She stated staff recommends that the HTSB committees and Board discuss and re-look at the hours.

Committee Member Gillentine made a motion to approve the two amendments as proposed by Committee Chairperson Ornelles.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles first called on *Ex-officio* Committee Member Kawazoe.

Ex-officio Committee Member Kawazoe added on to Executive Director Villalobos's statements, commenting that he thinks the Board may want to re-look at the student teaching requirements to make them clearer. He mentioned his counseling background and stated it is completely different counseling elementary students and high school students. He iterated the training and field work is imperative if a teacher candidate is going to be in K-12 as there needs to be a balance of the hours spent in both elementary and secondary levels. He mentioned it may be good to look at K-6 and 6-12 counseling licenses in the future.

Ex-officio Committee Member Kawazoe seconded Committee Member Gillentine's motion to approve the two amendments as proposed by Committee Chairperson Ornelles.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any further questions or discussion. There were no further questions or discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on the motion to approve the two amendments for NBI 23-49. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. All other committee members present voted to approve the two amendments for NBI 23-49.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any further questions or discussion. There were no further questions or discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 23-49, as amended, to the Board at the General Business Meeting scheduled later at 12:30 p.m. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. All other committee members present voted to recommend.

ACTION: The Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-49, as amended, to the Board, with seven of eight members present voting aye.

IV. ADJOURNMENT

Committee Chairperson Ornelles adjourned the Teacher Education Committee Meeting at 12:19 p.m.