

**HAWAII TEACHER STANDARDS BOARD  
GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING**

**Tuesday, April 28, 2023**

**Meeting Conducted by Remote Technology via Zoom  
and  
Physical Location at 650 Iwilei Road, Suite 268, Honolulu, HI 96817**

**MINUTES**

**PRESENT:**

Sean Bacon for Keith Hayashi  
Elena Farden for Keahi Makaimoku  
Lokelani Han  
Branden Kawazoe  
Justin Mew  
Kristi Miyamae

Lauren Moriarty for Bruce Voss  
Dr. Cecily Ornelles for Dr. Nathan Murata  
Dawn Raymond  
Kim Sanders  
Dr. Katina Soares

**EXCUSED:**

Dr. Jonathan Gillentine

**STAFF:**

Felicia Villalobos, Executive Director  
Tracey Idica, Licensing Specialist  
Kris Murakami, Licensing Specialist

Jennifer Padua, Licensing Specialist  
Raymond Rodriguez, Licensing Specialist  
Elaine Hutchinson, Secretary

**CALL TO ORDER:**

Chairperson Kawazoe called the meeting to order at 12:31 p.m.

**OPENING REMARKS:**

Chairperson Kawazoe shared information regarding procedures for virtual board meetings:

- The following board members, in addition to the Chairperson, are participating in today's virtual board meeting and have established audio and video connection.
- Board members shall be visible and audible to other members and the public during meetings.
- This board meeting will be recorded and all Committee and meeting minutes will be posted on HTSB's website.

**ROLL CALL TO ESTABLISH QUORUM:**

Chairperson Kawazoe called the roll and established quorum.  
Eleven (11) Board Members were present, one was excused.

**DISCLOSURE FROM BOARD MEMBERS AT PRIVATE LOCATIONS:**

Chairperson Kawazoe shared information regarding private location disclosure.

- Board members shall be considered present at the meeting for the purpose of determining compliance with the quorum and voting requirements of the board.
- Board members who are not participating at the Board’s public location must announce who is at the remote location with them. Minors do not need to be identified unless they have a personal business, property, or financial interest in an issue.

Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they have anyone present with them at their non-public site that they need to disclose.

- Board Member Farden did not have anything to disclose but wanted to announce that her “Otter.ai” (AI Notetaker) is ‘on’ so that it can be removed from the meeting.
  - Chairperson Kawazoe stated that staff will do that [remove it from the meeting].
- No other hands were raised and no disclosures were made.

**BOARD MEETING PROTOCOL INFORMATION:**

Chairperson Kawazoe shared information regarding board meeting protocols.

- As a reminder, all board members wishing to speak should raise their hand and the Chairperson will be notified to call on the person. The speaker must state their name prior to making their remarks.
- Votes will be conducted by roll call so that it is clear how each board member voted.
- Members of the public who have signed up to testify or would like to testify online must be logged into Zoom using the same name they used to sign up for testimony. Please use the Chat Box to provide your name and the agenda item that you are testifying on.
- Testifiers today will have two (2) minutes to testify.
- Anyone who missed the opportunity to testify before the relevant agenda item will be allowed to testify at specified portions of the meeting.
- Testifying online can be challenging due to technical issues. The Chat Box is being monitored by HTSB staff, and the Chairperson will be notified that you would like to testify. You will be called on to give your testimony at the appropriate times in the agenda.
- Written testimony received more than forty-nine (49) hours in advance of the meeting has been uploaded to the HTSB website and given to board members to review.
- A meeting held by interactive conference technology shall be recessed for up to thirty (30) minutes when audio communication cannot be maintained with a quorum of members, provided that the meeting may reconvene when only audio communication is reestablished.

**PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING AGENDA ITEM(S):** None

**ANNOUNCEMENTS:** None

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES:**

- The minutes from the February 10, 2023, meeting were deferred at the March 24, 2023 board meeting.
  - Executive Director Villalobos stated that she listened to and transcribed the audio of the meeting.
    - The discrepancy was on Page 12 of the draft minutes and was crossed out.
    - It was replaced with what is on Page 13, which is a word-for-word transcription of what occurred, with the edits and the changes.
    - Also included is a picture showing the edits that were made and the votes that were taken at that time.
    - She is available for questions.
  - Board Member Moriarty stated that her points are on Page 15 and 16 of the draft minutes—the final sentences regarding NBIs 22-70, 71 and 72.
    - Her concern is that the minutes should reflect more completely and accurately, the action that the board took.
    - Currently, the draft minutes do not say how the board adopted the NBI, whether it was by consensus or by a vote.
    - She believes that the minutes need to be amended to indicate how the board moved to adopt or failed to adopt a measure—by consensus or by a vote—and capture the action that the board took.
  - Chairperson Kawazoe asked Board Member Moriarty if this language that should be added: “The board voted and adopted NBI 22-70 as written.”
  - Board Member Moriarty agreed that would be sufficient for all three of the NBIs. [NBI 22-70, 71, 72]
  - The draft minutes were amended to include this language.
  - The minutes from the February 10, 2023, meeting were approved as amended.
- The minutes from the March 24, 2023, meeting were approved as written.

**EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR’S REPORT:**

Executive Director Villalobos submitted and stands on her report to the board as written.

- Update on Oregon Professional Educator Fair (OPEF) which she attended on April 11, 2023 with Licensing Specialist Padua.
  - This was the first time HTSB joined OTM on their recruitment effort.
    - HTSB and OTM had adjacent booths at the OPEF.
  - HTSB reached out to Oregon schools with teacher education programs, letting them know that HTSB and Hawaii DOE were going to be there.

- She estimates that 95% that came to our booth were originally from Hawaii, #ComeBackHome. We talked about the way they can use reciprocity to get a Hawaii license once they have their full license in either Oregon or Washington state. We provided information on the application process and let them know that there are no license fees in Hawaii.
- We directed people to the HIDOE booth next door to talk about employment opportunities, incentives and differentials.
- It was great and she recommends that our staff attend this recruitment fair again.
- Licensing Specialist Padua went to college in Oregon. She spoke about her networking efforts prior to, during, and after the OPEF.
  - She met with Oregon college recruiters who were here on Oahu visiting high schools and gave them information about HTSB's upcoming attendance at OPEF.
  - She contacted Deans of Education at Oregon schools, networked at other booths at the fair, and sent follow up emails after she returned.
  - She thanked Board Member Bacon for having the OTM staff attend the OPEF.
- Board Member Bacon extended his appreciation for working so closely with his office and staff.
  - He thinks it's a great thing to have the partnership for both the HTSB and DOE, going out on some of these job fairs together.
  - The more information that we can give our candidates to break down as many barriers as possible, let them know about reciprocity and those types of things, helps with our overall recruitment and retention efforts.
- Federal SAEF Grant Update  
U.S. Department of Labor's State Apprenticeship Expansion Formula (SAEF)
  - This is 6 million dollar grant for expanding apprenticeship programs in each State.
    - She thanked the Board for allowing us to pursue teacher apprenticeships, along with the Federal grant money that comes with that.
    - She spoke on the process and collaboration with the partnerships needed to make this happen.
    - This grant is K-12 specific so she is still looking at early education and has been talking to the Office of Early Learning (OEL) and how we can partner to get the early childhood teacher pipeline started as well.
    - We are going to be looking at a lot of different stakeholders to move forward. We do sit in on national conversations and are invited to the table for different teacher apprenticeship groups that have monthly meetings.

- Licensing Specialist Rodriguez has been working together with staff on this project. He spoke on the context and importance of this.
  - The Board has been identified as the sponsor or the intermediary, who will be running the teacher apprenticeship project and initiative.
  - He spoke of the services the grant would also be providing including pre-apprenticeship and mentorship models.
  - We will definitely be sharing the design ideas as we move forward.
  - He thanked the Board for their support of this and stated that it is a really big deal.

Executive Director Villalobos discussed one item that was not in her report because it happened just yesterday.

- She and Licensing Specialist Murakami went to UH-Manoa's William Richardson School of Law, where the Board of Education (BOE) heard oral arguments on Kamalani Academy's appeal of a Charter Contract non-renewal decision, issued by the State Public Charter School Commission.
  - The BOE overturned the Charter Commission's decision to non-renew Kamalani Academy's Charter. The BOE gave the reasons at the meeting.
  - Board Member Moriarty is a member of the BOE. She was there and did an excellent job. It was great seeing our board member up there, looking through all the of evidence and documents, and making decisions.
- Board Member Moriarty presented three points that she wanted to emphasize:
  1. She stated that the BOE's decision to reverse the decision of the Public Charter School Commission was taken on procedural and legal grounds.
    - The reason that she wants to emphasize this is that for us, this highlights the importance of HTSB and other boards and commissions, of having very clear and well documented procedures for how it handles its various responsibilities, and for following those procedures and documenting what has been done.
    - If you actually later read the decision, you will see that the that among the points, for example, that we made our decision on, was that the performance report did not include nor specify the deficiencies and weaknesses that would be considered.
    - The final decision issued by the Public Charter School Commission did not list specifically in the written decision, the grounds on which the decision was taken.
    - She thinks our HTSB staff has done a very good job throughout in documentation, that there is a process and that it is followed.
    - This decision once again, reinforces the importance of having such transparent and clear guidelines.
  2. One thing that came up during the appeal process is that Kamalani Academy had a teacher who is not appropriately licensed in Hawaii who was handling educational tasks.
    - Executive Director Villalobos and staff are looking back into. It had already been looked at but once again, it didn't show up in the record on appeal that the board was able to examine during the appeal process.

From our perspective on HTSB, we want to make sure that our records, at least, are clear about when we have responded to various inquiries.

3. She was impressed by the fact that our Executive Director and an investigator were there listening to this once again. They showed initiative to go out and understand what is happening in the broader community, and try to make the connections to how that affects our work on this board.
  - She is happy to answer questions later, if anybody wants to ask them.

**PRESENTATION: Business Solutions Technology (BST) Licensing Management System (LMS) Updates**

Mr. Kevin Costa, Director, Education Solutions: Power Point Presentation

- Changes relate to things that the Board has discussed and needed for operational support.
- Annual Cycle: Runs from January 1<sup>st</sup> to June 30<sup>th</sup> each School Year.
- Email reminders are sent out to advise that their licenses are expiring so they need to log into the system and submit a renewal application.
  - He reviewed the frequency and dates that the renewal reminder emails are sent.
  - A graph was shown onscreen that showed the number of emails per reminder date for the months of January to April 2023.
- LMS Enhancements
  - Institutions Portal: Supports all of educational preparation programs
    - Completer List Imports
  - Praxis Exam Score Receipt Notification Email to Profile owners from ETS
  - Employer Portal for DOE Staff Use
    - Provides DOE with Selected View Access to Profile Information
  - Profile Identification and SSN Verification Processing
  - Profile Email Verification Processing
  - Professional Fitness Module for HTSB Staff Use
  - Automated Cancellation of Applications
    - After 6-months of inactivity
  - Changes to Profile Registration Process
  - Reports Modules
- Under Development
  - Multi-factor Authentication (MFA) for Improved Login Security
  - Institutions: Program-specific Teaching Fields / Grade Levels
  - Duplicate LMS Profile Management
- Planned
  - Mobile Phone Text Messaging
- Possible
  - License/Permit Certificate PDF in English or Hawaiian

- Questions?
  - Board Member Han asked, “Can the DOE access this system?”
    - Mr. Costa stated that DOE can access some specific types of information that Executive Director Villalobos gave them access to. It is a selective view.
  - Board Member Han also asked, “Does the DOE have that same access capability with a Charter School?”
    - Mr. Costa referred her question to Executive Director Villalobos.
    - Executive Director Villalobos stated that they are still in conversations with that, because we know we would have to contact each Charter School separately, unless they are part of the DOE’s payroll system which we can get some access to some information.
  - Board Member Farden asked, “Is the portal that you shared with us, is it 504 compliant for those that may be accessing the information that have a vision impairment?”
    - Mr. Costa believes that we have alternate alt text message set up on things. He has to check with the technical team to confirm that, though he’s not positive. He knows that’s usually typically one of the requirements so that obviously the person’s browser can display things in different ways, or can actually translate text to speech for them.

**PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING AGENDA ITEM(S):** None

**LICENSING UPDATE:**

Licensing Specialist Raymond Rodriguez

- We are at that time of year where it’s getting really busy with applications and messages coming in.
- A lot of people are finishing their preparation programs, workgroups are wrapping up, and people are trying to renew their licenses.
- You will notice in the Executive Director’s report that there has been an increase in the positive feedback that we’re getting from applicants and licensees.
- We have been committing to getting back to people within 48 hours.
- The Licensing Team has done a lot of presentations to HSTA, the Charter Commission and preparation programs.
- It’s very busy, are working very hard and are thankful for the Board’s support.
- Are there any questions?
- Board Member Moriarty stated that two numbers stood out to her in the Executive Director’s report today.
  - At the end of March, there were three (3) pending applications that were pending the action by our HTSB staff. That is just fantastic.
  - She noted that Licensing Specialist Rodriguez modestly talked about the higher satisfaction rate. That graph showed three-quarters of the

respondents to the survey had marked that it was a very high quality of customer service experience. So, congratulations to our staff.

- Board Member Han stated that she just recently experienced the process and wanted to say thank you. It was way easier than it has ever been. There's several of us that needed to renew our licenses, but the process is so much easier.

**2023 AD HOC COMMITTEE LEGISLATIVE UPDATE:**

Legislative Committee Chairperson Miyamae

- Executive Director Villalobos and the HSTA union worked together and were able to include four (4) additional positions for HTSB in the final budget. They are two licensing specialists and two office assistants.
- She thanked Chairperson Kawazoe and Board Member Raymond for being part of the Ad Hoc Committee for the 2023 Legislative Session.
- We are now going to close that out, and thank you for your help with that.

**PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING AGENDA ITEM(S):** None

**NEW BUSINESS, COMMITTEE REPORTS, AND PENDING COMMITTEE ACTION**

**COMMITTEE REPORT: TEACHER STANDARDS COMMITTEE**

Teacher Standards Committee Chairperson Sanders

- We met this morning at 9:30 am and looked at four New Business Items.

**DISCUSSION/Action:**

**NBI 22-99:** Requirements for Adding Hawaiian Licensure Fields to an Existing Hawaii License

- Committee Chairperson Sanders reviewed NBI 22-99 which included the Rationale/Background.
  - She stated that the Teacher Standards Committee recommends approval of NBI 22-99, as written, to the full Board.
- Chairperson Kawazoe asked Board Members if there are any questions, comments or discussion.
- There being no further discussion, Chairperson Kawazoe called for a vote on whether or not to approve NBI 22-99, as written.
- Board Members voted to approve NBI 22-99, as written.
  - The motion carried unanimously with all Board Members present voting aye.
- NBI 22-99: Requirements for Adding Hawaiian Licensure Fields to an Existing Hawaii License, was adopted by the Board.



**DISCUSSION/Action:**

**NBI 22-100:** License Affirmation (March 2023 and Renewals)

- Committee Chairperson Sanders reviewed NBI 22-100.
  - She stated that the Teacher Standards Committee recommends approval of NBI 22-100, as written, to the full Board.
- Chairperson Kawazoe asked Board Members if there are any questions, comments or discussion.
- There being no further discussion, Chairperson Kawazoe called for a vote on whether or not to approve NBI 22-100, as written.
- Board Members voted to approve NBI 22-100, as written.
  - The motion carried unanimously with all Board Members present voting aye.
- NBI 22-100: License Affirmation (March 2023 and Renewals), was adopted by the Board.

**DISCUSSION/Action:**

**NBI 22-101:** The 2022-2023 CTE Workgroup Report and Recommendations (Part 1)

- Committee Chairperson Sanders stated that Licensing Specialist Rodriguez sits on the 2022-2023 CTE Workgroup, which met four times.
- Licensing Specialist Rodriguez reviewed NBI 22-101 is broken up into two parts.
  - Report: The workgroup that met—the board established the stakeholder group, and every single one of those stakeholders were met. We had attendance at all of our meetings and great feedback from all the stakeholder groups. This is a well-thought-out report and recommendation from the workgroup.
    - Number 1: The main point is that they would like to definitely meet next year, with the Board’s approval. They also were able to reach consensus on a number of issues. It was clear to this stakeholder group that they wanted to expand the options available for people to verify content knowledge in CTE fields. They have some examples, some ideas, but this is not the recommendation. This is just what they would like to continue talking about, and they wanted the Board to know the things that they are talking about and what their stakeholder groups are saying.
    - Number 2: This is looking at the different ways that a teacher can verify pedagogy or methodology of teaching or experience. Again, these are not recommendations. These are examples of what they are currently talking about. They were not able to reach consensus on these items, but this is what they would like to continue with.
  - Recommendations: This is what the workgroup would like to recommend to the Board.
    - Number 1: This is moving from the six current CTE license fields to the new 13 that are recognized by the Hawaii Department of Education. The workgroup is recommending that there is a transition period of at least one full year, but it may need more to

explore the impact on HQT, as well as the impact on the preparation programs that currently have these six license fields. The workgroup would really like the Board's approval and being able to reconvene to evaluate when the State is ready for this move.

- The provided chart on the NBI shows the six that the workgroup is recommending to move from, and the 13 that they are recommending to move to.
- Listed in parentheses is the DOE's projected rollout for each one of these new license fields.
- On the DOE website they are not called "license fields," they are called "CTE pathways," which is what the workgroup is recommending we change the CTE license fields to.
- Number 2: This is something very new, and this is regarding the CTE Standard Limited License and only that Standard Limited License. The workgroup would like to recommend to allow the requirement of an associate's degree to be met by a combination of comparable industry experience and education. The workgroup did some research and found that this would be consistent with industry practices and the University of Hawaii hiring practices, which was shared with us at the workgroup meeting.
  - The reason why this is a very new thing is because that move from an associate's degree to something that is comparable is something that would be a change in our HRS, Hawaii Revised Statutes.
  - Currently the HRS does say that you need to have at least an associate's degree for the Standard Limited License. It is outlined in HRS under the powers and duties of the Board.
  - If the Board were to agree and recommend this, this is something that we would have to talk to the AG's office about—what are our next steps moving forward.
- Committee Chairperson Sanders wanted to say that the Teacher Standards Committee recommends approval of NBI 22-101, as written, to the full Board.
- Board Member Bacon stated that this is really encouraging from his perspective and the Department's perspective, too.
  - The recent ratification of the new collective bargaining agreement allows CTE teachers to be hired at a higher salary now. Having these pathways and additional licensure ways allow them to be able to become employed with the Department.
  - It aligns very closely with what was just negotiated in the new collective bargaining agreement.
  - He is really encouraged to see where this goes as we continue to move forward so that we can do a better job of trying to fill some of the CTE pathways in our high schools.
- There being no further discussion, Chairperson Kawazoe called for a vote on whether or not to approve NBI 22-101, as written.

- Board Members voted to approve NBI 22-101, as written.
  - The motion carried unanimously with all Board Members present voting aye.
- NBI 22-101: The 2022-2023 CTE Workgroup Report and Recommendations (Part 1), was adopted by the Board.

**DISCUSSION/Action:**

**NBI 10-56 Revised:** Acceptance of Verification of Teaching Experience and Options for Meeting Standards for License Renewal

- Committee Chairperson Sanders reviewed NBI 10-56 Revised, commenting that it is revision after revision after revision.
  - She mentioned that this is just to tighten up this document. She stated that the Teacher Standards Committee voted to recommend it to the full Board.
- There being no further discussion, Chairperson Kawazoe called for a vote on whether or not to approve NBI 10-56 Revised.
- Board Members voted to approve NBI 10-56 Revised.
  - The motion carried unanimously with all Board Members present voting aye.
- NBI 10-56 Revised: Acceptance of Verification of Teaching Experience and Options for Meeting Standards for License Renewal, was adopted by the Board.

**COMMITTEE REPORT: BUDGET, PERSONNEL, AND STRATEGIC PLANNING COMMITTEE**

Budget, Personnel, and Strategic Planning Committee Chairperson Mew

- Our committee met at 11 this morning. Thank you, Committee Members, for waiting so long.

**DISCUSSION:**

**2022-2023 Budget Update**

- Committee Chairperson Mew stated that this annual budget for the third quarter is an update from the second quarter, which the committee met, discussed, viewed, and voted to accept.
  - To highlight, line-item 2 [HTSB Quality Assurance, Security, and Support] looks like only 3.76% has been spent.
    - Trainings, seminars, and reviews will be conducted over the summer, so that is where the chunk is going to be.
    - Also, from Executive Director Villalobos's report, she talked about the teacher apprenticeship program. That is huge for the teacher shortage. Funds are being put there so that we can get the ball rolling.
  - When asked if there were any red flags, Committee Chairperson Mew's reply was, "No." In his review of the spreadsheets, there were no red flags,

- no yellow flags. All green. We are on budget, and we do not have to adjust the budget for the coming fourth quarter.
- His only comment is that we will not see the fourth quarter report because this is our last meeting of the school year. But come the beginning of next school year, the fourth quarter report will be available.
  - There being no further discussion, Chairperson Kawazoe moved on to the next agenda item.

**DISCUSSION/Action:**

**NBI 22-95: Budget for 2023-2024**

- Committee Chairperson Mew reviewed NBI 22-95, stating that it is the responsibility of the Executive Director to come up with the budget, and then our Chair takes it and presents it to our committee for review.
  - Committee Chairperson Mew wanted to point out line-item 2 [HTSB Quality Assurance, Security, and Support & Address Teacher Shortage] because there is an increase from this current year's budget at \$59,100, and now you see \$87,100.
    - This is to help take into account the teacher apprenticeship program.
    - We wanted to commend both Licensing Specialist Rodriguez and Executive Director Villalobos for pursuing this. We hope that, with this, they can move forward in spite of the grant or non-grant.
  - Line-item 5 [Office operations] is actually a decrease from \$125,000 to what you see as \$87,000.
    - The move from the old office space to the expanded office space is pretty much done.
    - Therefore, the \$125,000 is not needed, but the \$87,000 is projected to be sufficient for office operations.
  - Line-item 6 [Statewide training for in-service teachers, teacher candidates, EPP support] is actually the same as last year, but the Board will be incorporating HAR §8-54-19.
    - The teacher prep programs need to incorporate or embed into the planning in their teacher prep about Hawaiian culture, knowledge of technology, ELL, and Model Code of Ethics.
    - That money will be a focused in those areas for in-service teachers.
  - The \$5,000 increase for line-item 8 [Board and other meetings] is because we may be moving into more in-person meetings next school year.
    - If so, our non-Oahu board members would need travel subsidies, etc.
    - As well as hearings. When there are contested hearings, if the respondents—the board members who are on the panel—need to be flown over, then we are anticipating those funds being there.
  - Finally, line-item 9 [Board members and staff to attend in-person or virtual trainings and conferences], there is a slight increase of \$5,000 from \$95,000.

- That is to account for workshops, trainings, and conferences that may require registration fees and/or membership in the organization in order to attend.

Committee Chairperson Mew stated that the committee discussed and voted unanimously in favor of NBI 22-95 for adoption by the Hawaii Teacher Standards Board.

- Chairperson Kawazoe mentioned that the committee had also discussed—because of the four new positions—that the budget would change a little bit.
  - We may need to amend this [NBI] at the first board meeting of the year, or at any time it comes up.
  - We are just waiting for that to happen when it goes through the Legislature.
- There being no further discussion, Chairperson Kawazoe called for a vote on whether or not to approve NBI 22-95, as written.
- Board Members voted to approve NBI 22-95, as written.
  - The motion carried unanimously with all Board Members present voting aye.
- NBI 22-95: Budget for 2023-2024, was adopted by the Board.

**DISCUSSION/Action:**

**NBI 22-96: 2023-2024 Election of HTSB Officers and Committee Assignments**

- Committee Chairperson Mew reviewed NBI 22-96, stating that, based on meetings with Executive Director Villalobos and Chairperson Kawazoe, what you see is each committee and what the committee is responsible for.
  - He joked that this committee has the most bullet points, so we get a pay raise from \$0.99 to \$3.99. Having said that, we take our jobs seriously, as all committees do.

He mentioned that if there are any board members who would like to sit on another committee in addition to what they are doing, or would like to move, that can be discussed.

- This is what is being recommended for next year.

Our committee did vote, and we voted to adopt NBI 22-96 as the appointments for the 2023-2024 school year.

- Chairperson Kawazoe stated that, just like the other New Business Item, we might have to amend this [NBI] as new board members come on or things shift around.
  - But this is what we have going forward if we vote to approve it.
  - But just a heads up, as we get new board members, we might be shifting things around.
- Board Member Farden had a point of inquiry on the committee assignments.
  - Is there a bylaw, or is it written somewhere, that we have to serve on three [committees]? She sees her name attached to three different committees.
- Executive Director Villalobos stated that there are currently no bylaws regarding that, but, unfortunately, we do not have all the positions filled right now. In order to meet quorum, she tries to place everyone in different committees so we can

meet quorum if individuals are not able to attend committee meetings and/or the General Business Meeting.

- We are hoping that more people will come on board. It is kind of hard at this time to get more teachers on board—because that is where our positions lie—just because they are overwhelmed, their plates are full.
- But we continue to ask teachers out there—teacher leaders—if they want to be a part of the board, and sometimes those teacher leaders already have their plates full.
- But we will continue to ask different individuals to be a part of the board. And, again, they have to go through the Boards and Commission and the Governor’s office. But we will keep our eyes and ears open, and feel free to do the same.
- Board Member Farden asked if the minimum quorum is stated in the HRS?
  - She is only asking because it seems quite unfair that we would have to burden to take up all of these different committees because HTSB is unable to fill those positions.
- Executive Director Villalobos stated that quorum is a part of the Robert’s Rules [of Order] and what we do to run our meetings. So that is actually a part of any State board—that we have to have quorum in order to run meetings.
  - But, again, if you would like to be taken off any of the committees, we can take you off and see if another board member who is not fully tasked with committees if they want to participate in another committee.
- Board Member Farden agreed and asked if Executive Director Villalobos can send her the bylaws, or if there are bylaws on the Robert’s Rules that is being used for quorum?
- Executive Director Villalobos stated that it is not for bylaws—it is actually under Robert’s Rules. She can send Board Member Farden a link to Robert’s Rules, as there are a lot of different websites.
- Board Member Farden asked if it is the twelfth edition that is being used.
- Executive Director Villalobos stated that she would have to go and look.
- There being no further discussion, Chairperson Kawazoe called for a vote on whether or not to approve NBI 22-96, as written.
- Board Members voted to approve NBI 22-96, as written.
  - Board Member Farden voted nay.
  - All other Board Members present voted aye.
- NBI 22-96: 2023-2024 Election of HTSB Officers and Committee Assignments, was adopted by the Board.

**DISCUSSION/Action:**

**NBI 22-97: 2023-2024 Hawaii Teacher Standards Board Meeting Schedule**

- Committee Chairperson Mew reviewed NBI 22-97, as amended in the committee meeting.
  - On October 20<sup>th</sup>, as it turns out, there is a major conference that would affect some board members, as well as HTSB staff, who would not be able to make the meeting because it is at the same time.

- Move the October 20<sup>th</sup> meeting to October 27<sup>th</sup>.
- With that, it is clear that the November 17<sup>th</sup> meeting would be too close to October 27<sup>th</sup> for the turn-around time for reports and committee work.
  - Move the November 17<sup>th</sup> meeting to December 1<sup>st</sup>.
  - There would be no November meeting, and instead replace it with a December meeting.

The committee would like to have this board-approved—the meeting schedule as amended.

- There being no further discussion, Chairperson Kawazoe called for a vote on whether or not to approve NBI 22-97, as amended.
- Board Members voted to approve NBI 22-97, as amended.
  - The motion carried unanimously with all Board Members present voting aye.
- NBI 22-97: 2023-2024 Hawaii Teacher Standards Board Meeting Schedule, was adopted by the Board.
- Chairperson Kawazoe quickly mentioned that Executive Director Villalobos had put in the Zoom chat the OIP link for the practices of State boards.

**DISCUSSION/Action:**

**NBI 22-98:** 2022-2023 The Hawaii Teacher Standards Board Executive Director's Evaluation Recommendation

- Committee Chairperson Mew reviewed NBI 22-98, stating that the committee discussed and voted to adopt this NBI.
  - Pages 2 through 13 is what our Board Members evaluated [Executive Director Villalobos] on, and those are the scores that can be seen.
    - For the four standards, which was optional with the evaluator's comments, 8 of the 12 provided responses there to further discuss or further describe, elaborate, amplify what they evaluated on.
  - After that, six staff members did their evaluation, found on pages 14 through 23.
    - For the four standards, which was optional, three of the six responded.
    - On page 19 for Standard 3 from the staff, there was one who evaluated as "marginal," but there was no elaboration, and Standard 3 is about pursuing professional improvement activities to strengthen own leadership performance and demonstrating ability to self-assess and to reflect on administrative practices.
  - Following this, our Executive Director gave a rather involved reflection after she had read it herself.
    - She rated herself basically right in the middle and said in the discussion she felt that there is always room to improve. This, in her first year, is why she did it.
  - Committee Chairperson Mew noted that Executive Director Villalobos took her initiative to give a rather lengthy and thoughtful reflection on all of these, and she rated herself as "acceptable" in the areas.

- Committee Chairperson Mew stated that our committee gave comments at our meeting that were very glowing of our Executive Director. As a result of that, we voted unanimously that we want the Hawaii Teacher Standards Board to approve the overall rating of “acceptable” for our Executive Director for the period of July 1, 2022 to June 30, 2023, and that the HTSB continues the appointment of Felicia Villalobos as Executive Director.
- Chairperson Kawazoe stated that what Executive Director Villalobos has done for the Teacher Standards Board has been phenomenal in terms of the direction we are headed and just the integrity of our license, all the while helping to ensure that we have qualified teachers in the classroom.
    - He mentioned that her work schedule is ridiculous—she spends hours and hours upon hours here at HTSB. And her dedication and commitment are unparalleled.
    - He is grateful, and our entire educator community should be grateful, too. He also mentioned that this is going to come up again—the review is going to be brought up in committee—and we are also going to have her set some goals for next school year.
    - That was something that came about from our last meeting, from some of the board members, which he thinks is great. We are always evolving, always being reflective. Lifelong learners.
  - Executive Director Villalobos stated that she just put “acceptable,” just because it has been, really, her first year as the Executive Director and not as an interim.
    - In her teaching practice when reflecting in that as well—she was a classroom teacher for 15 years—she could teach for three lifetimes and still have room to grow.
    - That is what she understands, and she still has a lot of things to learn from all facets. She is learning from different agencies and how they work within our agency as well.
    - There is still a lot of growth she needs to go through, but, unfortunately, because of some other issues, she has not had the time to seek out leadership training, per se.
      - She is looking now, thanks to Committee Chairperson/Principal Mew. He has been sending some her way from the Department. Hopefully she can get more time, especially with the four new positions that have been hired to kind of lighten the load.
      - She would like to take our licensing specialists on this training with her as well, for leadership. None of us have been vice principals or principals of schools.
      - We want to make sure that we have the best leaders in this agency.
    - She stated that, again, there is always room for growth. She appreciates everyone taking the time to do the survey, and she is looking forward to developing some goals for the following and future years as she continues on in this position.
    - She mentioned that she really appreciates her staff. They work tirelessly. They work extremely hard, and they are very dedicated, and so she does appreciate all her staff here.



- She also addressed the Board, of course, who are doing this for free as volunteers. She does appreciate your dedication to the Board because it does take a lot of time to go through the documents and really run the board well. It is because of you folks, so thank you.
- Chairperson Kawazoe asked Board Members if there are any questions, comments, or discussion before the board votes.
- Board Member Farden stated that she is in favor of this, and she just wanted to commend the committee, and also our Executive Director, for a job well done.
  - She suggested that perhaps going into next year, to consider having a rubric with the evaluation—that would be incredibly helpful. Otherwise, it becomes very subjective when we are looking at her goals.
  - Her second recommendation is for our Executive Director to outline those goals that we have to evaluate her on every month in her Executive Director's Report. It would be helpful.
- Chairperson Kawazoe mentioned that he forgot to say we are going to create a P.I.G. group—a permitted interaction group—as well, as we get geared up for the next school year.
  - So, we will be looking for board members for that as we kind of make this evaluation better and something that can have some longevity to it, too.
- There being no further discussion, Chairperson Kawazoe called for a vote on whether or not to approve NBI 22-98, as written.
- Board Members voted to approve NBI 22-98, as written.
  - The motion carried unanimously with all Board Members present voting aye.
- NBI 22-98: 2022-2023 The Hawaii Teacher Standards Board Executive Director's Evaluation Recommendation, was adopted by the Board.

**EXECUTIVE SESSION PROCEDURAL INFORMATION:**

Chairperson Kawazoe shared information regarding procedures for virtual Executive Session:

- Executive Session will be conducted in this virtual meeting room and all other attendees will be transferred to a waiting room without access to the general room.
- You may not re-enter until the waiting room is closed. If you leave the waiting room, you must log back into the general meeting and be admitted after the Executive Session is adjourned.
- To ensure confidentiality, the Executive Session will be accessible only to HTSB members and required staff. The participants must confirm that no unauthorized person is present and able to see or hear the Executive Session.

**MOTION TO RISE INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION (Mew/Raymond)**

*This portion of the meeting is a closed meeting under Section 92-4 and Section 92-5(a)(1)(2) and (4), Hawaii Revised Statutes.*

**BOARD MEMBERS VOTED TO ENTER EXECUTIVE SESSION AT 2:11 P.M.**

**CALL BACK TO ORDER BY CHAIRPERSON KAWAZOE AT 3:08 P.M.**

**TOPIC: Report out of Executive Session**

**DISCUSSION:**

Chairperson Kawazoe reported out:

- Approval of Executive Session Meeting Minutes from March 24, 2023.
- Personnel Update: Villalobos
- Consultation with Deputy Attorney General Michael Azuma on questions and issues pertaining to the board's powers, duties, privileges, immunities, and liabilities.
- Update on NBI 22-27 Hawaii State Ethics Commission Inquiry
- Update on HTSB Approved Educator Preparation Program (EPP) Clinical Experience Placements.
- Approval of NBI 22-92: Case Number 22-27 (Han/Raymond)

**TOPIC: Next HTSB Meeting: September 15, 2023**

**DISCUSSION:**

Chairperson Kawazoe stated that our next meeting is currently scheduled for September 15, 2023.

- The details about the agenda will come out prior to the meeting.

**ADJOURNMENT:**

Chairperson Kawazoe adjourned the meeting at 3:09 p.m.

Recorder: *Elaine Hutchinson*      Date: April 28, 2023  
Elaine Hutchinson