

**HAWAII TEACHER STANDARDS BOARD  
GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING**

**Tuesday, May 23, 2023**

**Meeting Conducted by Remote Technology via Zoom  
and  
Physical Location at 650 Iwilei Road, Suite 268, Honolulu, HI 96817**

**MINUTES**

**PRESENT:**

Elena Farden for Keahi Makaimoku  
Dr. Jonathan Gillentine  
Branden Kawazoe  
Justin Mew  
Kristi Miyamae  
Lauren Moriarty for Bruce Voss

Dr. Cecily Ornelles for Dr. Nathan Murata  
Dawn Raymond  
Kim Sanders  
Dr. Katina Soares  
Kerry Tom for Keith Hayashi

**EXCUSED:**

Lokelani Han

**STAFF:**

Felicia Villalobos, Executive Director  
Tracey Idica, Licensing Specialist  
Jennifer Padua, Licensing Specialist

Raymond Rodriguez, Licensing Specialist  
Elaine Hutchinson, Secretary

**CALL TO ORDER:**

Chairperson Kawazoe called the meeting to order at 11:16 a.m.

**OPENING REMARKS:**

Chairperson Kawazoe shared information regarding procedures for virtual board meetings:

- The following board members, in addition to the Chairperson, are participating in today's virtual board meeting and have established audio and video connection.
- Board members shall be visible and audible to other members and the public during meetings.
- This board meeting will be recorded and all meeting minutes will be posted on HTSB's website.

**ROLL CALL TO ESTABLISH QUORUM:**

Chairperson Kawazoe called the roll and established quorum.  
Eleven (11) board members were present, one was excused.

**DISCLOSURE FROM BOARD MEMBERS AT PRIVATE LOCATIONS:**

Chairperson Kawazoe shared information regarding private location disclosure.

- Board members shall be considered present at the meeting for the purpose of determining compliance with the quorum and voting requirements of the board.
- Board members who are not participating at the Board's public location must announce who is at the remote location with them. Minors do not need to be identified unless they have a personal business, property, or financial interest in an issue.

Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they have anyone present with them at their non-public site that they need to disclose.

- No disclosures were made.

**BOARD MEETING PROTOCOL INFORMATION:**

Chairperson Kawazoe shared information regarding board meeting protocols.

- As a reminder, all board members wishing to speak should raise their hand and the Chairperson will be notified to call on the person. The speaker must state their name prior to making their remarks.
- Votes will be conducted by roll call so that it is clear how each board member voted.
- All public members logged into Zoom can sign up to testify via the Zoom Chat feature. Please use the Chat Box to provide your name and the agenda item that you are testifying on. Staff will unmute you once it is your turn to testify. If you are not audible because of technical issues, the next Testifier will be called on.
- If you signed up to testify in person, please approach the table once your name is called. We will also call on Testifiers at other points indicated on the agenda but an individual may only testify on an agenda item once. When it is your time to testify, state your name, organization if applicable and the agenda item that you are testifying on.
- Testifiers will have a two (2) minute time limit. You will be notified when you have thirty (30) seconds left and you will be automatically muted once your allotted time for testimony has expired.
- Testifiers are not allowed to yield their time to other Testifiers.
- Written testimony received more than forty-nine (49) hours in advance of the meeting has been uploaded to the HTSB website and given to board members to review.
- A meeting held by interactive conference technology shall be recessed for up to thirty (30) minutes when audio communication cannot be maintained with a quorum of members, provided that the meeting may reconvene when only audio communication is reestablished.

**PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING AGENDA ITEM(S):**

Chairperson Kawazoe asked board staff to call on any Testifiers who have signed up to provide oral testimony on the agenda item(s).

Licensing Specialist Rodriguez informed that there is quite a number of testimony coming in through Zoom and in-person testimony that will come through the “Public Testimony (HTSB Office)” account on Zoom.

- Dean Cevallos, Principal of Kea‘au High School, emailed the HTSB office about wanting to join the Zoom meeting and submitting testimony on agenda item IV.A, entitled “NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates.” This request was made prior to the start of the General Business Meeting.
- Amy Perruso, Hawai‘i State Representative of District 46, testified through Zoom on agenda item IV.A, entitled “NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates”:

“So, good morning, Board. I have submitted written testimony, which I hope the board members have had a chance to read. As I mentioned in my testimony, TFA does not have an approved program in special education, which means that their teacher candidates placed in special education positions are out of compliance because these corps members are not participating in an alternate route to a special education certification. That aside, I think it’s also important to understand the overall impact that this temporary worker program has had on the teaching profession and on children in our public schools in Hawai‘i over the past decade.

“In my testimony I alluded to the idea of manufactured dependency, and I think it’s important to talk about what this actually looks like in practice. 598 TFA candidates have been licensed by HTSB since 2013. 501 were hired by the DOE and 46 by public charter schools. There are currently 173 corps members working for the DOE and 25 working for public charter schools, totaling 198 in all schools. So that’s about one-third of all of the total licensed since 2013. The data also reveals that, to date, 348 corps members have left the employment of the Department of Education since 2013, which is a very limited time window—that’s not the entirety of TFA’s presence. And only 137 of the 598 have stayed for five or more years in the DOE or public charter schools. So, that’s a retention rate of about 25%, which is abysmal and is about half of that of our tradi—” (30 seconds was called.) “—traditional teacher preparation programs.

“So, whatever the remedy developed to address the situation with the current cohort, it is important that the Board take a firm stance to make sure that TFA, the DOE, and the charter schools comply with federal law because now you understand the problem. The role of the Teacher Standards Board has never been more important as we try to move toward a public school system staffed by a stable, dedicated, and highly qualified local teacher workforce. Please feel free to reach out to our office if you need any help or support—”

Time was called for Representative Perruso of District 46.

- Jill Baldemor, Executive Director of Teach For America Hawai'i, testified in-person on agenda item IV.A, entitled "NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates":

"Aloha, Chair Kawazoe, and members of the Hawai'i Teacher Standards Board. Thank you for the opportunity to testify today on NBI 22-102. My name is Jill Baldemor and I started my career in education as a second grade teacher, and I've had the privilege of leading our Teach For America Hawai'i region for the past 16 years.

"Teach For America has proudly partnered with the Hawai'i Department of Education since 2006. And for those of you who may be less familiar with Teach For America, our program seeks to grow the pipeline of education advocates. We care deeply about issues of equity and seek out participants who believe that high quality, rigorous learning is a fundamental right for all students.

"Once we've selected our candidates—who we also call 'corps members'—we provide those names to the Hawai'i Department of Education, and those lists are shared with principals. Principals have the discretion to hire teachers who they feel are the best candidates for their school and may offer them any full-time teaching position, with the condition that TFA candidates must be in lines where they teach at least 50% of their time in grade-level content. For the past decade, we've recommended teachers in the subjects of elementary and secondary math, science, English, and social studies. This is true for teachers who have taught in both general education and special education teacher lines, as we stand firm in our conviction that special education is not a subject. Teachers in special education lines teach grade-level subjects while providing appropriate accommodations.

"For the last decade, the Hawai'i Teacher Standards Board has approved and issued licenses to all of our teachers that we have recommended, both those who have taught in general education and special education teaching lines." (30 seconds was called.) "We're here today, at the end of May, with a humble request that you simply continue to issue licenses for those Teach For America teachers that successfully complete our program requirements this year, including those who have taught in special education lines. Our arguments are three-fold. One: they have completed the clinical experience requirement of teaching 450 hours in the subject they're seeking a license. Two: they've received training and support by both Teach For America and Hawai'i Department of Education. And three: we believe that if you—"

Time was called for Executive Director Baldemor of Teach For America Hawai'i.

- Alyson Emrick, Director of Licensure and Regional Team Initiatives at Teach For America Hawai'i, testified in-person on agenda item IV.A, entitled "NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates":

“Good morning. My name is Alyson Emrick and I was a 2006 corps member and have been on the TFA Hawai'i staff for the past 15 years. My current role is Director of Licensure and Regional Team Initiatives. I, along with my team, work to ensure that all candidates recommended for licensure have met the requirements. And I am a rule follower.

“The third point that we'll be making today is to the extent that the Board believes that new policy should be adopted. We strongly urge the Board to make any changes on a prospective basis, only to avoid prejudicing those teachers who have reasonably relied on the plain language and the past practice of HTSB and have worked tirelessly all year to complete program requirements that, a year ago, would have allowed them to be certified.

“In regard to the clinical experience requirements specifically, NBI 12-27 Revised provides that candidates meet the requirements by working in a Hawai'i public or charter school, and completing student teaching in an appropriate grade level and subject they are seeking a license. TFA teachers who complete their supervised clinical experience in special education and general education settings alike meet these requirements. They are in Hawai'i public and charter schools, and elementary or secondary classrooms, as full-time teachers for a full school year, teaching core subject areas. This is verified at multiple points, beginning when principals hire TFA candidates, as candidates are observed ongoing throughout the year, and again at the end of the year when we verify their hours. We recommend for licensure in the subject area taught and have done so for over 10 years with no previous concerns by HTSB since all candidates—” (30 seconds was called.) “—meet the NBI guidelines.

“Since special education is not a subject in and of itself, some special education teachers teach grade-level subjects—English, social studies, science, math—to students, inclusive of those who receive special education services. With respect to role, I'm not aware of the HTSB definition beyond the examples provided in the NBI of school counselor and school librarian. No TFA candidate is improperly in the role of counselor or librarian. All are hired as full-time teachers.”

Time was called for Director Emrick of Teach For America Hawai'i.

- Ian Okamoto, Teach For America Hawai'i, testified in-person on agenda item IV.A, entitled “NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates”:

“My name is Ian Okamoto and I have been on TFA Hawai'i staff for five years. In my time with TFA, I have worked as a coach supporting our first- and second-year teachers, and have also worked to support and develop our program systems and alternative route to credential program. In my work with TFA, I've seen the effectiveness and success of our program firsthand as a coach and have also seen and been a part of the thoughtful work that has gone into the development of our teachers. Prior to working with TFA, I was a school administrator and have extensive experience in supervising comprehensive student supports, including special education.

“So, I’d like to continue by saying, finally and importantly, in terms of the language of NBI 12-27 Revised, it says ‘subject or school role.’ While we believe that TFA candidates have met both, so long as HTSB finds that there is sufficient evidence of one in it—for example, that the candidate is teaching in either subject or school role that they seek a license—the evidence meets the requirement, as stated in the plain language of the policy. In this case, TFA candidates clearly meet the requirement of teaching in the subject they are seeking a license.

“I’d like to pick up by also saying that our training program is robust. We provide rigorous training in content, and all teachers receive training in special education. From the first day of their summer practicum experience, candidates engaged in rigorous training on both subject-based pedagogy and special education, specifically the disability studies—” (30 seconds was called.) “—in education approach, learner variability and disability responsive practices, and accommodations and modifications. Following the practicum experience, corps members continued to be supported by school- and complex-level staff, as well as TFA coaches and supports. In addition to their teacher responsibilities, corps members are held to a high standard in our program. They must successfully complete formal observation cycles throughout the year that are inclusive of a formal lesson plan that includes backwards design, Hawai’i state teacher standards—”

Time was called for Mr. Okamoto of Teach For America Hawai’i.

- Sierra Callahan, Teach For America Hawai’i, testified in-person on agenda item IV.A, entitled “NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates”:

“Aloha. My name is Sierra Callahan and I’m a former student of TFA Hawai’i corps members and alum at ‘Aiea Intermediate and UH Mānoa, and a 2017 corps member who taught English at Wai‘anae High School as a SPED teacher, and a current TFA Hawai’i coach. I bring over a decade of these stories to this space to attest to the excellence of our candidates and the beneficial impact they have on the learning trajectory of all students.

“In the 2017 Endrew decision, the Supreme Court determined that students with disabilities are entitled to an educational benefit greater than the long-held standard of merely more than de minimis, or the minimum. The standard set is an appropriately ambitious program with meaningful opportunity to meet challenging objectives. This benefit is not in special education. A SPED is not something students learn, but rather, per the U.S. Department of Education, instructional strategies and curricula aligned to the challenging state content standards based on each child’s unique circumstances.

“We stand by this interpretation of a free and appropriate public education, which necessitates that SPEDucators develop subject-based pedagogical expertise in addition to—not in lieu of—continuously deepening their knowledge of SPED services and laws, as well as the individualized supports through which content is delivered. The Hawai’i DOE’s approach also aligns with this standard.

The Office of Student Support Services outlines that, quote, the general education curriculum is the standard, and staffing decisions are not made on a basis of labels, end quote.

“Our candidates have demonstrated that they can provide far more—” (30 seconds was called.) “—de minimis benefit. The minimum? This would be opting for long-term substitutes with little to no ongoing training in SPED services and content matter over qualified candidates. Defining SPED as a content area—and therefore perpetuating the stereotype that SPED kids learn about SPED—would be the minimum, a misreading of IDEA that implies that learning done in specific environments is inferior to or less rigorous than content-aligned learning in others. Being a SPED teacher does not exempt candidates from delivering accessible, rigorous instruction. We know this. Instead, our—”

Time was called for Ms. Callahan of Teach For America Hawai'i.

- Meilan Akaka Manfre, Teach For America Hawai'i, testified in-person on agenda item IV.A, entitled “NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates”:

“Aloha. My name is Meilan Akaka Manfre. Raised in Honolulu, Hawai'i, Teach For America provided a path for me to return home from the east coast in 2008 to become a highly qualified and licensed special education inclusion teacher at James Campbell High School. I hold a master's degree in special education from UH Mānoa and still hold my HTSB teacher license 15 years later in the fields of special education, secondary mathematics, and teacher leadership.

“As a classroom teacher, I co-taught algebra and geometry to students with and without disabilities, ensuring rigor and standards were grade-level aligned. I served on the Strategic Inclusion Leadership team in my third year of teaching, and the Response to Intervention team as well. After three years in the classroom, I stepped into the SPED Department Head role at the largest public high school in the state—supporting a department of 28 special education teachers, 260 students with disabilities, and countless colleagues and team members—to ensure all students received a free, appropriate public education in their least restrictive environment. I'm proud of the work that we did to maintain compliance metrics, including 100% child count and IEP deadlines, but more so that, through engaging with the leadership development offered both by Teach For America and the Hawai'i Department of Education, students had strong outcomes. As the SPED Department Head, I frequently observed teaching and learning across the school, and I can say with confidence that Teach For America teachers demonstrated proficiency in delivering content at the same levels as others, and SPED teachers grew to be at least—” (30 seconds was called.) “—as proficient as their colleagues.

“For the past decade, I've coached and mentored TFA teachers and school leaders, including Hawai'i State Teachers of the Year. And I believe—and I'm convinced—that the training is more than adequate to contribute positively in the Hawai'i Department of Education. Thank you.”

- Stephanie Shipton, Director of Regional Initiatives at Teach For America Hawai'i, testified in-person on agenda item IV.A, entitled "NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates":

"Aloha mai kākou. My name is Stephanie Shipton and I am a Director of Regional Initiatives at Teach For America Hawai'i. And while I am on staff at TFA, I am coming to you today, first and foremost, as a mother to two young children who believe that the world is full of joy, hope, possibility, love, and community. I am personally invested just like you all and I believe that all our students not only deserve, but have the right to, an excellent education with teachers who have the knowledge and skills to support their growth.

"But how do we make this a baseline instead of an aspiration? The teachers who choose to enter the classroom through TFA's program are a part of the answer, and voices from the community speak to their value. Meilan's story is just one of many. We have TFA teachers who take on leadership and mentorship roles in schools as department heads, district specialists, and school leaders—just as some examples.

"But the question in front of HTSB is not whether our teachers make a positive impact. It's not whether you philosophically believe in the existence of TFA. The question is whether these teacher candidates have met state licensing and credentialing standards. Specifically, do the candidates who go through our program teach 450 hours in the subject area for which they are seeking a license? You've received testimony from principals that this is true. The language of NBI 12-27 Revised specifies experience in subject or school role. Again, candidates clearly meet the requirements of teaching in the subject for which they are seeking a license, as observed and testified to by their principals. The reality is that these 15 candidates are 6% of the 900 teacher vacancies reported, and nearly one-third of which were in SPED. However, they fill these vacancies with excellence. And under state law, the—" (30 seconds was called.) "—Board must consider the existing applicant pool and level of qualification of these applicants when making decisions. And by changing a decade of precedence, on day 177 of 182, the Board would ultimately hinder passionate, qualified teachers from being in the classroom. Until this NBI, one candidate, who had plans to serve as a course (?) lead next year, and another was eager to continue teaching at their alma mater. These are local homegrown educators who are unwavering, innovative, service-minded, and culturally responsive.

"In a year where a lack of transparency and personal vendettas have broken the public's trust in government—"

Time was called for Director Shipton of Teach For America Hawai'i.

- Kaitlin Miyashiro-Carvalho, Teach For America Hawai'i, testified in-person on agenda item IV.A, entitled "NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates":



“Aloha mai kākou. Mahalo for the chance to speak on NBI 22-102. ‘O Katie ko‘u inoa. No ‘Aiea mai au. My name is Katie. I’m a Teach For America coach and I coach five of the corps members who are in a special education setting. I also bring with me my identity as a Kānaka Maoli wāhine from ‘Aiea, mom, and social studies teacher of eight years, starting at Wai‘anae High School.

“I wanted to share the impact that these new policies will have on the teachers that I coach. If HTSB chooses to adopt new policies or revise existing ones, please do so on a prospective basis only. These teachers have completed every requirement that was asked of them. The implication of changing the goal posts on them now has real consequences to both the teachers and their communities. For you folks, it looks like a list of names, but, to me, these are strong teachers who are both kama‘āina and malihini. Ameenah Saalih graduated from Kapolei High, Alec Lazor from ‘Iolani, Julia De Jong from UH Mānoa. And these are people who have roots here and have dedicated themselves to our communities because they are of our communities. These are people in special education that teach their content, on top of care coordination duties and additional expectations outlined and monitored by their school and the HIDOE. When I met with these teachers yesterday, Julia shared that her proudest moment was in an IEP meeting, when a parent came up to her after and said, ‘Thank you. Thank you for caring about my kid.’ While they all have received a Proficient in Danielson—” (30 seconds was called.) “—by both the admin and myself, this shows that their impact is transformational and affects families. While it’s obvious that if you take away their ability to be licensed, you take away the impact that these people have on their families.

“It should also be noted that Hawai‘i is expensive. These teachers have all stated to me that they are anxious, stressed, concerned about not being licensed because this means they’ll be unable to afford living here. Some will have to move back to the continent, or the mainland. Also, they won’t be able to stay in their current positions.”

Time was called for Ms. Miyashiro-Carvalho of Teach For America Hawai‘i.

- Josh Heimowitz, Senior Managing Director of Teach For America Hawai‘i, testified in-person on agenda item IV.A, entitled “NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates”:

“Aloha. My name is Josh Heimowitz. I am the Senior Managing Director of Teach For America. I’ve had the privilege of working on this team for the past nine years. What I often share is that the best part of this role is the people I work with—the colleagues, our teachers, our alumni—who are making a difference, believe in our community, and are working hard every day to make Hawai‘i better.

“While operationally TFA can recruit and train teachers in general education, there is a broader impact on schools and students. TFA does not place teachers. Principals hire our teachers because there is a need and they have a positive experience with our teachers and our program. We understand there are different

perspectives and viewpoints around alternative certification programs, and we welcome your questions, conversations, and feedback at any time. But the issue before you today is not about whether you like Teach For America or not. The question before you is whether the special education teachers have met your policy of teaching 450 hours in the subject that they are seeking a license. They have. Please follow your policies.

“Appreciate your time. Thank you.”

- Disa Hauge, Interim Complex Area Superintendent for Nānākuli-Wai‘anae, testified in-person on agenda item IV.A, entitled “NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates”:

“Aloha. I am Disa Hauge, Complex Area Superintendent for Nānākuli-Wai‘anae, and thank you for allowing me to address this agenda item, NBI 22-102.

“As a complex, we hire a large number of TFA teachers because we are a hard-to-fill area and we simply cannot fill our vacant positions. At this point in time, the alternative to TFA for us is to put long-term substitute teachers with high school diplomas into our classes. This is not acceptable to anyone, and, although not yet certified, I have found TFA teachers to be quick learners, critical thinkers, and caring adults to our students. The situation in which we now find ourselves needs a solution focused. Past practice may be at issue, but it’s not the fault of the candidates and I hope that our goal is to find a solution that keeps these teacher candidates in the profession.

“The majority of TFA SPED teachers taught core subjects in inclusion or resource settings. My understanding is that they traditionally are certified in their core subject, not in SPED. Please do not assume that SPED resource classes are less rigorous than inclusion or regular ed core classes. They are not. There is no SPED core curricula. When I was Principal at Wai‘anae High School, all students in regular ed inclusion and resource classes took the same common formative assessments, the same midterm assessments, and the same—” (30 seconds was called.) “—final exams. The standards are the same, strategies may be different, and accommodations are individualized, but those pedagogical practices require much more rigorous skills on the part of the teacher. Let me be clear: SPED TFA teachers have additional responsibilities that our kids need.

“It sounds like I’m advocating for TFA SPED. I’m not. I’m advocating for our kids who need these teachers. Please find a solution.”

- Ray Pikelny-Cook, Principal of Wai‘anae High School, testified in-person on agenda item IV.A, entitled “NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates”:

“Hi, everyone. My name is Ray Pikelny-Cook. I’m the Principal at Wai‘anae High School. I have a whole speech here, but I think I’m not going to be talking off this speech because everything that has been said before me is what I would

mimic. What I want to share with you today is how it's going to impact our community and our school in Wai'anae.

"We do not have the teachers—the SPED teachers—available. We have multiple positions that's going to be open if these teachers aren't licensed. I think that they came in this year under the understanding that they were going to get licensed by the end of the year, and they'd start next year in their SPED placement. I have 10 openings if this does not happen. 10 openings that I have to now go and find SPED teachers for, that I'll probably have to put—like Disa said—long-term subs with high school diplomas. TFAs come to us with bachelor's degrees, master's degrees from Duke, from UCLA. Recognized colleges. They're quick learners, they get into the community, they support the students, they come to games, they support the families, they work intensely with the families to try and develop plans—IEP plans—that work for kids.

"I think that we're doing a disservice to our students and it's going to impact what happens in our community as well. Please reconsider—" (30 seconds was called.) "—just for the teachers, at least, that have gone through the program this year under the understanding that they were going to get licensed. Please reconsider because there's nobody coming to Wai'anae, knocking down doors to work at our school and fill positions. But here we have an option—we have TFAs. They care for our kids, they care for the community, and they provide a service that Hawai'i, at this time, cannot fulfill.

"Thank you."

- Dale Fryxell, Dean of the School of Education and Behavioral Sciences at Chaminade University, testified through Zoom on agenda item IV.A, entitled "NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates":

"Hi. Thank you for letting me testify today. My name is Dale Fryxell. I'm the Dean of the School of Education and Behavioral Sciences at Chaminade University, and I was also a member of the AAQEP Quality Review team for the Teach For America site review that just happened.

"I'm writing this testimony in regard to the proposed NBI 22-102. I was a member of the recent AAQEP Quality Review team reviewing Teach For America program this past January. In total, I invested many hours reviewing TFA's programs, collecting additional evidence during the site visit, and meeting with the Quality Review team members. I must say that, based on all the evidence provided by TFA and their self-study, and the information that we collected through our interviews and meetings during that site visit, the entire team was extremely impressed with the quality, rigor, and training provided by TFA to all their candidates. I believe this outcome was affirmed by a unanimous decision of the AAQEP Commission in recommending full seven-year accreditation. I was very impressed with the great opportunities that TFA candidates have, where they are able to be hired full-time to fill open positions that otherwise mainly go unfilled or would be filled by unqualified, untrained, long-term substitutes, who often do not have any college training at all.

“I’m going to skip around in my testimony a bit to hit some highlights here, but you can read the full version that was submitted.

“I’d just like to reinforce that inclusion placement is identified in a student’s IEP as a general education—” (30 seconds was called.) “—classroom setting. The beauty of the team-teaching model of inclusion is that the teachers are able to support and learn from each other while teaching the content that they are assigned to teach—math, English, or whatever. It is best practice in an inclusion classroom for students to not actually know who the regular education teacher is and who the special education teacher is. They are both just math teachers or social studies teachers.

“Thank you very much for this opportunity.”

- Hannah Loera, Wai‘anae High School, testified through Zoom on agenda item IV.A, entitled “NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates”:

“Educators, advocates, and esteemed Board Members—good morning and mahalo. My name is Hannah Loera and I’m a first-year TFA corps member in special education and care coordinator at Wai‘anae High School.

“I must reaffirm our shared mission: regardless of our years of experience, nation of origin, or current professional position, we are here for the same purpose—to advocate and ensure that every student in every classroom has access to quality education in Hawai‘i. Under the IDEA, students with disabilities are entitled to a free and appropriate public education based on curriculum and standards that are the same or similar to those used as general education students.

“While my students receive SPED services, they participate in the same standardized assessments and content area curriculum as their non-disabled peers. I have not, nor will not, be evaluated as teaching SPED, but, rather, evaluated by my ability to scaffold and differentiate the general education curriculum to students who require SPED services. As such, I am submitting my university coursework, educator effectiveness observations, and full-year clinical teaching experience to support my licensure in secondary English. Upon my approval for licensure, I will follow the HTSB’s current policy on adding a field of teaching special education by passing of the necessary Praxis that verifies my content and experience knowledge. I have been observed, supervised, and supported by school and TFA personnel every week for the past year. I received my administrator’s Proficient on Danielson’s domains, and, as a SPED teacher, received additional training during the summer and throughout the school year. This is in addition to approximately the 70 hours of formal—” (30 seconds was called.) “—professional training through Wai‘anae High School, district supervisors, and nationally accredited SATEP program through TFA. Furthermore, as an actual participant of the AAQEP site visit in January, I am in the unique position of clarifying my, and other TFA members’, experience as a first-year SPED teacher. While we all hope for more resources for our students and additional supports, we have received several hundred hours of rigorous

instruction and training, in addition to over 500 hours of clinical teaching experience.

“Thank you.”

- Paoakalani Shook, Manager of Regional Team Initiatives at Teach For America Hawai'i, testified through Zoom on agenda item IV.A, entitled “NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates”:

“Aloha. My name is Paoakalani and I'm a 2015 TFA Hawai'i alumni who got to come back home to O'ahu after graduating from Harvard University to serve my community. I received a licensure in elementary K-6 from HTSB while serving as a special education teacher at Leihoku Elementary. While in the TFA Hawai'i ARC program, I received training and support through coaching, university coursework, and other development opportunities in both my subject area and special education that allowed me to develop my competency as a classroom teacher. Being a special education teacher provided an opportunity for me to more deeply understand and experience firsthand the inequities that are at play in our education system, and I have since continued to live out my commitment to helping expand access to equal yet individualized education for all of our keiki, especially for those coming from similar backgrounds as me—as a low-income first-gen Native Hawaiian.

“After teaching, I worked for the DOE's Office of Hawaiian Education, leading statewide implementation of HĀ, BOE Policy E-3, allowing for the contextualization of learning outcomes to Hawai'i. I then worked for UH West O'ahu, managing a grant program that expanded access to early college opportunities for Native Hawaiian and other students in the 'Ewa moku. And now I serve on TFA Hawai'i staff, which has been a full circle experience as I believe so deeply in our organization's mission of building a coalition of equity-oriented leaders working to expand opportunities for all children.

“I'm excited for the ways in which our current corps members will continue to contribute to the growth—” (30 seconds was called.) “—of our students in schools, many of whom are in dire need to fill their multitude of vacant teacher positions in special education settings with not only competent teachers, but teachers such as our corps members, who truly believe in the potential of each child and will serve as passionate, lifelong student advocates and community leaders. I thus strongly advocate that our candidates have met the criteria needed to obtain licensure, and I believe that our past, current, and future corps members have and will be equipped with a solid foundation needed to deepen their impact.

“Mahalo.”

- Ryan Mandado, CEO of DreamHouse 'Ewa Beach Public Charter School, testified through Zoom on agenda item IV.A, entitled “NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates”:

“Hello, everyone. My name is Ryan Mandado. I’m the current CEO of DreamHouse ‘Ewa Beach Public Charter School, Hawai‘i’s newest and fastest growing public charter school. Today I want to offer a story about my experience as a special education teacher through the Teach For America program. I am a 2015 corps member and I received enough and adequate training in order for me to lead Hawai‘i’s largest public high school, James Campbell High School, as their Special Education Department Head.

“Throughout my program, some of the things that I learned were culturally-responsive teaching, universal design for learning, brain-targeted teaching through Johns Hopkins University, being an advocate for disability justice, and how to implement a high quality project-based learning for all learners. As a response, once again, I led the largest special education department in the state, coached 30 SPEDucators, and serviced over 300 students with special needs, and, as a response, received \$70,000 from our former superintendent to support students in creating transitional plans at the high school. In turn, I became a school leader because I was advocating for more inclusive environments. And at DreamHouse, we are a full, inclusive environment. And all of these things—and some of our development of the school—was a result of all the training that I received from Teach For America and being a special education teacher. I was also responsible for implementing training to corps members, so, if you’re interested, I helped to coach and develop corps members and how to read and write IEPs, goal and objective writing, how to work with general education teachers to discuss excellent tier-one instruction, as well as teaching—” (30 seconds was called.) “—teaching strategies.

“To summarize everything, I just want to remind everyone that specially designed instruction may be delivered by an individual under the guidance of or in consultation with a special education teacher. Special education is a service, not a specific person or place—and that is on the Hawai‘i Revised Statutes chapter 60 page 14, if anyone is interested. So, thank you very much for allowing me to speak today.”

- Ryan Oshita, Vice Principal of Wai‘anae High School, testified through Zoom on agenda item IV.A, entitled “NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates”:

“Aloha. My name is Ryan Oshita and I’m providing testimony on NBI 22-102. I started teaching at Wai‘anae High School in 1994 and this is my twenty-ninth year. And I, along with every other administrator and teacher on the leeward coast and other hard-to-fill schools, would love to hire qualified special education teachers to work with our most needy students. I would also love them to stay until they are eligible to retire. However, this is not the case for the majority of teachers we hire, whether TFA or not.

“I ask that you reconsider the decision for not allowing TFA teachers to be hired as SPED teachers. With the statewide \$10,000 SPED differential, along with the \$8,000 hard-to-fill differential for schools on the leeward coast, we are still unable to hire qualified SPED teachers on the coast. Were it not for TFA, we

would need to hire long-term substitute teachers, most of whom have less than a bachelor's degree and they will not be able to carry any IEP cases, thus increasing the caseload for the remaining certified SPED teachers that we have on staff. Over the past nine years, I have conducted over 24 substitute teacher classes for the community school for adults, simply because we need to build the teacher pool on the leeward coast. We simply do not have enough subs to fill our vacancies. And I ask you to reconsider because, ultimately, it is our most vulnerable students who will suffer the consequences of this action, and I earnestly request that you prevent such an outcome from—" (30 seconds was called.)"—transpiring.

"I'd just like to say hi to Sierra and Katie because they were also Wai'anae High School SPED teachers, and it was a sore loss when they left. Thank you."

Licensing Specialist Rodriguez informed that there is no additional oral testimony at this time.

Board members received written testimony before the meeting. (A listing of the people who submitted written testimony before the meeting is included at the end of these minutes.)

**ANNOUNCEMENTS:** None

**EXECUTIVE SESSION PROCEDURAL INFORMATION:**

Chairperson Kawazoe shared information regarding procedures for virtual Executive Session:

- Executive Session will be conducted in this virtual meeting room and all other attendees will be transferred to a waiting room without access to the general room.
- You may not re-enter until the waiting room is closed. If you leave the waiting room, you must log back into the general meeting and be admitted after the Executive Session is adjourned.
- To ensure confidentiality, the Executive Session will be accessible only to HTSB members and required staff. The participants must confirm that no unauthorized person is present and able to see or hear the Executive Session.

**MOTION TO RISE INTO EXECUTIVE SESSION (Mew/Farden)**

*This portion of the meeting is a closed meeting under Section 92-4 and Section 92-5(a)(1)(2) and (4), Hawaii Revised Statutes.*

**BOARD MEMBERS VOTED TO ENTER EXECUTIVE SESSION AT 12:01 P.M.**

**CALL BACK TO ORDER BY CHAIRPERSON KAWAZOE AT 1:58 P.M.**

**TOPIC: Report out of Executive Session**

**DISCUSSION:**

Chairperson Kawazoe reported out:

- Consultation with Deputy Attorney General Michael Azuma on questions and issues pertaining to the board's powers, duties, privileges, immunities, and liabilities.
- Update on HTSB Approved Educator Preparation Program (EPP) Clinical Experience Placements.

**PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING AGENDA ITEM(S):**

Chairperson Kawazoe asked board staff to call on any additional Testifiers who have signed up to provide oral testimony on the agenda item(s).

Licensing Specialist Rodriguez informed that there are additional Testifiers signed up in the Zoom chat.

- Grace Brown, Service Supervisor at Arc of Kona, testified through Zoom on agenda item IV.A, entitled "NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates":

"My name is Grace Brown and I am a 2020 Teach For America Hawai'i alumni. I'm now a service supervisor and service coordinator for a disability services organization, the Arc of Kona. I received licensure from HTSB in elementary education and added the field of special education after passing the Praxis. As a corps member, I returned to my alma mater on Hawai'i Island, Hōnaunau Elementary, to teach third to fifth grade special education. This was after receiving my bachelor's in sociology from UH Mānoa, and TFA gave me an avenue into educational equity directly within my community.

"Being licensed in my content area, as well as special education, enabled me to create an inclusive environment for students with disabilities to succeed. As a special educator, your role is not simply to work with special education students. It is to support all students to be able to access the general education curriculum. To suggest that special education teachers are not qualified to earn licensure in their content area because they work with students with IEPs is blatantly disrespectful to the concept of inclusion, and it also further promotes the ableist division in our schools between students with disabilities and those without. Enabling our first-year corps members to earn their licensure this year will mean keeping passionate, dedicated, and excellent teachers in our schools, which is what we need.

"While in TFA, I received training and support in both my subject area and special education. I was provided with an excellent mentor, who I was able to meet with weekly. I co-taught all elementary subjects to third, fourth, and fifth grade. I also taught reading exclusively to general—" (30 seconds was called.)  
"—education students in first and second grade. Additionally, my experiences teaching both special education and general education have motivated me to



return to my alma mater, UH Mānoa, in the fall to pursue a graduate degree in educational foundations, in the pursuit of creating a more equitable education system for all of our keiki. I don't know if I would have ever taken this step had it not been my experiences with TFA, so I strongly urge you all to honor your precedent and license our corps members. Thank you."

- Lauren Gaeta, Teach For America Hawai'i, testified through Zoom on agenda item IV.A, entitled "NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates":

"Hi, I am Lauren Gaeta. I am a 2013 Teach For America Hawai'i alum, former teacher at Wai'anae High School for six years in general education and the inclusion setting, and now I'm staff at Teach For America Hawai'i as a coach for first- and second-year teachers.

"Over a hundred pages of testimony from school and district leaders, colleagues and alumni, those with boots-on-the-ground firsthand knowledge also corroborates what we know: our candidates are qualified, competent, and needed. I can affirm from experience—and now as a coach—that all our teachers, including our special education teachers, have received the same training and support, and meet the licensure requirements in their designated subject areas of math, science, English, social studies, and elementary. Remembering that they use the same NGSS and Common Core Standards, and the same assessments in their classrooms. Remembering that special education is a setting or a learning environment where students are supported and learning content and mastery of their content area is the best benefit that students are entitled to.

"I want to share a quick memory of my first week back teaching in 2013. I still remember one of the questions a student asked me: 'How long are you going to stay, miss?' This broke my heart. It showed that our students have internalized and believe that they don't matter, that the system and the people around them don't care enough about their stability and education. Our teachers are needed because our students deserve them.

"Bottom line: not allowing these—" (30 seconds was called.) "—teachers to be licensed will affect our students, our next generation of leaders. Please reconsider, especially for the current candidates who are in their final weeks of program and spent the last year of building relationships with and caring for and teaching their students. If left unlicensed, those teachers' classrooms are at risk of having that many more students with special needs left without a teacher. Thank you."

- Lia Rozmiarek-Held, Managing Director of Regional Team Initiatives at Teach For America Hawai'i, testified through Zoom on agenda item IV.A, entitled "NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates":

"Aloha, Board. I appreciate the opportunity to comment on NBI 22-102. My name is Lia Rozmiarek, born and raised in Wailupe. I am the Managing Director

of Regional Team Initiatives at Teach For America Hawai'i with 13 years in teaching. This is my twenty-fourth year in education.

“In the reading of this NBI, the implied position that teachers of special education are somehow also not teachers of content presents, on its face, an ableist orientation that students with disabilities’ needs are so radically different or somehow lower than a non-disabled child’s needs. That having a teacher teach a disabled child biology would never qualify them to teach biology to a student in a general education setting. This implication dehumanizes people with disabilities, which does not negate the challenges of being disabled in this society. But many of those challenges are created by society, not by disability. It is critical for students with disabilities that their teachers are strong content teachers, which we know our teachers and candidates for licensure are.

“On behalf of Hannah Bedwell, a teacher at Mā'ili EI who wanted to be here today but could not make the scheduled time, I share from her written testimony: ‘As an individual with disabilities myself, the past year has presented significant hardships. My primary objective has been to make a meaningful impact on the lives of the next generation of disabled youth, while serving as a representative of the disabled community within the classroom. I’m equipped to teach them self-advocacy skills and dismantle ableist stigmas that affect not just adults, but also fourth grade students, and have an inside understanding that can only be attributed to one directly within the community. The assertion that my role as a special education teacher somehow renders the content and rigor in my classroom fundamentally different from a general education classroom—solely due to the composition of the student body—is inherently rooted in ableism. It is important to emphasize that special education should not be regarded as a distinct content area, as all students should be exposed to the same grade-level content if engaging in equitable and ethical practices, regardless of accommodations or modifications. Equitable opportunities should not be presented solely in the special education classroom, but by all teachers in every classroom.’”

Time was called for Managing Director Rozmiarek-Held of Teach For America Hawai'i.

Licensing Specialist Rodriguez informed that there is no additional oral testimony.

**TOPIC: NBI 22-102** Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates.

**DISCUSSION/ACTION:**

- Chairperson Kawazoe introduced NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates.
- Prior to any discussion or decision was rendered regarding NBI 22-102, Licensing Specialist Rodriguez informed Chairperson Kawazoe that he was made aware of one final Testifier (Dean Cevallos).
- Chairperson Kawazoe allowed the final Testifier to present his oral testimony.

- Dean Cevallos, Principal of Kea‘au High School, testified through Zoom on agenda item IV.A, entitled “NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates”:

“So, I got informed about this because I’ve had TFA candidates for the past almost seven years and we have them in a variety of different positions. One of those, of course, is SPED, and we’re a highly inclusive high school. So, when I heard that we were going to look at the possibility of not having them licensed after a year of our training, and also training we get from our complex area superintendents, I felt that we were dishonoring the fact that—number one—we need special education teachers and regular education teachers, and it’s a venue that gives us very qualified and productive candidates. I’ve had nothing but good responses from all of my Teach For America candidates. And it’s whatever we get in through—we try to accommodate them the best we can, and they get training the best we can. But by the time they leave, they’ve had just as much training as with anybody else, and they’ve been given the content needs through our school and through the complex and through TFA, which do a great job at coaching these individuals in making sure that they’re very well-qualified.

“I would hope that, as the Department of Education is in such need of teachers, that we wouldn’t throw away the capability of one organization being able to give us very highly qualified, very talented teachers to join us in the teaching realms. So, I would appreciate if we could make sure that we honor that fact, and, if there’s individual cases, that we take that into consideration and it’s not overall—” (30 seconds was called.) “—throughout the TFA. So, as far as the principle goes, I really am appreciative of the TFA, the candidates. I’ve had great candidates come through and I would highly recommend that we look at making sure they get licensed because they work very hard and are determined and communicate and connect with our kids. So please take that into consideration.

“I appreciate my time. Thank you very much.”

- Licensing Specialist Rodriguez informed that there is no additional oral testimony.
- Chairperson Kawazoe called for a motion to discuss NBI 22-102. (Raymond/Sanders)
- Motion to amend NBI 22-102. (Gillentine/Farden)
- Board Member Gillentine proposed to amend the NBI by adding two (2) additional options that he believes are outlined in the Hawai‘i Revised Statutes (HRS):
  - Option (B) concerning observation and
  - Option (C) concerning test.He thinks that the wording would have to be taken from the law.

- Executive Director Villalobos put up the actual Hawai'i Administrative Rules (HAR) on the screen to copy and paste from it into the NBI.
- Board Member Gillentine stated that this expands the options for the candidates in question, particularly in:
  - Option (B) Through the demonstration of proficiency through documented satisfactory work experience and observation by the EPP.But these other options are part of our rules and so he feels that having additional options might be beneficial in this situation where there's a difficult situation overall in terms of looking at licensure issues.
- Board Member Mew stated that he is a principal representative on this board. He totally empathizes with those who testified saying that there is a need for teachers in the classroom, and that is what we try to do.
  - What we also need to be concerned about—and why we're here on the board—is to ensure that every classroom has highly qualified teachers. That is what we do.
  - There was a question that we had when looking at the testimony we're being provided and the data that was provided to us. These gave us this cause to relook at what the Teach For America (TFA) candidates were doing.
  - This is not about not allowing Emergency Hires. That is fine because principals look at what their qualifications are, having an Emergency Hire permit, and [principals] will place the candidate or Emergency Hire into a position where help is needed.
  - The concern really was about the teachers from TFA who are being placed in vacancies where they were not able to meet their clinical experience. And especially about secondary in the content area.
  - We looked at the so-called teaching lines that they were in and said, "Hey, wait a minute. How can you get your clinical experience in the subject area you're being licensed in if it's in a Special Education line?" That caused us to pause and review this. And that was the question.He spoke about his experience at his school when there is a student teacher—and his experience is typically with University of Hawai'i at Mānoa, Chaminade University, and Brigham Young Institute-Hawai'i, where they have student teacher candidates:
  - They always inform his school that, in order for the student teacher candidates to meet their clinical experience, they need to be placed in a line where they can get that clinical experience. Therefore, the EPP can then recommend them for licensure.
  - That's his platform, so we do that.
  - Otherwise, he does have Emergency Hire folks in lines at his school that— They're not going for that. They're here as a teacher, Emergency Hire, so that they can help us help our [student teachers] meet the standards of whatever courses they're teaching so they can earn credit. So that was the question.

- This is to no fault of the seventeen (17) teachers that really caused us pause. He believes that if the teachers were being placed by TFA into the lines, that they should ensure and let the teachers know, yes, this will lead you to whatever content you're in that TFA is allowed to issue.
- But that was the question. It was a question of supervised clinical experience in that particular area.

He spoke to his Math Department Chair at his school and asked the question about inclusion mathematics versus general education mathematics versus resource mathematics, which is all special education.

- The Math Department Chair, a Presidential Award recipient, stated that, no, there is a big difference. You cannot get the same experience in special education mathematics as you can in general education mathematics.
- For him, his department chair's response confirmed that in order to get the highly qualified teachers their license in our classrooms, HTSB's process needs to be followed.

He recommended approval of NBI 22-102, even as modified by Board Member Gillentine.

- Board Member Moriarty stated that she is the Board of Education (BOE)'s representative on the Hawai'i Teacher Standards Board.
  - The BOE is passing a new strategic plan for the state's education system and for the implementation plan.
  - One of its high priority items is to make sure that all of our students have a highly qualified, effective teacher. One of the outcomes is that all teacher positions are filled with qualified hires.
  - As is evident by the length of time spent in Executive Session today, this issue was discussed from many different angles and considered very carefully.

She stated that the question is really not the broad question. There were lots of different things that could have just been decided, but we were actually deciding a single and very nuanced question.

- The question is, "Whether these specific candidates are sufficiently prepared to be issued general education licenses in specific content areas?"
- She thinks that Board Member Principal Mew shared some of the sense of the discussion that we had.
- So this—the amended proposal—proposes a nuanced response which would give, for example, a teacher who taught in a contained class with a small number of students—perhaps partially in the content area, but perhaps other life skills as well—alternative opportunities to be able to demonstrate that he/she was, in fact, able to show that he/she was sufficiently prepared to teach in what might be a larger general education class setting with a different range of students in it, and that might require

a different set of teaching methods or instruction in order to meet the content and standards requirements that would, in fact, be the same.

- She thinks that the desire of this amended version is to be able to provide that more nuanced opportunity to these particular candidates to demonstrate their proficiency.

She wanted to say that, listening to the testimony, we could see what an amazing contribution the TFA teachers have made both to individual students and to schools across our state, especially in some of the hardest-to-fill positions and areas.

- And thank you. This is an amazing contribution and, in dealing with this difficult issue today, we would not want to discourage anybody. Just please know that we value you.

She stated that what she would like to do—given this great, just amazing evidence we’ve seen of success—is encourage TFA to seek to get approved to be able to prepare students for licensure in the SPED area.

- She thinks that would have made the task today much easier for us.

- Board Member Ornelles stated that, as others have expressed, this was an extremely difficult conversation.

- She wanted to first recognize TFA teacher candidates, the passion they bring to their work, and the commitment they have expressed.

She mentioned that, thinking from an EPP perspective, it is a tremendous responsibility for our educator preparation programs to ensure that programs are aligned, and that the field experience that our [student teachers] have really support and strengthen our candidates and prepare them for what they’re being licensed in.

- She just wanted to underscore that message because we owe that to our teacher candidates, that we are providing that for them and guiding through them through these experiences so that these kinds of very difficult and painful situations don’t have to happen if we can avoid that in the future.

- Board Member Soares stated that she is a principal on Moloka‘i at a hard-to-fill school. She mentioned she has a differential for all of the differentials that are available.

- Just coming from that perspective, she knows how hard it is because she is in a super remote area and they really have to grow their own. So, she understands how important these programs are.

She stated that, at the same time, no matter where your students are, whether in a remote area like Wai‘anae—which is very similar to her demographic—our students deserve quality candidates.

- That’s what this board is about.

- It's not about blocking and we totally support filling the teacher shortage, but it needs to be with quality candidates, and we need to have fidelity in the programs that we are providing.
- Her school also uses programs similar to TFA to fill their positions.
- It is important to her, as a principal supervising some of these people in "grow your own" programs, to make sure that they are certified and trained in the area that they are teaching. Our kids are that important.

She stated that the other part that hasn't been mentioned as much is the special education law and our responsibility to make sure that those kids are being educated by people trained in that field.

- She is just underscoring and appreciating everything that everyone else has said.
  - She also would highly encourage TFA to go for aligning with getting SPED certification and having that as one of the options, because it is one of our areas of highest need going forward.
- Board Member Miyamae stated that she is speaking not just as a board member, but as a teacher who has worn many hats. She commends all of you for going into teaching that are on here.
    - She started out as a SPED teacher and then switched over to general education. She has also been a mentor, so she has worn all the hats. Her heart goes out to you and she knows how difficult it is.
    - Going forward, speaking to the change, hopefully that will help out for those that were in a SPED placement this year to be able to get your qualifications.

She stated that, again, going through a special education program is very different. To have that knowledge and to go through the coursework, to make sure that we're following federal laws is so important.

- She thinks sometimes that it's just so specialized that we need to remember it's not that we're downplaying being in a special ed setting or an inclusion setting at all.
- She thinks what we're saying is that we commend you for going into this, but we want to make sure that everybody has those qualifications needed, being if you're going into a SPED program—that would be ultimately great because, you're right, we do have this great need.

She wanted to reiterate what some of the other board members said that, going forward, if TFA would just add that qualification as an EPP, she thinks that would alleviate this.

- From all the wonderful testimony that we're hearing from people saying that they're coming out qualified, if you want to go that route, she thinks it's awesome.
- But again, we need to look at making sure that we do have those qualifications in place for the teachers.
- So, hopefully with this amendment, it will help those that were in that current placement going forward.

- And again, TFA, please consider it. She thinks that would be just great going forward if you could have that qualification.
- Chairperson Kawazoe continued the discussion on the proposed amendment to NBI 22-102.
- Board Member Gillentine made a formatting suggestion to the last line.
- Board Member Sanders stated that the proposed amendment currently goes straight into the added Options (B) and (C), without an Option (A).
  - She asked if the [original] paragraph is the Option (A), and, if it is, should it be labeled as such?
- Chairperson Kawazoe stated he believes the first option would be the four hundred fifty (450) hours.
  - He asked Executive Director Villalobos to assist with clarifying an Option (A).
- Executive Director Villalobos stated that Option (A) would be “complete supervised clinical experience in student teaching, internship...”
  - She asked Chairperson Kawazoe if he would like her to speak on the three Options.
- Chairperson Kawazoe agreed and asked Executive Director Villalobos to expand on the three Options.
- Executive Director Villalobos stated that:
  - **Option (A)** is traditionally for in-state approved programs where a teacher is placed in the actual field in which they’re going to be recommended for licensure.
    - We have different licenses.
    - We have a special education license, which a program is approved through the Board to put the teacher candidates in that placement. Then, they’ll be issued a license in special education.
    - We also have the general education line, where our programs are approved through that line and they’re allowed to recommend in that line.

Through this option, you have the four hundred fifty (450) hours of clinical experience placement.

In the past, the Board has approved two (2) other options: Option (B) and Option (C).

  - **Option (B)**: The demonstration of teaching proficiency through a combination of documented satisfactory work experience and observation by the EPP.
    - This is more for if someone has completed a program—let’s say they completed a program from a different state, but it never led to



licensure and maybe they want to look at not doing an entire clinical experience but going through an approved EPP program in our state that is approved by the Board to satisfy that need.

- It can also be someone in a private school who maybe had twenty (20) years of teaching experience. Along with the observation route, they would also have to complete anything in Hawai'i Administrative Rules, which is outlined by the Board. All EPP programs in Hawai'i have to braid that into their programs.
  - **Option (C):** Passing a board approved performance assessment.
    - Currently, the only board-approved assessment for clinical experience is the Educative Teacher Performance Assessment (edTPA).
    - There is a New Business Item with cut scores on that as well.
  - So those are the three (3) Options.
  - There's no other board-approved test. The edTPA is the only one.
  - To summarize, the three (3) options are:
    - A. The four hundred fifty (450) hours of clinical experience in the area in which you're going to be recommended for licensure;
    - B. Demonstration of teaching proficiency, which is done by the EPP program in conjunction with the documented satisfactory work experience;
    - C. The board-approved assessment, which is the edTPA currently on the books right now.
- Chairperson Kawazoe asked Board Members if there was any further discussion on the proposed amendment.
  - Board Members discussed the language of the proposed amendment and made suggestions to ensure there is consistency with the language in Hawai'i Administrative Rules §8-54-19.
  - Chairperson Kawazoe called for a vote on whether or not to approve the proposed amendment to NBI 22-102.
  - Board Members voted in favor of approving the proposed amendment to NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates.
    - The motion carried unanimously with all members present voting aye.
  - Chairperson Kawazoe stated that he shared the same sentiments as the rest of the board members in regard to the situation the TFA candidates are in.
    - We are grateful, no doubt, you are doing a fantastic job in the classrooms and wherever you are at. It is a difficult time for everybody, especially for the TFA candidates.
- He stated that the bottom line, though, is that TFA is not approved to recommend in special education. Therefore, the teaching placement should not be in special education.

- Just to reference some of the placements, for instance, we have some CBI Community-Based Instruction teachers that are going to be recommended for English.
- The alignment for us as the Board—that does not meet our Vision and Mission.
- And so, to everybody else’s point, we highly encourage TFA to get approved to recommend in special education. That will help us fill the shortage.

He stated that HTSB, moving forward with our staff and Executive Director—everybody is on board to help with the teacher shortage, retaining teachers, and doing what we can for our youth.

- That is our sentiment and stance, and we hope to make progress.
- There being no further discussion, Chairperson Kawazoe called for a vote on whether or not to approve NBI 22-102, as amended.
- Board Members voted to approve NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates, as amended.
  - The motion carried unanimously with all members present voting aye.
- NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates as amended, was adopted by the Board.

**TOPIC: Next HTSB Meeting: September 15, 2023**

**DISCUSSION:**

**ADJOURNMENT:**

Chairperson Kawazoe adjourned the meeting at 3:08 p.m.

Recorder: Elaine Hutchinson      Date: May 23, 2023  
Elaine Hutchinson

**List of the people who submitted written testimony before the meeting**

NAME	ORGANIZATION	AGENDA ITEM
Hannah Bedwell	Mā'ili Elementary School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Avery Rowcroft	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Ryan Lancaster	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Colleen Bixler	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Alexa Bourcier	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Matthew Jones	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Christina Bailey	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Kelsey Nelson	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Kylee Bauer	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Andrew Smith	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Tamie Richardson	Ka'imiloa Elementary School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Michael Ratcliffe	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Mckinley Bleskachek	Konawaena Middle School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Benjamin Luginbill	Kealakehe High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Sarah Kern	Chiefess Kamakahalei Middle School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Shelby Roberson	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates

Latasha Davis	Wahiawā Middle School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Katrina Karl	Waipahu High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Cassidy Holbrook	Wai'anae Intermediate School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Martin Moore	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Darren Sana	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Brendan Fliris	Ka'ū-Kea'au-Pāhoa Complex Area	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Alyssa Imai	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Erica Kelly	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Jennifer Megahan	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
JT Su	'Ewa Makai Middle School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Bill Chen	Kealakehe High School, Vice Principal	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Marites Kaji	Wai'anae High School, Vice Principal	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Katie Kealoha	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Hannah Loera	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Ryan Tong	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Richard Gardenhire	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Julia De Jong	Mā'ili Elementary School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Josh Manansala	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates

Garrett Gage	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Madeleine Mazzola	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Renee Lovell	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Nicole Clapson	Lehua Elementary School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Stephany Makizuru	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Madeline McKinnon	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Joseph Gulisao	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Griffin Bolan	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Alec Lazor	'Aiea High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Christen Wilson	Lehua Elementary School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Deborah Moon		IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Moses Mikasobe-Magno III	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Julianna Grainge	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Paoakalani Shook	Teach For America Hawai'i, Manager of Regional Team Initiatives	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Hannah Thornton	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Ryan Oshita	Wai'anae High School, Vice Principal	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Kristin Lindquist	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates

Valerie Romero	Ka'imiloa Elementary School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
William Moran	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Dr. Dale Fryxell	Chaminade University School of Education and Behavioral Sciences, Dean	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Danielle Brown	Wai'anae High School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Jon Henry Lee	James Campbell High School, Principal	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Gabriella DeRossi	Wai'anae Intermediate School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Grace Brown	Arc of Kona, Service Supervisor	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Kristina Vilorio	DreamHouse 'Ewa Beach Public Charter School	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Maile Shimabukuro	District 22, Hawai'i State Senator	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Scot Matayoshi	District 49, Hawai'i State Representative	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Anela Pia	Ka'imiloa Elementary School, Principal	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Jill Baldemor	Teach For America Hawai'i, Executive Director	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Trever Asam	Cades Schutte LLP	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Amy Perruso	District 46, Hawai'i State Representative	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Jeanné Kapela	District 5, Hawai'i State Representative	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Sierra Callihan	Teach For America Hawai'i	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates

**APPROVED**

Jenna Moriwaki		IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates
Disa Hauge	Nānākuli-Wai'anae Complex Area, Interim Complex Area Superintendent	IV.A. NBI 22-102 Student Teaching Policy Regarding Teach For America Candidates