



**STATE OF HAWAII
HAWAII TEACHER STANDARDS BOARD
TEACHER EDUCATION COMMITTEE MEETING**

MINUTES

Remote Technology via Zoom

650 Iwilei Road, Suite 158
Honolulu, HI 96817

Friday, August 30, 2024

PRESENT IN-PERSON:

Kristi Miyamae, *Ex-officio*

PRESENT ONLINE:

Dr. Cecily Ornelles for Dr. Nathan Murata, *Committee Chairperson*

Dr. Jonathan Gillentine, *Committee Vice-Chairperson*

Dawn Raymond

Dale Matsuura

Sean Bacon for Keith Hayashi

Dondra Ozaki

Lokelani Han, *Ex-officio*

EXCUSED:

Kahele Dukelow for Roy Takumi

STAFF:

Felicia Villalobos, Executive Director

Steven Harada, Licensing Specialist

Dr. Mitzie Higa, Licensing Specialist

Tracey Idica, NBCT, Licensing Specialist

Kris Murakami, Esq., Licensing Specialist

Dr. Jennifer Padua, Licensing Specialist

UNAPPROVED

I. CALL TO ORDER

A. ROLL CALL TO ESTABLISH QUORUM

Committee Chairperson Dr. Cecily Ornelles called the Teacher Education Committee Meeting to order at 11:15 a.m.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles shared information regarding procedures for virtual committee meetings, then called roll call and established quorum. *Ex-officio* Committee Member Kristi Miyamae was present in-person. Committee Chairperson Ornelles; Committee Vice-Chairperson Dr. Jonathan Gillentine; Committee Members Dawn Raymond, Dale Matsuura, Sean Bacon, Dondra Ozaki; and *Ex-officio* Committee Member Lokelani Han were present online. Committee Member Kahele Dukelow was excused.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles shared information regarding non-public site disclosure. None of the committee members participating online had anyone present with them. Committee Chairperson Ornelles then shared additional information regarding meeting protocols and procedures.

B. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON COMMITTEE AGENDA ITEMS

None

C. ANNOUNCEMENTS

None

D. APPROVAL OF COMMITTEE MINUTES

Committee Chairperson Ornelles suggested an amendment on page four of the April 26, 2024, meeting minutes regarding changing '*Institute for Teacher Education*' to '*School of Teacher Education*.' She stated this official change at the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's College of Education was approved in spring of 2022 by the Board of Regents.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles mentioned she would also suggest this amendment for the April 26, 2024, General Business Meeting minutes.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any other corrections to the minutes. There were no other corrections from committee members.

The minutes of the April 26, 2024, meeting was approved as amended.

II. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON COMMITTEE AGENDA ITEMS

None

III. ACTION / DISCUSSION ITEMS

E. NBI 21-05 Revised: Revised State Approval of Leeward Community College Educator Preparation Unit and Programs

UNAPPROVED

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 21-05 Revised, highlighting the revisions made in red, which includes the Rationale/Background.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles suggested an amendment to the Rationale/Background regarding the licensure level for Leeward Community College's ("LCC's") Advanced Professional Certificate in Special Education Program. She recommended adding the following sentence: *'The level of licensure for special education should reflect K-6 and 6-12.'*

Christina Keaulana, a member of the public, was recognized by Committee Chairperson Ornelles to provide the Hawai'i Teacher Standards Board ("HTSB") with more information.

Ms. Keaulana apologized for not following protocol but wanted to clarify the discrepancy mentioned in the Rationale/Background. She explained LCC is approved for PK-12 for add-a-field licensure but not initial licensure. She asked if it would be helpful to include the descriptor *'initial licensure'* in the suggested amendment. Therefore, the final suggested amendment would state, *'The level of licensure for special education should reflect K-6 and 6-12 for initial licensure.'*

Committee Chairperson Ornelles stated she thought it would be accurate to include that but wanted confirmation from Executive Director Felicia Villalobos.

Executive Director Villalobos confirmed it was correct.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 21-05 Revised, as revised, to the full board ("Board") at the General Business Meeting scheduled later at 12:30 p.m. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. All other committee members present voted to recommend.

ACTION — The Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 21-05 Revised, as revised, to the Board, with seven of eight members present voting aye.

F. NBI 21-10 Revised: Approval of Leeward Community College's Letter of Intent to Plan a SPED PK-3 Initial Licensure Program

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 21-10 Revised, which includes the Rationale/Background.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any questions or discussion.

Regarding the grade level *'PK,'* Committee Vice-Chairperson Gillentine asked if HTSB should follow the label provided by the educator preparation provider ("EPP"), or if HTSB should use a consistent label across all licensure work. He also asked if *'PK'* is different from *'P'* when it comes to licensure.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked Executive Director Villalobos to comment on this. Committee Chairperson Ornelles also stated she believed that the licensure level for preschool to third grade was currently indicated as *'PK-3.'*

Executive Director Villalobos stated the licensure level was currently 'P-3.' She explained that HTSB has a system where the applications are tailored with certain grade bands. She also stated the level is based on what the EPPs use in their letter of intent, and not created by HTSB. She mentioned once the EPPs turn their program in for review and for adoption by the Board to initiate the program, HTSB can change it at that time or address it as a New Business Item ("NBI"), which should have the accurate licensure grade level.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any further questions or discussion. There were no further questions or discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 21-10 Revised, as written, to the Board at the General Business Meeting scheduled later at 12:30 p.m. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. All other committee members present voted to recommend.

ACTION — The Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 21-10 Revised, as written, to the Board, with seven of eight members present voting aye.

G. NBI 20-15 Revised: Approval of the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's Letter of Intent to Plan a New Program in School Counseling

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 20-15 Revised, highlighting the revisions made in red. She stated the revisions currently align with NBI 24-04, which was heard during the Teacher Standards Committee Meeting earlier at 10:30 a.m. She also stated the Teacher Standards Committee voted to recommend NBI 24-04, as amended, to the Board.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles suggested an amendment regarding the first bullet point of the revised Master of Education Degree in School Counseling license fields. To align with the recommendation of the Teacher Standards Committee at their meeting earlier, Committee Chairperson Ornelles moved to amend the grade level 'PK-6' to 'P-6.'

Committee Vice-Chairperson Gillentine seconded the motion.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on the grade level amendment. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. All other committee members present voted to amend.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles suggested another amendment regarding the revised language added to the Rationale/Background. She moved to amend the wording by replacing it with: *'The school counseling program offered through UH Mānoa received approval through the UH Board of Regents on October 20, 2022, to prepare candidates to support P-12 students.'*

Committee Vice-Chairperson Gillentine seconded the motion.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any further questions or discussion regarding the amendment. There were no further questions or discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on the Rationale/Background amendment. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. All other committee members present voted to amend.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any further questions or discussion on NBI 20-15 Revised, as amended. There were no further questions or discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 20-15 Revised, as amended, to the Board at the General Business Meeting scheduled later at 12:30 p.m. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. All other committee members present voted to recommend.

ACTION — The Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 20-15 Revised, as amended, to the Board, with seven of eight members present voting aye.

H. NBI 11-03 Revised: Criteria for Satisfying HTSB’s Clinical Experience Options

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 11-03 Revised, highlighting the revisions made in red, which includes the Rationale/Background. She noted Options B and C were not established to bypass requirements essential for maintaining quality of instruction but are more of an exception to the norm for individuals who may be able to fulfill demonstrating and documenting that they have met all the quality indicators for their teaching license.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any questions or discussion.

Ex-officio Committee Member Han wanted clarification regarding monitoring the ‘*process*’ of the program versus ‘*progress*.’ She asked if there was a difference between the two.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles answered she believes the state approved teacher education program’s (“SATEP’s”) monitoring process would include the progress of the teacher candidates using the option and ensuring they meet the requirements.

Committee Member Bacon wanted clarification regarding when these revised requirements would take effect as he wanted to ensure the candidates currently working on one of these options are not going to be negatively impacted. He also mentioned Option B ‘*may*’ be effective immediately, not ‘*must*’ be effective immediately. He asked if the Board could make an effective date clearer for the Institutions of Higher Education (“IHEs”).

Committee Chairperson Ornelles stated she thinks the first bullet point may affect these candidates because the SATEP may not have provided the Option B requirements to HTSB, and some candidates may have already been approved by the IHE. She also stated she believes the second bullet point should be fulfilled regardless, but she thinks it would be advisable to include an effective date.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked Executive Director Villalobos to weigh in on the discussion and an appropriate effective date.

Executive Director Villalobos clarified that this would be for all EPPs, not just the approved programs that are IHEs. She mentioned Option B is not often used because it costs IHEs

money compared to having a candidate fully enrolled and completing an entire program. She explained a bit of the NBI's history and stated it has gone through many revisions over the years because the Board wanted to add more guardrails and ensure that EPPs were providing everything as outlined in Hawaii Administrative Rules ("HAR"). She also mentioned she has not ever seen anyone use Option C so far, but it exists just in case.

Referring back to an effective date, Executive Director Villalobos stated it would be up to the committee and the Board to decide on a timeline and whether or not they would want to grandfather candidates in. She gave some examples that the committee may decide that the changes be effective January 1, 2025, so everyone could start to do their Option B now, or the committee may decide that the changes be effective immediately so only the candidates currently in a program using Option B could be grandfathered in, and then the EPP would need to meet the revised requirements moving forward with all other candidates.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles stated she thinks it is difficult to choose a specific date such as January 1, 2025, because it would not apply to the fall semester candidates. She stated she wonders if it should apply immediately to those who are currently considering or applying for Options B or C.

Committee Member Bacon suggested wording that the revised option would take effect immediately for those who have not started their clinical experience. He reiterated his concern about any potential negative impacts on those candidates.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles stated she thinks it is not just the student teaching portion as those candidates are not doing the 450 hours in Option A since Option B is an exception to the rule. She suggested wording that the revised option would take effect immediately for those who are currently applying for Option B.

Committee Member Bacon suggested wording that the revised option would take effect immediately for new candidates specifically.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any further questions or discussion.

Ex-officio Committee Member Han wanted clarification regarding the suggested wording from Committee Member Bacon.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles clarified that the revised option would apply to all new candidates who want to use Option B, so from here on out they would need to adhere to the revised requirements.

Referring to the suggested wording from Committee Member Bacon, Committee Member Raymond asked if candidates currently using Option B would not need to do a minimum of three formal observations by the SATEP.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles answered that is the implication because the previous language of the NBI did not specify a minimum number of observations.

Ex-officio Committee Member Miyamae asked if the suggested wording from Committee Member Bacon would also apply to the five years of full-time employment.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles answered that is correct.

Committee Member Ozaki asked when the revised requirements would be implemented if there is no specific effective date.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles answered the effective date would be when the NBI is approved by the Board.

Ex-officio Committee Member Han wanted clarification regarding the minimum of three formal observations and asked about the implications it has for both the SATEPs and the candidates.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles stated she would hope that the SATEPs determine the number of observations based on need. She explained one observation is not adequate and not enough to verify consistency, a second observation may verify competency and provide increased assurance, but a third observation has a stronger establishment and can reinforce consistency.

Executive Director Villalobos advised that there should first be a motion to amend the NBI before further discussion surrounding the suggested wording continues.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a motion to amend Option B with the suggested wording.

Committee Vice-Chairperson Gillentine moved to amend Option B. Committee Member Bacon seconded the motion.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any further questions or discussion about the Option B amendment.

Committee Member Raymond commented she understands where Committee Member Bacon is coming from, but she feels it is very important that all the revised requirements apply to not only the new candidates coming in but also the current candidates using Option B if there is a possibility that they will not be negatively affected.

Committee Member Bacon asked if the amended language should be added to Option C.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles acknowledged Committee Member Raymond's comment. She mentioned HTSB could ask EPPs to document how the criteria have been met, but she stated it is hard to know how many candidates may be affected. She asked Executive Director Villalobos if HTSB has data regarding how many candidates are using Option B.

Executive Director Villalobos answered she did not have a number at the moment. She stated there are no EPPs who indicate up front that they are using Option B, but rather they inquire about it to ensure they are on the right track. She mentioned HTSB staff has asked some EPPs about how they recommend a candidate for Option B as it varies from program to program. She also mentioned this NBI can be revised again, but she advised putting some guardrails in place now to ensure, for example, that emergency hire experience is not being used to circumvent 450 hours of clinical experience, which is currently possible without the revised requirements.

UNAPPROVED

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any further questions or discussion regarding the amendment to Option B. There were no further questions or discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on the Option B amendment for NBI 11-03 Revised. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. All other committee members present voted to amend.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles moved to add that same amendment to Option C, as well as strike *'or permit'* from *'...to grant a Hawai'i license or permit'* in Option C.

Committee Member Bacon seconded the motion.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any further questions or discussion about the Option C amendments. There were no further questions or discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on the Option C amendments for NBI 11-03 Revised. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. All other committee members present voted to amend.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any further questions or discussion on NBI 11-03 Revised, as amended. There were no further questions or discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 11-03 Revised, as amended, to the Board at the General Business Meeting scheduled later at 12:30 p.m. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. All other committee members present voted to recommend.

ACTION — The Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 11-03 Revised, as amended, to the Board, with seven of eight members present voting aye.

I. NBI 12-27 Revised: Student Teaching Policy for HTSB Approved Educator Preparation Providers

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 12-27 Revised, which includes the Rationale/Background, and highlighted the revisions made in red.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any questions or discussion.

Committee Member Bacon mentioned sometimes EPPs have difficulty finding appropriate student teacher placements. He asked if HTSB has any indication or data showing that this would not hinder the EPP's ability to place candidates appropriately so that they can complete their program in a timely manner.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles stated she feels this NBI underscores the need for EPPs to ensure that their candidates' clinical experience aligns with what they are being prepared for. She mentioned it reinforces the readiness of these candidates and stated she thinks it will have EPPs more thoughtfully determine the appropriateness of placement. She

UNAPPROVED

commented she knows it is a challenge, but she believes it will contribute to the quality of the candidates' preparation.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any further questions or discussion. There were no further questions or discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 12-27 Revised, as written, to the Board at the General Business Meeting scheduled later at 12:30 p.m. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. All other committee members present voted to recommend.

ACTION — The Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 12-27 Revised, as written, to the Board, with seven of eight members present voting aye.

IV. ADJOURNMENT

Committee Chairperson Ornelles adjourned the Teacher Education Committee Meeting at 12:35 p.m.