



**STATE OF HAWAII
HAWAII TEACHER STANDARDS BOARD
GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING**

MINUTES

Remote Technology via Zoom

650 Iwilei Road, Suite 158
Honolulu, HI 96817

Friday, September 27, 2024

PRESENT IN-PERSON:

Kristi Miyamae, *Board Chairperson*
Sean Bacon for Keith Hayashi
Kim Sanders

PRESENT ONLINE:

Dr. Philip Bossert
Kahele Dukelow for Roy Takumi
Dr. Jonathan Gillentine
Dale Matsuura
Justin Mew
Dr. Cecily Ornelles for Dr. Nathan Murata
Dondra Ozaki
Dr. Katina Soares

EXCUSED:

Lokelani Han, *Board Vice-Chairperson*
Dawn Raymond

NOT PRESENT:

Elena Farden for Keahi Makaimoku

STAFF:

Felicia Villalobos, Executive Director
Steven Harada, Licensing Specialist
Dr. Mitzie Higa, Licensing Specialist

STAFF (continued):

Kris Murakami, Esq., Licensing Specialist
Dr. Jennifer Padua, Licensing Specialist

I. CALL TO ORDER

A. ROLL CALL TO ESTABLISH QUORUM

Board Chairperson Kristi Miyamae called the General Business Meeting to order at 11:06 a.m.

Board Chairperson Miyamae shared information regarding procedures for virtual board meetings, then called roll call and established quorum. Board Chairperson Miyamae, and Board Members Sean Bacon and Kim Sanders were present in-person. Board Members Dr. Philip Bossert, Kahele Dukelow, Dr. Jonathan Gillentine, Dale Matsuura, Justin Mew, Dr. Cecily Ornelles, Dondra Ozaki, and Dr. Katina Soares were present online. Board Vice-Chairperson Lokelani Han and Board Member Dawn Raymond were excused. Board Member Elena Farden was not present.

Board Chairperson Miyamae shared information regarding non-public site disclosure. None of the board members participating online had anyone present with them to disclose. Board Chairperson Miyamae then shared additional information regarding meeting protocols and procedures.

B. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING AGENDA ITEMS

Executive Director Felicia Villalobos announced there was on-time and late written testimony submitted.

HTSB staff shared the late written testimony on-screen for viewing.

C. ANNOUNCEMENTS

Board Chairperson Miyamae announced the Hawai'i Teacher Standards Board ("HTSB") has a new board member, Dr. Philip Bossert, who will be HTSB's Hawai'i Association of Independent Schools ("HAIS") representative. She welcomed Dr. Bossert and shared more about him.

D. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Board Chairperson Miyamae introduced Executive Director Villalobos to share her report.

Executive Director Villalobos announced the full board ("Board") would not be voting on any meeting minutes at this time. She explained the Board will vote on two sets of meeting minutes at the November board meeting.

Regarding her Executive Director's Report, Executive Director Villalobos noted that HTSB has a unique opportunity to gather data through the license and permit application process that possibly the Hawai'i Department of Education ("HIDOE") schools, the Hawai'i public charter schools, and Hawai'i-approved educator preparation programs ("EPPs") cannot. She

UNAPPROVED

mentioned HTSB can gather data such as where individuals are currently teaching at, whether in Hawai'i, the continental U.S., or internationally. She highlighted the number of elementary education emergency hires is surpassing special education as the teacher shortage area, though it is not only a concern in Hawai'i but a national one as well. She stated the data HTSB is gathering will be shared with stakeholders who can possibly use it for recruitment and retention purposes.

Executive Director Villalobos stated one of the revised questions on the application survey asks where applicants graduated high school from. She also stated HTSB is piloting Educators Rising and some of the high school CTE (Career and Technical Education) pathways. She mentioned HTSB is trying to take a count of where applicants may be interested in teaching. She clarified if a school name is not shown in the results, then HTSB did not have an applicant from that school.

Board Member Dukelow asked if the individuals filling out this survey were applying for a license.

Executive Director Villalobos answered it is anyone filling out a license application, including tenured teachers, and it could also be to add a field to their license or to renew their license.

For Question 6, Executive Director Villalobos clarified the list of the current 14 Hawai'i-approved EPPs and other programs that are no longer in Hawai'i. She explained teacher candidates may have completed those other programs at that time when they were still Hawai'i-approved. For Question 7, she noted that the top five states where applicants completed their state-approved teacher education programs ("SATEPs") may be in alignment with HIDOE's recruitment efforts or due to information about HIDOE being shared with teachers who have licenses from these other states. For Question 8, she mentioned the current Hawai'i-approved EPPs want to know when applicants completed their SATEP. She stated eventually HTSB can align these results with the specific EPP and track where the applicants are at. For Question 13, which addresses the Hawaii Administrative Rules ("HAR") requirements for Hawai'i-approved EPPs, she explained the answer '*Not Part of my Program*' could mean applicants completed their Hawai'i-approved EPP before the HAR requirement existed or their non-Hawai'i-approved SATEP did not incorporate it.

Executive Director Villalobos shared NASDTEC (National Association of State Directors of Teacher Education) is advertising for its second national convening on registered apprenticeship in teaching. She explained HTSB and other Hawai'i educational stakeholders attended the first convening and learned about the apprenticeship programs in other states and jurisdictions. She invited board members to attend if they were interested and available.

Executive Director Villalobos briefly shared about Dive Into Education 2.0, an event for high school students in the CTE pathway that was put together by Ms. Tammy Yoon of Pearl City High School and her students, which they started last year.

Board Chairperson Miyamae expressed her excitement to see so many high school students interested in the teaching pathway. She also shared Licensing Specialist Tracey Idica did a great job moderating a panel of early leaders. She stated it was a very nice event that would hopefully get some excitement going for the teaching profession.

Executive Director Villalobos shared an update regarding the SAEF (State Apprenticeship Expansion Formula) grant. She stated in order to receive the SAEF grant funding, the

registered apprenticeship program needs to be approved in the state of Hawai'i. She explained this is done through the Department of Labor and Industrial Relations ("DLIR") and its State Apprenticeship Council, who then makes a recommendation to DLIR Director Mr. Jade Butay. She thanked Licensing Specialist Dr. Mitzie Higa for working extremely hard navigating the application process, as well as HTSB's stakeholders.

Specialist Higa shared HTSB went to the State Apprenticeship Council's meeting yesterday with DLIR and, contingent upon HGEA (Hawaii Government Employees Association) signing, the council approved the standards of apprenticeship for teachers. She stated HIDOE will need to meet with HGEA for a consultative letter, but she expressed HTSB's eagerness to move forward and begin planning next steps now that funds can be released to start the program. She noted funding actually dropped to DLIR in July, but the State Apprenticeship Council only meets quarterly.

Board Chairperson Miyamae commented this is exciting news and HTSB looks forward to working with Board Member Bacon and HIDOE so that more qualified teachers can get into the classroom. She thanked everyone for their hard work.

Board Chairperson Miyamae announced the Teacher Education Committee's Dropbox contains a syllabi folder for NBI 24-08 and unredacted program reports related to NBI 24-07 and NBI 24-08. She stated the public will receive the redacted reports with no syllabi details in order to safeguard the programs' intellectual properties.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

II. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING AGENDA ITEMS

None

E. LICENSING UPDATE – Licensing Specialist Steven Harada

Board Chairperson Miyamae introduced Specialist Harada to share the licensing update.

Specialist Harada stated licensing notifications and applications have been steady but not overflowing. He announced for the first time this year on September 6th, the licensing team zeroed out all notifications and thought that was amazing considering there were about 1,000 notifications a couple of months ago.

Specialist Harada shared the first semester of HIDOE's biannual audit for the 2024-2025 school year did not go as planned. He explained the licensing letters from HIDOE's Office of Talent Management ("OTM") were not sent out to the teachers, principals, regional officers and assistants, complex area superintendents, HSTA (Hawai'i State Teachers Association), and HTSB. He also mentioned the personnel regional officers that he spoke with were not aware of the letters, due dates, or the audit. He stated that HTSB's licensing specialists ended up doing much of the legwork to get teachers to comply and, overall, two teachers did not comply or meet the scheduled deadline.

Specialist Harada addressed the teacher payroll issue that has been reported on in the news and media. He stated HTSB hopes to receive more information or explanation from HIDOE regarding its mention of licensing in relation to this issue. He explained HTSB's

UNAPPROVED

licensing specialists often overextend themselves to help resolve applicants' license and permit matters by sending reminders and follow-ups to teachers who lack active licenses or permits, which is outside of their job responsibilities. He iterated the specialists' primary goal is to ensure all teachers and school administrators comply with state law, as well as to ensure Hawai'i's students have highly qualified teachers and are safe in their schools.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

F. LEGISLATIVE UPDATE – Licensing Specialist Dr. Mitzie Higa

Board Chairperson Miyamae introduced Specialist Higa to share the legislative update.

Specialist Higa stated HTSB is continuing to work on getting a bill into the Governor's package that will support registered teacher apprenticeship. She mentioned the Board will be informed as soon as that happens.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

III. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING AGENDA ITEMS

None

IV. NEW BUSINESS, COMMITTEE REPORTS, AND PENDING COMMITTEE ACTION

BOARD ACTION – NEW BUSINESS

Board Chairperson Miyamae stated the Teacher Standards Committee did not meet. She called for a motion to move NBI 24-05.

Board Member Sanders moved NBI 24-05. Board Member Gillentine seconded the motion.

A. NBI 24-05: License Affirmation (August 2024)

Board Chairperson Miyamae reviewed NBI 24-05, affirming the licenses and permits for the respective month.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Miyamae called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 24-05, as written. Board Chairperson Miyamae did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 24-05, as written.

ACTION — NBI 24-05: License Affirmation (August 2024), as written, was adopted by the Board.

PENDING COMMITTEE ACTION – Budget, Personnel, and Strategic Planning Committee: Mew

UNAPPROVED

The Budget, Personnel, and Strategic Planning Committee met at 9:02 a.m. They had one update and looked at one New Business Item (“NBI”).

B. HTSB’s 2023-2024 Fiscal Year Review

Committee Chairperson Mew introduced HTSB’s 2023-2024 Fiscal Review, stating the Budget, Personnel, and Strategic Planning Committee recommends it to the Board. He asked Executive Director Villalobos to speak on the red line items, but also mentioned HTSB’s budget is in the black at the bottom of the last page of the report

Executive Director Villalobos explained the red line items are related to union contract negotiations that are done over a period of four years. She stated when the pay raises occur, that money comes out of HTSB’s personnel funding, which may make it seem like the budget is short when it actually is not. She mentioned a lot of funding has been encumbered and that is done prior to the July 1st deadline. She explained HTSB uses encumbered funds for the beginning of the school year since sometimes the money does not drop on time, depending on the state and its budget.

Committee Chairperson Mew asked board members if they had any questions or discussion.

ACTION — None. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

C. NBI 23-43 Revised: The Hawai‘i Teacher Standards Board Election of Board Officers and Committee Assignments for 2024-2025

Committee Chairperson Mew reviewed NBI 23-43 Revised, which adds new board member Dr. Philip Bossert to three committees. He stated the Budget, Personnel, and Strategic Planning Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-43 Revised, as written, to the Board.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Miyamae called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 23-43 Revised, as written. Board Chairperson Miyamae did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 23-43 Revised, as written.

ACTION — NBI 23-43 Revised: The Hawai‘i Teacher Standards Board Election of Board Officers and Committee Assignments for 2024-2025, as written, was adopted by the Board.

PENDING COMMITTEE ACTION – Teacher Education Committee: Ornelles

The Teacher Education Committee met at 10:00 a.m. and looked at three New Business Items.

D. NBI 24-06: Adoption of Revised Hawaiian Program Standards

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 24-06, which includes the Rationale/Background. She acknowledged on-time and late written testimonies submitted. She explained the amendments made to the NBI during the committee meeting. She stated the Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 24-06, as amended, to the Board.

UNAPPROVED

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Miyamae called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 24-06, as amended. Board Chairperson Miyamae did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 24-06, as amended.

ACTION — NBI 24-06: Adoption of Revised Hawaiian Program Standards, as amended, was adopted by the Board.

E. NBI 24-07: Approval of Modifications to the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's Dual Preparation Bachelor of Education Early Childhood Education and Elementary Education Program to a Single Licensure Track

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 24-07, which includes the Rationale/Background. She acknowledged on-time written testimony submitted and oral public testimony provided. She explained the amendments made to the NBI during the committee meeting. She stated the Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 24-07, as amended, to the Board.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Miyamae called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 24-07, as amended. Board Chairperson Miyamae did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 24-07, as amended.

ACTION — NBI 24-07: Approval of Modifications to the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's Dual Preparation Bachelor of Education Early Childhood Education and Elementary Education Program to a Single Licensure Track, as amended, was adopted by the Board.

F. NBI 24-08: Approval of Modifications to the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's Master of Education in Teaching Initial Dual Preparation Licensure Program

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 24-08, which includes the Rationale/Background. She acknowledged on-time written testimony submitted and oral public testimony provided. She stated the Teacher Education Committee ran out of time to fully discuss this NBI, so committee members voted to recommend NBI 24-08, as written, to the Board for an opportunity to discuss and ask questions.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked board members if they had any questions or discussion.

Board Chairperson Miyamae stated the modifications seem like a new track for licensure. She asked how it is a program modification since it is going from secondary 6-12 and secondary special education to elementary K-6 and elementary special education. She mentioned she has taught elementary and middle school secondary, and she commented they are very different.

UNAPPROVED

Committee Chairperson Ornelles answered in her understanding of this grade band extension, it fits within HTSB's requirements for a program modification. She mentioned it was also approved as a modification through University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's ("UH Mānoa's") Office of the Vice Provost for Academic Excellence. She stated the grade band extension draws upon courses and programs that already exist, and no new courses are needed. She then yielded to Dr. Rhonda Black, of UH Mānoa's College of Education, for any additional clarifying information.

Dr. Black stated the courses for both the dual elementary and dual secondary tracks already exist and are listed on page 22 of the NBI's attached documentation.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked if Dr. Black could explain how the courses address the differences between teaching the two grade brands (e.g., elementary special education and secondary special education).

Dr. Black stated oftentimes it is the same course in two different sections. She explained, for example, course 'SPED 620' is the same course on the books, but the students are in different groups with different readings.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked how the Hawaiian culture, knowledge, and language and the Model Code of Ethics for Educators ("MCEE") requirements are incorporated in this program modification.

Dr. Black answered Hawai'i's special requirements are now part of the assessment system. She stated every student needs to turn in a product and demonstrate competency, so those requirements are addressed in both seminar and field. She also stated students need to prepare a portfolio in which they demonstrate what they have done throughout their program addressing each of the Hawai'i teacher standards and Hawai'i's special requirements.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked if students declare their grade band beforehand to ensure they get proper student teaching and field placement practicum. She stated HTSB wants to make sure they are highly qualified and that they will receive the correct license.

Dr. Black answered students declare their grade band at the beginning of the program. She mentioned if they change their mind, they could move into the other grade band group in their classes. She stated if there are extra classes they need to make up for, that may extend their program as they need to take those missing classes and be in the field that matches their license.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked board members if they had any further questions or discussion. There were no further questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Miyamae called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 24-08, as written. Board Chairperson Miyamae did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 24-08, as written.

ACTION — NBI 24-08: Approval of Modifications to the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's Master of Education in Teaching Initial Dual Preparation Licensure Program, as written, was adopted by the Board.

UNAPPROVED

V. EXECUTIVE SESSION

Board Chairperson Miyamae shared information regarding procedures for virtual Executive Session.

Board Chairperson Miyamae called for a motion to rise into Executive Session.

Board Member Mew moved to rise into Executive Session. Board Member Sanders seconded the motion.

Board Chairperson Miyamae called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether or not to rise into Executive Session. Board Chairperson Miyamae did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to rise into Executive Session at 12:03 p.m.

This portion of the meeting is a closed meeting under Hawaii Revised Statutes (“HRS”) §92-4 and HRS §92-5(a)(1)(2) and (4).

Board Chairperson Miyamae called the meeting back to order at 1:19 p.m.

Board Chairperson Miyamae reported out what was discussed during Executive Session:

- Meeting minutes from August 30, 2024
- Personnel and EPP updates from Executive Director Villalobos
- Consultation with Deputy Attorney General Darien Chow
- NBI 24-09: Case No. 24-01 – Adopted
- NBI 24-10: Case No. 24-02 – Adopted

VI. NEXT HTSB MEETING: November 15, 2024

Board Chairperson Miyamae stated the next HTSB Board Meeting was scheduled for November 15, 2024. The details of the agenda would come out prior to the meeting.

VII. ADJOURNMENT

Board Chairperson Miyamae adjourned the General Business Meeting at 1:20 p.m.

UNAPPROVED

List of people who submitted written testimony before the board meeting

<i>ON-TIME TESTIMONY</i>		
NAME	ORGANIZATION	AGENDA ITEM
Jon Yoshioka, Ph.D.	University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's College of Education, School of Teacher Education – Professor & Director	IV.D. NBI 24-06: Adoption of Revised Hawaiian Program Standards
Jon Yoshioka, Ph.D.	University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's College of Education, School of Teacher Education – Professor & Director	IV.E. NBI 24-07: Approval of Modifications to the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's Dual Preparation Bachelor of Education Early Childhood Education and Elementary Education Program to a Single Licensure Track
Jon Yoshioka, Ph.D.	University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's College of Education, School of Teacher Education – Professor & Director	IV.F. NBI 24-08: Approval of Modifications to the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's Master of Education in Teaching Initial Dual Preparation Licensure Program

<i>LATE TESTIMONY</i>		
NAME	ORGANIZATION	AGENDA ITEM
Rebecca Kapolei Kiili, Ed.D.	Hawai'i State Teachers Association – Maui Chapter Treasurer, Human & Civil Rights Committee Member	IV.D. NBI 24-06: Adoption of Revised Hawaiian Program Standards