



**STATE OF HAWAII
HAWAII TEACHER STANDARDS BOARD
TEACHER EDUCATION COMMITTEE MEETING**

MINUTES

Remote Technology via Zoom

650 Iwilei Road, Suite 158
Honolulu, HI 96817

Friday, September 27, 2024

PRESENT IN-PERSON:

Kristi Miyamae, *Ex-officio*

PRESENT ONLINE:

Dr. Cecily Ornelles for Dr. Nathan Murata, *Committee Chairperson*
Dr. Jonathan Gillentine, *Committee Vice-Chairperson*
Kahele Dukelow for Roy Takumi
Dale Matsuura
Dondra Ozaki

EXCUSED:

Dawn Raymond
Lokelani Han, *Ex-officio*

NOT PRESENT:

Sean Bacon for Keith Hayashi

STAFF:

Felicia Villalobos, Executive Director
Steven Harada, Licensing Specialist
Dr. Mitzie Higa, Licensing Specialist
Kris Murakami, Esq., Licensing Specialist
Dr. Jennifer Padua, Licensing Specialist

I. CALL TO ORDER

A. ROLL CALL TO ESTABLISH QUORUM

Committee Chairperson Dr. Cecily Ornelles called the Teacher Education Committee Meeting to order at 10:00 a.m.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles shared information regarding procedures for virtual committee meetings, then called roll call and established quorum. *Ex-officio* Committee Member Kristi Miyamae was present in-person. Committee Chairperson Ornelles; Committee Vice-Chairperson Dr. Jonathan Gillentine; and Committee Members Kahele Dukelow, Dale Matsuura, and Dondra Ozaki were present online. Committee Member Dawn Raymond and *Ex-officio* Committee Member Lokelani Han were excused. Committee Member Sean Bacon was not present.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles shared information regarding non-public site disclosure. None of the committee members participating online had anyone present with them. Committee Chairperson Ornelles then shared additional information regarding meeting protocols and procedures.

B. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON COMMITTEE AGENDA ITEMS

Executive Director Felicia Villalobos announced there was on-time and late written testimony submitted.

HTSB staff shared the late written testimony on-screen for viewing.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles stated she would recognize the written testimonies when their corresponding New Business Item (“NBI”) is addressed.

C. ANNOUNCEMENTS

Executive Director Villalobos announced the committee would not be voting on any meeting minutes at this time. She stated she meant to announce this at the earlier Budget, Personnel, and Strategic Planning Committee Meeting as well. She explained the committees will vote on two sets of meeting minutes at their next committee meeting date.

II. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON COMMITTEE AGENDA ITEMS

Executive Director Villalobos announced there are two testifiers signed up in the Zoom online chat box for NBI 24-07 and NBI 24-08.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles stated she will call on the testifiers for a two-minute testimony when their corresponding NBI is addressed.

III. ACTION / DISCUSSION ITEMS

D. NBI 24-06: Adoption of Revised Hawaiian Program Standards

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 24-06, which includes the Rationale/Background. She acknowledged on-time and late written testimonies submitted.

HTSB staff shared late written testimony on-screen for viewing.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles stated in the late written testimony there is a request for a correction to the spelling of the testifier's name in the NBI's attached documentation. She suggested an amendment to correct the spelling of the testifier's name. She then called for a motion to amend the NBI's attached documentation as such.

Committee Vice-Chairperson Gillentine moved to amend the spelling of the testifier's name. Committee Member Dukelow seconded the motion.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any questions or discussion regarding the name spelling amendment. There were no questions or discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on the name spelling amendment for NBI 24-06. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. All other committee members present voted to amend.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any further questions or discussion on NBI 24-06.

Ex-officio Committee Member Miyamae stated every contributor is named in the NBI's attached documentation except for the Hawai'i Teacher Standards Board ("HTSB") staff. She suggested an amendment to replace '*Hawai'i Teacher Standards Board Staff*' with the staff's names. She stated their hard work was very instrumental.

Committee Vice-Chairperson Gillentine moved to amend the HTSB staff contributors. *Ex-officio* Committee Member Miyamae seconded the motion.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on the HTSB staff amendment for NBI 24-06. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. All other committee members present voted to amend.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 24-06, as amended, to the full board ("Board") at the General Business Meeting scheduled at 11:00 a.m. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. All other committee members present voted to recommend.

ACTION — The Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 24-06, as amended, to the Board, with five of six members present voting aye.

E. NBI 24-07: Approval of Modifications to the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's Dual Preparation Bachelor of Education Early Childhood Education and Elementary Education Program to a Single Licensure Track

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 24-07, which includes the Rationale/Background. She acknowledged the written testimony submitted and yielded to public oral testimony.

Dr. Leah Muccio, of University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's ("UH Mānoa's") College of Education ("COE"), testified the requested program modification is to include a single licensure track. She stated the modification has been approved by UH Mānoa's Office of the Vice Provost for Academic Excellence. She also stated the modifications include a change in grade level

UNAPPROVED

band, a shift from dual license fields to a single license field, and changes to the core curriculum and coursework. She iterated this early childhood care and education (“ECCE”) program track would shift to a targeted focus on early childhood education (“ECE”), covering birth through age eight (B-8).

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any questions or discussion.

Ex-officio Committee Member Miyamae asked if HTSB needs to ensure that Hawaiian culture, knowledge, and language and the Model Code of Ethics for Educators (“MCEE”) are incorporated in this program modification.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles stated they are requirements and called on Dr. Muccio to answer that question.

Dr. Muccio answered the MCEE would be utilized throughout the program, along with the NAEYC (National Association for the Education of Young Children) ethical framework, and also emphasized in the student teaching seminar.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any further questions or discussion.

Ex-officio Committee Member Miyamae asked how the Hawaiian culture requirements will be covered.

Dr. Muccio answered the revised course objectives aligned with the Hawai'i teacher standards and addressed the Hawaiian culture requirements. She stated they will be included throughout the program and in the student teachers' field experiences.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any further questions or discussion.

Ex-officio Committee Member Miyamae stated since board members are not licensing experts, she wanted to ask HTSB staff if this program modification aligns or if there are any concerns.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles yielded to HTSB staff to answer that question.

Licensing Specialist Dr. Jennifer Padua stated part of her responsibility is to go through the program reviews, and questions were sent to Dr. Muccio. She explained Dr. Muccio's team addressed the Hawaiian culture, knowledge, and language and MCEE requirements in the course objectives and Appendix D of the NBI's attached documentation.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any further questions or discussion. There were no further questions or discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles suggested an amendment to revise the NBI's title by adding 'include' so that the new title is 'Approval of Modifications to the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's Dual Preparation Bachelor of Education Early Childhood Education and Elementary Education Program to include a Single Licensure Track.'

UNAPPROVED

Committee Member Dukelow stated she was concerned for community college students because the required 300- and 400-level prerequisites would mean an extra semester before transferring into the program. She also stated she hopes there is a way to alleviate that through course articulations with the current community college requirements.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called on Dr. Muccio to address that concern.

Dr. Muccio stated those particular courses are offered through the C3S (Cross-Campus Course Sharing) program in which students can take classes at community college rates. She mentioned UH Mānoa has articulation agreements in place with the four early childhood community college programs. She explained students who graduate with an associate degree in ECE would come into the UH Mānoa program with the prerequisite requirements met, and they would not be required to take some of the UH Mānoa courses.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles re-suggested the amendment to revise the NBI's title by adding '*include*.' She then suggested a second amendment to insert a second paragraph indicating an effective date for students already enrolled in the program. She also suggested a third amendment before the Rationale/Background section to include recognition that UH Mānoa's Interim Vice Provost for Academic Excellence approved the requested program modification. Additionally, she suggested a fourth amendment to add '*in the licensure portion of the program*' in the second sentence of the Rationale/Background section. She then called for a motion to amend the NBI with those four suggestions.

Committee Vice-Chairperson Gillentine moved to amend NBI 24-07 as suggested by Committee Chairperson Ornelles. Committee Member Ozaki seconded the motion.

Ex-officio Committee Member Miyamae stated she believes the first amendment of adding '*include*' to the NBI's title would no longer be germane because it is no longer a program modification and rather trying to attach another preparation program. She explained leaving the NBI's title as is without the '*include*' would be a true program modification.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles confirmed if *Ex-officio* Committee Member Miyamae's suggestion is to not have '*include*' in the title.

Ex-officio Committee Member Miyamae answered yes and stated she is okay with the other suggested language. She explained adding '*include*' to the title would create a new second track since the single licensure track stays, which she believes is not germane.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles stated the dual preparation track would need to go through university approvals for official removal and then submitted to HTSB. She mentioned her suggestion was to ensure the program would remain so that the students currently enrolled would be able to complete it, and then the dual licensure track would be removed.

Ex-officio Committee Member Miyamae suggested inserting that information into the second paragraph that was added with the second amendment. She stated she thinks that would take care of her concern without changing the intent of the program modification.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles stated it would ensure the students currently enrolled in the program are taken care of and are recognized when they complete it. She mentioned that would be a separate issue from university processes. She then suggested revising the first amendment and removing '*include*' from the title, so it remains as its original title.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any further questions or discussion regarding the remaining amendments. There were no further questions or discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on the amendments for NBI 24-07. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. All other committee members present voted to amend.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any further questions or discussion on NBI 24-07. There were no further questions or discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 24-07, as amended, to the Board at the General Business Meeting scheduled at 11:00 a.m. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. All other committee members present voted to recommend.

ACTION — The Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 24-07, as amended, to the Board, with five of six members present voting aye.

F. NBI 24-08: Approval of Modifications to the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's Master of Education in Teaching Initial Dual Preparation Licensure Program

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 24-08, which includes the Rationale/Background. She acknowledged faculty present from the School of Teacher Education at UH Mānoa's COE and yielded to public oral testimony.

Dr. Rhonda Black, of UH Mānoa's COE, testified to the history and success of UH Mānoa's Master of Education in Teaching program. She mentioned it is the only special education dual licensure program for individuals who want to teach secondary education, and it was approved by UH Mānoa's Office of the Vice Provost for Academic Excellence. Regarding elementary education, she stated they have worked very hard during planning to align content and ensure coverage without unnecessary redundancy, as well as address Hawai'i teacher standards and Hawai'i's special requirements.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles acknowledged the written testimony submitted.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if they had any questions or discussion.

Ex-officio Committee Member Miyamae stated she does have some questions but as the General Business Meeting is about to start, she asked if it is possible to defer this NBI so that board members can have enough time to discuss and give it their full attention.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles confirmed if *Ex-officio* Committee Member Miyamae's request is to defer this NBI.

Ex-officio Committee Member Miyamae stated to defer until the November board meeting.

Dr. Black stated deferring this NBI to November would mean the program cannot accept students for this year.

UNAPPROVED

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked *Ex-officio* Committee Member Miyamae if she has several items to discuss that she feels could not be adequately addressed now.

Ex-officio Committee Member Miyamae answered from what she understands of this NBI, she would not be able to recommend it. She mentioned she could bring her questions up at the General Business Meeting and asked Executive Director Villalobos for clarification on procedures.

Executive Director Villalobos answered a board member can vote not to recommend this NBI, or, if it is recommended, further discussion can be held at the General Business Meeting. She stated the Board Chairperson can open it up to more discussion as not all board members are on this committee.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles stated this program was initially targeted for hearing at the April board meeting last school year, but it did not make that meeting and it also did not make the August board meeting this school year. She requested the committee recommend this NBI so that questions and discussion could be brought to the General Business Meeting, but she asked for further clarification on procedures.

Executive Director Villalobos stated it would be like a regular NBI as the committee would either vote to recommend or not recommend it to the full board.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles requested the committee bring this NBI to the full board.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 24-08, as written, to the Board at the General Business Meeting scheduled at 11:00 a.m. Committee Chairperson Ornelles did not vote. All other committee members present voted to recommend.

ACTION — The Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 24-08, as written, to the Board, with five of six members present voting aye.

IV. ADJOURNMENT

Committee Chairperson Ornelles adjourned the Teacher Education Committee Meeting at 11:02 a.m.

UNAPPROVED

List of people who submitted written testimony before the committee meeting

<i>ON-TIME TESTIMONY</i>		
NAME	ORGANIZATION	AGENDA ITEM
Jon Yoshioka, Ph.D.	University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's College of Education, School of Teacher Education – Professor & Director	III.D. NBI 24-06: Adoption of Revised Hawaiian Program Standards
Jon Yoshioka, Ph.D.	University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's College of Education, School of Teacher Education – Professor & Director	III.E. NBI 24-07: Approval of Modifications to the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's Dual Preparation Bachelor of Education Early Childhood Education and Elementary Education Program to a Single Licensure Track
Jon Yoshioka, Ph.D.	University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's College of Education, School of Teacher Education – Professor & Director	III.F. NBI 24-08: Approval of Modifications to the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's Master of Education in Teaching Initial Dual Preparation Licensure Program

<i>LATE TESTIMONY</i>		
NAME	ORGANIZATION	AGENDA ITEM
Rebecca Kapolei Kiili, Ed.D.	Hawai'i State Teachers Association – Maui Chapter Treasurer, Human & Civil Rights Committee Member	III.D. NBI 24-06: Adoption of Revised Hawaiian Program Standards