

**HAWAI‘I TEACHER STANDARDS BOARD
GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING**

Friday, October 27, 2023

**Meeting Conducted by Remote Technology via Zoom
and
Physical Location at 650 Iwilei Road, Suite 158, Honolulu, HI 96817**

MINUTES

PRESENT:

Branden Kawazoe, *Board Chairperson*
Lokelani Han, *Board Vice-Chairperson*
Kahele Dukelow for Warren Haruki
Dr. Jonathan Gillentine
Justin Mew
Kristi Miyamae
Dr. Cecily Ornelles for Dr. Nathan Murata
Dawn Raymond
Kim Sanders
Dr. Katina Soares

EXCUSED:

Sean Bacon for Keith Hayashi
Elena Farden for Keahi Makaimoku
U‘ilani Miguel, *Non-Voting Member*

STAFF:

Felicia Villalobos, Executive Director
Tracey Idica, Licensing Specialist
Kris Murakami, Esq., Licensing Specialist
Dr. Jennifer Padua, Licensing Specialist
Raymond “RJ” Rodriguez, Licensing Specialist
Elaine Hutchinson, Secretary

I. CALL TO ORDER

A. ROLL CALL TO ESTABLISH QUORUM

Board Chairperson Branden Kawazoe called the General Business Meeting to order at 12:38 p.m.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe shared information regarding procedures for virtual board meetings, then called roll call. Board Chairperson Kawazoe, Board Members Dr. Jonathan Gillentine, Justin Mew, Kristi Miyamae, Dr. Cecily Ornelles, Dawn Raymond, Kim Sanders, and Dr. Katina Soares participated remotely. Board Members Sean Bacon, Elena Farden, and Non-Voting Board Member U'ilani Miguel were excused. Board Vice-Chairperson Lokelani Han and Board Member Kahele Dukelow were not present at roll call.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe shared information regarding non-public site disclosure. None of the board members participating remotely had anyone present with them. Board Chairperson Kawazoe then shared additional information regarding meeting protocols and procedures.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called on Executive Director Felicia Villalobos for verification of written testimony.

Board Vice-Chairperson Han entered remotely. Quorum was established.

Board Member Dukelow entered remotely.

Executive Director Villalobos stated both on-time and late written testimonies were posted on the Hawai'i Teacher Standards Board ("HTSB") public website and uploaded to the Dropbox of the full board ("Board"). Executive Director Villalobos mentioned, at the discretion of the Chairperson, time may be allotted to look at the late written testimony.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe allotted five minutes for board members to review the late written testimony.

B. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING AGENDA ITEMS

Jill Baldemor, Executive Director of Teach For America ("TFA") Hawai'i, signed up to testify in-person on agenda item IV.C, entitled "NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs":

"Aloha, Chair Kawazoe and members of the Hawai'i Teacher Standards Board. My name is Jill Baldemor and I am the Executive Director of Teach For America Hawai'i. I started my career in education as a second grade teacher in 1995 and have been leading our work at Teach for America Hawai'i for the past 16 years. Throughout my tenure I have had the honor and privilege of working with the talented staff at the Hawai'i Teacher Standards Board, including former Executive Directors Sharon Mahoe and Lynn Hammonds. I have appreciated that we have always been able to work together collaboratively and transparently.

"As you are aware, in May we were granted a full seven-year term of national accreditation with no concern cited, which was reviewed and reconfirmed by AAQEP two weeks ago. Today we request that you honor AAQEP's decision and grant Teach for

America Hawai‘i continued state approval for a full seven-year term without concerns and conditions.

“In the Teacher Education Committee Meeting earlier today, a few board members shared concern regarding data around teachers in CBI placements, noting that this was not an outlier. We would like to correct this misrepresentation. In the past decade—to the best of my knowledge—there have been three teachers hired in CBI placements out of 700 teachers recommended for licensure. These were very unique circumstances and most assuredly an outlier. In each case we work very closely with the school and those candidates to ensure they received training and were observed teaching the relevant content.

“Second, Director Villalobos was asked about the interpretation of NBI 12-27 Revised. She represented that the interpretation has not changed since its adoption in 2013. We disagree based on conversations that I have personally had with HTSB’s former executive director, and we humbly ask this board to publicly discuss: Why? If the interpretation has not changed, did HTSB audit and verify the appropriateness of student teacher placements every year? Why did HTSB license our teachers in special education lines? And why did HTSB not share any comment or concern at any time over the past decade? Thank you.”

Alyson Emrick, Teach For America Hawai‘i, signed up to testify in-person on agenda item IV.C, entitled “NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs”:

“Aloha. My name is Alyson Emrick. I was a 2006 TFA corps member and after earning my master’s in education from the University of Pennsylvania, I joined TFA staff here, where I have been for the last 15 years.

“Teach for America Hawai‘i has been a state approved teacher education program since 2013 and we have recommended approximately 700 teacher candidates for licensure in elementary and secondary content areas. It is true that some schools have hired TFA teachers in special education lines due to the significant need for special educators and the willingness of TFA teachers to respond to the need. This was always done transparently and in compliance with HTSB’s policies as written and described to us.

“We see that next on the agenda is revising the language of NBI 12-27. We are fully ready to comply with the revised version, if approved, in the same way that we have fully complied with the existing version. Please. Read the language. The existing version requires that candidates complete clinical experience at the appropriate grade level and in the subject or school role for which they are seeking a license. All teacher candidates, including those in special education lines, gained experience in the appropriate grade levels and in the subject area they were seeking a license. Principals verified that special education teachers use the same curriculum and standards and provided special education services in addition to—and not in lieu of—teaching a subject area content.

“Importantly, every year HTSB conducted annual audits, which included a review and verification of the appropriateness of placement. Every year HTSB licensed the teachers that we recommended, including those who taught in special education lines, without any comment or concern. As such, we respectfully submit that we have complied

with HTSB policy, and request that the language about TFA Hawai‘i being in violation of policy be stricken. Thank you.”

Jacqueline Scanlan, Teach For America Hawai‘i, signed up to testify in-person on agenda item IV.C, entitled “NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs”:

“Good afternoon, all. My name is Jackie Scanlan. TFA Hawai‘i is what brought me back home in 2011 and has shaped my career in education. When I returned home, I co-taught math as a special educator and was eventually nominated by my peers to be the Special Education Department Head at James Campbell High School. I hold a M.A. in Teaching and I currently work on the TFA Hawai‘i staff team.

“As we’ve shared, TFA Hawai‘i has met HTSB annual audits and HTSB has licensed all of our teacher candidates, including those in special education teaching lines up and through the summer of 2023. While we recommended candidates for general education content areas, many of these teachers went on to add the field of Special Education to their license through the add-a-field policies. And some, like myself, actually led special education departments at their school or complex area.

“All of that discussion aside, the fact is our candidates are no longer being placed and hired in special education lines. We did this in compliance with the new and revised interpretation that was shared with us. HTSB shared for the very first time a concern regarding teachers in special education lines in April earlier this year, and in response we took immediate action to align with the new guidance.

“This year beginning July 2023, HIDOE Principals were advised and confirmed that all of our teacher candidates enrolled in TFA Hawai‘i’s alternative route to certification program are in general education teaching lines. At all times, both before and after HTSB shared its concerns, we’ve complied with HTSB guidance, and we will continue to do so.

“We respectfully submit that the existing system of annual audits, annual reports, and other meetings and communications that we have with HTSB staff is appropriate and sufficient for ensuring continued compliance, as it is for other state approved teacher education programs here in Hawai‘i. Thank you.”

Joshua Lee, Director of Data Systems at Teach For America Hawai‘i, signed up to testify in-person on agenda item IV.C, entitled “NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs”:

“Aloha. My name is Joshua Lee and TFA inspired me to enter a career in education and brought me back home in 2007 after I completed an MBA program at Carnegie Mellon University. I taught math at ‘Aiea Intermediate School for five years, earned tenure, and a master’s degree in teaching. Afterwards I worked on the Hawai‘i Growth Model at the state level. I’m now on staff with TFA Hawai‘i as the Director of Data Systems.

“AAQEP is a well-respected national accrediting body with a membership of over 200 education providers. Contrary to this NBI’s representation that AAQEP’s leadership and site visit team were notified of a violation and took no action, AAQEP conducted an additional review and concluded that TFA remained in compliance with all AAQEP

standards. A letter about this was sent to the HTSB Director and Chair on October 13, 2023, and is attached to our written testimony.

“Far off from disagreeing with AAQEP’s finding of no wrongdoing, NBI 22-102 stated that TFA teacher candidates would be issued a license once they completed supervised clinical experience as required by previous HTSB NBI and the Hawai‘i Administrative Rules. TFA proved that to be true for all the teachers we recommended for licensure, and they were issued licenses.

“I urge all board members to act with integrity, to uphold the reputation of HTSB by removing statements in this NBI that imply factual untruths about matters that can be easily verified through documents in the public record. Given that AAQEP conducted a thorough review of our program and found us to be in compliance, we respectfully request that HTSB honor AAQEP’s approval of seven years of accreditation without conditions, as HTSB has done for the other six teacher education programs in our state that have been accredited by AAQEP. Thank you very much.”

Erin Auerbach, Director of Development at Teach For America Hawai‘i, signed up to testify in-person on agenda item IV.C, entitled “NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs”:

“Aloha. My name is Erin Pauahi Auerbach and I am the Director of Development at Teach for America Hawai‘i. I have an MBA from New York University and I came home to Hawai‘i in 2016 to join staff.

“Since 2013 TFA Hawai‘i has recruited, trained, and helped license approximately 700 teacher candidates for Hawai‘i public schools. Today there are 571 people in our network who are contributing to the community here in our islands. Our staff works tirelessly to support our network in a variety of ways. 79 candidates are currently enrolled in our alternative route to certification program and regularly engage with TFA staff and partners. 125 first- and second-year teachers receive regular observations, coaching, and professional development. Over 400 alumni have access to resources and ongoing learning opportunities. We are partnering with three schools to provide tutoring support to students through our Ignite Fellowship, five schools to design and execute a summer training program for incoming teachers, and with community organizations to elevate and strengthen early literacy initiatives. Recruitment and selection of new teachers takes place year-round for us. We share this list of activities not to pat ourselves on the back, but rather to urge HTSB to let us focus on this work that directly impacts students, teachers, and our Hawai‘i public schools.

“As my colleagues before me have shared, TFA Hawai‘i has complied with all policies, has been found to be in compliance by AAQEP, and affirms that it will continue to comply with policies moving forward. We wish to understand and humbly ask this Board to publicly discuss the following: If the interpretation of 12-27 has not changed, why did HTSB audit and verify appropriateness of student teaching placements every year? Why did HTSB license our teachers who were in special education lines? And why did HTSB not share any comment or concern at any time over the past decade? Me ka ha‘aha‘a, mahalo.”

Sierra Callihan, Teach For America Hawai‘i, signed up to testify in-person on agenda item IV.C, entitled “NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs”:

“Aloha. My name is Sierra Callihan. I attended Hawai‘i public schools and I’m grateful to have had TFA Hawai‘i teachers when I was a student at ‘Aiea Intermediate and UH Mānoa. I joined TFA Hawai‘i as a 2017 corps member and taught ELA at Wai‘anae High School as the SPED teacher. I now coach TFA teachers across Hawai‘i and bring over a decade of these stories to this space to attest the excellence of TFA’s program and the beneficial impact on the learning trajectory of all students, including myself.

“As my colleagues have shared, I urge you to grant seven years of continued state approval without conditions and areas of improvement. The conditions are not necessary, and we humbly submit the time would be better spent on work that directly impacts students. To the extent HTSB feels conditions are necessary, we request the following modifications: (1) We strongly object to Condition 4, which requires TFA to send a letter to school administrators about who they are allowed to hire in accordance with IDEA federal law. It is the kuleana of the Hawai‘i Department of Ed to advise its principals on hiring with guidance from its attorneys. It is not Teach For America’s place to advise on hiring practices and federal law. (2) We request that the phrase, ‘*TFA teacher candidates*,’ used in Conditions 1 and 3, be clearly defined to mean TFA teachers who were candidates for licensure in the previous year, and not all TFA teachers broadly. It is only relevant for HTSB to request verification of information for teachers that are actually recommended for licensure. And while we do not object to providing verification for teachers that are recommended for licensure, we do note that HTSB’s annual audit on a random sampling of teachers already takes place. An audit on every teacher that is recommended for licensure is burdensome and not necessary. Thank you.”

Darin Lim Yankowitz, Teach For America Hawai‘i, signed up to testify in-person on agenda item IV.C, entitled “NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs”:

“Hi. My name is Dr. Darin Lim Yankowitz. I am originally from the San Francisco Bay and Teach For America Hawai‘i brought me to O‘ahu, which is now my home, where I raise my children, and where I intend to spend the rest of my life. I started as a teacher coach here for our corps members in Wai‘anae, Nānākuli, ‘Ewa Beach, and Ka‘ū, and now lead Teach For America’s efforts to recruit leaders across the country.

“As my colleagues before me have shared, I urge you to grant TFA seven years of continued state approval without conditions and areas of improvement. However, to the extent that HTSB feels conditions are necessary, we request that duplicative requests be eliminated. HTSB already requires providers to complete an annual report and an annual audit, in addition to submitting comprehensive information when we recommend teachers for licensure. Conditions 1 and 2 largely request the same information that is submitted in other ways. In summary, Conditions 1 and 2 are duplicative. Condition 3, the audit, already exists and is unnecessary to expand. Condition 4, a letter to principals, should be

stricken as the Hawai‘i Department of Education and its attorneys should advise principals on hiring in compliance with federal law.

“To be clear, Teach For America Hawai‘i fully commits to working in partnership with HTSB to ensure compliance with all policies and laws. We have and will continue to willingly participate in annual audits and reports. We will continue to submit information for each teacher candidate we recommend for HTSB to review before issuing a license, and we will continue to work collaboratively and transparently with HTSB staff as we have for the past decade.

“We have been awarded seven years of national accreditation with no concerns. We respectfully request that the Hawai‘i Teacher Standards Board honor this as it has for every other provider and grant TFA Hawai‘i seven years of continued state approval without conditions or areas of improvement. Thank you very much.”

Pi‘ikea Kalakau-Baarde, Teach For America Hawai‘i, signed up to testify in-person on agenda item IV.C, entitled “NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs”:

“Aloha mai kākou. My name is Pi‘ikea Kalakau-Baarde. I am a Kamehameha Schools graduate, a 2015 TFA Hawai‘i alum, and over the last nine years I’ve held educational leadership positions in both the public and private sectors here in Hawai‘i. I feel strongly that TFA Hawai‘i should be awarded seven years of state approval without conditions based on my experiences as a corps member of the program and as someone who is kama‘āina from a rural community, similar to where corps members serve.

“I joined TFA a few years out of college while working at the State Capitol. I wanted to make a more concrete impact on the Native Hawaiian community and realized through my time at the Legislature that working in education would be the best way to do that. TFA was the most feasible option for me in terms of alternative routes to credentialing. TFA’s ARC program allowed me to transition into a career in education and obtain both a teacher license and a master’s degree while continuing to live and work in Hawai‘i.

“TFA was the most challenging thing I have done in my professional and academic career and changed the trajectory of my life. Throughout the two years and beyond I was supported by TFA staff in partnership with my school leadership and professors at Johns Hopkins, where I got my master’s degree. I love the six years I spent on the Wai‘anae coast, and during that time I realized my passion for service. I have since served on my local neighborhood board, the boards of various community organizations, and more.

“In closing, I’d like to leave you with this ‘ōlelo no‘eau: *‘A‘ohe pau ka ‘ike i ka hālau ho‘okahi*, meaning, *‘All knowledge is not taught in the same school.’* My route to a career in education was not traditional, but it was the best choice for me and I’m thankful that I had the opportunity to do so through TFA’s alternative route to credentialing program. Thank you.”

Lia Rozmiarek, Teach For America Hawai‘i, signed up to testify in-person on agenda item IV.D, entitled “NBI 12-27 Revised: Student Teaching Policy for HTSB Approved Educator Preparation Providers”:

“Aloha. My name is Lia Rozmiarek and this is my twenty-fourth year in education, a journey I began in 1999 as a classroom teacher of 13 years through Teach For America, taking on family and community engagement, curriculum writing and development, early adoption of Danielson pilots, becoming a WASC accreditor, and attaining a master’s degree in education from Loyola Marymount University before returning home to Hawai‘i in 2012 to join Teach For America staff.

“I am addressing NBI 12-27 Revised. Mahalo to the Board for revising the previous language and for adding four new paragraphs that include additional information not available or articulated in the prior version of the NBI. TFA remains willing and ready to comply with the revised NBI, as proposed, as it has fully complied with the prior NBI, and to continue its transparent partnership and communication with HTSB as we have for the past decade.

“What I would respectfully request is to strike the phrase in the Rationale that reads, quote, ‘*The interpretation of this NBI has not changed since the initial adoption of the NBI in 2013,*’ end quote. In fact, the change in language from ‘*or*’ to ‘*and*’ is substantive and a material change. The additional paragraphs are also substantial material changes. These changes, by their nature, do shift the interpretation of the prior NBI. While the new language of the NBI may—as Director Villalobos shared in the Teacher Education Committee Meeting discussion—reflect the original intent, it is, in fact, new language.

“Again, we are willing and able to meet the revised NBI language as we fully met the requirements in the prior version of the NBI, and simply request that the Rationale language acknowledge that this revised language does, in fact, reflect a new interpretation. Thank you.”

Jill Baldemor, Executive Director of Teach For America Hawai‘i, signed up to testify in-person on agenda item IV.D, entitled “NBI 12-27 Revised: Student Teaching Policy for HTSB Approved Educator Preparation Providers”:

“Aloha, Chair Kawazoe, members of the Hawai‘i Teacher Standards Board. I am back again to testify on the next agenda item, the revision of NBI 12-27 Revised. We see that the Board is taking action now to revise this NBI at this time to revise the language, presumably because it is no longer aligned to the new interpretation.

“As my colleagues have shared in our testimony, we stand ready to be in full compliance with this revised version, if approved, just as we have been in full compliance with the existing version. The existing version states that candidates must be teaching in the subject or school role, such as librarian or counselor. The new version materially changes ‘*or*’ to ‘*and*.’ Given this material change, we respectfully request that the line in the NBI that states the interpretation of this NBI has not changed since the initial adoption of the NBI in 2013 be stricken from the NBI. Respectfully, this is revisionist history as the NBI is, in fact, changing. This is a material change in the language of the NBI, which does change the interpretation of the policy. Given this, we respectfully submit that would be inappropriate for this NBI to state that the interpretation has not changed. Thank you for your consideration.”

Dale Fryxell, Dean of the School of Education and Behavioral Sciences at Chaminade University, signed up to testify through Zoom on agenda item IV.C,

entitled “NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs”:

“Good afternoon. My name is Dale Fryxell, Dean of the School of Education and Behavioral Sciences at Chaminade University. Due to the limited time, I will summarize my written testimony as follows.

“I was the HTSB approved local practitioner on the AAQEP site visit team. As part of the team, we conduct a thorough review of the TFA program and came to the database conclusion that TFA produces well-trained teachers who fulfill essential needs in our local schools, and I am confident about the high quality of the TFA program.

“My letter highlights TFA’s compliance with the established interpretation of policies for teacher preparation programs, emphasizing that no concerns arose over the last 10 years related to NBI 12-27 during the HTSB annual monitoring and reporting. If TFA was not in compliance with the implementation of NBI 12-27 over all of those years, then HTSB should have clarified their interpretation prior to the time of the site visit.

“TFA candidates have been effectively teaching specific content in diverse, inclusive classroom settings. Special education teachers in inclusive settings do not teach special education—they teach subjects like math, science, and language arts. I think that it is unfair to impose conditions on TFA since the program consistently followed the policies as presented by HTSB. My concern with placing the many conditions on the TFA program is that they were simply following the policies as they were written. I do not feel that a change in an interpretation of an existing policy should impact the approval of the TFA program.

“I am happy to see the revisions in NBI 12-27 that are on the meeting agenda, as they will clarify the reinterpretation of the student teaching policies. I am confident that TFA will follow the new interpretations just as they have always followed the HTSB policies in the past. In fact, they have already implemented the revised interpretation for the ‘23-‘24 cohort placements.

“I strongly advocate for awarding TFA a seven-year approval without the conditions outlined in NBI 23-13, emphasizing the—”

Time was called for Dean Fryxell of Chaminade University.

Lindsey Takenaka, Teach For America Hawai’i, signed up to testify through Zoom on agenda item IV.C, entitled “NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs”:

“My name is Lindsey Takenaka and I will be sharing testimony on behalf of Leslie Ziu: ‘My name is Leslie Ziu and I continue to work in the Hawai’i Department of Education with our public schools. In 2012 I began in education as a TFA corps member and I’m so grateful to the organization that set me on this lifelong career path to serve our students here in Hawai’i.’

“By pursuing my licensure through TFA, I was able to receive direct classroom teaching, coaching, content area training, and rigorous feedback to ensure I would be able to provide needed pedagogical instruction to students. I was also grateful to take courses at Chaminade University through the TFA licensure program to gain even more local

context with professors who are experts in the field. I write to strongly advocate for Hawai‘i Teacher Standards Board to award TFA Hawai‘i’s teacher preparation program seven years of state approval without conditions.’

“‘In Hawai‘i we continue to have teacher shortages in our state. We know that our communities have a high cost of living, particularly for those new to the education career. TFA Hawai‘i provided me a path to pursue licensure in a way that was supportive, rigorous, and also affordable. I know I remain a proud member of the Hawai‘i Department of Education today because of the foundation TFA Hawai‘i provided me. I have been able to, for over a decade, to work with students and see our school state test scores double, mentor new teachers who also continue in the field, and even work as a public school administrator. The doors opened for me through TFA program cannot be overstated, and I in turn seek to continue investing in our public school system.’

“‘TFA provides programming that enables caring and hardworking individuals to become teachers from both in- and out-of-state. As an administrator who assists in school hiring, I can attest that we need great teachers as much now as ever before and urge you to support the organizations like TFA seeking to meet this need. I again ask you to grant TFA full state approval without conditions, in alignment with AAQEP.’

“Thank you very much.”

HTSB staff stated there was no further testimony.

C. ANNOUNCEMENTS

None

D. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES

The minutes of the September 15, 2023, meeting was approved as written.

E. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR’S REPORT

Board Chairperson Kawazoe introduced Executive Director Felicia Villalobos to share her report.

Executive Director Villalobos acknowledged her report and mentioned there were new survey questions included but would discuss them at the next board meeting as more data would be available at that time.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

II. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING AGENDA ITEMS

None

F. LICENSING UPDATE – Licensing Specialist Tracey Idica

Board Chairperson Kawazoe introduced Licensing Specialist Idica to share an update.

Licensing Specialist Idica stated the licensing section of HTSB staff was still keeping up with the audit of teachers teaching without a valid license or permit in both Hawai'i Department of Education (“the Department”) schools and Hawai'i public charter schools. She mentioned the number of teachers still not in compliance with state law was concerning, but the next deadline for the audit was November 1st.

Licensing Specialist Idica asked Board Chairperson Kawazoe for permission to defer to Licensing Specialist Raymond “RJ” Rodriguez to share about an upcoming event with Educators Rising. Licensing Specialist Idica also mentioned the Hawai'i National Board Certified Teachers collective was preparing for their score release celebration on December 9th. She then deferred to Licensing Specialist Rodriguez to share about the upcoming event.

Licensing Specialist Rodriguez stated the Career Technical Education (“CTE”) pathways established an education pathway that had over 560 high school students enrolled last year, which could lead to these students enrolling in an educator preparation program (“EPP”) and becoming a teacher someday. Licensing Specialist Rodriguez stated the Hawai'i Education Association (“HEA”) awarded \$5,000 to a CTE education pathway teacher this year. This teacher organized an event at University of Hawai'i – West O'ahu on November 3rd with her CTE education pathway students to bring together about 170 other high school CTE education pathway students. The event would give these students opportunities to talk to different Hawai'i EPPs approved by the Board, and it was done through support from groups such as the Department's CTE unit, the Hawai'i State Teachers Association, HTSB, Hawai'i EPPs, and HEA. Licensing Specialist Rodriguez mentioned he was not aware of an event like this being done before and hoped it would only grow. He stated a key piece of this event was Educators Rising, a curriculum for CTE pathways in high school and clubs. The Educators Rising curriculum was already approved by the Board, and the Department was still in the process of vetting it. Educators Rising would be flying out to help emcee the event and engage the students in activities that typically took place at national events.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

**G. DISCUSSION – HTSB's Legislative Permitted Interaction Group 2024
Legislative Priorities Recommendations: Miyamae**

Board Member Miyamae reviewed HTSB's Legislative Permitted Interaction Group 2024 Legislative Priorities Recommendations and highlighted the changes from what was previously NBI 22-52 Revised: 2023 HTSB Legislative Priorities. She stated any

feedback from board members would help so that this could be introduced at the next board meeting.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

III. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING AGENDA ITEMS

There was no additional public testimony.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called on Board Vice-Chairperson Han.

Board Vice-Chairperson Han apologized and stated she was trying to raise her hand in Zoom for Board Member Miyamae. She wanted clarification regarding the “e.g.,” used in HTSB’s Legislative Permitted Interaction Group 2024 Legislative Priorities Recommendations, that the “e.g.,” list was not limited to what was written.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe stated the “e.g.,” was not limited to what was written.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any further questions or discussion. There were no further questions or discussion from board members.

IV. NEW BUSINESS, COMMITTEE REPORTS, AND PENDING COMMITTEE ACTION

COMMITTEE REPORT – Teacher Standards Committee: Sanders

The Teacher Standards Committee met at 9:00 a.m. and looked at two New Business Items.

A. NBI 23-12: License Affirmation (August 2023 and September 2023)

Board Member Sanders stated the Teacher Standards Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-12, as written, to the Board. Board Member Sanders reviewed NBI 23-12, affirming the licenses and permits for the respective months.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 23-12, as written. The motion carried unanimously with all board members present voting to approve NBI 23-12, as written.

ACTION: NBI 23-12: License Affirmation (August 2023 and September 2023), was adopted by the Board.

B. NBI 21-02 Revised: Acceptable Valid Government Issued Photo Identification

Board Member Sanders stated the Teacher Standards Committee voted to recommend NBI 21-02 Revised, as written, to the Board. Board Member Sanders reviewed NBI 21-02 Revised pertaining to the addition of two valid U.S. identification documents, which included the Rationale/Background.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 21-02 Revised, as written. The motion carried unanimously with all board members present voting to approve NBI 21-02 Revised, as written.

ACTION: NBI 21-02 Revised: Acceptable Valid Government Issued Photo Identification, was adopted by the Board.

COMMITTEE REPORT – Teacher Education Committee: Ornelles

The Teacher Education Committee met at 9:47 a.m. and looked at six New Business Items.

C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs

Board Member Ornelles stated the Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-13, as written, to the Board. Board Member Ornelles reviewed NBI 23-13, which included the Rationale/Background.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any discussion.

Board Member Gillentine briefly shared he was a graduate of the Hawai'i public schools and university system, as well as a special education teacher of 30+ years. He made three points: (1) He felt the teacher placement of an individual in a special education community-based instruction (CBI) setting did not prepare him/her for licensure in English Language Arts. (2) In his opinion, AAQEP (Association for Advancing Quality in Educator Preparation) accreditation did not equate to meeting HTSB policies. (3) The fact that teacher candidates were being placed in special education classrooms while being licensed in other fields was not made known to HTSB by Teach For America Hawai'i staff. This information came out when HTSB staff was speaking informally with some of the teacher candidates that were present during the AAQEP site visit.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any further questions or discussion. There were no further questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 23-13, as written. The motion carried unanimously with all board members present voting to approve NBI 23-13, as written.

ACTION: NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs, was adopted by the Board.

D. NBI 12-27 Revised: Student Teaching Policy for HTSB Approved Educator Preparation Providers

Board Member Ornelles stated the Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 12-27 Revised, as written, to the Board. Board Member Ornelles reviewed NBI 12-27 Revised, which included the Rationale/Background and reflected clarification of language.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 12-27 Revised, as written. The motion carried unanimously with all board members present voting to approve NBI 12-27 Revised, as written.

ACTION: NBI 12-27 Revised: Student Teaching Policy for HTSB Approved Educator Preparation Providers, was adopted by the Board.

E. NBI 20-34 Revised: Consideration of Provisional Approval of the University of Hawai’i at Mānoa’s College of Education Added Field Program in Special Education Mild/Moderate and Special Education Severe/Autism

Board Member Ornelles stated the Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 20-34 Revised, as written, to the Board. Board Member Ornelles reviewed NBI 20-34 Revised, which included the Rationale/Background and reflected a change in language from “*profound*” to “*autism*.”

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 20-34 Revised, as written. The motion carried unanimously with all board members present voting to approve NBI 20-34 Revised, as written.

ACTION: NBI 20-34 Revised: Consideration of Provisional Approval of the University of Hawai’i at Mānoa’s College of Education Added Field Program in Special Education Mild/Moderate and Special Education Severe/Autism, was adopted by the Board.

F. NBI 23-14: Approval of Substantive Modifications to the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's Post Baccalaureate in Special Education Certificate Program

Board Member Ornelles stated the Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-14, as written, to the Board. Board Member Ornelles reviewed NBI 23-14, which included the Rationale/Background.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 23-14, as written. The motion carried unanimously with all board members present voting to approve NBI 23-14, as written.

ACTION: NBI 23-14: Approval of Substantive Modifications to the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's Post Baccalaureate in Special Education Certificate Program, was adopted by the Board.

G. NBI 23-15: One-Time Approval of a Program Exception for the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's 2022-2024 BEd in Early Childhood Education/Early Childhood Special Education Mild/Moderate Dual Licensure Program

Board Member Ornelles stated the Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-15, as written, to the Board. Board Member Ornelles reviewed NBI 23-15, which included the Rationale/Background.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 23-15, as written. The motion carried unanimously with all board members present voting to approve NBI 23-15, as written.

ACTION: NBI 23-15: One-Time Approval of a Program Exception for the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's 2022-2024 BEd in Early Childhood Education/Early Childhood Special Education Mild/Moderate Dual Licensure Program, was adopted by the Board.

H. NBI 23-16: Adoption of the Council for Exceptional Children's Early Interventionist/Early Childhood Special Educator Standards

Board Member Ornelles stated the Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-16, as written, to the Board. Board Member Ornelles reviewed NBI 23-16, which included the Rationale/Background.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 23-16, as written. The motion carried unanimously with all board members present voting to approve NBI 23-16, as written.

ACTION: NBI 23-16: Adoption of the Council for Exceptional Children’s Early Interventionist/Early Childhood Special Educator Standards, was adopted by the Board.

V. EXECUTIVE SESSION

Board Chairperson Kawazoe shared information regarding procedures for virtual Executive Session.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a motion to move into Executive Session.

Board Member Mew made a motion to move into Executive Session. Board Vice-Chairperson Han seconded the motion.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether or not to move into Executive Session. The motion carried unanimously with all board members present voting to move into Executive Session at 1:44 p.m.

This portion of the meeting is a closed meeting under Hawai'i Revised Statutes (“HRS”) §92-4 and HRS §92-5(a)(1)(2) and (4).

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called the meeting back to order at 3:06 p.m.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe reported out what was discussed during Executive Session:

- Meeting minutes from September 15, 2023
- Personnel update from Executive Director Villalobos
- Consultation with Deputy Attorney General Michael Azuma
- Approved NBI 23-17
- Approved NBI 23-18 with amendments

VI. NEXT HTSB MEETING: December 1, 2023

Board Chairperson Kawazoe stated the next HTSB Board Meeting was scheduled for December 1, 2023. The details of the agenda would come out prior to the meeting.

VII. ADJOURNMENT

Board Chairperson Kawazoe adjourned the General Business Meeting at 3:07 p.m.

List of people who submitted written testimony before the board meeting

ON-TIME TESTIMONY		
NAME	ORGANIZATION	AGENDA ITEM
Scott Hamilton	Wheeler Middle School, Vice Principal	IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Charles Clausner	Saint Louis School, Teacher	IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Cara Muraoka	Mānoa Elementary School, Teacher	IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Kalāhikiola Aukai	Kamehameha Schools – Kapālama, Teacher	IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Taylor Hamilton	Punahou School, Teacher	IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Sarah Kern	Chiefess Kamakahelei Middle School, Instructional Coach	IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
David Miyashiro (Sun-Miyashiro)	HawaiiKidsCAN, Founding Executive Director	IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Erin Auerbach	Teach For America Hawai'i, Director of Development and External Network	IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Pi'ikea Kalakau-Baarde	Teach For America Hawai'i, Director of Regional Team Initiatives	IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Brigitte Russo	Wai'anae Intermediate School, Teacher	IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Lipoa Kahaleuahi	Ma Ka Hana Ka 'Ike, Executive Director	IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs

UNAPPROVED

Esther Kwon	Daniel K. Inouye Elementary School, Vice Principal	IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Cameron Kubota	Lincoln Elementary School, TA Principal	IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Alex Harris	Harold K.L. Castle Foundation, Vice President of Programs	IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Mathieu Williams	Kealakehe High School, Teacher	IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Harmonie Ahuna	Teach For America Hawai'i, Manager of Regional Team Initiatives	IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Jaz Palafox	Wai'anae High School, Teacher	IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Lauren Gaeta	Teach For America Hawai'i, Manager of Regional Initiatives	IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Kaelin Tancayo-Spielvogel	Punahou School, Teacher	IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Dale Fryxell, Ph.D.	Chaminade University, Dean of School of Education and Behavioral Sciences	IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Lindsay Kosasa	Waipahu High School, Teacher	IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Mark LaCelle-Peterson	Association for Advancing Quality in Educator Preparation (AAQEP), President and CEO	IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Jill Baldemor	Teach For America Hawai'i, Executive Director	IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs

UNAPPROVED

Derek Minakami	Kāneʻohe Elementary School, Principal	IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
<i>LATE TESTIMONY</i>		
NAME	ORGANIZATION	AGENDA ITEM
Mitchell Roth	County of Hawaiʻi, Mayor	IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Kara Kusunoki		IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Latasha Davis	Moanalua Middle School, Teacher	IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Leslie Ziu	Kapolei High School, Assistant Principal	IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Hannah Loera	Waiʻanae High School, Teacher	IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Ryan Mandado, Ed.D	DreamHouse ʻEwa Beach Public Charter School, CEO	IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Amy Perruso	House District 46, Hawaiʻi State Representative	IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Grace Brown		IV.C. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs