

**HAWAI‘I TEACHER STANDARDS BOARD
TEACHER EDUCATION COMMITTEE MEETING**

Friday, October 27, 2023

**Meeting Conducted by Remote Technology via Zoom
and
Physical Location at 650 Iwilei Road, Suite 158, Honolulu, HI 96817**

MINUTES

PRESENT:

Dr. Cecily Ornelles for Dr. Nathan Murata, *Committee Chairperson*
Kahele Dukelow for Warren Haruki
Dr. Jonathan Gillentine
Dawn Raymond
Branden Kawazoe, *Ex-officio*
Lokelani Han, *Ex-officio*

EXCUSED:

Sean Bacon for Keith Hayashi, *Committee Vice-Chairperson*
U‘ilani Miguel, *Non-Voting Member*

STAFF:

Felicia Villalobos, Executive Director
Tracey Idica, Licensing Specialist
Kris Murakami, Esq., Licensing Specialist
Dr. Jennifer Padua, Licensing Specialist
Raymond “RJ” Rodriguez, Licensing Specialist
Elaine Hutchinson, Secretary

I. CALL TO ORDER

A. ROLL CALL TO ESTABLISH QUORUM

Committee Chairperson Dr. Cecily Ornelles called the Teacher Education Committee Meeting to order at 9:47 a.m.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles shared information regarding procedures for virtual committee meetings, then called roll call. Committee Chairperson Ornelles, Committee Members Dr. Jonathan Gillentine, Dawn Raymond, and *Ex-officio* Committee Members Branden Kawazoe and Lokelani Han participated remotely. Committee Vice-Chairperson Sean Bacon and Non-Voting Committee Member

U'ilani Miguel were excused. Committee Member Kahele Dukelow was not present at roll call.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles shared information regarding procedures for oral public testimony. She called on Executive Director Felicia Villalobos for verification of written public testimony.

Executive Director Villalobos stated both on-time and late written testimonies were posted on the Hawai'i Teacher Standards Board ("HTSB") public website and uploaded to the Dropbox of the full board ("Board"). Executive Director Villalobos mentioned, at the discretion of the Chairperson, time may be allotted to look at the late written testimony.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles allotted five minutes for committee members to review the late written testimony.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for oral testimony. HTSB staff worked through technical difficulties at the physical meeting location. Committee Chairperson Ornelles then stated oral testimony would have a two-minute time limit.

Committee Member Dukelow entered remotely. Quorum was established.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles instructed HTSB staff to take the oral testimony in the order as indicated.

Ex-officio Committee Member Han asked about the oral testimony time limit.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles stated the time limit would be two minutes per individual.

HTSB staff worked through additional technical difficulties at the physical meeting location.

B. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON COMMITTEE AGENDA ITEMS

Jill Baldemor, Executive Director at Teach For America ("TFA") Hawai'i, signed up to testify in-person on agenda item III.A, entitled "NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs":

"Aloha, Chair Ornelles and members of the Teacher Education Committee. My name is Jill Baldemor and I am the Executive Director of Teach for America Hawai'i. I started my career in education as a second grade teacher in 1995 and have been leading our work at Teach for America Hawai'i for the past 16 years. Throughout my tenure I have had the honor and privilege of working with the talented staff at the Hawai'i Teacher Standards Board, including former Executive Directors Sharon Mahoe and Lynn Hammonds, and current Executive Director Felicia Villalobos. I have appreciated that we have always been able to work together collaboratively and transparently. We have never tried to hide

the ball. We have always operated with integrity. This was so in 2013 when we first came before you for state approval of our teacher education program and remains true today as we come before you again to ask for continued state approval.

“As you are aware, in May we were granted a full seven-year term of national accreditation with no concern cited, which was reviewed and reconfirmed by AAQEP two weeks ago. Today we request that you honor AAQEP’s decision and grant Teach for America Hawai‘i continued state approval for a full seven-year term without concerns or conditions.

“We respectfully make three points: (1) Teach for America Hawai‘i has at all times acted in accordance with HTSB’s guidance. There is no need for additional conditions, and any language regarding violation of policy should be stricken. (2) Honoring the decision of AAQEP aligns with HTSB’s past practices of respecting the rigorous and comprehensive review of the national accrediting body. (3) Imposing burdensome conditions takes away from important work that directly impacts teachers, students, and schools. HTSB has numerous systems and structures in place to appropriately monitor compliance, and we are committed to continuing to work collaboratively and transparently with HTSB staff, as we have for the past decade. Thank you for your time and consideration.”

Alyson Emrick, Director of Licensure at Teach For America Hawai‘i, signed up to testify in-person on agenda item III.A, entitled “NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs”:

“Aloha. My name is Alyson Emrick and I am the Director of Licensure with TFA Hawai‘i. I was a 2006 TFA corps member and after earning my master’s in education from the University of Pennsylvania, I joined staff here, where I have been for the last 15 years.

“Teach for America Hawai‘i has been a state approved teacher education program since 2013 and we have recommended approximately 700 teacher candidates for licensure in elementary and secondary content areas. It is true that some schools have hired TFA teachers in special education lines due to the significant need for special educators and willingness of TFA teachers to respond to the need. This was always done transparently and in compliance with HTSB’s policies as written and described to us.

“We see that next on the committee’s agenda is revising the language of NBI 12-27. We are fully ready to comply with the revised version, if approved, in the same way that we have fully complied with the existing version. The existing version requires that candidates complete clinical experience at the appropriate grade level and in the subject or school role for which they are seeking a license. All teacher candidates, including those in special education lines, gained experience in the appropriate grade level and in the subject area they were seeking a license. Principals verified that special education teachers use the same curriculum and standards and provided special education services in addition to—and not in lieu of—teaching a subject area content.

“Importantly, every year HTSB conducted annual audits, which included a review and verification of the appropriateness of the student teaching placement. Every year HTSB licensed the teachers that we recommended, including those who taught in special education lines, without any comment or concern. As such, we respectfully submit that

we have complied with HTSB policy, and request that the language about TFA being in violation of the policy be stricken. Mahalo.”

Jacqueline Scanlan, Teach For America Hawai‘i, signed up to testify in-person on agenda item III.A, entitled “NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs”:

“Good morning, Board. My name is Jackie Scanlan. Teach For America is what brought me back home in 2011 and has shaped my career in education. When I returned home, I was a special educator and eventually nominated by my peers to be the Special Education Department Head at Campbell High School and earned my master’s in teaching. On staff with Teach For America Hawai‘i, I’ve led our work recruiting homegrown educators and welcoming in our newest teacher candidates.

“As Jill and Aly have shared, TFA has complied with HTSB annual audits, and HTSB licensed all teacher candidates, including those in special education lines up to and through the summer of 2023. Many of these teachers added the field of Special Education to their license. Some, like myself, led special education departments at their schools or complex area.

“Just this year in April 2023, HTSB shared for the very first time a concern regarding teachers in special education lines. In response, we took immediate action to align with the new guidance. This school year beginning July 2023, HIDOE Principals were advised and confirmed that all TFA teacher candidates enrolled in TFA Hawai‘i’s alternative route to certification are in general education teaching lines. At all times, both before and after HTSB shared its concern, TFA Hawai‘i has complied with HTSB guidance, and we will continue to do so.

“We respectfully submit that the existing system of annual audits, annual reports, and other meetings and communication with HTSB staff is appropriate and sufficient for ensuring continued compliance, as it is for other state approved teacher education programs here in Hawai‘i. Thank you very much.”

Joshua Lee, Director of Data Systems at Teach For America Hawai‘i, signed up to testify in-person on agenda item III.A, entitled “NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs”:

“Aloha. My name is Joshua Lee and TFA Hawai‘i was what brought me back home in 2007 and inspired me to enter a career in education after completing an MBA program at Carnegie Mellon University. I taught math at ‘Aiea Intermediate School for five years, earned tenure, and a master’s degree in teaching. I then worked on data systems at the Hawai‘i Department of Education and am currently on staff with TFA Hawai‘i as the Director of Data Systems.

“As my colleague Jackie shared, HTSB has numerous systems in place to ensure compliance. In addition, AAQEP is a well-respected national accrediting body with a membership of over 200 education providers. The AAQEP accreditation process is comprehensive and rigorous, spending several years of study, hundreds of pages of data analysis, and it includes an in-person site visit with dozens of interviews. HTSB’s website shows that AAQEP has awarded seven years of accreditation to seven teacher

education programs operating in Hawai‘i, including our program. For each of the other six programs, HTSB has granted state approval for the same period of time awarded by AAQEP without any additional conditions required, respecting AAQEP’s very rigorous and thorough accreditation process.

“Contrary to the representation in the NBI that AAQEP’s leadership and site visit team were notified of a violation and took no action, AAQEP did conduct an additional review and concluded that TFA remained in compliance with all AAQEP standards. This letter was sent to HTSB’s Director and Chair on October 13, 2023, and is attached to our written testimony.

“Given that AAQEP has conducted a thorough review of our program and has found us to be in compliance, we respectfully request that HTSB honor AAQEP’s approval of seven years of accreditation without conditions, as HTSB has done for every other Hawai‘i provider that has been accredited by AAQEP. Thank you.”

Erin Auerbach, Director of Development at Teach For America Hawai‘i, signed up to testify in-person on agenda item III.A, entitled “NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs”:

“Aloha mai kākou. My name is Erin Pauahi Auerbach and I am the Director of Development at Teach for America Hawai‘i. I have an MBA from New York University and I came home to Hawai‘i in 2016 to join staff. I was not previously a classroom teacher, however, in my everyday work I am surrounded by former teachers who are now teacher coaches responsible for delivering and managing our ARC program—many of whom I am here with today.

“My colleagues before me have shared Teach for America Hawai‘i has complied with all policies, has been found to be in compliance by AAQEP, and affirms to continue to comply with policies moving forward. The systems that are in place to monitor compliance are sufficient and appropriate, and we urge HTSB to allow us to focus on our work.

“Since 2013 TFA Hawai‘i has recruited, trained, and helped license approximately 700 teacher candidates for Hawai‘i public schools. Today there are 571 people in the network—teachers, school and system leaders, and community advocates who are living and contributing to the community here in Hawai‘i. Our staff works tirelessly to support our network in a variety of ways. 79 candidates are currently enrolled in our alternative route to certification program and regularly engage with TFA staff and partners. 125 first- and second-year teachers receive regular observations, coaching, and professional development, and over 400 alumni have access to resources and ongoing learning opportunities. We are partnering with three schools to provide tutoring support for our students through our Ignite Fellowship. We are partnering with five to design and execute summer training program for incoming teachers. And we are partnering with community organizations to elevate and strengthen early literacy initiatives. Recruitment and selection of new teachers takes place year-round for us.

“We share this list of activities not to pat ourselves on the back, but rather to urge HTSB to let us focus on this work that directly impacts students, teachers, and our Hawai‘i public schools. Mahalo.”

Sierra Callihan, Teach For America Hawai‘i, signed up to testify in-person on agenda item III.A, entitled “NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs”:

“Aloha. My name is Sierra Callihan. I attended Hawai‘i public schools and I’m grateful to have had TFA Hawai‘i teachers when I was a student at ‘Aiea Intermediate and UH Mānoa. I joined TFA Hawai‘i as a 2017 corps member and taught ELA at Wai‘anae High School as a SPED teacher. I now coach TFA teachers across Hawai‘i and bring over a decade of these stories to this space to attest to the excellence of TFA’s program and the beneficial impact it has on the learning trajectory of all students, including myself.

“As my colleagues have shared before me, I urge you to grant TFA seven years of continued state approval without conditions and areas of improvement. The conditions are not necessary, and we humbly submit that the time would be better spent on work that directly impacts students. To the extent HTSB feels conditions are necessary, we request the following modifications: (1) We strongly object to Condition 4, which requires TFA to send a letter to school administrators about who they are allowed to hire in accordance with IDEA federal law. It is the kuleana of the Hawai‘i Department of Education to advise its principals on hiring with guidance from its attorneys. It is not TFA’s place to advise on hiring practices and federal law. (2) We request the phrase, ‘*TFA teacher candidates*,’ used in Conditions 1 and 3, be clearly defined to mean TFA teachers who were candidates for licensure in the previous year, and not all TFA teachers broadly. It is only relevant for HTSB to request verification of information for teachers that are actually recommended for licensure. And while we do not object to providing verification for these teachers, we do note that HTSB’s annual audit on a random sampling of teachers already takes place. An audit on every teacher that is recommended for licensure is burdensome and not necessary. Thank you.”

Lia Rozmiarek, Teach For America Hawai‘i, signed up to testify in-person on agenda item III.A, entitled “NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs”:

“Good morning. My name is Lia Rozmiarek and this is my twenty-fifth year in education, a journey I began in 1999 as a classroom teacher of 13 years through TFA, taking on family and community engagement, curriculum writing, early adoption of Danielson pilots, and WASC accreditation as a WASC accreditor, and attaining a master’s in education from Loyola Marymount University before returning home to Hawai‘i in 2012 to join TFA Hawai‘i staff.

“As my colleagues before me have shared, I urge you to grant TFA seven years of continued state approval without conditions and areas of improvement. To the extent that HTSB feels conditions are necessary, we request that duplicative requests be eliminated. HTSB already requires providers to complete an annual report and an annual audit, in addition to submitting comprehensive information when we recommend teachers for licensure. Conditions 1 and 2 largely request the same information that is submitted in other ways. In summary, Conditions 1 and 2 are duplicative. Condition 3, the audit, already exists and is unnecessary to expand. Condition 4, a letter to principals, should be

stricken as the Hawai‘i Department of Education and its attorneys should advise principals on hiring in compliance with federal law.

“To be clear, Teach For America Hawai‘i fully commits to working in partnership with HTSB to ensure compliance with all policies and laws. We have and will continue to willingly participate in annual audits and reports. We will continue to submit information for each teacher candidate we recommend for HTSB to review before issuing a license. We will continue to work collaboratively and transparently with HTSB staff as we have for the past decade.

“We have been awarded seven years of national accreditation with no concerns. We respectfully request that the Hawai‘i Teacher Standards Board honor this as it has for every other provider and grant TFA Hawai‘i seven years of continued state approval without conditions or areas of improvement. Thank you.”

Lauren Gaeta, Teach For America Hawai‘i, signed up to testify in-person on agenda item III.A, entitled “NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs”:

“Hello. My name is Lauren Gaeta and I’m a 2013 Teach For America alum, taught at Wai‘anae High School for six years, and I’m currently on TFA Hawai‘i staff coaching our new teachers. I come here to share why I feel strongly that TFA Hawai‘i’s teacher preparation program should be awarded seven years of state approval without conditions.

“The program provided me with foundational knowledge and valuable learning experiences that prepared me for the classroom and, more importantly, shaped my leadership to be a culturally responsive educator by providing the opportunities for me to get connected with the local community, especially as someone that’s not from here. The reflections, programming, and coaching conversations around the focus on responsive instructional leadership and DEI, layered with the Hawai‘i teacher performance standards, helped prepare me to be a leader at my placement school.

“The success I found in my classroom with my students soon earned me the position as Science Department Head by my fourth year of teaching, all the while I was finding other ways to give opportunities to our students by finding leadership opportunities in athletics and extracurriculars. School admin and the athletic department saw my commitment and leadership as a coach in my third year and asked me to be an interim athletic director when our school was going through a transition. I also volunteered to be the class advisor of the class of 2018 in my second year, seeing them through their four years till graduation.

“I am fortunate in my current role to be still connected to and support the community I taught in. I am the most proud to see my students I taught 10 years ago now teaching in classrooms of their own, and would like to think my journey as a TFA corps member—and my other TFA peers they had as teachers—helped shape these former students to be on the path to be educators in their own community. And I am only one story of many of my fellow peers that have used this quality and feasible path to licensure to become leaders in their local community advocating for our students. I urge you to grant TFA full state approval without conditions, in alignment with the seven years of approval they have already received from AAQEP. Thank you.”

Pi'ikea Kalakau-Baarde, Teach For America Hawai'i, signed up to testify in-person on agenda item III.A, entitled "NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs":

"Aloha mai kākou. My name is Pi'ikea Kalakau-Baarde and I am a Kamehameha Schools 2009 graduate, a 2015 TFA Hawai'i alum, and over the last nine years I've held educational leadership positions in both the public and private sectors here in Hawai'i. I feel strongly that TFA Hawai'i should be awarded seven years of state approval without conditions based on my experiences as a corps member of the program and as someone who is kama'āina from a rural community, similar to where TFA corps members serve.

"I joined TFA a few years out of college while working at the State Capitol. I wanted to make a more concrete impact on the Native Hawaiian community and realized through my time at the Legislature that working in education would be the best way to do that. TFA was the most feasible option for me in terms of alternative routes to credentialing in the state. TFA's ARC program allowed me to transition into a career in education and obtain both a teacher license and a master's degree while continuing to live and work in Hawai'i.

"TFA was the most challenging thing I have done in my professional and academic career and changed the trajectory of my life. Through the two years and beyond I was supported by TFA staff in partnership with my school leadership and professors at Johns Hopkins, where I got my master's degree. I love the six years I spent on the Wai'anae coast, and during this time I realized my passion for service. I have since served on my local neighborhood board, the boards of various community organizations, and more.

"In closing, I'd like to leave you with this 'ōlelo no'eau: *'A 'ohe pau ka 'ike i ka hālau ho 'okahi*, meaning, *'All knowledge is not taught in the same school.'* My route to a career in education was not traditional, but it was the best choice for me and I'm thankful that I had the opportunity to do so through TFA's alternative route to credentialing program. Thank you."

Jill Baldemor, Executive Director at Teach For America Hawai'i, signed up to testify in-person on agenda item III.B, entitled "NBI 12-27 Revised: Student Teaching Policy for HTSB Approved Educator Preparation Providers":

"Aloha again, members of the Teacher Education Committee. I'm back again to testify on the next item, which is NBI 12-27 Revised. We noticed that this was added to the agenda, and we appreciate that the Board is going to take this up to clarify the revised language that they're looking to put into place.

"As Aly shared in our testimony earlier, we are ready to be in full compliance with this new version, if approved. However, we want to make sure to share that the existing version we were also fully in compliance with. The existing version that is being marked out says, *'Candidates shall complete supervised clinical experience in student teaching, internship, or residency in a Hawai'i public, charter, or private school at the appropriate grade level and in the subject or school roles.'* In the revised version, the *'or'* is being changed to an *'and,'* and school roles are being delineated beyond school counselor and school librarian. These are new changes which, again, we're willing and ready to comply with. But we would like to ask that, in the Rationale, the line that states, *'The*

interpretation of this NBI, which requires a teacher's clinical placement to be in alignment with the licensure field they will be recommended in, has not changed since the initial adoption—we would request that that line be stricken because it is, in fact, changing. The ‘or’ is changing to an ‘and,’ and the roles are being further delineated.

“Given that these are changes that materially changes the language, we would respectfully submit that what’s stated here in the Rationale/Background should be taken out because it is not historically the way that this was worded. And given that it’s changed, we would appreciate if, instead of saying that it has not changed, recognizing that it will be changing now.

“Once again, we are ready to be in full compliance. Thank you for your consideration.”

HTSB staff addressed technical difficulties that might occur while switching to online oral testimony via Zoom.

Michael Sheehey, Early Childhood Education/Early Childhood Special Education Co-Program Coordinator at University of Hawai‘i at Mānoa, signed up to testify through Zoom on agenda item III.E, entitled “NBI 23-15: One-Time Approval of a Program Exception for the University of Hawai‘i at Mānoa’s 2022-2024 BEd in Early Childhood Education/Early Childhood Special Education Mild/Moderate Dual Licensure Program”:

“Good morning. My name is Michael Sheehey, a Co-Program Coordinator of the Early Childhood Education/Early Childhood Special Education teacher preparation program at the University of Hawai‘i at Mānoa. Before I begin, I’d like to acknowledge my colleagues here in support of our request: Dean Nathan Murata, Dr. Jon Yoshioka, Dr. Lori Fulton, Dr. Leah Muccio, Dr. Chris Au, and Dr. Rhonda Black. We are seeking approval for a one-time program exception for the UH Mānoa 2022-2024 BEd in Early Childhood Education/Early Childhood Special Education Mild/Moderate Dual Licensure Program, which we will refer to as the ‘*blended program*.’

“If granted, the requested exception would allow 27 nontraditional teacher candidates to fulfill their special education student teaching requirement prior to completing their special education content coursework. In fall of 2022, restructuring of the blended program to comply with HTSB policies received final approval from the university. At the time of approval, the 2022-2024 cohort had already started their program. Due to the timing of the final approval, this current cohort’s course and field sequence were impacted.

“The blended program is a 78-credit two-year program with rigorous coursework and clinical experiences in the content areas of Early Childhood and Early Childhood Special Education. The blended program was developed to address the critical need for licensed early childhood and special education teachers in Hawai‘i. Upon program completion and recommendation for licensure, these candidates will meet this need by serving their communities throughout the Hawai‘i Department of Education. Thank you.”

Dale Fryxell, Dean of the School of Education and Behavioral Sciences at Chaminade University, signed up to testify through Zoom on agenda item III.A,

entitled “NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs”:

“Morning. My name is Dale Fryxell, Dean of the School of Education and Behavioral Sciences at Chaminade University. Due to the limited time, I will summarize my written testimony as follows.

“I was the HTSB approved local practitioner on the AAQEP site visit team. As part of the team, we conduct a thorough review of the TFA program and came to the database conclusion that TFA produces well-trained teachers who fulfill essential needs in our local schools, and I am confident about the high quality of the TFA program.

“My letter highlights TFA’s compliance with the established interpretation of policies for teacher preparation programs, emphasizing that no concerns arose over the last 10 years related to NBI 12-27 during HTSB annual monitoring and reporting. If TFA was not in compliance with the implementation of NBI 12-27 over all of those years, then HTSB should have clarified their interpretation prior to the time of the site visit.

“TFA candidates have been effectively teaching specific content in diverse, inclusive classroom settings. Special education teachers in inclusive settings do not teach special education—they teach subjects like math, science, and language arts. I think that it is unfair to impose conditions on TFA since the program consistently followed the policies as presented by HTSB. My concern with placing the many conditions on the TFA program is that they were simply following the policies as they were written. I do not feel that a change in the interpretation of an existing policy should impact the approval of the TFA program.

“I am happy to see the revisions in NBI 12-27 that are on this meeting agenda, as they clarify the reinterpretation of the student teaching policies. I am confident that TFA will follow the new interpretation just as they have always followed the HTSB policies in the past. In fact, they have already implemented this revised interpretation for the ‘23-‘24 cohort placements.

“I strongly advocate for awarding TFA a seven-year state approval without the conditions outlined in NBI 23-13, emphasizing the importance of welcoming and supporting the quality program—”

Time was called for Dean Fryxell of Chaminade University.

Rhonda Black, Special Education Department Chair at University of Hawai‘i at Mānoa, signed up to testify through Zoom on agenda item III.C, entitled “NBI 20-34 Revised: Consideration of Provisional Approval of the University of Hawai‘i at Mānoa’s College of Education Added Field Program in Special Education Mild/Moderate and Special Education Severe/Autism,” and agenda item III.D, entitled “NBI 23-14: Approval of Substantive Modifications to the University of Hawai‘i at Mānoa’s Post Baccalaureate in Special Education Certificate Program”:

“I’m Rhonda Black from the University of Hawai‘i at Mānoa, Department Chair in Special Education. My colleagues here from the University of Hawai‘i at Mānoa have been acknowledged. Thank you so much for our dean, our directors, and my colleagues.

“For NBI 20-34 Revised, I want to add that this is simply a name change. We would like to remove the word ‘*profound*’ from the wording of the licensure program. We are adding wording that is about the support needs of a student rather than their level of disability.

“For NBI 23-14, I would like to add to the current NBI: The reason for the course number changes is not solely for efficiency of staff utilization. Reasons for changing course numbers is that both programs—the BEd in Special Education and the post-baccalaureate certificate in Special Education—they are both initial licensure programs. Students in both programs are receiving the same licensure. The BEd program began in 2022. As our first students are going through the program, our course instructors are collaborating to ensure that students in both programs are meeting the Hawai‘i teacher performance standards and the Council for Exceptional Children’s initial practice-based professional preparation standards for special education. Both programs use the same set of standards, therefore, it made sense that students in the Extensive Support Needs tracks take the same course numbers. Thank you.”

Lindsey Takenaka, Teach For America Hawai‘i, signed up to testify through Zoom on agenda item III.A, entitled “NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs”:

“Hi, my name is Lindsey and I’m going to be sharing testimony on behalf of Leslie Ziu: ‘My name is Leslie Ziu and I continue to work in the Hawai‘i Department of Education with our public schools. In 2012 I began in education as a Teach For America corps member and I’m so grateful to the organization that set me on this lifelong career path to serve students here in Hawai‘i.’

“By pursuing my licensure through TFA, I was able to receive direct classroom coaching, content area training, and rigorous feedback to ensure I would be able to provide needed pedagogical instruction to students. I was also grateful to take courses in Chaminade University of Honolulu through the TFA licensure program to gain even more local context with professors who are experts in the field. I write to strongly advocate for the Hawai‘i Teacher Standards Board to award Teach For America Hawai‘i’s teacher preparation program seven years of state approval without conditions.’

“In Hawai‘i we continue to have teacher shortages in our state. We know that our communities have high cost of living, particularly those new to education career. TFA Hawai‘i provided me a path to pursue licensure in a way that was supportive, rigorous, and also affordable. I know I remain a proud member of the Hawai‘i DOE today because of the foundation TFA Hawai‘i provided me. I have been able, for over a decade, to work with students and see our school state test scores double, mentor new teachers who also continue in the field, and even work as a public school administrator. The doors opened for me through TFA program cannot be overstated, and I in turn seek to continue investing in our public school system.’

“TFA provides programming that enables caring and hardworking individuals to become teachers from both in- and out-of-state. As an administrator who assists in school hiring, I can attest that we need great teachers as much now as ever before and urge you to support the organizations like TFA seeking to meet this need. I again ask you to grant TFA full state approval without conditions, in alignment with AAQEP.’

“Thank you.”

HTSB staff stated there was no further testimony.

C. ANNOUNCEMENTS

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reminded of information regarding meeting protocols and procedures, and of information regarding non-public site disclosure. None of the committee members participating remotely had anyone present with them.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reminded of information regarding procedures for oral public testimony. She provided another opportunity for public testimony. There was no additional public testimony.

D. APPROVAL OF COMMITTEE MINUTES

The minutes of the September 15, 2023, meeting was approved as written.

Executive Director Villalobos informed Committee Chairperson Ornelles that there were no announcements for agenda item I.C.

II. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON COMMITTEE AGENDA ITEMS

None

III. ACTION ITEMS

A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 23-13, which included the Rationale/Background.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if there was any discussion.

Committee Member Gillentine supported NBI 23-13, referring to both the NBI’s Rationale/Background and his 30+ years of experience teaching special education. The instance of an individual who was teaching in a special education line, doing community-based instruction, but pursuing licensure in Secondary English Language Arts did not make sense to him. Committee Member Gillentine stated that, as this instance was also not an outlier, the listed conditions in NBI 23-13 were warranted, necessary, and appropriate. He mentioned that, as a former site visitor for NCATE (National Council for Accreditation of Teacher Education) and CAEP (Council for the Accreditation of Educator Preparation), he did not see that meeting AAQEP (Association for Advancing Quality in Educator Preparation) standards equated to fulfilling HTSB policies.

Ex-officio Committee Member Han asked why Condition 2 regarding the Notification of Personnel Action (Form 5) only addressed Hawai'i Department of Education ("the Department") TFA completers and did not include Hawai'i public charter schools ("charter schools").

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called on Executive Director Villalobos to answer that question.

Executive Director Villalobos stated HTSB staff would need to look into whether charter schools had a Form 5 or an equivalent document. She mentioned most TFA placements were in the Department's school system, and the Form 5 would be used to confirm that placements were in the correct line compared with what was recommended for licensure.

Committee Member Raymond supported NBI 23-13. Taking into consideration the Rationale/Background, she stated the Board would not be following HTSB's Mission and Vision if the conditions were not put into place. She spoke about her experience as a licensed special education teacher and highlighted that special education teachers not only taught content, but also went through specialized training for care-coordinating duties and learned strategies to be able to provide the appropriate support for students with needs.

In reference to NBI 12-27 Revised, *Ex-officio* Committee Member Kawazoe wanted to address the written and oral public testimonies commenting that HTSB was changing or putting in new guidance since 2013.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called on Executive Director Villalobos to speak on that.

Executive Director Villalobos stated that, having sat on the Board from 2012 to 2020, the intent of NBI 12-27 Revised had always stayed the same since its adoption in 2013 and the added language was only clarifying that. She explained this was why HTSB had educator preparation program ("EPP") approval in Hawai'i, why there was a review process for programs, and why these programs were only allowed to recommend in certain licensure fields. She stated not all programs approved by the Board were able to recommend in Special Education, one of the programs being TFA as they did not go through HTSB's review process.

Ex-officio Committee Member Kawazoe stated it was the EPP's responsibility to ensure that its teacher candidates were in the correct placement and in the field which they would be recommended for licensure. He referred to NBI 23-13's Rationale/Background, his experience as a counselor, and agreed with Committee Member Gillentine's comments. *Ex-officio* Committee Member Kawazoe supported NBI 23-13 with its conditions, as it seemed like TFA was on board with upholding HTSB's standards. He mentioned he appreciated the testimonies and hard work that

TFA's candidates were putting into Hawai'i's students, but he also echoed Committee Member Raymond's sentiment regarding HTSB's Mission and Vision.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if there was any further discussion. There was no further discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 23-13, as written, to the Board at the General Business Meeting scheduled later at 12:30 p.m.

ACTION: The Teacher Education Committee voted unanimously to recommend NBI 23-13, as written, to the Board, with all members present voting aye.

B. NBI 12-27 Revised: Student Teaching Policy for HTSB Approved Educator Preparation Providers

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 12-27 Revised, which included the Rationale/Background and reflected clarification of language.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if there was any discussion.

Ex-officio Committee Member Kawazoe wanted to reconfirm with HTSB staff who was responsible for placement.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called on Executive Director Villalobos to answer that question.

Executive Director Villalobos stated any HTSB approved EPP had to ensure that placements were in correct alignment with the licensure fields it was approved for by the Board. She mentioned principals did not keep lists of all the EPPs and what each program was approved for. She explained it was up to the EPP, who was preparing their teachers and then recommending them for licensure. HTSB did not get the recommendations from the Department or the Hawai'i State Public Charter School Commission, but from the EPP.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if there was any further discussion. There was no further discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 12-27 Revised, as written, to the Board at the General Business Meeting scheduled later at 12:30 p.m.

ACTION: The Teacher Education Committee voted unanimously to recommend NBI 12-27 Revised, as written, to the Board, with all members present voting aye.

C. NBI 20-34 Revised: Consideration of Provisional Approval of the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's College of Education Added Field Program in Special Education Mild/Moderate and Special Education Severe/Autism

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 20-34 Revised, which included the Rationale/Background and reflected a change in language from "*profound*" to "*autism*."

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if there was any discussion. There was no discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 20-34 Revised, as written, to the Board at the General Business Meeting scheduled later at 12:30 p.m.

ACTION: The Teacher Education Committee voted unanimously to recommend NBI 20-34 Revised, as written, to the Board, with all members present voting aye.

D. NBI 23-14: Approval of Substantive Modifications to the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's Post Baccalaureate in Special Education Certificate Program

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 23-14, which included the Rationale/Background.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if there was any discussion. There was no discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 23-14, as written, to the Board at the General Business Meeting scheduled later at 12:30 p.m.

ACTION: The Teacher Education Committee voted unanimously to recommend NBI 23-14, as written, to the Board, with all members present voting aye.

E. NBI 23-15: One-Time Approval of a Program Exception for the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's 2022-2024 BEd in Early Childhood Education/Early Childhood Special Education Mild/Moderate Dual Licensure Program

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 23-15, which included the Rationale/Background.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if there was any discussion. There was no discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 23-15, as written, to the Board at the General Business Meeting scheduled later at 12:30 p.m.

ACTION: The Teacher Education Committee voted unanimously to recommend NBI 23-15, as written, to the Board, with all members present voting aye.

F. NBI 23-16: Adoption of the Council for Exceptional Children’s Early Interventionist/Early Childhood Special Educator Standards

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 23-16, which included the Rationale/Background.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles asked committee members if there was any discussion. There was no discussion from committee members.

Committee Chairperson Ornelles called for a roll call vote on whether or not to recommend NBI 23-16, as written, to the Board at the General Business Meeting scheduled later at 12:30 p.m.

ACTION: The Teacher Education Committee voted unanimously to recommend NBI 23-16, as written, to the Board, with all members present voting aye.

IV. ADJOURNMENT

Committee Chairperson Ornelles adjourned the Teacher Education Committee Meeting at 11:03 a.m.

List of people who submitted written testimony before the committee meeting

ON-TIME TESTIMONY		
NAME	ORGANIZATION	AGENDA ITEM
Scott Hamilton	Wheeler Middle School, Vice Principal	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Charles Clausner	Saint Louis School, Teacher	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Cara Muraoka	Mānoa Elementary School, Teacher	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Kalāhikiola Aukai	Kamehameha Schools – Kapālama, Teacher	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Taylor Hamilton	Punahou School, Teacher	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Sarah Kern	Chiefess Kamakahelei Middle School, Instructional Coach	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
David Miyashiro (Sun-Miyashiro)	HawaiiKidsCAN, Founding Executive Director	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Erin Auerbach	Teach For America Hawai'i, Director of Development and External Network	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Pi'ikea Kalakau-Baarde	Teach For America Hawai'i, Director of Regional Team Initiatives	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Brigitte Russo	Wai'anae Intermediate School, Teacher	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Lipoa Kahaleuahi	Ma Ka Hana Ka 'Ike, Executive Director	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs

UNAPPROVED

Esther Kwon	Daniel K. Inouye Elementary School, Vice Principal	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Cameron Kubota	Lincoln Elementary School, TA Principal	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Alex Harris	Harold K.L. Castle Foundation, Vice President of Programs	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Candice Frontiera, Ph.D.	Kailua-Kalāheo Complex Area, School Renewal Specialist	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Mathieu Williams	Kealakehe High School, Teacher	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Garrett Gage	Wai'anae High School, Teacher	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Harmonie Ahuna	Teach For America Hawai'i, Manager of Regional Team Initiatives	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Jaz Palafox	Wai'anae High School, Teacher	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Lauren Gaeta	Teach For America Hawai'i, Manager of Regional Initiatives	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Kaelin Tancayo-Spielvogel	Punahou School, Teacher	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Dale Fryxell, Ph.D.	Chaminade University, Dean of School of Education and Behavioral Sciences	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Lindsay Kosasa	Waipahu High School, Teacher	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America's Educator Preparation Unit and Programs

Derek Minakami	Kāneʻohe Elementary School, Principal	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Mark LaCelle-Peterson	Association for Advancing Quality in Educator Preparation (AAQEP), President and CEO	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Jill Baldemor	Teach For America Hawaiʻi, Executive Director	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
LATE TESTIMONY		
NAME	ORGANIZATION	AGENDA ITEM
Mitchell Roth	County of Hawaiʻi, Mayor	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Latasha Davis	Moanalua Middle School, Teacher	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Leslie Ziu	Kapolei High School, Assistant Principal	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Hannah Loera	Waiʻanae High School, Teacher	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Ryan Mandado, Ed.D	DreamHouse ʻEwa Beach Public Charter School, CEO	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Amy Perruso	House District 46, Hawaiʻi State Representative	III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs
Grace Brown		III.A. NBI 23-13: Continuing State Approval for Teach For America’s Educator Preparation Unit and Programs