



**STATE OF HAWAII
HAWAII TEACHER STANDARDS BOARD
GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING**

MINUTES

Remote Technology via Zoom

650 Iwilei Road, Suite 158
Honolulu, HI 96817

Friday, November 15, 2024

PRESENT IN-PERSON:

Kristi Miyamae, *Board Chairperson*
Justin Mew
Kim Sanders

PRESENT ONLINE:

Lokelani Han, *Board Vice-Chairperson*
Sean Bacon for Keith Hayashi
Kahele Dukelow for Roy Takumi
Dr. Jonathan Gillentine
Dale Matsuura
Dr. Cecily Ornelles for Dr. Nathan Murata
Dondra Ozaki
Dawn Raymond
Dr. Katina Soares

EXCUSED:

Dr. Philip Bossert

NOT PRESENT:

Elena Farden for Keahi Makaimoku

STAFF:

Felicia Villalobos, Executive Director
Steven Harada, Licensing Specialist
Dr. Mitzie Higa, Licensing Specialist

STAFF (continued):

Kris Murakami, Esq., Licensing Specialist
Dr. Jennifer Padua, Licensing Specialist

I. CALL TO ORDER

A. ROLL CALL TO ESTABLISH QUORUM

Board Chairperson Kristi Miyamae called the General Business Meeting to order at 12:00 p.m.

Board Chairperson Miyamae shared information regarding procedures for virtual board meetings, then called roll call and established quorum. Board Chairperson Miyamae and Board Member Kim Sanders were present in-person. Board Vice-Chairperson Lokelani Han and Board Members Sean Bacon, Kahele Dukelow, Dr. Jonathan Gillentine, Dale Matsuura, Dr. Cecily Ornelles, Dondra Ozaki, Dawn Raymond, and Dr. Katina Soares were present online. Board Member Justin Mew was not present at roll call. Board Member Dr. Philip Bossert was excused. Board Member Elena Farden was not present.

Board Chairperson Miyamae shared information regarding non-public site disclosure. None of the board members participating online had anyone present with them to disclose. Board Chairperson Miyamae then shared additional information regarding meeting protocols and procedures.

B. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING AGENDA ITEMS

None

C. ANNOUNCEMENTS

Executive Director Felicia Villalobos announced she will send out a Doodle Poll to find a possible date in December for a shortened board meeting to review two new potential educator preparation programs (“EPPs”).

D. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES

The minutes of the August 30, 2024, meeting and the September 27, 2024, meeting were approved as written.

E. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR’S REPORT

Board Chairperson Miyamae introduced Executive Director Villalobos to share her report.

Executive Director Villalobos stated she stood on her report.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

II. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING AGENDA ITEMS

None

F. LICENSING UPDATE – Licensing Specialist Dr. Mitzie Higa

Board Chairperson Miyamae introduced Specialist Higa to share the licensing update.

Specialist Higa shared the licensing specialists are busy arranging for licensing presentations and preparing for the start of the renewal period in January. She mentioned applications are also coming in from recent graduates of Hawai'i-approved EPPs.

Board Vice-Chairperson Han wanted clarification on the turnaround time of graduating from an EPP to obtaining licensure.

Specialist Higa explained it depends on when the EPP sends out its institutional recommendation and when the individual wants to obtain their license. She shared it can be up to 30 days. She mentioned the licensing specialists go through many notifications a day, but they process applications as fast as they can, though it can take longer during the renewal period.

Executive Director Villalobos asked Board Chairperson Miyamae if she could provide additional information.

Board Chairperson Miyamae called on Executive Director Villalobos.

Executive Director Villalobos explained EPPs have up to six weeks to turn in their institutional recommendations because they need to verify that their teacher candidates met all coursework and other requirements so the candidates are not recommended inappropriately. She mentioned the licensing specialists do make these in-state completers a priority when the recommendations come through the licensing management system ("LMS") because they know the license is needed as soon as possible for employment.

Board Member Dukelow asked what '*Submitted*' for '*New Applications by Status*' meant in the Executive Director's Report.

Executive Director Villalobos answered it is the amount of people who submitted an application, but the application has not been fully processed for various reasons such as waiting on documentation (e.g., valid government-issued photo identification, verification forms). She mentioned an application is open for six months before expiring, but the applicant can then submit a new application. She stated this is to ensure the Professional Fitness ("PF") section of the application is up-to-date when it is submitted.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

G. REGISTERED TEACHER APPRENTICESHIP UPDATE – Licensing Specialist Dr. Mitzie Higa

Board Chairperson Miyamae introduced Specialist Higa to share an update on registered teacher apprenticeship.

Specialist Higa shared the registered teacher apprenticeship is at the consult and confer stage. She explained because the Hawai'i Department of Education ("HIDOE") is the employer, it is meeting with the unions for that process. She mentioned HTSB can move on once that process is completed, but HTSB also needs to wait for the SAEF (State Apprenticeship Expansion Formula) grant budget to be signed and the funds to be released by HIDOE. She stated in the meantime, HTSB has been getting subgrant applications ready for the University of Hawai'i ("UH") system to get teachers into shortage areas (i.e., special education, Hawaiian immersion, Career and Technical Education ["CTE"], elementary education). She emphasized that currently it is a waiting game, but HTSB is doing what it can now so that it is ready to go as soon as it is able to move forward. She asked if Board Member Bacon would be able to share anything on HIDOE's side.

Board Member Mew entered the meeting remotely via Zoom.

Board Member Bacon stated the consultation process has begun and it was sent out to the appropriate unions. He mentioned there is a deadline coming up shortly for the unions to submit any questions, comments, or concerns. He stated depending on what is received by the unions, there will most likely be a back-and-forth dialogue before moving forward.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

H. BOARD MEMBERS REPORT ON CONFERENCES ATTENDED

Board Chairperson Miyamae stated she was able to attend the NASDTEC (National Association of State Directors of Teacher Education and Certification) Professional Practices Institute ("PPI") conference with Board Member Raymond.

Board Member Raymond shared one of her biggest takeaways was the fact that not every U.S. state has the Model Code of Ethics for Educators ("MCEE"). She mentioned each state adopts its own code of ethics, so it may be similar to the MCEE but it is not the same. She shared about an interesting session she had attended in which prosecutors and adjudicators discussed their concerns regarding what is happening in their states as they work on cases. She stated they want to see more professional development ("PD") regarding boundaries with students, in addition to the course(s) that NASDTEC already offers. She mentioned they also want school entities and teacher preparation programs to be required to include this topic because they found that grooming happens often prior to students graduating. She shared Kentucky changed legislation about the use of numbers for case titles in this area, that they will now have the educator's name on the case. She recalled how, in the past, HTSB had also discussed using names versus numbers on its cases. She shared there is a nationwide backlog of caseloads due to staffing shortages, and the oldest open case was about 10 years old. She stated, despite hearing about educator cases, it was nice to hear reassurances that educators are not monsters, that these cases are a very slim percentage. She also shared she felt very happy when an attendee from Washington state said Dr. Troy Hutchings had recommended Hawai'i as one of the states to look at for MCEE.

Board Chairperson Miyamae shared this was her first time attending the PPI so it was interesting to see how much of an outlier Hawai'i is compared to other states because Hawai'i is one large district. She mentioned many states seem to have ethics commissions where they handle their discipline problems and licensing. She shared one of the sessions she attended discussed situations regarding breach of contract (e.g., teachers not showing

up to work), that some states suspend teachers for 90 days for certain infractions. She also shared some states are creating more PLCs (Professional Learning Communities) to try to support and retain teachers through mentoring. She mentioned mentoring is also part of Arkansas state law. She shared another session discussed requiring ethics training for teachers and how often some states require them (e.g., in cycles, online, every five years for license renewal). She mentioned one state also includes training for suicide and trafficking. She shared unfortunately states are not seeing a decrease in cases, so they want to embed more code of conduct trainings. She mentioned one state has a hotline to report incidents and another state requires administrators to report an incident within 24 hours. She stated some commissions require teachers to go through a summary of suspension. She shared another session discussed restorative approaches in response to public misconception of the educator profession, such as providing PD, evaluations, treatment, and mentorships. She also shared one of the last sessions discussed trends and changes in state legislation. She mentioned the five biggest trends are: (1) Portability of Professional License of Servicemembers and Spouses, (2) changes in state governance, (3) removal modification of traditional licensing standards, (4) the Interstate Teacher Mobility Compact, and (5) courts striking down moral turpitude.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

III. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING AGENDA ITEMS

None

IV. NEW BUSINESS, COMMITTEE REPORTS, AND PENDING COMMITTEE ACTION

BOARD ACTION – NEW BUSINESS

Board Chairperson Miyamae briefly introduced NBI 24-11 and stated it did not go through committee. She called for a first and second to move NBI 24-11.

Board Member Raymond moved NBI 24-11. Board Member Gillentine seconded the motion.

A. NBI 24-11: Approval of HTSB’s 2025 Annual Report

Board Chairperson Miyamae emphasized that the annual report may be reviewed for non-substantive corrections. She then deferred to Executive Director Villalobos.

Executive Director Villalobos stated this annual report is submitted to the Hawai'i State Legislature, and HTSB will most likely get questions about the report during its presentation to the House of Representatives. She clarified that, although the report says 2025, it is for the 2023-2024 school year. She also commended Licensing Specialist Dr. Jennifer Padua for gathering all the EPP data for the report.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Miyamae called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 24-11, as written. Board Chairperson Miyamae did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 24-11, as written.

APPROVED

ACTION — NBI 24-11: Approval of HTSB’s 2025 Annual Report, as written, was adopted by the full board (“Board”).

PENDING COMMITTEE ACTION – Teacher Standards Committee: Sanders

The Teacher Standards Committee met at 9:00 a.m and looked at two New Business Items (“NBIs”).

B. NBI 24-12: License Affirmation (September 2024)

Committee Chairperson Sanders stated the Teacher Standards Committee voted to recommend NBI 24-12, as written, to the Board. She reviewed NBI 24-12, affirming the licenses and permits for the respective month.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Miyamae called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 24-12, as written. Board Chairperson Miyamae did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 24-12, as written.

ACTION — NBI 24-12: License Affirmation (September 2024), as written, was adopted by the Board.

C. NBI 24-13: Adoption of Praxis Licensure Exam for Health Occupations (5052)

Committee Chairperson Sanders stated the Teacher Standards Committee voted to recommend NBI 24-13, as written, to the Board. She reviewed NBI 24-13, which includes the Rationale/Background.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Miyamae called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 24-13, as written. Board Chairperson Miyamae did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 24-13, as written.

ACTION — NBI 24-13: Adoption of Praxis Licensure Exam for Health Occupations (5052), as written, was adopted by the Board.

PENDING COMMITTEE ACTION – Teacher Education Committee: Ornelles

The Teacher Education Committee met at 10:00 a.m. and looked at three New Business Items.

D. NBI 24-14: The Expansion of Chaminade’s School Counseling License to Include Preschool

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 24-14, which includes the Rationale/Background. She shared about the discussion that was had amongst committee members and the questions that were answered by Dr. Darren Iwamoto, of Chaminade University’s School of Education and Behavioral Sciences. She also reviewed the

APPROVED

amendments made to the NBI in red. She stated the Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 24-14, as amended, to the Board.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Miyamae called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 24-14, as amended. Board Chairperson Miyamae did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 24-14, as amended.

ACTION — NBI 24-14: The Expansion of Chaminade’s School Counseling License to Include Preschool, as amended, was adopted by the Board.

E. NBI 24-15: Adoption of the Council for Exceptional Children’s Advanced Special Education Preparation Standards

Committee Chairperson Ornelles reviewed NBI 24-15, which includes the Rationale/Background. She also reviewed the amendments made to the NBI in red. She stated the Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 24-15, as amended, to the Board.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Miyamae called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 24-15, as amended. Board Chairperson Miyamae did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 24-15, as amended.

ACTION — NBI 24-15: Adoption of the Council for Exceptional Children’s Advanced Special Education Preparation Standards, as amended, was adopted by the Board.

F. NBI 22-32 Revised: Approval of the University of Hawai’i at Mānoa’s Letter of Intent to Plan a Reading Specialist Add-a-Field Program

Committee Chairperson Ornelles stated she has been asked by the Board Chairperson to recuse herself from NBIs pertaining to UH Mānoa. She deferred to Committee Vice-Chairperson Gillentine to review NBI 22-32 Revised.

Committee Vice-Chairperson Gillentine stated the Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 22-32 Revised, as written, to the Board. He reviewed NBI 22-32 Revised, which includes the Rationale/Background. He shared about the discussion that was had amongst committee members and the questions that were answered by Dr. Rhonda Black, of UH Mānoa’s College of Education.

Board Chairperson Miyamae asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Miyamae called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 22-32 Revised, as written. Board Chairperson Miyamae did not vote. Board

APPROVED

Member Ornelles recused herself from the vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to approve NBI 22-32 Revised, as written.

ACTION — NBI 22-32 Revised: Approval of the University of Hawai‘i at Mānoa’s Letter of Intent to Plan a Reading Specialist Add-a-Field Program, as written, was adopted by the Board.

V. EXECUTIVE SESSION

Board Chairperson Miyamae shared information regarding procedures for virtual Executive Session.

Board Chairperson Miyamae called for a motion to rise into Executive Session.

Board Member Raymond moved to rise into Executive Session. Board Member Mew seconded the motion.

Board Chairperson Miyamae called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether or not to rise into Executive Session. Board Chairperson Miyamae did not vote. The motion carried unanimously with all other board members present voting to rise into Executive Session at 12:44 p.m.

This portion of the meeting is a closed meeting under Hawaii Revised Statutes (“HRS”) §92-4 and HRS §92-5(a)(1)(2) and (4).

Board Chairperson Miyamae called the meeting back to order at 1:58 p.m.

Board Chairperson Miyamae reported out what was discussed during Executive Session:

- Petitioner’s Written Exceptions to The Whole or Any Part of The Recommended Decision
- Meeting minutes from September 27, 2024
- Personnel updates from Executive Director Villalobos
- Consultation with Deputy Attorney General Darien Chow
- NBI 24-16: Case No. 24-03 – Adopted

VI. NEXT HTSB MEETING: January 17, 2025

Board Chairperson Miyamae stated the next HTSB Board Meeting was scheduled for January 17, 2025. The details of the agenda would come out prior to the meeting.

VII. ADJOURNMENT

Board Chairperson Miyamae adjourned the General Business Meeting at 2:00 p.m.