

**HAWAI‘I TEACHER STANDARDS BOARD
GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING**

Friday, December 1, 2023

**Meeting Conducted by Remote Technology via Zoom
and
Physical Location at 650 Iwilei Road, Suite 158, Honolulu, HI 96817**

MINUTES

PRESENT:

Branden Kawazoe, *Board Chairperson*
Lokelani Han, *Board Vice-Chairperson*
Kahele Dukelow for Warren Haruki
Elena Farden for Keahi Makaimoku
Dr. Jonathan Gillentine
Justin Mew
Kristi Miyamae
Dr. Cecily Ornelles for Dr. Nathan Murata
Dawn Raymond
Kim Sanders
Dr. Katina Soares
Kerry Tom, in place of Sean Bacon for Keith Hayashi

EXCUSED:

U‘ilani Miguel, *Non-Voting Member*

STAFF:

Felicia Villalobos, Executive Director
Tracey Idica, Licensing Specialist
Kris Murakami, Esq., Licensing Specialist
Dr. Jennifer Padua, Licensing Specialist
Elaine Hutchinson, Secretary

ALSO PRESENT:

Kevin Costa, Business Solutions Technology

I. CALL TO ORDER

A. ROLL CALL TO ESTABLISH QUORUM

Board Chairperson Branden Kawazoe called the General Business Meeting to order at 12:30 p.m.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe shared information regarding procedures for virtual board meetings, then called roll call and established quorum. Board Chairperson Kawazoe; Board Vice-Chairperson Lokelani Han; Board Members Kahele Dukelow, Elena Farden, Dr. Jonathan Gillentine, Justin Mew, Kristi Miyamae, Dr. Cecily Ornelles, Dawn Raymond, Kim Sanders, and Dr. Katina Soares; and Mr. Kerry Tom participated remotely. Non-Voting Board Member U'ilani Miguel was excused.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe shared information regarding non-public site disclosure. None of the board members participating remotely had anyone present with them. Board Chairperson Kawazoe then shared additional information regarding meeting protocols and procedures.

B. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING AGENDA ITEMS

None

C. ANNOUNCEMENTS

Licensing Specialist Tracey Idica shared that Board Member Sanders was nominated for the National Distinguished Principal Award, representing the Leeward District.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe congratulated Board Member Sanders for her nomination.

Executive Director Felicia Villalobos informed of the pending weather and electricity at the public meeting location at Dole Cannery.

D. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES

The minutes of the October 27, 2023, meeting was approved as written.

E. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Board Chairperson Kawazoe introduced Executive Director Villalobos to share her report.

Executive Director Villalobos acknowledged her report and the various information available. One highlight of her report was on the Hawai'i Department of Education ("the Department") Emergency Hire Report. She explained emergency hires were teachers who had not obtained licensure but might be in an educator preparation

program (“EPP”) to receive licensure. She noted there was a surprising amount of emergency hires placed in counseling, elementary education, and special education positions. She also stated Hawai‘i Teacher Standards Board (“HTSB”) would be sharing this data at the TECC (Teacher Education Coordinating Committee) meeting with Superintendent Keith Hayashi, the 14 Hawai‘i-approved EPPs, and Dr. Nathan Murata of the University of Hawai‘i at Mānoa. She hoped HTSB could ensure that these emergency hire teachers were enrolled in one of these Hawai‘i EPPs and were on their way toward licensure.

Executive Director Villalobos’s next focus in her report was the new survey that was implemented on all HTSB applications to start tracking EPP completers. The survey asked a series of questions to find out where teachers were at in their careers and where they were coming from. The data collected from this survey would be shared with different stakeholders (e.g., the full board [“Board”], Hawai‘i State Teachers Association, the Department, Hawai‘i State Legislature) so HTSB could help address the teacher shortage.

Key interpretations from the application surveys and data:

- As there was a large number of applicants that had less than one year of full-time teaching experience in Hawai‘i, that meant teacher recruitment was coming in from the continental United States and maybe even internationally.
- Teaching was still a young profession as most applicants had a combined full-time teaching experience [in Hawai‘i, another U.S. state, U.S. territory, or Department of Defense Education Activity school] of less than four years.
- Knowing which U.S. state applicants completed their state approved teacher education program (“SATEP”) in meant the data could help the Department plan their teacher recruitment trips.
- Some local students who completed their SATEP in another state, especially on the west coast, came back to teach in Hawai‘i.
- Considering there was a large Hawai‘i population at University of Nevada - Las Vegas, it was surprising that there was a low number of local students who came back to teach in Hawai‘i.
- As 60% of Hawai‘i’s teachers came from out of state, those teachers did not have Hawaiian knowledge and culture embedded into their out-of-state SATEP, and possibly even Model Code of Ethics (“MCEE”) since not all states adopted it.
 - For the 14 Hawai‘i-approved EPPs, Hawaiian knowledge and culture and MCEE were required to be embedded into their programs by Hawaii Administrative Rules.
 - Regarding the Hawaiian knowledge and culture requirement, the Hawaiian Workgroup would need to look at adding extra requirements for renewal and ensuring teachers from out of state had that indigenous knowledge.
- Surprised to find that most applicants felt they did not receive a quality induction to teaching in Hawai‘i and to Hawaiian culture or was not provided instruction during the first three years of teaching in Hawai‘i.
 - This data would help the Department look into quality mentor support.
 - Quality induction and mentorship were key factors in retaining teachers.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion.

Board Member Farden thanked Executive Director Villalobos for her extensive and thorough report, especially for the data as that helped the Board with its work. She asked if the progress report on the executive director's performance goals was also included in the Executive Director's Report.

Executive Director Villalobos stated the Board did not put performance goals as part of the Executive Director's Report. She mentioned the Permitted Interaction Group ("P.I.G.") still needed to meet, since the Board wanted to re-look at the performance indicators for the executive director. The P.I.G. would need to get the Board's approval.

Board Member Farden asked if there was a legend indicating the different colors on the chart located on page 15, Question #6, of the Executive Director's Report.

Executive Director Villalobos explained there was no legend as it came right from the licensing management operator and stated she would include one in the next report.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any further questions or discussion. There were no further questions or discussion from board members.

Executive Director Villalobos added after her report that the moratorium in place for all EPPs—to put a pause on any program recommendations or reviews—had expired today, December 1st. That meant as of today, the Board could now receive program reviews or letters of intent. Executive Director Villalobos also mentioned there was an NBI currently with the Teacher Education Committee that the Board would need to vote on regarding a proposed moratorium for out-of-state EPPs only. She reiterated this one was different from the moratorium that just expired, which affected both out-of-state and in-state EPPs.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any further questions or discussion. There were no further questions or discussion from board members.

II. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING AGENDA ITEMS

None

F. LICENSING UPDATE – Licensing Specialist Dr. Jennifer Padua

Licensing Specialist Padua stated the licensing specialists were continuing to process applications and were gearing up for the license renewal period beginning

January 1, 2024. She mentioned last year was her first experience with the renewal period and staff had about 1,000 notifications waiting for them after the holidays.

Licensing Specialist Padua elaborated on what Executive Director Villalobos stated about the EPP moratorium, informing that part of her work was looking at EPPs and researching best practices. She was working with two researchers from the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa ("UH Mānoa"), culling through the data of EPP requirements and what the best practices were in literature. She shared two findings based on what was found so far:

Finding 1: Initial Letter of Intent from EPPs

- HTSB had a very skim letter of intent before and did not ask questions like:
 - *Do EPPs have financial capacity?*
 - *Do EPPs have organizational credibility?*
 - *If EPPs are doing programs, are their teachers coming out with quality or competency?*
 - *Are the teachers staying in the program?*
 - *Are EPPs offering a license field that would meet Hawai'i's educational needs?*
 - For example: Chaminade University was the only Hawai'i approved EPP offering school counseling in terms of licensing. So, if another Hawai'i approved EPP wanted to offer school counseling, that would be something that HTSB would want to pursue versus elementary education as HTSB already had several EPPs with elementary education or multiple pathways to elementary education such as degree, post-baccalaureate, or master's programs.
- The letter of intent helped HTSB understand the EPP's ability to offer a licensure program, which was important because if the letter of intent was not seen, how would HTSB know that the EPP was going to implement anything?
 - Prior to this, HTSB would just accept all letters of intents.

Finding 2: Details in Submitted Program Applications

- When EPPs submitted their program applications, that provided more details about how they could sustain their program.
- Licensing Specialist Padua mentioned the accreditation process and field visits she had conducted, stating that part of being an EPP was making sure it got program accreditation and national accreditation, as well as meeting the Department's policies.
 - One of the Department's policies was making sure teachers had six credits of sheltered instruction or TESOL (Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages) requirements, regardless of licensure field.
 - Could an EPP already provide this kind of course credit so that when teachers got into the field, they would not need to keep taking courses and then possibly get a letter that they did not finish in time and were not in compliance?

Licensing Specialist Padua stated HTSB was also looking at Hawai'i-specific requirements such as understanding Hawaiian culture, knowledge, and history, as well as special education and working with diverse learners. She informed that revisions were made to the letter of intent, the program modification, and the program application to make these documents much more robust compared to before. She also mentioned a suggestion based on her collaboration with the UH Mānoa researchers in which they found that other U.S. states created an infographic showing interested parties what it would take to have an approved program in their state. She then thanked the Board for supporting the EPP moratorium and made herself available for any questions.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion.

Board Vice-Chairperson Han asked if there was anything happening with HTSB's EPPs to incorporate more school counseling programs other than the one at Chaminade University, seeing as there was a greater need.

Licensing Specialist Padua stated UH Mānoa had submitted a letter of intent a couple of years ago. She mentioned the letter of intent was approved, but HTSB was currently waiting on the program application. She asked Board Member Ornelles if she had any additional information.

Board Member Ornelles stated UH Mānoa's College of Education was trying to push this forward in terms of having final approvals for organization with the location of the degree and track, which would be in the Department of Educational Psychology. Memos were currently going through UH and once those final approvals came through, UH Mānoa's College of Education would like to submit to HTSB the program application for provisional approval hopefully in early spring. She stated the program itself had Board approval, but they were just waiting on a few memos and approvals for how the school counseling program would articulate and sit with the rehab counseling program. Board Member Ornelles mentioned she was working with individuals to get the proposal ready for HTSB so that a committee could review it, reiterating that they were targeting early spring for submission to HTSB.

Executive Director Villalobos asked Board Chairperson Kawazoe if she could add to Licensing Specialist Padua and Board Member Ornelles's statements.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called on Executive Director Villalobos.

Executive Director Villalobos mentioned the research that Licensing Specialist Padua and Dr. Ronnie Tiffany-Kinder conducted on license renewal, pointing out that many U.S. states were adding mental health requirements to license renewal, along with other training requirements such as suicide prevention and CPR. She stated the Board currently did not have many renewal requirements besides '*Effective*' ratings on EES (Educator Effectiveness System) and employment. She

stated if those types of trainings (e.g., suicide prevention, CPR) were missed coming out of teachers' EPPs or teachers were not trained in their states, at least that could be caught at Hawai'i's license renewal. She stated it would still take research to find what resources were available. She mentioned this was brought up at a national conversation because mental health seemed to be a national issue with both teachers and students, which was why many teachers were leaving the profession. She stated HTSB was looking at the National Education Association and other stakeholders in other states, what their requirements were, and what resources they were providing teachers to help with this situation.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any further questions or discussion. There were no further questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe thanked Board Member Ornelles and UH Mānoa's College of Education for giving Hawai'i's teacher candidates another option for a school counseling program.

G. PRESENTATION – Kevin Costa: Business Solutions Technology (BST) Licensing Management System (LMS) Security Updates

Mr. Costa shared his PowerPoint presentation with a focus on information security of HTSB's licensing management system ("LMS") due to cyber-related warfare prevalent around the world today.

Real-World Online Threats

- *Web Attackers*: Attempt to infiltrate and gain control over software applications or information. Malware or ransomware packages may be deployed if access is gained.
 - Government is often impacted by ransomware, and many times it is the education sector as it probably has the least sophisticated security controls in place.
- *Distributed Denial of Service Attacks (DDoS)*: Attempts to overwhelm a website's capacity to provide service to legitimate users. Makes the website unavailable for all users.
- *Intruders*: Attempt to gain access to a site's infrastructure using zero-day exploits in software.
 - E.g., your mobile device will have you update your phone's software to prevent unauthorized users from getting access, but it ends up taking control of your phone to get your sensitive information, or just lock you out.
- *Web Scanners*: Automated software that "scans" systems for known vulnerabilities to try and exploit.
 - There are "good hackers" (i.e., white hat, ethical hackers) whose job is to find these vulnerabilities before the "bad hackers" (i.e., black hat) find them, then report the vulnerabilities to the vendor to get them fixed.

- *Anonymizers*: Malicious end-points using mechanisms to 'hide' their location/identity using tools such as VPNs, multiple routes, and TOR browser to obfuscate identity.
 - People who tend to use this are protestors so there are no repercussions.

Security Overview – Current Infrastructure

➤ Amazon Web Services (AWS)

- Requirement: AWS basic cloud infrastructure security.
- Reason: AWS provides the overall security for the hosted HTSB website and LMS application.

- Requirement: AWS GuardDuty service.
- Reason: Actively monitors hosted site infrastructure for malicious activity and unauthorized behavior.

➤ Application and Database Servers

- Requirement: Run security monitoring software on all servers.
- Reason: Provides server-level security for the hosted HTSB website and LMS application within the AWS cloud infrastructure security perimeter.

- Requirement: LMS Information Backups
- Reason: Backups are stored separately from the AWS server locations to minimize the risk of unauthorized access and a ransomware attack. Backups are encrypted. Backups are important and help protect against data loss.
 - Backups done nightly so that only a day's worth of work is lost if a ransomware event happens, and the system needs to be restored.
 - Even though backups are encrypted, they are tested on a regular basis to ensure that it can be reloaded and accessed for emergency use.

- Requirement: Data Encryption over the Web
- Reason: Encrypt information between the end user's browser and the Application Servers using an SSL Certificate.
 - By default, information traveling across the open web is not encrypted.

- Requirement: Limited access to Non-Production systems
- Reason: Minimizes risk of data loss requiring positive access authorization.
 - HTSB staff and BST support staff can only access the non-production systems through a special proactive security setup.
 - All part of security layers to make sure that the LMS data is protected.

Security Overview – HTSB WordPress

➤ WordPress Access Control

- Requirement: Only authorized HTSB staff can access and maintain WordPress site contents.

- Reason: Prevents malicious actors' unauthorized posting or manipulation of website contents.
- Requirement: WordFence Security Service for WordPress
 - An additional layer of security for WordPress.
- Reason: Provides real-time protection from malicious actors trying to gain access to WordPress content pages.
 - As WordPress is widely used around the world, there are malicious tools focused on breaking into WordPress-supported sites.
 - HTSB's WordPress site alone had over 16,000 attempted attacks in November (based on statistics pulled 11/30/2023 9:30 a.m.).
 - Although this is not a large amount compared to what other websites probably see, this is a fairly large amount for HTSB.
 - These attempted attacks are mostly done by automated bots trying to find a vulnerable point so that they can break into the system.

Security Overview – Current LMS

- Account Registration
 - Requirement: Registrant must activate Profile by clicking on link in the received email.
 - Reason: Verifies Profile has a valid email address.
 - Checks that the registrant is not a bot trying to gain LMS access.
- Profile Login
 - Requirement: If not already “verified”, the Profile owner is prompted to verify all email addresses on file.
 - Reason: Prepares the LMS to send emails only to “verified” email addresses.
 - Since this is a recently added step, those that were originally registered with an email address in the LMS were verified.
 - Now there are prompts to verify any and all the different email addresses on file to ensure the Profile owner can be contacted and receive the necessary reminders that go out periodically (e.g., license renewal).
- Application Approval
 - Requirement: Prevent application approval and license/permit issuance if the Profile owner's identity hasn't been verified.
 - Reason: Ensure that an applicant has provided valid Government-issued document(s) for identity verification by HTSB staff.
 - Additional security components have been added to help ensure valid information, especially when verifying applicants coming from other countries.

Security Overview – Planned LMS

- Profile Login
 - Requirement: If not already “verified,” the Profile owner is prompted to verify the mobile phone number on file.

- Reason: Prepares the LMS to send text messages to only “verified” mobile phone numbers.
 - The goal is to have more than one communication mechanism.
 - E.g., if someone is unable to access their email, they should be able to access their mobile phone.
- Requirement: Multi-Factor Authentication (MFA) feature enablement to require Profile owner to receive and enter a one-time use code to complete a login transaction.

What is Multi-Factor Authentication?

- ❖ Something the user knows: Their LMS Password
 - ❖ Something the user has: One-time use Security Code
 - ❖ Something the user is: Typically, a biometric identifier such as a fingerprint that smart devices can capture.
 - Not planning on implementing this as it will be a little too difficult to deal with on individual devices.
- Reason: An added layer of security helps prevent bots and/or malicious actors from gaining access to LMS. The Profile owner has to provide something they know- their password, and the one-time use code that they would receive on their personal device to complete the login transaction.
 - MFA would be implemented every time a normal Profile owner logs in.
 - The Board can be assured that the person who asked to log in is the same and correct person that is verified in the account.
 - The adjustment for HTSB staff would be a prompt to confirm once every four to eight hours, but at least once a day, so that staff is not constantly bombarded throughout the day when they are trying to do their work and logging in and out of the system.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or comments for Mr. Costa.

Executive Director Villalobos asked Board Chairperson Kawazoe if she could add to Mr. Costa’s presentation.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called on Executive Director Villalobos.

Executive Director Villalobos thanked Mr. Costa for bringing the topic of additional security checks to HTSB staff’s attention. She stated applicants uploaded sensitive information to the system now, but prior to this checks and balances, there were a lot of data/documents that were not uploaded. Executive Director Villalobos wanted to give the Board an update on this matter as this sensitive information in HTSB’s system needed to be secured.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe thanked Executive Director Villalobos for the update and also thanked Mr. Costa for his work on the website.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any further questions or discussion. There were no further questions or discussion from board members.

III. PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON GENERAL BUSINESS MEETING AGENDA ITEMS

None

IV. NEW BUSINESS, COMMITTEE REPORTS, AND PENDING COMMITTEE ACTION

COMMITTEE REPORT – Budget, Personnel, and Strategic Planning Committee: Mew

The Budget, Personnel, and Strategic Planning Committee met at 9:01 a.m. and looked at a budget update and one New Business Item.

A. Budget Update

Board Member Mew shared an update about the First Quarter of School Year 2023-2024 Annual Budget. He explained the amounts colored blue were encumbered expenses from last fiscal year and funds were allowed to be rolled over, which did not yet affect this year's budget. He stated HTSB was within budget and projected to be within budget for the remainder of the fiscal year.

Board Member Mew asked board members if they had any questions for himself or the committee. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

ACTION: None. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

B. NBI 22-95 Revised: Budget for 2023-2024

Board Member Mew stated the Budget, Personnel, and Strategic Planning Committee voted to recommend NBI 22-95 Revised, as written, to the Board. He reviewed NBI 22-95 Revised, mentioning Executive Director Villalobos and Board Chairperson Kawazoe looked at areas of cost savings within the budget and moved funds to other areas where they could be used. Board Member Mew stated this was an allowable practice and iterated the total budget remained the same. He addressed line-item revisions for HTSB's 2023-2024 budget due to workgroup meeting expenses, funds needed for the research and development of initiatives the Board was undertaking (e.g., teacher apprenticeship, teacher pre-apprenticeship, residencies) to help address the teacher shortage, and funds for office staff growth and office equipment. He then made himself available for any questions.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 22-95 Revised, as written.

Board Member Soares was not present at the time of voting. Board Chairperson Kawazoe did not vote. All other board members present voted to approve NBI 22-95 Revised, as written, with 10 of 12 members present voting aye.

ACTION: NBI 22-95 Revised: Budget for 2023-2024, was adopted by the Board.

COMMITTEE REPORT – Legislative Committee: Miyamae

The Legislative Committee met at 9:45 a.m. They looked at two New Business Items.

C. NBI 23-19: Approval of HTSB’s 2024 Annual Report

Board Member Miyamae stated the Legislative Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-19, as written, to the Board. She reviewed NBI 23-19 and informed that this Annual Report will be presented to the Governor, the President of the Senate, and the Speaker of the House prior to Opening Day of Legislature. She noted that the spike in the *License and Permit Data* table was due to automatic license renewals.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Member Soares re-entered remotely.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 23-19, as written. The motion carried unanimously with all board members present voting to approve NBI 23-19, as written.

ACTION: NBI 23-19: Approval of HTSB’s 2024 Annual Report, was adopted by the Board.

D. NBI 23-20: HTSB’s 2024 Legislative Priorities

Board Member Miyamae stated the Legislative Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-20, as written, to the Board. She reviewed NBI 23-20, which included the Rationale/Background. She mentioned this was brought up as a discussion topic at the last board meeting and there was no additional information provided.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 23-20, as written. The motion carried unanimously with all board members present voting to approve NBI 23-20, as written.

ACTION: NBI 23-20: HTSB's 2024 Legislative Priorities, was adopted by the Board.

COMMITTEE REPORT – Teacher Standards Committee: Sanders

The Teacher Standards Committee met at 10:30 a.m. and looked at two New Business Items.

E. NBI 23-21: License Affirmation (October 2023)

Board Member Sanders stated the Teacher Standards Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-21, as written, to the Board. She reviewed NBI 23-21, affirming the licenses and permits for the respective month.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 23-21, as written. The motion carried unanimously with all board members present voting to approve NBI 23-21, as written.

ACTION: NBI 23-21: License Affirmation (October 2023), was adopted by the Board.

F. NBI 23-22: Adoption of the 2023-2024 Hawaiian Focus Workgroup Recommendations (Part 3)

Board Member Sanders stated the Teacher Standards Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-22, as written, to the Board. She reviewed NBI 23-22, which included the Rationale/Background. She informed HTSB would be advocating for the first three bullet points listed, and HTSB would be developing the other three bullet points. Board Member Sanders also mentioned the Hawaiian workgroup worked very hard on these recommendations and the committee members were very excited about this.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 23-22, as written. The motion carried unanimously with all board members present voting to approve NBI 23-22, as written.

ACTION: NBI 23-22: Adoption of the 2023-2024 Hawaiian Focus Workgroup Recommendations (Part 3), was adopted by the Board.

COMMITTEE REPORT – Teacher Education Committee: Ornelles

The Teacher Education Committee met at 11:15 a.m. and looked at three New Business Items.

G. NBI 23-23: The Granting of a Posthumous HTSB License

Board Member Ornelles stated the Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-23, as written, to the Board. She reviewed NBI 23-23, which included the Rationale/Background.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 23-23, as written. The motion carried unanimously with all board members present voting to approve NBI 23-23, as written.

ACTION: NBI 23-23: The Granting of a Posthumous HTSB License, was adopted by the Board.

H. NBI 23-24: Imposed Moratorium for Out-of-State Educator Preparation Providers Seeking Program Approval

Board Member Ornelles stated the Teacher Education Committee voted to recommend NBI 23-24, as written, to the Board. She reviewed NBI 23-24, which included the Rationale/Background. She also clarified the moratorium for EPPs that Executive Director Villalobos referred to earlier in this meeting was lifted as of today, December 1st, but this NBI 23-24 would impose a moratorium for all out-of-state EPPs seeking program approval in Hawai'i with HTSB.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether to approve or deny NBI 23-24, as written. The motion carried unanimously with all board members present voting to approve NBI 23-24, as written.

ACTION: NBI 23-24: Imposed Moratorium for Out-of-State Educator Preparation Providers Seeking Program Approval, was adopted by the Board.

I. NBI 23-25: Approval of Substantive Modifications to the University of Hawai'i at Mānoa's Master of Education in Curriculum Studies (PK-3) Added Field Program

Board Member Ornelles introduced NBI 23-25 but stated it would be deferred to the next board meeting on January 12, 2024.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

ACTION: Deferred to January 12, 2024, board meeting.

V. EXECUTIVE SESSION

Board Chairperson Kawazoe shared information regarding procedures for virtual Executive Session.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a motion to move into Executive Session.

Board Member Miyamae made a motion to move into Executive Session. Board Member Raymond seconded the motion.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called for a roll call vote on the motion of whether or not to move into Executive Session. The motion carried unanimously with all board members present voting to move into Executive Session at 1:44 p.m.

This portion of the meeting is a closed meeting under HRS §92-4 and HRS §92-5(a)(1)(2) and (4).

Board Chairperson Kawazoe called the meeting back to order at 2:01 p.m.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe reported out what was discussed during Executive Session:

- Meeting Minutes from October 27, 2023
- Personnel Update from Executive Director Villalobos
- Consultation With Deputy Attorney General Michael Azuma
- Deferred NBI 23-26 and NBI 23-27

VI. NEXT HTSB MEETING: January 12, 2024

Board Chairperson Kawazoe stated the next HTSB Board Meeting was scheduled for January 12, 2024. The details of the agenda would come out prior to the meeting.

Board Chairperson Kawazoe asked board members if they had any questions or discussion. There were no questions or discussion from board members.

VII. ADJOURNMENT

Board Chairperson Kawazoe adjourned the General Business Meeting at 2:02 p.m.