

TITLE: Results and Recommendations from HTSB Annual Educator Preparation Provider Completer Audit School Year 2023-2024

The Hawai'i Teacher Standards Board (HTSB) adopts the results and recommendations from its annual Educator Preparation Provider (EPP) Completer Audit for the 2023–2024 school year.

While HTSB conducts an annual audit of program completers, the EPPs must also submit an annual report (Hawaii Administrative Rules [HAR] [§8-54-2\[6\]](#)) about their program, which includes program completer data, information about basic skills and content knowledge, and clinical experience. Information from the EPPs may be reported to the Governor, legislature, the Board of Education (Hawaii Revised Statute [HRS] [§302A-803](#)), or the national accreditor (HAR §8-54-26-29).

The following describes the HTSB audit process, results, and recommendations based on data collected from EPP completers for the 2023-2024 school year.

Process

The HTSB staff provided EPP faculty with a list of evidence to verify the basic skills, content knowledge, and clinical experience. During the annual EPP meeting, EPP staff were provided with a list of evidence to verify the basic skills, content knowledge, and clinical experience of selected teacher candidates for the audit (see Table 1).

Required Documentation	Explanation
Basic Skills	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• If a bachelor's degree is listed, then use the undergraduate transcript.
Content Knowledge	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• If a Praxis test is listed, then use the official score report.• If coursework is listed, then use course grades.
Clinical Experience/ Student Teaching	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Evidence must verify school name, cooperating/mentor teacher, school, and grade level.• If Emergency Hire, then use the employment document verifying their hiring as an Emergency Hire teacher, school, grade level, and subject.

Table 1. Verification and Evidence of Completers

The HTSB staff provided the EPPs with a Program Completer Information Cover Sheet template to gather information and organize evidence for each teacher candidate and their cooperating/mentor teacher qualifications (see Appendix A).

The HTSB staff selected ten percent of the number of yearly program completers of each EPP and a minimum of five records per EPP (read [NBI 13-14](#)). Teach for America is an exception due to the requirement that all completers be audited (read [NBI 23-13](#)).

A multistage cluster process was used to select completers, ensuring randomization within each EPP-approved licensure field (Cresswell & Creswell, 2018). Each Licensing Specialist (LS) sorted the clusters according to licensure field (e.g., elementary education, special education), grade level span (e.g., K-6, 6-12), licensure pathway (e.g., traditional bachelor's degree, post-baccalaureate, master's degree), and program completion date (e.g., month, semester). Audit participants were then randomly selected within their cluster. Among the fourteen EPPs, 155 completers were chosen for the audit (see Table 2). Two EPPs had fewer than five completers.

Hawai'i EPP	Number of Audits
Brigham Young University Hawai'i	5
Chaminade University-School Counseling	6
Chaminade University-School of Education	5
Hawai'i Pacific University	5
iTeach	5
Kaho'iwai Center for Adult Teaching and Learning	6
Kahuawaiola at University of Hawai'i at Hilo	4
Leeward Community College-Career and Technical Education	5
Leeward Community College-Special Education	6
Teach Away	5
Teach For America Hawai'i	44
University of Hawai'i at Hilo	5
University of Hawai'i at Mānoa-College of Education	46
University of Hawai'i at Mānoa-Library and Informational Science	3
University of Hawai'i at West O'ahu	5
Total	155

Table 2. EPP Completers Selected for Audit

One HTSB LS was responsible for collecting and selecting the completers and sharing information about the audit process. Each LS was involved in the audit to maintain objectivity and eliminate bias. They were assigned to review completers from each EPP and had a similar number of completers to review.

Each LS reviewed the audit information independently and wrote comments or questions about the evidence. The EPP Institution Program Completer Record was also available as another data source. The Program Completer Record is submitted when the EPP recommends a candidate for licensure and contains information about the candidate's basic skills and knowledge as well as the dates of their clinical experience and placement. In a separate meeting, the LS discussed their findings and questions. Collectively, the LS decided whether the evidence met audit requirements or if additional information was needed from the EPP. The results section describes their findings.

The LS also applied recommendations from the past audit (read [NBI 23-49](#)). First, the LS would contact program completers or EPP staff when licensure exam scores are missing when the Program Completer Recommendation and applications were received. Secondly, the HTSB Program Completer data was adjusted to align with Title II reporting dates (i.e., September 1 to August 30).

Results

All fourteen EPPs submitted audit information by the due date. Ten EPPs provided evidence that met all criteria, and no clarification was needed. Four EPPs were asked to provide additional information, such as:

- Resolving a conflict in a teaching field and the completer's clinical experience in a sixth-grade classroom. The EPP changed the recommendation from Japanese 6-12 to Japanese 6-8.
- Explaining inconsistent evidence verifying clinical experience hours. The EPP reported that faculty needed advance notice to collect or establish a system for documenting clinical experience hours.
- Supplying evidence showing its Option B completer met all Hawai'i-Specific Requirements (read [NBI 11-03 Revised](#)). The EPP provided evidence showing the candidate met requirements.
- Explaining how the combination of coursework and licensure exams met content knowledge requirements. The EPP provided transcripts verifying the college courses used to meet content knowledge requirements, as well as the Praxis exam scores.
- Explaining how evidence was documented to meet the Hawai'i-Specific Requirements ([§8-54-19](#)), clinical experience, and the type of support given to a completer whose clinical experience was on the U.S. Continent as part of [NBI 22-71 Out-of-State Teacher Candidates Enrolled in an Approved HTSB Educator Preparation Program Prior to November 19, 2021](#). The EPP used time logs, videos, coursework, weekly synchronous meetings, and hired on-site support from an individual with a valid Hawai'i teaching license for this completer.

The LS found variability among the types of cooperating/mentor teachers (e.g., EPP staff, private or public school teachers), license level (e.g., Emergency Hire Permit, Provisional License, Standard License), and validity (e.g., expired, valid, no license) among all EPPs.

Recommendations

As a result of the audit, the following recommendations are offered to improve the auditing process for HTSB and EPP staff and to maintain program preparation quality among Hawai'i EPPs.

1. As with EPP Audit [NBI 23-49](#), reviewing the completer evidence for the required 450 hours of clinical experience/student teaching proved to be a complex process. The commonly used evidence was a time sheet or a digital app. Eight of the 14 EPPs' documentation varied from completers submitting the Hawai'i Department of Education Personnel Form 5 or EPP-developed timesheets that tracked clinical experience on a daily or weekly basis. During the EPP annual meeting, HTSB staff will provide clear guidance on documenting evidence of clinical experience to ensure completers are prepared for teaching. This recommendation is supported by research (Francies, Glover, & Jamieson, 2021; Zeichner, Darling-Hammond, Berman, Dong, & Sykes, 2024).
2. Data related to cooperating/mentor teachers raised new questions and highlighted the importance of [NBI 24-38](#), The Formation of the Cooperating/Mentor Teacher Workgroup. The audit revealed varied practices across EPPs, with some aligning best practices for cooperating/mentor teacher selection and others showing inconsistencies. Key findings include:
 - Six EPPs had cooperating/mentor teachers with valid HTSB licenses that matched the same teaching field and grade level as their completers.
 - One EPP is an add-a-field program and does not require cooperating/mentor teachers.
 - Fifty-eight completers across seven EPPs had cooperating/mentor teacher assignments that did not meet expectations. These included:
 - Mentor teachers without a license,
 - Mentor teachers with an expired HTSB license,
 - School administrators serving as cooperating/mentor teachers, or
 - Mentor teachers with valid HTSB licenses that did not align with the completer's teaching field.

The majority of these 58 completers were Emergency Hire Teachers. For those who did not have a cooperating/mentor teacher, there was no evidence that their employer had assigned them a cooperating/mentor teacher. In response, HTSB

staff are working with EPP faculty to emphasize the importance of assigning qualified cooperating/mentor teachers, as supported by research (Frances, Glover, & Jamieson, 2021; Zeichner, Darling-Hammond, Berman, Dong, & Sykes, 2024), and to support the formation of a cooperating/mentor teacher workgroup.

The Board should require that all teacher candidates be assigned a cooperating/mentor teacher who holds a valid Hawai'i license in the same licensure field as the candidate. Audit data showed that Emergency Hire Teachers are often unsupported, either assigned cooperating/mentor teachers who do not hold the appropriate license or supported by EPP staff who lack licensure in the candidate's field.

3. The HTSB LS staff will continue auditing EPP completers based on the Board's approval of [NBI 23-33](#) Revised Teacher Candidates Clinical Experience Criteria for Initial Licensure in Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages, and ensuring program completers recommended in a teaching field with grades K-12 have documentation of an elementary and secondary setting as written in [NBI 12-27](#) Revised Student Teaching Policy for HTSB Approved Educator Preparation Providers.
4. The Board should establish qualifications for cooperating/mentor teachers.
5. The Board should create an NBI that pertains to HTSB's audit process.
6. The Board shall direct HTSB staff to reevaluate the EPP chapter in Hawaii Administrative Rules and provide recommendations based on current practices, policies, and laws.
7. The Board should prevent EPPs from placing candidates in 6th-grade classrooms as a loophole to recommend licensure for grades K-12.

Rationale/Background:

The HTSB conducts annual audits of completers from Hawai'i-approved EPPs (see [NBI 13-14](#) and [NBI 12-27 Revised](#)). The purposes of the audits are to verify teacher candidates' basic skills and content knowledge before their clinical experience/student teaching/internship, and to verify completion of their supervised clinical experience, student teaching, internship, or residency in a Hawai'i public, charter, or private school at the appropriate grade level(s) and in the subjects or school roles (e.g., school counselor, school librarian) for which they are seeking a license. Programs found to be in violation of these requirements may be subject to Board action.

Submitted by: Kristi Miyamae

Referred to: Teacher Education Committee

References

Francies, C., Glover, S., and Jamieson, C. (2021). Enhancing teacher preparation through clinical experience. Education Commission of the States.

National Academy of Education. (2024). *Evaluating and improving teacher preparation programs*. K. M. Zeichner, L. Darling-Hammond, A. I. Berman, D. Dong, & G. Sykes (Eds.). National Academy of Education.

Appendix A. Program Completer Information Cover Sheet

(Insert EPP Logo)

(Replace with EPP Name)
(COLLEGE/SCHOOL OF EDUCATION)
PROGRAM COMPLETER INFORMATION COVER SHEET

Student Name	
Completer Date	
Degree/Licensure Pathway	
Licensure Area/Grade Level	

Clinical Experience / Student Teaching	Placement 1	Placement 2
School*		
Grade Level*		
Student Teaching Dates*		
Cooperating/Mentor Teacher's Name*		
Cooperating/Mentor Teacher License Level*		
Cooperating/Mentor Teacher Teaching Fields and Grade Levels*		
Identify Type of Mentor (e.g., EPP, HIDEOE, HIPCS, No Mentor)		

*For K-12 completers, list all placement schools, mentor teachers, and student teaching dates. Information is located on the [HTSB Public Licensure Search website](https://www.hawaii.gov/education/programs-and-services/teacher-licensure/public-licensure-search/).

Audit Requirements

Required Documentation	Title of Evidence
Basic Skills	
Content Knowledge	
Clinical Experience/Student Teaching (Evidence must verify school name, cooperating/mentor teacher, school, grade level, and documentation of 450 hours of clinical experience (e.g., timesheet). If applicable, Plan B documentation to meet Hawaii Specific requirements)	