

New Business Item 23-49

Introduced April 26, 2024

Approved April 26, 2024

TITLE: Results and Recommendations from HTSB’s 2023 Annual Educator Preparation Provider Completer Audit

The Hawai'i Teacher Standards Board (HTSB) conducts annual audits of completers from the Hawai'i approved educator preparation provider (EPP) ([New Business Item \[NBI\] 13-14](#) and [NBI 12-27 Revised](#)). The purposes of the audit are to verify teacher candidates' basic skills and content knowledge prior to their clinical experience/student teaching/internship and completion of their supervised clinical experience in student teaching, internship, or residency in a Hawai'i public, charter, or private school at the appropriate grade level(s) and in the subjects or school roles (e.g., school counselor, school librarian) for which they are seeking a license. A program in violation shall be sanctioned, including revoking its state approval.

While HTSB conducts an annual audit of program completers, the EPPs must also submit annual program completer data, including basic skills and content knowledge information, in their [Title II Federal Report](#).

The following describes the HTSB audit process, results, and recommendations based on data collected from EPP completers in the school year 2022-2023.

Process

During the annual HTSB-EPP meeting, EPP staff were given a list to provide evidence of basic skills, content knowledge, clinical experience, and the Model Code of Educator Ethics (MCEE) from selected teacher candidates for the audit (see Table 1). The MCEE is a Hawai'i-specific requirement (Hawai'i Administrative Rules [§8-54-19](#)) that develops teacher candidates' understanding of ethical principles and equips them with strategies to make ethical decisions. For several years, the HTSB has consulted with Dr. Troy Hutchings to provide professional development on MCEE to EPP staff and teacher candidates ([NBI 22-69](#)).

The EPP staff were given a Program Completer Information Cover Sheet template to provide information and organize evidence for each teacher candidate (see Appendix A).

Verification	Type of Evidence
Basic Skills	One of the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Passing scores on basic skills licensure test adopted by the Board in Reading, Writing, and Mathematics. • Qualifying scores on SAT Reading and Mathematics sections and passing scores on PPST Writing test. • Bachelor’s degree awarded by an accredited institution of higher education.
Content Knowledge	One of the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Passing score on licensure test adopted by the Board in the content field. • National Board for Professional Teaching Standards certification in the content field. • Content major consisting of a minimum of thirty (30) semester hours in the content field for a bachelor’s degree awarded by an accredited institution of higher education. • A minimum of thirty (30) semester hours in the content field from an accredited institution of higher education, at least fifteen (15) of which must be upper division level. • A master’s, specialist, or doctoral degree in the license field awarded by an accredited institution of higher education.
Clinical Experience	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Start date should be after the completion of content knowledge (e.g., check start date on transcript, and no content courses should be taken simultaneously). • Includes a student teaching start and completion date. • Placement matches licensure field and grade span.
Model Code of Educator Ethics	EPP Institution Program Completer Record.

Table 1. Verification and Evidence of Completers

The HTSB staff selected 10% of the number of yearly program completers of each EPP, but at least five records per EPP (NBI 13-14). A multistage cluster process (Cresswell & Cresswell, 2018) was utilized to select completers to ensure randomization within the EPPs approved licensure field. The cluster was sorted according to licensure field, grade level span, licensure pathway (e.g., traditional, alternative), and program completion date. Audit participants were then randomly selected within the cluster. Ninety-eight completers from the 14 EPPs were selected for the audit (see Table 2). Of the 14 EPPs, two EPPs had less than five completers.

Hawai'i EPP	Number of Audits
Brigham Young University Hawai'i	5
Chaminade University - Counseling	5
Chaminade University - School of Education	5
Hawai'i Pacific University	5
iTeach	7
Kaho'iwai Center for Adult Teaching and Learning	5
Kahuawaiola at the University of Hawai'i at Hilo	2
Leeward Community College	5
Teach Away	5
Teach For America Hawai'i	5
University of Hawai'i at Hilo	5
University of Hawai'i at Mānoa College of Education	36
University of Hawai'i at Mānoa Library and Informational Science	3
University of Hawai'i at West O'ahu	5
Total	98

Table 2. EPP Completers Selected for Audit

One HTSB Licensing Specialist (LS) collected and selected the completers and shared information about the audit process with the HTSB Audit Team. Each LS was involved in the audit to maintain objectivity and eliminate bias when reviewing the completer's verification. Each LS was assigned completers from each EPP, and a similar number of completers were distributed among the HTSB Audit Team.

Each LS reviewed the audit information independently and wrote any comments or questions about the evidence. The EPP Institution Program Completer Record was also available as another data source. The completer record is submitted when the EPP recommends a candidate for licensure and contains information about basic skills and knowledge types, clinical experience dates, and clinical experience placement. Later, all LSs discussed their findings and questions. Collectively, the LS decided whether the evidence met audit requirements or if additional information was needed from the EPP. The results section describes the findings.

Results

All EPPs submitted audit information by the due date. Ten EPPs provided evidence that met all criteria, and no clarification was needed. Four EPPs were asked to provide additional information, such as:

- Resolving conflicting locations about the completer's clinical experience school. The EPP corrected and resubmitted the cover sheet.
- Describing the imbalance of completers' clinical experience hours in an elementary and secondary setting for a K-12 licensure field. The EPP explained

that the teacher candidate must complete a minimum of 100 hours in the secondary clinical experience setting. In combination with the primary clinical experience setting, the teacher candidate will exceed 450 hours.

- Describing how a teacher candidate who accepted an Emergency Hire Teacher position in an elementary education setting fulfilled clinical experience at an elementary and secondary setting to obtain a K-12 licensure field. The EPP explained that the teacher candidate and the K-12 school signed a Memorandum of Agreement. The EPP did not know if a substitute teacher was hired at the elementary school when the teacher candidate completed field experience at the secondary school.
- Justifying why program completers entered the clinical experience without finishing coursework or meeting content knowledge. The EPP explained that one teacher candidate met content knowledge by taking the Praxis. Another teacher candidate was grandfathered under [NBI 20-27](#).
- Explaining how evidence was documented to meet the Hawai'i Specific Requirements ([§8-54-19](#)), clinical experience, and the type of support given to a completer whose clinical experience was on the U.S. Continent as part of [NBI 22-71 Out-of-State Teacher Candidates Enrolled in an Approved HTSB Educator Preparation Program Prior to November 19, 2021](#). The EPP used time logs, videos, coursework, weekly synchronous meetings, and hired on-site support from an individual with a valid Hawai'i teaching license for this completer.
- Explaining how the combination of coursework and licensure exams met content knowledge requirements. The EPP provided transcripts verifying college courses used to meet content knowledge and the Praxis exam scores.
- Completing missing information (e.g., student teaching dates). The EPPs corrected and resubmitted the cover sheet.

Recommendations

As a result of the audit, the following recommendations are offered to improve the process and collection of evidence to support the EPPs.

1. Teacher candidates should send their licensure exam scores directly to the HTSB, especially those who use a combination of coursework and licensure exams to meet content knowledge requirements. For example, elementary education candidates must demonstrate proficient content knowledge in social studies, reading, math, and science and may use a combination of coursework and licensure exams. Since the audit, the LS has contacted teacher candidates using the combination verification to upload their licensure exam scores and relevant coursework upon receipt of the EPP Institution Program Completer Record.

2. The documentation of 450 hours could have been more concrete. The current practice to verify clinical experience includes the EPP providing the school's name, grade level, and mentor teacher. Most EPPs included the semester or school year dates instead of student teaching dates. Hawai'i Pacific University provided concrete evidence of their candidate's clinical experience hours as documented from a digital app. The HTSB staff should seek information on how EPPs collect evidence to verify teacher candidates' clinical experience hours.
3. The HTSB staff will adjust auditing completers based on the Title II school year (September 1 to August 30) to ensure data accuracy at the state and federal levels.
4. The Board should clarify the equal number of clinical experience hours teacher candidates must fulfill in the elementary and secondary settings if they pursue a license with grades K-12.
5. Given that fulfilling clinical practice/student teaching/internship at the sixth-grade level can result with a recommendation for licensure at the elementary or secondary levels, HTSB is recommending that if a teacher candidate is placed in a sixth grade classroom for their clinical experience/student teaching/internship, the EPP needs to indicate a recommendation for one of these levels: (a) elementary or (b) secondary with a content area.
6. HTSB recommends that teacher candidates have a cooperating teacher with a valid Hawai'i teaching license in a field aligned to the license field being pursued by the teacher candidate. Data showed that teacher candidates who are also Emergency Hire Teachers are supported by cooperating teachers who do not have the same licensure field or are not assigned a cooperating teacher by the EPP.
7. The Board should establish qualifications for cooperating teachers.
8. The Board should create an NBI that pertains to HTSB's audit process.
9. The Board shall direct HTSB staff to reevaluate the EPP chapter in Hawai'i Administrative Rules and provide recommendations based on current practices, policies, and laws.

Rationale/Background:

Submitted by: Branden Kawazoe
Referred to: Teacher Education Committee

Appendix A. Program Completer Information Cover Sheet

(Insert EPP Logo)

(Replace with EPP Name)

(COLLEGE/SCHOOL OF EDUCATION)

PROGRAM COMPLETER INFORMATION COVER SHEET

Student Name	
Completer Date	
Degree Program	
Licensure Area/Grade Level	

Clinical Experience / Student Teaching	Placement 1	Placement 2
School*		
Cooperating/Mentor Teacher's Name*		
Cooperating/Mentor Teacher's Licensure Type and Field**		
Identify Type of Mentor (e.g., EPP, HIDEOE, HIPCS, No Mentor)		
Grade Level*		
Student Teaching Dates*		

*For K-12 completers, list all placement schools, mentor teachers, and student teaching dates

** Information is located on the [HTSB Public Licensure Search website](#).

Audit Requirements

Required Documentation	Title of Evidence
Basic Skills	
Content Knowledge	
Clinical Experience/Student Teaching (Evidence must verify school name, cooperating/mentor teacher, school, and grade level)	

TITLE: Results and Recommendations from HTSB's 2023 Annual Educator Preparation Provider Completer Audit

The Hawai'i Teacher Standards Board (HTSB) conducts annual audits of completers from the Hawai'i approved educator preparation provider (EPP) ([New Business Item \[NBI\] 13-14](#) and [NBI 12-27 Revised](#)). The purposes of the audit are to verify teacher candidates' basic skills and content knowledge prior to their clinical experience/student teaching/internship and completion of their supervised clinical experience in student teaching, internship, or residency in a Hawai'i public, charter, or private school at the appropriate grade level(s) and in the subjects or school roles (e.g., school counselor, school librarian) for which they are seeking a license. A program in violation shall be sanctioned, including revoking its state approval.

While HTSB conducts an annual audit of program completers, the EPPs must also submit annual program completer data, including basic skills and content knowledge information, in their [Title II Federal Report](#).

The following describes the HTSB audit process, results, and recommendations based on data collected from EPP completers in the school year 2022-2023.

Process

During the annual HTSB-EPP meeting, EPP staff were given a list to provide evidence of basic skills, content knowledge, clinical experience, and the Model Code of Educator Ethics (MCEE) from selected teacher candidates for the audit (see Table 1). The MCEE is a Hawai'i-specific requirement (Hawai'i Administrative Rules [§8-54-19](#)) that develops teacher candidates' understanding of ethical principles and equips them with strategies to make ethical decisions. For several years, the HTSB has consulted with Dr. Troy Hutchings to provide professional development on MCEE to EPP staff and teacher candidates ([NBI 22-69](#)).

The EPP staff were given a Program Completer Information Cover Sheet template to provide information and organize evidence for each teacher candidate (see Appendix A).

Verification	Type of Evidence
Basic Skills	One of the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Passing scores on basic skills licensure test adopted by the Board in Reading, Writing, and Mathematics. • Qualifying scores on SAT Reading and Mathematics sections and passing scores on PPST Writing test. • Bachelor’s degree awarded by an accredited institution of higher education.
Content Knowledge	One of the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Passing score on licensure test adopted by the Board in the content field. • National Board for Professional Teaching Standards certification in the content field. • Content major consisting of a minimum of thirty (30) semester hours in the content field for a bachelor’s degree awarded by an accredited institution of higher education. • A minimum of thirty (30) semester hours in the content field from an accredited institution of higher education, at least fifteen (15) of which must be upper division level. • A master’s, specialist, or doctoral degree in the license field awarded by an accredited institution of higher education.
Clinical Experience	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Start date should be after the completion of content knowledge (e.g., check start date on transcript, and no content courses should be taken simultaneously). • Includes a student teaching start and completion date. • Placement matches licensure field and grade span.
Model Code of Educator Ethics	EPP Institution Program Completer Record.

Table 1. Verification and Evidence of Completers

The HTSB staff selected 10% of the number of yearly program completers of each EPP, but at least five records per EPP (NBI 13-14). A multistage cluster process (Cresswell & Cresswell, 2018) was utilized to select completers to ensure randomization within the EPPs approved licensure field. The cluster was sorted according to licensure field, grade level span, licensure pathway (e.g., traditional, alternative), and program completion date. Audit participants were then randomly selected within the cluster. Ninety-eight completers from the 14 EPPs were selected for the audit (see Table 2). Of the 14 EPPs, two EPPs had less than five completers.

Hawai'i EPP	Number of Audits
Brigham Young University Hawai'i	5
Chaminade University - Counseling	5
Chaminade University - School of Education	5
Hawai'i Pacific University	5
iTeach	7
Kaho'iwai Center for Adult Teaching and Learning	5
Kahuawaiola at the University of Hawai'i at Hilo	2
Leeward Community College	5
Teach Away	5
Teach For America Hawai'i	5
University of Hawai'i at Hilo	5
University of Hawai'i at Mānoa College of Education	36
University of Hawai'i at Mānoa Library and Informational Science	3
University of Hawai'i at West O'ahu	5
Total	98

Table 2. EPP Completers Selected for Audit

One HTSB Licensing Specialist (LS) collected and selected the completers and shared information about the audit process with the HTSB Audit Team. Each LS was involved in the audit to maintain objectivity and eliminate bias when reviewing the completer's verification. Each LS was assigned completers from each EPP, and a similar number of completers were distributed among the HTSB Audit Team.

Each LS reviewed the audit information independently and wrote any comments or questions about the evidence. The EPP Institution Program Completer Record was also available as another data source. The completer record is submitted when the EPP recommends a candidate for licensure and contains information about basic skills and knowledge types, clinical experience dates, and clinical experience placement. Later, all LSs discussed their findings and questions. Collectively, the LS decided whether the evidence met audit requirements or if additional information was needed from the EPP. The results section describes the findings.

Results

All EPPs submitted audit information by the due date. Ten EPPs provided evidence that met all criteria, and no clarification was needed. Four EPPs were asked to provide additional information, such as:

- Resolving conflicting locations about the completer's clinical experience school. The EPP corrected and resubmitted the cover sheet.
- Describing the imbalance of completers' clinical experience hours in an elementary and secondary setting for a K-12 licensure field. The EPP explained

that the teacher candidate must complete a minimum of 100 hours in the secondary clinical experience setting. In combination with the primary clinical experience setting, the teacher candidate will exceed 450 hours.

- Describing how a teacher candidate who accepted an Emergency Hire Teacher position in an elementary education setting fulfilled clinical experience at an elementary and secondary setting to obtain a K-12 licensure field. The EPP explained that the teacher candidate and the K-12 school signed a Memorandum of Agreement. The EPP did not know if a substitute teacher was hired at the elementary school when the teacher candidate completed field experience at the secondary school.
- Justifying why program completers entered the clinical experience without finishing coursework or meeting content knowledge. The EPP explained that one teacher candidate met content knowledge by taking the Praxis. Another teacher candidate was grandfathered under [NBI 20-27](#).
- Explaining how evidence was documented to meet the Hawai'i Specific Requirements ([§8-54-19](#)), clinical experience, and the type of support given to a completer whose clinical experience was on the U.S. Continent as part of [NBI 22-71 Out-of-State Teacher Candidates Enrolled in an Approved HTSB Educator Preparation Program Prior to November 19, 2021](#). The EPP used time logs, videos, coursework, weekly synchronous meetings, and hired on-site support from an individual with a valid Hawai'i teaching license for this completer.
- Explaining how the combination of coursework and licensure exams met content knowledge requirements. The EPP provided transcripts verifying college courses used to meet content knowledge and the Praxis exam scores.
- Completing missing information (e.g., student teaching dates). The EPPs corrected and resubmitted the cover sheet.

Recommendations

As a result of the audit, the following recommendations are offered to improve the process and collection of evidence to support the EPPs.

10. Teacher candidates should send their licensure exam scores directly to the HTSB, especially those who use a combination of coursework and licensure exams to meet content knowledge requirements. For example, elementary education candidates must demonstrate proficient content knowledge in social studies, reading, math, and science and may use a combination of coursework and licensure exams. Since the audit, the LS has contacted teacher candidates using the combination verification to upload their licensure exam scores and relevant coursework upon receipt of the EPP Institution Program Completer Record.

11. The documentation of 450 hours could have been more concrete. The current practice to verify clinical experience includes the EPP providing the school's name, grade level, and mentor teacher. Most EPPs included the semester or school year dates instead of student teaching dates. Hawai'i Pacific University provided concrete evidence of their candidate's clinical experience hours as documented from a digital app. The HTSB staff should seek information on how EPPs collect evidence to verify teacher candidates' clinical experience hours.
12. The HTSB staff will adjust auditing completers based on the Title II school year (September 1 to August 30) to ensure data accuracy at the state and federal levels.
13. The Board should clarify the equal number of clinical experience hours teacher candidates must fulfill in the elementary and secondary settings if they pursue a license with grades K-12.
14. ~~The Board should prevent EPPs from placing candidates in 6th grade classrooms as a loophole to recommend licensure for grades K-12.~~
Recommendation:
 Given that fulfilling clinical practice/student teaching/internship at the sixth-grade level can result with a recommendation for licensure at the elementary or secondary levels, HTSB is recommending that if a teacher candidate is placed in a sixth grade classroom for their clinical experience/student teaching/internship, the EPP needs to indicate a recommendation for one of these levels: (a) elementary or (b) secondary with a content area.
15. ~~The Board should require~~ **HTSB recommends** that teacher candidates have a cooperating teacher with a valid Hawai'i **teaching** license in **a field aligned to the license field being pursued by the teacher candidate.** ~~the same licensure field.~~ Data showed that teacher candidates who are also Emergency Hire Teachers are supported by cooperating teachers who do not have the same licensure field or are not assigned a cooperating teacher by the EPP.
16. The Board should establish qualifications for cooperating teachers.
17. The Board should create an NBI that pertains to HTSB's audit process.
18. The Board shall direct HTSB staff to reevaluate the EPP chapter in Hawai'i Administrative Rules and provide recommendations based on current practices, policies, and laws.

Rationale/Background:

Submitted by: Branden Kawazoe
Referred to: Teacher Education Committee

Appendix A. Program Completer Information Cover Sheet

(Insert EPP Logo)

(Replace with EPP Name)

(COLLEGE/SCHOOL OF EDUCATION)

PROGRAM COMPLETER INFORMATION COVER SHEET

Student Name	
Completer Date	
Degree Program	
Licensure Area/Grade Level	

Clinical Experience / Student Teaching	Placement 1	Placement 2
School*		
Cooperating/Mentor Teacher's Name*		
Cooperating/Mentor Teacher's Licensure Type and Field**		
Identify Type of Mentor (e.g., EPP, HIDEOE, HIPCS, No Mentor)		
Grade Level*		
Student Teaching Dates*		

*For K-12 completers, list all placement schools, mentor teachers, and student teaching dates

** Information is located on the [HTSB Public Licensure Search website](#).

Audit Requirements

Required Documentation	Title of Evidence
Basic Skills	
Content Knowledge	
Clinical Experience/Student Teaching (Evidence must verify school name, cooperating/mentor teacher, school, and grade level)	